Examining long-term variability in saturated hydraulic conductivity of sandy soils and its influencing factors

Saeed Nikghalb Ashouri¹, Adrian Pittari¹, Vicki Moon¹, and Ali Shokri¹

¹Waikato University

September 13, 2023

Abstract

Saturated hydraulic conductivity (Ks) is a crucial parameter that influences water flow in saturated soils, with applications in various fields such as surface water runoff, soil erosion, drainage, and solute transport. However, accurate estimation of Ks is challenging due to temporal and spatial uncertainties. This study addresses the knowledge gap regarding the long-term behaviour of Ks in sandy soils with less than 10% fine particles. The research investigates the changes in Ks over a long period of constant head tests and examines the factors influencing its variation. Two sandy samples were tested using a hydraulic conductivity cell, and the hydraulic head and discharge were recorded for over 50 days. The results show a general decline in Ks throughout the test, except for brief periods of increase. Furthermore, the relationship between flow rate and hydraulic head gradient does not follow the expected linear correlation from Darcy's law, highlighting the complex nature of sandy soil hydraulic conductivity. The investigation of soil properties in three different sections of the samples before and after the tests revealed a decrease in the percentage of fine particles and a shift in specific gravity from the bottom to the top of the sample, suggesting particle migration along the flow direction. Factors such as clogging by fine particles and pore pressure variation contribute to the changes in Ks. The implications of this study have far-reaching effects on various geotechnical engineering applications. These include groundwater remediation, geotechnical stability analysis, and drainage system design.

Hosted file

972606_0_art_file_11334405_s0js72.docx available at https://authorea.com/users/664099/ articles/665992-examining-long-term-variability-in-saturated-hydraulic-conductivityof-sandy-soils-and-its-influencing-factors Examining long-term variability in saturated hydraulic conductivity of sandy soils and its
 influencing factors

3 Saeed Nikghalb Ashouri¹, Adrian Pittari¹, Vicki Moon¹, Ali Shokri¹

1. Waikato University, New Zealand

4 5

6 Abstract

7 Saturated hydraulic conductivity (Ks) is a crucial parameter that influences water flow in saturated 8 soils, with applications in various fields such as surface water runoff, soil erosion, drainage, and 9 solute transport. However, accurate estimation of *Ks* is challenging due to temporal and spatial 10 uncertainties. This study addresses the knowledge gap regarding the long-term behaviour of Ks in 11 sandy soils with less than 10% fine particles. The research investigates the changes in Ks over a 12 long period of constant head tests and examines the factors influencing its variation. Two sandy 13 samples were tested using a hydraulic conductivity cell, and the hydraulic head and discharge were 14 recorded for over 50 days. The results show a general decline in Ks throughout the test, except for 15 brief periods of increase. Furthermore, the relationship between flow rate and hydraulic head gradient does not follow the expected linear correlation from Darcy's law, highlighting the complex 16 17 nature of sandy soil hydraulic conductivity. The investigation of soil properties in three different 18 sections of the samples before and after the tests revealed a decrease in the percentage of fine 19 particles and a shift in specific gravity from the bottom to the top of the sample, suggesting particle 20 migration along the flow direction. Factors such as clogging by fine particles and pore pressure 21 variation contribute to the changes in Ks. The implications of this study have far-reaching effects on 22 various geotechnical engineering applications. These include groundwater remediation, 23 geotechnical stability analysis, and drainage system design. 24 Keywords: Saturated hydraulic conductivity, constant head test, clogging, sandy soil, drainable

25 pores

26 **1. Introduction**

27 The saturated hydraulic conductivity (*Ks*) plays a crucial role in determining the water flow rate 28 within the saturated zone of soils. This parameter is essential in various fields of study, including 29 surface water runoff, soil erosion, deep percolation, drainage, crop simulation models, and solute

30 transport (Ben-Hur et al., 2009; Boadu, 2000; Hwang et al., 2017; Suleiman & Ritchie, 2001). Using

31 the Darcy equation, *Ks* can be defined as the ratio of water flow (*Q*) in the unit section of saturated

- 32 soil (*A*) to the hydraulic gradient (*i*). The parameter *Ks* is present in the majority of equations
- 33 related to water flow in a saturated medium, yet its estimation can be challenging both in the
- 34 laboratory and the field due to temporal and spatial uncertainties (Suleiman & Ritchie, 2001).

35 Laboratory estimations of *Ks* utilise three standard methods: constant head, falling head, and

36 constant flow rate, as detailed in ASTM D5856-15 (2015). When dealing with granular and

disturbed samples containing less than 10% of fine particles passing 75 μm or No. 200 sieve, the

recommended approach is the constant head method, as outlined in ASTM D2434-19 (2019).

39 Conversely, samples comprising more than 10% of fine particles can be analysed using any of the

40 three mentioned methods. However, *Ks* measurements are conducted using a rigid-wall,

41 compaction-mold permeameter, with specific criteria provided in ASTM D5856 (2015).

42 Extensive research has been conducted on the long-term variations of hydraulic conductivity in 43 low-permeability soils, which are commonly employed in landfill sites and artificial wetlands. From 44 the perspective of an Earth scientist, these materials might be perceived as loose sediment or 45 deposits rather than the conventional 'soil,' which typically encompasses a mixture of inorganic and 46 organic constituents. In landfills, leachate, and artificial wetlands, contaminated water from roads 47 needs to be contained to gradually remove the pollutants from the water and prevent pollution of 48 underground water resources (Fang et al., 2022; Li et al., 2023; Shaver, 2020; Touze-Foltz et al., 49 2006; Valencia-González et al., 2022; W. Wang et al., 2023). Therefore, the application of a layer 50 with very low permeability is necessary to reduce the infiltration of contaminated water into the 51 soil while simultaneously eliminating pollutants. Several studies have shown that the Ks in low 52 permeability soil samples change with infiltration of the water that contains chemical or biological 53 agents (Francisca & Glatstein, 2010; Liu & Liu, 2020; Lu et al., 2020; Montoro & Francisca, 2010).

Chemical substances present in the fluid can create a chemical imbalance and interfere with ion exchange processes in the soil, leading to fluctuations in *Ks*. According to a study conducted by Jo et al. (2005), a 3-year test observed a tenfold variation in *Ks* of a clay liner permeated by leachatecontaining chemical agents. In their tests, the hydraulic conductivity of one of the samples reached stability after about 1.5 years of the test. On the other hand, the formation of microorganisms and the presence of nutrients to feed them can cause clogging in the soil and, hence, a reduction in the drainable pores and *Ks* (Fang et al., 2022; VanGulck & Rowe, 2004).

In sandy soils, the duration of the test is usually relatively short. It is commonly assumed that the
test can be concluded when four samples yield values within ±25% of the mean calculated from

63 these four samples throughout the test (ASTM D5856-15, 2015). Also, there is no reference to the 64 length of the test in ASTM D2434-19 (2019). However, several studies suggest that the hydraulic conductivity of sandy soils can change over time. For example, there has been extensive research on 65 66 the variation of hydraulic conductivity in groundwater artificial recharge (Konikow et al., 2001; 67 Mays & Hunt, 2005; Siriwardene et al., 2007; Song et al., 2020; Ye et al., 2019). Vanderzalm et al. (2020) and Du et al. (2018) subjected sandy samples to water permeation containing suspended 68 69 solids and Fe (III) ions, respectively, for an extended period (40 days in the former case and seven 70 days in the latter study), leading to observed fluctuations in Ks that demonstrate a prevalent 71 declining pattern over time. These studies identified physical and biological clogging mechanisms 72 as dominant factors for Ks variation. However, neither of the above studies has tested a sample 73 permeated with distilled water or tap water with minimum suspended solids or chemicals to 74 ensure that Ks remains constant under minimum influent contamination. Du et al. (2013) and Z. 75 Wang Et al. (2012) used tap water with and without suspended solids in a constant head test on 76 quartz sand samples and observed a noticeable drop in Ks over four days. Siriwardene et al. (2007) 77 also reported a reduction in the Ks when the sample was permeated with tap water containing 78 suspended solids. They noticed clogging of the suspended solids in the lower section of the sample 79 as the main reason for the noticeable drop in the Ks, whereas Z. Wang et al. (2012) showed that 80 finer suspended solids could travel deeper in the sample and cause blockage of the drainable pores.

81 Clogging can also be caused by the internal mobilisation or swelling of fine particles in the soil 82 (Jeong et al., 2018a; Konikow et al., 2001; Mohan et al., 1993; Torkzaban et al., 2015). Additionally, 83 clay minerals like *Illite, Kaolinite,* and *Montmorillonite* can be washed with water, leading to the 84 blockage of drainable pores in the sample and a reduction in Ks (Cihan et al., 2022; Jeong et al., 85 2018a; Y. Wang et al., 2021). Stormwater management devices like artificial soakage basins and 86 soak pits are commonly recommended in new urban developments with high infiltration rates 87 (Shaver, 2020). Furthermore, with the widespread use of artificial groundwater recharge, the long-88 term behaviour of Ks in sandy materials gains significant importance. Variations in Ks and pore 89 blockages can profoundly influence the effectiveness of design strategies employed in stormwater 90 management and groundwater recharge scenarios.

Currently, there is a lack of research focusing on the extended-duration variations in *Ks* within
sandy soils due to fluctuating hydraulic levels. Observing *Ks* over the long term provides insights
into the sustained groundwater movement within the aquifer, with changes in hydraulic levels
indicating shifts in aquifer water levels during and after rainfall events. This study aims to bridge
the knowledge gap regarding the prolonged behaviour of hydraulic conductivity in sandy soils.

- 96 Although various research has explored short-term *Ks* variations, particularly in the context of
- 97 stormwater management devices, a comprehensive understanding of how Ks evolves over extended
- 98 timeframes remains limited. Grasping the long-term behaviour of *Ks* holds critical significance for
- 99 the effectiveness of soakage systems and safeguarding subsurface water resources. Thus, this paper
- 100 illuminates the key factors shaping *Ks* variations over prolonged periods.

101 2. Materials

109

102 **2.1.** Sample source and physical properties

- 103 The soil examined in this study is river sand, commercially referred to as pit sand, often employed
- 104 for embankments and raised areas like pathways. The pit sand used for this investigation
- 105 originated from sand quarries situated in Ngahinapouri and Te Kowhai, located along the Waipa
- 106 River in Waikato, New Zealand, as depicted in Figure 1. For this study, two samples (sample *A* and
- sample *B*) were taken from the same batch of pit sand provided by a supplier. Sample *B* was used as
- 108 a replication in this research.



Figure 1- The geographical location of the Waipa River in New Zealand, with the samples originating
 from sand quarries located near the Waipa riverbanks.

- 112 Table 1 outlines the physical properties of the samples. Upon microscopic examination and particle
- separation, five distinct groups are discerned (Figure 2): quartz and feldspar (approximately 60%),
- 114 pumice (approximately 11%), colourful particles (approximately 6%), magnetics (approximately
- 115 10%), and glass shards (approximately 13%). The magnetic minerals were isolated through
- 116 magnetic separation. X-ray diffraction (XRD) analysis was employed to assess mineral composition,
- 117 while the loss on ignition (LOI) method was utilised to estimate the presence of organic material in
- the samples. The analysis of XRD data peak patterns confirms that quartz and feldspar constitute
- the majority of minerals in the sample (Figure 3).
- 120 A laser diffractometer (Malvern Mastersizer 3000) was used to determine the particle size
- 121 distribution of the samples. For this study, the particles below 75 μm were considered as fines,
- 122 which aligns with the classification of ASTM for fine and coarse particles (ASTM D2487, 2020). The
- 123 particle size distribution results indicate that the samples are primarily sandy, with less than 10%
- 124 of fine materials. Particles below 5 μm were considered mobile colloidal particles (Kretzschmar et
- al., 1999), and the percentages of these particles are also mentioned in Table 1. Based on Standard
- Proctor tests (ASTM, 2012), the optimal compaction moisture of the samples was determined to be12%.
- 128

Table 1- Properties of	tested samples
------------------------	----------------

Parameter	Sample A	Sample B
Specific gravity of grains	2.6739	-
Specific surface (m ² /kg)	84.60	102.90
Particles < 5 μm (%)	2.3	2.6
Particles 5-75 μm (%)	5.06	5.83
Particles > 75 μm (%)	92.61	91.56
Dry density (g/cm³)	1.289	1.261
Optimal gravimetric compaction moisture (%)	12	12
Sample gravimetric moisture (%)*	8.1	11.8
Organic matter	1.7%	1.7%

129 * Sample gravimetric moisture was measured when the sample was compacted in the mould. A

130 small amount of sample A and B was taken and dried in the oven, and moisture was measured.





133

Figure 2- Separation of particles under microscope: (a) Quartz and feldspar, (b) Pumice, (c), glass shards, and (d) colourful minerals



134

Figure 3- XRD analysis of the sample: Major peaks are related to the quartz and feldspar content in the
 sample

137 2.2. Sample preparation

138 Prior to conducting the tests, the samples underwent a preparation process that involved drying in 139 an oven at 105°C for 24 hours and passing through a 2 mm sieve. The moist tamping method was 140 used to prepare the samples, which is based on a technique described by Ladd (1978). This method 141 allows for achieving a uniform distribution of density in the sample. A specific amount of soil was 142 weighed, and distilled water was sprayed onto the samples to attain an initial moisture content of 143 8.1% (Sample A) and 11.8% (Sample B). The choice of 8.1% moisture for sample A was intended to 144 explore the influence of initial compaction moisture on the extended-term variations of Ks. The 145 samples were then covered and left for approximately 24 hours to achieve moisture balance before

- 146 testing. The samples were compacted in a constant head test cell with an interior diameter and
- height of 76.2 *mm* and 292 *mm*, respectively. Compaction was carried out in layers of 12 *mm*. Before
- 148 the compaction, subsamples were taken to measure the actual moisture, particle size distribution,
- and XRD. The final dry density of the samples was calculated from the net dry soil used and
- 150 compacted sample volume and listed in The soil examined in this study is river sand, commercially
- 151 referred to as pit sand, often employed for embankments and raised areas like pathways. The pit
- 152 sand used for this investigation originated from sand quarries situated in Ngahinapouri and Te
- 153 Kowhai, located along the Waipa River in Waikato, New Zealand, as depicted in Figure 1. For this
- 154 study, two samples (sample *A* and sample *B*) were taken from the same batch of pit sand provided
- 155 by a supplier. Sample *B* was used as a replication in this research.



Figure 1- The geographical location of the Waipa River in New Zealand, with the samples originating
 from sand quarries located near the Waipa riverbanks.

- 159 Table 1 outlines the physical properties of the samples. Upon microscopic examination and particle
- 160 separation, five distinct groups are discerned (Figure 2): quartz and feldspar (approximately 60%),
- 161 pumice (approximately 11%), colourful particles (approximately 6%), magnetics (approximately
- 162 10%), and glass shards (approximately 13%). The magnetic minerals were isolated through

163 magnetic separation. X-ray diffraction (XRD) analysis was employed to assess mineral composition,

- 164 while the loss on ignition (LOI) method was utilised to estimate the presence of organic material in
- 165 the samples. The analysis of XRD data peak patterns confirms that quartz and feldspar constitute
- 166 the majority of minerals in the sample (Figure 3).

167 A laser diffractometer (Malvern Mastersizer 3000) was used to determine the particle size

- 168 distribution of the samples. For this study, the particles below 75 μ m were considered as fines,
- 169 which aligns with the classification of ASTM for fine and coarse particles (ASTM D2487, 2020). The
- particle size distribution results indicate that the samples are primarily sandy, with less than 10%
- 171 of fine materials. Particles below 5 μm were considered mobile colloidal particles (Kretzschmar et
- al., 1999), and the percentages of these particles are also mentioned in Table 1. Based on Standard
- 173 Proctor tests (ASTM, 2012), the optimal compaction moisture of the samples was determined to be
- 174 12%.

175 Table 1.

- 176 To achieve saturation, the samples were first connected to a vacuum pump for one hour. Distilled
- and de-aired water was then introduced into the test cell in an upward direction, following the
- 178 procedure outlined in ASTM D2434-19 (ASTM, 2019), to minimise air entrapment. The samples
- were left saturated overnight to reduce the chances of air entrapment further.

180 **3. Methods**

181 **3.1.** Constant head hydraulic conductivity tests

182The schematic experimental apparatus used for the constant head hydraulic conductivity test is183shown in Figure 4. The adjustable water head tank enabled the alteration of the hydraulic head184during the experiment without the need to terminate the test. In addition, there were porous disks185with a 1 *mm* mesh size and a spring on top to hold the sample stable in the cell. The mesh size of the186porous disk was selected in a way to prevent the formation of clogging and pressure drops on the187disk.



Figure 4-Schematic constant head hydraulic conductivity apparatus-(1) Water tank, (2) overflow outlet, (3)
 water supply hose, (4) adjustable level board, (5) ruler, (6) water entrance valve, (7) piezometer 1, (8)
 piezometer 2, (9) piezometer 3, (10) water outlet, (11) scale for measuring the discharge

192 The water flow and head gradient were measured at least thrice daily. The collection of effluent in a

193 bucket was carried out for each flow measurement, and the duration of the effluent collection was

194 recorded. Subsequently, the discharge was calculated by dividing the weight of the collected

195 effluent by the collection duration.

196 The tests were conducted in a back-and-forth pattern with water heads ranging from 963 *mm* to

197 1765 *mm*, with increments and decrements of approximately 200 *mm*. The hydraulic head began at

a minimum of 963 *mm* and was incrementally increased by around 200 *mm* until it reached a

199 maximum of 1765 *mm*. Subsequently, the head followed the same pattern of decrease in sequential

200 steps. The testing period has lasted for approximately 53 days. Detailed information on the test

201 numbers, hydraulic heads, and durations can be found in **Error! Reference source not found.**.

2	Λ	2
2	υ	2

188

Table 2- Hydraulic Head and Durations of Constant Head Tests on Samples A and B

Test Number	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10			
Hydraulic head	963	1163	1365	1558	1765	1558	1365	1163	963	Varies			
(mm)	200	1100	1000	1000	1700	1000	1000	1100	700	Varies			
Sample A Duration	5	5	5	5	6	6	6	5	3	7	6	7	1
(days)		0	0	0	5	0		U U		*			

Sample B Duration	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	21	N / A
(days)	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	51	N/A

During the testing process, the pressure and discharge readings were recorded simultaneously by three piezometers. As depicted in Figure 4, the pressure inside the sample was measured by two piezometers located at points 7 and 8, while the piezometer at point 9 measured the water head at the discharge point on the opposite end of the cell.

- After completing test 9 on sample *A*, the water flow was not stopped, and a moderately rapid
- 209 constant head test was conducted using the same hydraulic heads as tests 1 to 9. This test,
- 210 designated as "Test 10", lasted approximately 16 hours, with each constant head being run for
- about 2 hours. The purpose of Test 10 was to observe any changes in *Ks* under a shorter duration
- and to determine if the *Ks* during the head-increasing stage were similar to the reciprocal *Ks* during
- the head-decreasing stage.
- In the case of sample *B*, test 9 was allowed to run for 31 days at the minimum head (963 *mm*) after an increasing trend in the *Ks* of the sample was observed from day 53 onwards. The purpose was to determine how long the *Ks* would continue to change and whether it would return to a value similar
- to the beginning of the test.
- 218 In order to examine changes in soil properties during the test, the samples were recovered from the
- 219 hydraulic conductivity cell. After extraction, the samples were divided into three sections: bottom,
- 220 middle, and top. Subsequently, particle size distribution and specific gravity measurements were
- conducted on these sub-samples to assess any variations resulting from the test.

222 **4. Results**

223 4.1. Long-term Ks Tests

The long-term change in *Ks* calculated for both samples is illustrated in Figure 5. The *Ks* values of the samples showed a general decline throughout the tests, as shown in Figure 5, except for three brief periods. These periods occurred between days 36 to 38 for sample *A* and between days 0 to 1 and 37 to 40 for sample *B*.

- Furthermore, there are two distinct periods of a noticeable increase in *Ks* in both samples, which
- coincide closely in timing, specifically between days 35 and 40. In sample *A*, the increase in *Ks* starts
- at 1365 *mm* head and ends at the same head in Figure 5a. However, in sample *B*, *Ks* starts

- increasing at 1163 *mm* head and starts decreasing again at 963 *mm* head in Figure 5b. There is no
- clear answer to why *Ks* increases in the mentioned periods in the samples. At the end of the tests,
- the final *Ks* values for samples *A* and *B* were 96% and 91% lower than their maximum, respectively.
- The initial moisture levels (8.1% for sample A and 11.8% for sample B) appear to have had limited
- influence on the extended-term variation of *Ks*. However, they might have played a role in the initial
- stages of permeation. Figure 5 illustrates that sample *A* achieved its maximum *Ks* within the first
- 237 few hours of commencing the test. In contrast, sample *B* took approximately two days to reach its
- 238 peak *Ks*.
- Also, throughout the head increase cycle, a notable pattern emerges: at the onset of each hydraulic
- 240 head increment, there is a marginal uptick in *Ks*, which is subsequently followed by a sustained
- 241 decrease. This minor elevation in *Ks* can be attributed to the abrupt rise in the hydraulic head.



Figure 5- Changes of Ks over time for samples A (a) & B (b)- the generally reducing trend in Ks is
 noticeable in both samples

245 4.2. Flow-head gradient relationship

In the hypothetical scenario, where the samples remained unchanged throughout the tests, Darcy's law would anticipate the clustering of all data points at each hydraulic head increment around a single point, forming a unified line. Figure 6 illustrates the relationship between flow rate (Q) and hydraulic head gradient (i) within samples A and B across varying hydraulic head levels. The symbol "R" signifies the period characterised by a decreasing head. The scatterplots demonstrate

the absence of a straightforward linear correlation between Q and i.



Figure 6: Scatterplots exploring the correlation between head gradient and flow rate in samples A
 and B with different hydraulic head levels. The symbol "R" signifies the period characterised by a
 decreasing hydraulic head.

256 In the case of sample A, during test phases 1 to 4, wherein the head is incrementally raised every 5 257 or 6 days from 963 to 1765 mm, a decrease in flow accompanied by an increase in head gradient 258 becomes evident. Interestingly, even within each step, the scatterplot does not exhibit the expected 259 convergence around a single point, as outlined by Darcy's law. This suggests a dynamic nature of 260 the sample during this period, with the hydraulic conductivity undergoing continuous changes. 261 However, test 5, characterised by the maximum head of 1765 mm and a 5-day observation period, 262 showcases a remarkable consistency in both head gradient and flow rate, implying a phase of 263 stability.

Furthermore, as the head is reduced to 1558mm, this stability persists, with the scatterplot points clustering around a single location and both flow rate and head gradient diminishing. On the contrary, during tests 7 to 9, where the head drops from 1365 to 963 mm, the scatterplot points display unpredictable distribution, deviating significantly from the expectations of Darcy's law. This observation indicates a departure from the anticipated behaviour of the sample.

- In sample B, the initial test with a head of 963 mm shows an unexpected trend where both the head
- 270 gradient and flow rate increase, deviating from the expected convergence around a single point. As
- we move through tests 2 to 4, involving a hydraulic head increase from 1163 to 1558 mm, a distinct
- behaviour emerges: despite the elevated hydraulic head, the head gradient rises while the flow rate
- 273 unexpectedly drops. This pattern suggests a shift in the hydraulic properties of the samples.

- Nevertheless, when the hydraulic head is raised to 1765 mm and subsequently reduced to 1163
- 275 mm over four 5-day intervals, the sample aligns somewhat better with the predictions of Darcy's
- law. Data points cluster more closely around a central location, and the flow rate responds to
- 277 changes in the hydraulic head. However, variations still exist at each step. In contrast, at the lowest
- head level of 963 mm, there's an increase in head gradient while the flow rate remains stable.

279 **4.3.** Sample A behaviour in a relatively short-duration test

Test 10 was carried out to ensure that the variations in *Ks* and *Q-i* relation are not noticeable in the short term. In this test, the sample exhibited a distinct behaviour compared to the other tests. The test involved subjecting the sample to a cycle of increasing and decreasing hydraulic heads, similar to the previous tests, but for a shorter period of approximately 16 hours.

Interestingly, this relatively quick test demonstrated a strong linear correlation between the water flux and the gradient within the sample, as expected by the Darcy law. The hydraulic conductivity was determined to be 7×10^{-7} *m/s* during the increasing stage of the test head and 8×10^{-7} *m/s* during the decreasing stage. The correlation between *Q* and *i* is illustrated in Figure 7. Contrary to Figure 6, a notably stronger correlation between *Q* and *i* can be observed.



Figure 7- The relationship between Q and i in test 10 for sample A, where the gradients are varied. The
 blue and orange arrows represent the periods of increasing and decreasing test heads, respectively.

292 4.4. Extending the sample B in the minimum constant head for 31 days

293 Test B has been extended for an additional 31-day period under the minimum head condition (963

- 294 mm). This extension aims to investigate whether hydraulic conductivity comes into stability
- 295 without any disruptions.

Figure 8(a) depicts the correlation between flow rate and head gradient during this period. The *Q-i*correlation exhibits unpredictable fluctuations in both hydraulic gradient and flow rate, mirroring
the patterns observed in the preceding 45 days, as shown in Figure 6.

- 299 The temporal evolution of *Ks* is visually outlined in Figure 8(b). The variability of *Ks* spans from
- 300 1.25×10⁻⁴ m/s to 0.5×10⁻⁴ m/s, centring around a median value of 1.0×10-4 mm. In summary, the
- 301 continuation of the testing procedure with a consistent hydraulic head maintained over the course

302 of 31 days does not result in the stabilisation of the hydraulic conductivity of the sample. The *Ks*

303 values persistently oscillate within a range of +33% and -46% around the median value, thereby

- 304 underscoring the absence of stability in the system. However, a decreasing trend is absent in
- 305 contrast to previous observation periods.



306

Figure 8- (a) The relationship between Q and i for sample B during an extended period (31 days) of
running test 9 at the minimum hydraulic head. The colour spectrum and arrows depict the temporal
sequence of the measurements. (b) The changes in Ks over time for sample B during the same 31-day
duration of test 9 at the minimum hydraulic head.

4.5. Comparison of soil properties before and after the tests

In order to assess the influence of the constant head test on soil properties, particle size
distribution (PSD) and specific gravity (GS) measurements were performed on both the original soil
samples and different sections of the soil after the test. This investigation aimed to understand how
the test influenced the PSD and density characteristics of the soil samples.

Figure 9 shows the *PSD* of the sample's top, middle, and bottom sections and the original sample prior to the test. Additionally, Table 3 compares the total particles below and above 75 μm for reference. The results in Table 3 indicate that the sample's total percentage of fine particles decreased after the tests. Approximately 2% of fine particles in sample *A* and 1% in sample *B* were washed away during the long-term tests. It is noteworthy that samples *A* and *B* contained less than 9% of fine particles (below 75 μm).



Figure 9- Particle size analysis of the samples (comparison of the samples before tests and after tests,
 divided by sub-samples of different sections)

325

326	Table 3- Comparison of total percentage of particles below and above 64 µm before and after tests
327	divided by different sections in the sample

	Sample A	L			Sample B			
Totals (%)	Original	Bottom	Middle	Тор	Original	Bottom	Middle	Тор
Below 75 μm	7.37	5.09	5.41	5.74	8.42	4.06	6.68	7.63
Above 75 μm	92.61	94.91	94.59	94.26	91.58	95.94	93.32	92.37





Figure 10- Specific gravity of sample A before and after test divided by sub-samples of different 330 sections

331 Figure 9 and Table 3 show that the percentage of fine particles below 75 µm is highest at the top

332 section of the samples, followed by the middle and bottom sections. While the difference in the

333 percentage of fine particles among different sections is minor for sample A (less than 1%), it is

334 higher for sample B (around 3%).

335 *Gs* measurements are presented as a box plot in Figure 10. The box plots illustrate notable changes 336 in the specific gravity of the sample in comparison to the original sample. The lowest Gs is found at

the bottom section of sample A, while the highest *Gs* is observed at the top section, with a slightincrease in the middle section.

339 **5. Discussion**

Examining soil properties in the original sample before and after the constant head test reveals
notable alterations in the soil characteristics. These changes directly impact the hydraulic
conductivity, highlighting the direct influence of the test on soil properties and subsequent
hydraulic behaviour. For example, Figure 5(a & b) demonstrates a prevailing long-term decreasing
trend in *Ks*. However, it is important to note that there are also intermittent shorter periods where *Ks* show an increase. This observation highlights the dynamic nature of the system, wherein both
long-term trends and shorter-term fluctuations in hydraulic conductivity are evident.

The *Ks* tests on the coarse particles (sandy samples with less than 10% fines) are generally short because the variation of *Ks* is very marginal during the first few hours of the tests. For example, in sample *A*, the change of *Ks* during the first 5 hours from starting the test was only 2%, which is negligible. However, after five days, the *Ks* dropped by 40%, and at the end of the test, the *Ks* dropped by around 96% from the beginning of the test.

352 Figure 6 clearly represents the dynamic nature of the samples' hydraulic gradient and pore

353 pressure. These parameters undergo continuous fluctuations without exhibiting a consistent

decreasing or increasing pattern. Even extending the test for a longer period (Figure 8 (a) and (b))

does not create a stable gradient in the sample. Therefore, it can be inferred that the connectivity of

356 the drainable pores is constantly changing. This observation underscores the complex behaviour of

357 the hydraulic system within the samples, emphasising the need to consider the temporal variations

in pore pressure when analysing the overall hydraulic response.

359 The variations in the hydraulic gradient and discharge relation, and hence hydraulic conductivity in 360 the samples, can be attributed to several factors. According to the ASTM standard (ASTM, 2015), air 361 entrapment can potentially reduce hydraulic conductivity. In this research, a primary focus was 362 minimising air entrapment within the sample during saturation. As a result, no visible evidence of 363 air entrapment was observed during the test. The transparent acrylic test cell facilitated direct 364 observation of the sample particles throughout the experiment. The absence of any noticeable 365 formation of air bubbles among the particles from the sides of the samples suggests that air 366 entrapment is unlikely to contribute to the observed reduction in *Ks* in our study.

367 Another factor that can affect the continuous reduction of *Ks* is the blockage of drainable pores with 368 fine particles (Jeong et al., 2018b), which restricts the flow of water and leads to a decrease in the 369 *Ks.* Particle size distribution of the samples (Figure 9) shows that the fine particles in all sections 370 have decreased compared to the original sample prior to the test. Furthermore, there is a decrease 371 in Gs in the top section and an increase in the bottom section (Figure 10). It can be concluded that 372 mobile low-density fine particles (such as fine pumice) have displaced from the bottom of the 373 sample to the top. Another reason for the reduction in the Ks can be related to the continuous 374 blockage of the drainable pores with fine particles with rough surfaces (such as glass shards) or the 375 simultaneous impact of blockage by glass shards and mobilisation and blockage by low-density 376 particles. The SEM image of the sample in Figure 11 shows a noticeable amount of glass shards and 377 pumice in the small section of the sample. Continuous mobilisation or re-deposition of these 378 particles can change the connection of the drainable pores and reduce Ks.



Figure 11- 220x magnification of the sample using SEM providing a closer view of the fine particles in
 the sample

- 382 The ASTM standard for granular soils (ASTM, 2019a) explains the procedure of estimating the *Ks*
- 383 without mentioning the period of carrying out each test. The long-term *Ks* results in Figure 6 show
- a noticeable drop in the *Ks*, and if the test is terminated in a few hours, the resulting *Ks* will be 96%

higher than the final one. Similar results were reported by (Du et al., 2018; Vanderzalm et al., 2020),

when they permeated the sample with a solution containing *Fe (III)* or water with suspended solids.

387 In our research, there was no *Fe (III)* contamination source, and the water used was drinking water

from a tap. Figure 7 demonstrates a robust linear relationship between *Q* and *i* during the

389 increasing and decreasing head phases during short-term testing. However, when comparing this

figure to the long-term tests illustrated in Figure 6, it becomes evident that the *Q-i* relationship

391 varies over time.

392 The long-term variability of hydraulic conductivity holds significant importance for systems

393 enduring extended saturation periods. For instance, artificial soakage basins and soak pits are

394 frequently recommended in the context of stormwater management in new urban developments

395 (Shaver, 2020). These systems gather runoff from urban areas and gradually infiltrate the water

into the ground. A crucial factor in designing these soakage systems is the saturated hydraulic

397 conductivity. However, it's important to note that the testing duration commonly used to assess the

398 *Ks* rate is often short and may not accurately represent the long-term behaviour of hydraulic

399 conductivity. Consequently, it's wise to account for the long-term variation of Ks when reporting Ks

400 values for applications involving soil saturation, such as soakage basins or drainage pipes. This

401 precaution is essential as overestimation could lead to erroneous calculations.

402 6. Conclusion

403 This study provides valuable insights into the variation of hydraulic conductivity in sandy samples 404 through a long-term constant head experiment. The results demonstrate a significant reduction in 405 *Ks*, primarily due to physical clogging caused by fines and pumice particles. The increased 406 concentration of pumice particles in the top section indicates their mobility and potential blockage 407 of drainable pore sections, affecting Ks. These changes were not observed in short-term tests, 408 highlighting the importance of longer-term investigations. The findings stress the need for 409 extended constant head tests to accurately assess and report Ks in sandy samples, enhancing our 410 understanding of their hydraulic behaviour. These findings have practical implications in various 411 geotechnical engineering applications, such as groundwater remediation, landfill design, 412 geotechnical stability analysis, and drainage system design.

413 **7. Acknowledgment**

414 This research was supported by the University of Waikato Doctoral Scholarship.

415 8. Data Availability Statement

416 All data used and generated by this study, including hydraulic head and flow measurements, can be 417 found in <u>PDI-36052</u>.

418 **9. References**

- 419 ASTM. (2019). Standard Test Method for Permeability of Granular Soils (Constant Head)
- 420 (D2434-19). ASTM International, West Conshohocken, PA. https://doi.org/10.1520/D2434-19
- 421 ASTM D2434-19. (2019). Standard Test Method for Permeability of Granular Soils (Constant
- 422 Head). *ASTM International, West Conshohocken, PA*. https://doi.org/10.1520/D2434-19
- 423 ASTM D2487. (2020). Standard Practice for Classification of Soils for Engineering Purposes

424 (Unified Soil Classification System). *ASTM*.

- 425 ASTM D5856-15. (2015). Standard Test Method for Measurement of Hydraulic Conductivity of
- 426 Porous Material Using a Rigid-Wall, Compaction-Mold Permeameter. *ASTM International, West*427 *Conshohocken, PA*.
- 428 Ben-Hur, M., Yolcu, G., Uysal, H., Lado, M., & Paz, A. (2009). Soil structure changes: Aggregate

size and soil texture effects on hydraulic conductivity under different saline and sodic

- 430 conditions. *Australian Journal of Soil Research*. https://doi.org/10.1071/SR09009
- 431 Boadu, F. K. (2000). Hydraulic Conductivity of Soils from Grain-Size Distribution: New Models.
- 432 *Journal of Geotechnical and Geoenvironmental Engineering*, *126*(8), 739–746.

433 https://doi.org/10.1061/(ASCE)1090-0241(2000)126:8(739)

434 Chaneva, J., Kluger, M. O., Moon, V. G., Lowe, D. J., & Orense, R. P. (2023). Monotonic and cyclic

435 undrained behaviour and liquefaction resistance of pumiceous, non-plastic sandy silt. *Soil*

- 436 *Dynamics and Earthquake Engineering, 168, 107825.*
- 437 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.soildyn.2023.107825
- 438 Cihan, A., Petrusak, R., Bhuvankar, P., Alumbaugh, D., Trautz, R., & Birkholzer, J. T. (2022).
- 439 Permeability Decline by Clay Fines Migration around a Low-Salinity Fluid Injection Well.
- 440 *Groundwater*, 60(1), 87–98. https://doi.org/10.1111/gwat.13127
- 441 Du, X., Wang, Z., & Ye, X. (2013). Potential Clogging and Dissolution Effects During Artificial
- 442 Recharge of Groundwater Using Potable Water. *Water Resources Management*, 27(10), 3573–
- 443 3583. https://doi.org/10.1007/S11269-013-0365-5/FIGURES/13

- 444 Du, X., Zhang, H., Ye, X., & Lu, Y. (2018). Flow Velocity Effects on Fe(III) Clogging during
- 445 Managed Aquifer Recharge Using Urban Storm Water. *Water 2018, Vol. 10, Page 358, 10*(4),
- 446 358. https://doi.org/10.3390/W10040358
- 447 Fang, Y., Kong, L., Zhang, P., Zhang, L., Zhao, H., Xiang, X., Cheng, S., Zhang, H., Ju, F., & Li, L.
- 448 (2022). Fifteen-year analysis of constructed wetland clogging: A critical review. *Journal of*
- *Cleaner Production, 365, 132755.*
- 450 https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jclepro.2022.132755
- Francisca, F. M., & Glatstein, D. A. (2010). Long term hydraulic conductivity of compacted soils
 permeated with landfill leachate. *Applied Clay Science*.
- 453 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.clay.2010.05.003
- 454 Hwang, H. T., Jeen, S. W., Suleiman, A. A., & Lee, K. K. (2017). Comparison of saturated
- 455 hydraulic conductivity estimated by three different methods. *Water (Switzerland)*.
- 456 https://doi.org/10.3390/w9120942
- Jeong, H. Y., Jun, S. C., Cheon, J. Y., & Park, M. (2018a). A review on clogging mechanisms and
 managements in aquifer storage and recovery (ASR) applications. *Geosciences Journal*, 22(4),
 667–679. https://doi.org/10.1007/S12303-017-0073-X/METRICS
- Jeong, H. Y., Jun, S.-C., Cheon, J.-Y., & Park, M. (2018b). A review on clogging mechanisms and
 managements in aquifer storage and recovery (ASR) applications. *Geosciences Journal*, 22(4),
 667–679. https://doi.org/10.1007/s12303-017-0073-x
- 463 Jo, H. Y., Benson, C. H., Shackelford, C. D., Lee, J.-M., & Edil, T. B. (2005). Long-Term Hydraulic
- 464 Conductivity of a Geosynthetic Clay Liner Permeated with Inorganic Salt Solutions. *Journal of* 465 *Geotechnical and Geoenvironmental Engineering*. https://doi.org/10.1061/(asce)1090-
- 466 0241(2005)131:4(405)
- 467 Kikkawa, N., Orense, R. P., & Pender, M. J. (2013). Observations on microstructure of pumice
- 468 particles using computed tomography. *Canadian Geotechnical Journal*, *50*(11), 1109–1117.
- 469 https://doi.org/10.1139/cgj-2012-0365
- 470 Konikow, L. F., August, L. L., & Voss, C. I. (2001). Effects of Clay Dispersion on Aquifer Storage
- and Recovery in Coastal Aquifers. *Transport in Porous Media*, 43(1), 45–64.
- 472 https://doi.org/10.1023/A:1010613525547

- 473 Kretzschmar, R., Borkovec, M., Grolimund, D., & Elimelech, M. (1999). *Mobile Subsurface*
- 474 *Colloids and Their Role in Contaminant Transport* (pp. 121–193).
- 475 https://doi.org/10.1016/S0065-2113(08)60427-7
- 476 Ladd, R. (1978). Preparing Test Specimens Using Undercompaction. *Geotechnical Testing*
- 477 *Journal*, 1(1), 16. https://doi.org/10.1520/GTJ10364J
- Li, K., Chen, Y., Ye, W., & Wang, Q. (2023). Modelling the evolution of dual-pore structure for
- 479 compacted clays along hydro-mechanical paths. *Computers and Geotechnics*, *157*, 105308.
- 480 https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.compgeo.2023.105308
- Liu, L., Orense, R., & Pender, M. (2015). Crushing-induced liquefaction characteristics of
 pumice sand. *Proc., Australia-New Zealand Conference on Geomechanics.*
- 483 Liu, Y., & Liu, J. (2020). The BioChemical Clogging of Landfill Leachate Collection System: Based
- 484 on Laboratory Studies. International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health,
- 485 *17*(7), 2299. https://doi.org/10.3390/ijerph17072299
- Lu, H., Wang, C., Li, D., Li, J., & Wan, Y. (2020). Permeability, Pore, and Structural Parameters of
 Undisturbed Silty Clay Presented in Landfill Leachate. *Water, Air, & Soil Pollution, 231*(5), 190.
 https://doi.org/10.1007/s11270-020-04568-0
- Mays, D. C., & Hunt, J. R. (2005). Hydrodynamic Aspects of Particle Clogging in Porous Media.
 Environmental Science & Technology, *39*(2), 577–584. https://doi.org/10.1021/es049367k
- 491 Mohan, K. K., Vaidya, R. N., Reed, M. G., & Fogler, H. S. (1993). Water sensitivity of sandstones
- 492 containing swelling and non-swelling clays. *Colloids and Surfaces A: Physicochemical and*
- 493 Engineering Aspects, 73, 237–254. https://doi.org/10.1016/0927-7757(93)80019-B
- 494 Montoro, M. A., & Francisca, F. M. (2010). Soil Permeability Controlled by Particle-Fluid
- 495 Interaction. *Geotechnical and Geological Engineering*. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10706-010-
- 496 9348-y
- 497 Shaver, E. (2020). Waikato stormwater management guideline.
- 498 Siriwardene, N., Deletic, A., & Fletcher, T. (2007). Clogging of stormwater gravel infiltration
- 499 systems and filters: Insights from a laboratory study. *Water Research*, *41*(7), 1433–1440.
- 500 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.watres.2006.12.040

501 502	Song, W., Liu, X., Zheng, T., & Yang, J. (2020). A review of recharge and clogging in sandstone aquifer. <i>Geothermics, 87</i> , 101857. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.geothermics.2020.101857
503	Suleiman, A. A., & Ritchie, J. T. (2001). Estimating saturated hydraulic conductivity from soil
504	porosity. Transactions of the American Society of Agricultural Engineers.
505	https://doi.org/10.13031/2013.4683
506	Torkzaban, S., Bradford, S. A., Vanderzalm, J. L., Patterson, B. M., Harris, B., & Prommer, H.
507	(2015). Colloid release and clogging in porous media: Effects of solution ionic strength and
508	flow velocity. Journal of Contaminant Hydrology, 181, 161–171.
509	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jconhyd.2015.06.005
510	Touze-Foltz, N., Duquennoi, C., & Gaget, E. (2006). Hydraulic and mechanical behavior of GCLs
511	in contact with leachate as part of a composite liner. <i>Geotextiles and Geomembranes</i> , 24(3),
512	188–197. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.geotexmem.2006.01.004
513	Valencia-González, Y., Quintero-Ramírez, A., & Lara-Valencia, L. A. (2022). A laboratory
514	methodology for predicting variations in the geotechnical parameters of soil exposed to solid
515	waste leachates in the field. <i>Results in Engineering</i> , 14, 100398.
516	https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.rineng.2022.100398
517	Vanderzalm, J. L., Page, D. W., Barry, K. E., & Gonzalez, D. (2020). Evaluating Treatment
518	Requirements for Recycled Water to Manage Well Clogging during Aquifer Storage and
519	Recovery: A Case Study in the Werribee Formation, Australia. Water 2020, Vol. 12, Page 2575,
520	12(9), 2575. https://doi.org/10.3390/W12092575
521	VanGulck, J. F., & Rowe, R. K. (2004). Evolution of clog formation with time in columns
522	permeated with synthetic landfill leachate. Journal of Contaminant Hydrology.
523	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jconhyd.2004.06.001
524	Wang, W., Dong, L., Zhai, T., Wang, W., Wu, H., Kong, F., Cui, Y., & Wang, S. (2023). Bio-clogging
525	mitigation in constructed wetland using microbial fuel cells with novel hybrid air-
526	photocathode. Science of The Total Environment, 881, 163423.
527	https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2023.163423
528	Wang, Y., Yu, M., Bo, Z., Bedrikovetsky, P., & Le-Hussain, F. (2021). Effect of temperature on
529	mineral reactions and fines migration during low-salinity water injection into Berea

- 530 sandstone. *Journal of Petroleum Science and Engineering*, *202*, 108482.
- 531 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.petrol.2021.108482
- 532 Wang, Z., Du, X., Yang, Y., & Ye, X. (2012). Surface clogging process modeling of suspended
- 533 solids during urban stormwater aquifer recharge. *Journal of Environmental Sciences*, 24(8),
- 534 1418–1424. https://doi.org/10.1016/S1001-0742(11)60961-3
- 535 Ye, X., Cui, R., Du, X., Ma, S., Zhao, J., Lu, Y., & Wan, Y. (2019). Mechanism of Suspended Kaolinite
- 536 Particle Clogging in Porous Media During Managed Aquifer Recharge. *Groundwater*, 57(5),
- 537 764–771. https://doi.org/10.1111/gwat.12872