### What is the Altitude of Thermal Equilibrium?

William K. Peterson<sup>1</sup>, Naomi Maruyama<sup>2</sup>, Phil G. Richards<sup>3</sup>, Philip J Erickson<sup>4</sup>, Andrew B Christensen<sup>5</sup>, and Andrew Yau<sup>6</sup>

<sup>1</sup>University of Colorado Boulder <sup>2</sup>University of Colorado <sup>3</sup>George Mason University <sup>4</sup>Massachusetts Institute of Technology <sup>5</sup>Dixie State University <sup>6</sup>University of Calgary

January 17, 2023

#### Abstract

Thermal equilibrium in planetary atmospheres occurs at altitudes where the ion, electron, and neutral temperatures are equal. Thermal equilibrium is postulated to occur in the collision-dominated lower ionosphere. This postulated altitude is above the lower boundary of all empirical models of planetary ionospheres. Physics-based model predictions of the altitude can not be validated due to a lack of adequate simultaneous observations of temperature profiles. This study presents temperature profiles from simultaneous observations on Atmosphere Explorer–C below 140 km and quiet-time neutral observations from TIMED/GUVI over Millstone Hill. These are compared with profiles from physics-based models with a discussion of their respective limitations. We conclude that there does not yet exist a quantitative understanding of the ion, electron, and neutral thermalization processes in low-altitude planetary ionospheres. Progress on this topic requires an adequate database of simultaneous ion, electron, and temperature profiles in the 110 to 140 km altitude range.

#### Hosted file

953393\_0\_art\_file\_10590004\_rt1tfw.docx available at https://authorea.com/users/550834/ articles/618227-what-is-the-altitude-of-thermal-equilibrium

# 1 What is the Altitude of Thermal Equilibrium?

- 2 3
  - W.K. Peterson<sup>1†</sup>, Naomi Maruyama<sup>1</sup>, Phil Richards<sup>2†</sup>, Philip J. Erickson<sup>3</sup>, Andrew B.
- 4 Christensen<sup>4†</sup>, and Andrew W. Yau<sup>5</sup>
- 5
- 6 1: LASP, University of Colorado, Boulder
- 7 2: George Mason University, Fairfax Virgina
- 8 3: Haystack Observatory, Massachusetts Institute of Technology, 99 Millstone Road, Westford
- 9 MA
- 10 4: Aerospace Corporation Retired, 2350 East El Segundo Blvd, El Segnundo CA
- 11 5: University of Calgary, Calgary, Alberta Canada
- 12 †: Retired

## 13 Key Points:

14

20

- Thermal equilibrium is postulated to be attained at the lowest altitude heated by photoelectrons.
- Quantitative understanding of thermal equilibrium requires observations that validate models.
   There is an ongoing community need for simultaneous neutral, ion, and electron
  - 3. There is an ongoing community need for simultaneous neutral, ion, and electron temperature profiles below 140 km altitude.

### 21 Abstract

Thermal equilibrium in planetary atmospheres occurs at altitudes where the ion, electron, and neutral temperatures are equal. Thermal equilibrium is postulated to occur in the collision-

- 23 and neutral temperatures are equal. Thermal equilibrium is postulated to occur in the collision-24 dominated lower ionosphere. This postulated altitude is above the lower boundary of all
- 24 dominated lower lonosphere. This postulated altitude is above the lower boundary of all 25 empirical models of planetary ionospheres. Physics-based model predictions of the altitude can
- 26 not be validated due to a lack of adequate simultaneous observations of temperature profiles.
- 27 This study presents temperature profiles from simultaneous observations on Atmosphere
- 28 Explorer–C below 140 km and quiet-time neutral observations from TIMED/GUVI over
- 29 Millstone Hill. These are compared with profiles from physics-based models with a discussion of
- 30 their respective limitations. We conclude that there does not yet exist a quantitative
- 31 understanding of the ion, electron, and neutral thermalization processes in low-altitude planetary
- 32 ionospheres. Progress on this topic requires an adequate database of simultaneous ion, electron,
- and temperature profiles in the 110 to 140 km altitude range.

### 34 Introduction

- 35 The sub-auroral / mid- and low- latitude ionosphere is primarily created by the
- 36 photoionization of neutral atmospheric gases by solar EUV and soft X-ray radiation below 120
- 37 nm. Approximately half the solar EUV energy is deposited in the ion states, and the remainder is
- 38 carried by energetic photoelectrons. Much of the chemical energy deposited in the ions by
- 39 photoionization leads to the heating of neutral particles through chemical reactions (Richards,
- 40 2012). Since the amount of heating per neutral gas particle increases with altitude, the neutral gas

41 temperature also increases with altitude until it is ultimately limited by downward heat

42 conduction.

43 44 Quantitatively understanding the production and thermalization of photoelectrons has 45 been a goal of space physicists since the dawn of the space age (for recent perspectives, see 46 Peterson 2021 and Richards 2022). Photoelectrons are a significant source of ionization 47 throughout the ionosphere, and they become the dominant ionization source below about 180 km 48 altitude, as the softer EUV component is increasingly attenuated by absorption. The 49 photoelectrons lose their energy in a cascade process involving the excitation and ionization of 50 neutral species, and they eventually join the thermal electron population. At low energies, the 51 photoelectrons heat the existing thermal electron population. Then, the thermal electrons lose 52 their energy to the ions and neutrals. As a result, thermal electrons are usually hotter than ions, 53 which are hotter than the neutrals. However, at low enough altitudes, where the neutral density is 54 so much greater than that of the ions and electrons, cooling rates are so high that the ion, 55 electron, and neutral temperatures are expected to be practically equal; i.e., in thermal equilibrium.

56 57

58 Below the altitude of thermal equilibrium, photoelectrons continue to be produced and 59 thermalized. The resulting electron temperature in this collision-dominated environment will be 60 slightly higher than the ion and neutral temperatures, but these temperature differences are 61 beyond any realistic measurement capability. Indeed, even at night, EUV emissions from stars, 62 galaxies, and sunlight resonantly scattered from the upper atmosphere generate small numbers of 63 photoelectrons.

64

65 Photochemical equilibrium, where ions and electrons recombine locally and the different 66 ion and neutral species undergo charge exchange reactions to attain chemical equilibrium, is well-known to occur below about 200 km altitude on Earth at solar minimum. This has been 67 68 confirmed by numerous satellite measurements. On the other hand, thermal equilibrium, where 69 the neutral, ion, and electron temperatures are approximately equal, is postulated to occur at 70 some altitude below ~140 km on Earth and Mars. As discussed below, both planets have a 71 relative lack of in-situ observations in this critical region. The altitude of thermal equilibrium delineates where energy input to the neutral atmosphere from solar EUV irradiance is small 72 73 relative to the heat capacity of the thermospheric neutral gas. Below this altitude, neutrals can be 74 heated by other processes, including gravity waves and solar UV absorption. Another low-75 altitude heat source is atomic oxygen produced in the thermosphere by photodissociation of O<sub>2</sub>. 76 The atomic oxygen so produced cannot recombine in the thermosphere, and it diffuses down to 77 the mesosphere, where it recombines into  $O_2$  via 3-body reactions that release energy. The 78 energy exchange processes determining the neutral temperature at the mesopause (~80 km on 79 Earth) and above is a topic of current community interest (e.g., Sarris et al. 2020, Heelis and 80 Maute 2020, Palmroth et al. 2021, and Jones et al. 2022).

81

82 Systematically investigating and modeling the processes that heat neutrals above the 83 mesopause and below the altitude of thermal equilibrium requires a robust understanding of the 84 upper boundary conditions, such as ion, electron, and neutral temperature profiles in the 110-130 85 km range. Thus, to understand neutral heating at these altitudes, the altitude of thermal

86 equilibrium must be well defined. Currently, the established heat equation formalism is used to

quantify the relationships between the heating and cooling processes and to predict the thermal
equilibrium altitude (e.g., see Schunk and Nagy, 2009; Kelley, 2009; and Matta et al., 2014).

- 90 This paper is focused on assessing our quantitative understanding of the highest altitude 91 below which thermal equilibrium occurs. Despite over 60 years of observations, model 92 predictions of the altitudes where thermal equilibrium occurs have not been validated because 93 there is not an adequate database of simultaneous electron, ion, and neutral temperatures in the 94 collision-dominated environment of the lower ionospheres of planetary atmospheres. We have 95 been unable to find published observations of the altitude of thermal equilibrium in the 96 atmospheres of Earth or Mars. Simultaneous in-situ observations of the electron, ion, and neutral 97 temperature profiles below 140 km on Earth and Mars are limited to the small number of 98 intervals where the Atmosphere Explorer-C (AE-C; Dalgarno et al. 1973) and the Mars 99 Atmosphere and Volatile Evolution (MAVEN; Jakosky et al. 2015) satellites were driven into 100 unstable low orbits for intervals of a few days. Both the AE-C and MAVEN satellites used 101 onboard propulsion to drive the perigee altitude down and back up from these unstable orbits.
- 102

103 A literature search has not revealed any publications presenting simultaneous altitude 104 profiles of the electron, ion, and neutral temperatures from AE-C. However, there are archived 105 data of AE-C that have simultaneous neutral, ion, and electron temperature profiles. Two 106 examples are presented below. Surprisingly, there are more observations of simultaneous low-107 altitude ion, electron, and neutral temperature profiles at Mars from the MAVEN satellite 108 compared with those on Earth. Analysis of the Mars temperature profiles at altitudes below 140 109 km have demonstrated: 1) That MAVEN data are not consistent with a plasma characterized by 110 electrons in thermal equilibrium with the neutral population above 100 km (Peterson et al. 2020) 111 and 2). The source of energy maintaining high ion temperatures at low altitudes on Mars has not 112 been identified (Hanley et al. 2021). Further analysis by Ergun et al. (2021) shows that CO<sub>2</sub> 113 excitation/de-excitation of its lowest-energy vibrational states dominates energy transfer to and 114 from electrons. Additionally, Andersson et al. (2019) have detected an unexpected and 115 unexplained electron temperature spike in the lower dynamo region of the Mars ionosphere. We 116 are unsure if features such as those found in the lower ionosphere of Mars exist in the Earth's 117 ionosphere since there is not an adequate database of simultaneous electron, ion, and neutral 118 temperature profiles.

119

120 On Earth, ground-based incoherent/collective Thomson radar scattering facilities 121 routinely obtain altitude profiles of electron and ion temperatures (e.g., Mahajan, 1967, Evans 1969). However, there are significantly fewer published altitude profiles of the neutral 122 123 temperature. Most of the published neutral temperature altitude profiles are obtained from scans 124 of far ultraviolet radiances observed on the Earth's limb (e.g., Meier et al. 2015). We could not 125 find any publications presenting neutral temperature profiles extending below 200 km obtained 126 over an operating incoherent scatter radar. However, Zhang et al. (2005) presented and analyzed neutral temperature profiles obtained by the TIMED/GUVI instrument (Christensen et al. 2003) 127 128 above 200 km with ion and electron temperature profiles obtained above 150 km by the 129 Millstone Hill incoherent scatter radar. Extensive archives of both TIMED/GUVI and Millstone 130 Hill radar observations exist. We identified multiple intervals where temporally and near 131 spatially coincident temperature profiles were available in these archives. Two examples are 132 presented and discussed below.

#### 133

- 134 There are many physics-based models of the Earth's ionosphere that can predict the
- altitude of thermal equilibrium under various solar and geophysical conditions. For example, the
- Whole Atmosphere Community Climate Model with thermosphere and ionosphere extension
   (WACCM-X 2.0) (Liu et al. 2018), the NCAR Thermosphere-Ionosphere-Electrodynamics
- General Circulation Model (TIE-GCM) (Qian et al. 2014), SAMI3 is another model of the
- 139 Ionosphere (SAMI3) (Huba and Drob, 2017), the Coupled Thermosphere-Ionosphere-
- 140 Plasmasphere model, CTIP (Millward et al. 1996), the whole Atmosphere Model with
- 141 Ionosphere, Plasmasphere, Electrodynamics WAM-IPE, (Hysell et al. 2022), and the Field Line
- 142 Interhemispheric Plasma (FLIP) model (Richards et al. 2009).
- 143

144 This paper analyzes sub-solar neutral, ion, and electron temperature profiles from the 145 archives of AE-C, TIMED/GUVI, and the Millstone Hill Incoherent scatter radar. To minimize 146 ionospheric storm effects, temperature profile data were selected equatorward of the auroral zone 147 during geomagnetically quiet intervals and compared with model results from the TIE-GCM and

- 148 FLIP models.
- 149 Data and Models
- 150

### 151 AE-C Satellite

152 The Atmosphere Explorer (AE) mission was designed to "make cause and effect studies 153 and carry out the simultaneous measurements that are needed to achieve a detailed understanding 154 of the physical processes that govern the lower thermosphere and ionosphere" (Dalgarno et al. 1973). AE-C is the only spacecraft with simultaneous observations of neutral, ion, and electron 155 156 temperatures below 140 km on Earth. It was launched in December 1973 into a 150 × 4294 km, 157 68° inclination orbit. Onboard propulsion was used in 1974 to temporarily lower perigee and 158 sample altitudes below 150 km. Neutral temperatures were obtained from the Neutral 159 Atmosphere Temperature Experiment (NATE) instrument (Spencer et al. 1973), ion 160 temperatures were obtained by the Retarding Potential Analyzer (RPA) instrument (Hanson et al. 1973), and electron temperatures were obtained by the Cylindrical Electrostatic Probe (CEP) 161 162 instrument (Brace et al. 1973). Total plasma densities were obtained by both the CEP and RPA instruments. Selected data from all the AE-C instruments at a 15-second cadence were 163

- 164 collecteted into a Unified Abstract (UA) file and archived by NASA. Data from the UA file are 165 used here.
- 165 us 166

### 167 TIMED/GUVI

168 The Thermosphere Ionosphere Mesosphere Energy and Dynamics (TIMED) satellite was 169 launched in December 2001 into a 630-kilometer circular orbit inclined at 74.1°. Christensen et 170 al. (2003) describe the Global UltraViolet Imager (GUVI) instrument and some initial results. 171 Meier et al. (2015) describe the methods used to obtain neutral temperature altitude profiles and 172 error estimates from the limb scan data. Limb scan and other data products are archived at the 173 Johns Hopkins Applied Physics Laboratory. The APL archives contain data from February 23, 174 2002 through December 12, 2007, with data gaps associated with instrument and satellite operations. Data for orbits where the limb scan was within 7° of latitude and 15° of longitude of 175 176 the Millstone Hill radar were used in the analysis presented here.

177

#### 178 Millstone Hill (MH) Incoherent Scatter Radar

179 The Millstone Hill (MH) incoherent scatter radar is located at 42.6° North, 71.5° West 180 and has been operated as a community ionospheric facility for more than 5 solar cycles. Ion 181 density and electron and ion temperature profiles are obtained at varying time cadence from the 182 power spectrum of averaged radar pulse returns as described by e.g. Evans (1969). Collective 183 Thomson/incoherent scatter is a random process where thermal electrons, electrostatically 184 modified by the presence of ions, provide a very weak radar backscatter target. The random 185 nature of the scatter requires that many spectra are averaged in time to identify up and down 186 shifted peaks associated with the ion acoustic plasma resonance frequency, which is proportional 187 to the square root of the ratio of the ion temperature to mass. The detailed shape of the 188 up/downshifted lines is related to the ratio of the electron and ion temperature. Ion temperature is 189 obtained from a spectral fitting code that includes a model of ion composition as a function of 190 altitude. Depending on the time delay (altitude) of the return, different types of radar pulses, 191 averaging times, and altitude binning are used. Consequently, there are many data products 192 available from the Millstone Hill (MH) radar archived data in the Madrigal distributed database 193 operated by the facility. In this study, we use the 15-minute cadence gridded data product in 194 Madrigal, which provides electron and ion temperature profiles consistently at a fixed temporal 195 and spatial resolution and with data coverage encompassing the 5 years of GUVI operation. 196 197 FLIP ionospheric model

The field line interhemispheric plasma (FLIP) model is a one-dimensional model that calculates the plasma densities and temperatures along magnetic flux tubes from below 100 km in the Northern Hemisphere through the plasmasphere to below 100 km in the Southern Hemisphere (Richards 2001; Richards et al. 2010). A detailed description of the FLIP model can be found in the paper by Kotov et al. (2015). The only significant update since 2015 is the adoption of the latest Magnetic Apex coordinates instead of tilted dipole coordinates (Van Zandt et al. (1972), Richmond (1995)).

205

The FLIP model solves the continuity and momentum equations for O<sup>+</sup>, H<sup>+</sup>, He<sup>+</sup>, and N<sup>+</sup> along entire field lines. Many other ion densities are calculated from local chemical equilibrium. The chemical reaction rates were validated using AE satellite data (Richards, 2011). The ion and electron temperatures are obtained by solving time-dependent energy equations that are based on the work of Schunk and Nagy (1978). For the neutral atmosphere, including the netural temperature, the FLIP model uses the NRL Mass Spectrometer, Incoherent Scatter Radar Extended model (NRLMSISE-00) (Picone et al. 2002).

213

The photoionization calculations in this paper use a model of solar EUV irradiances based on measurements by the Solar Extreme Ultraviolet Experiment (SEE) instrument on the TIMED satellite (Woods et al. 2008). The SEE irradiances produce very good agreement between the measured and modeled NmF2 during the 2006-2009 solar minimum period (Richards et al. 2009, 2010, 2014). The heating of thermal electrons by photoelectrons is determined by the solution of the two-stream photoelectron flux equations along entire field lines using the method of Nagy and Banks (1970).

221

#### 223 TIE-GCM model

224 The Thermosphere-Ionosphere-Electrodynamics General Circulation Model (TIE-GCM) 225 "self-consistently solves the fully coupled, nonlinear, hydrodynamic, thermodynamic, and 226 continuity equations of the neutral gas, the ion and electron energy and momentum equations, the 227 ion continuity equation, and neutral wind dynamo" (e.g., Qian et al. 2014). Effects of turbulent 228 mixing caused by gravity wave breaking are implicitly included by specifying an eddy 229 diffusivity (Roble et al. 1987). TIE-GCM uses the Apex Coordinates and take inputs of F10.7 cm 230 solar radio flux and Kp index. TIE-GCM self-concistently calculates the neutral temperature in 231 addition to electron and ion temperatures above the lower boundary at 97 km at which the model 232 reads in the temperature values from the history input file. The vertical level spacing is 0.5 points each scale height (~7km). Furthermore, photoelectron flux and the corresponding photoelectron 233 234 heating rate for thermal electrons is calculated self-consistently with plasma densities and 235 temperatures in FLIP every time step whereas TIE-GCM assumes the heating rate to be 236 proportional to the photoionization rate using the efficiency factor (Swartz and Nisbet, 1972; 237 Smithtro & Solomon, 2008; Smithtro & Sojka, 2005). We have used the runs-on-request feature 238 of the NASA Community Coordinated Modeling Center (CCMC) to produce the model results

- shown in Figure 2.
- 240

### 241 Results

#### 242 Atmosphere Explorer

#### 243

244 Figure 1 compares modeled and *in-situ* altitude profile data for plasma density and the 245 ion, electron, and neutral temperatures from AE-C orbits 2929-downleg (top row) and 2935 246 (bottom row) during a geomagnetically quiet interval. The data from the upleg and downleg of 247 orbit 2929 are not significantly different. The times, latitudes, and longitudes of perigee were 248 1974-08-25/20:09:00 and 1974-08-26/07:13:45, -3.4° and -3°, and 82° W and 110.5° E, 249 respectively. The magnetic activity was low, the planetary magnetic indices (A<sub>P</sub>) being 6 and 4, 250 and the  $F_{10,7}$  indices were 75.7 and 73 for the two passes. The perigee near the geographic 251 equator was chosen because the temperatures are least likely to be affected by geomagnetic 252 activity there.

253

Panels A, B, D, and E report observed and modeled values from 100 to 250 km. Panels A
and D show the plasma density as a function of altitude from the CEP instrument as plus (+)
signs, from the RPA instrument as asterisks (\*), and the FLIP model as dashed lines. Panels B
and E show CEP electron temperatures (Te) as black plus (+) signs, RPI ion temperatures (Ti) as
red multiplication (×) signs, and NATE neutral temperatures (Tn) as blue boxes. The dashed
lines are FLIP model temperatures for electrons (black), ions (red), and neutrals (blue).

260
261 Temperature differences from 100 to 150 km are shown in panels C and F. The observed
262 Te-Tn values are shown as black plus (+) signs, and the observed Ti-Tn values are shown as red
263 asterisks (\*). The FLIP model results are shown as black dashed lines for Te-Tn, and red dashed
264 lines for Ti-Tn (which are negligible).

265

266 Observational uncertainties are not shown because the literature has only qualitative 267 discussions of the uncertainties in the AE-C instruments. The equatorial perigee passes sample different latitudes and longitudes on the inbound and outbound portions of orbit 2935 (bottom
row). Unlike orbit 2929, this results in significantly different temperatures and densities at nearly
identical altitudes for orbit 2935. The RPA ion density measurements were systematically 40%
larger than the CEP measurements at the lowest altitudes. The FLIP model densities are typically
within 10% of the RPA values.

274 The FLIP model calculations shown in Figure 1 were performed along separate field lines 275 corresponding to each data point along the satellite orbit. The model results are close to the 276 observed electron, ion, and neutral temperature profiles below 250 km. Because of the strong 277 energy coupling, the FLIP model calculated electron and ion temperatures are sensitive to the 278 NRLMSISE-00 empirical model neutral temperatures. Observed neutral temperatures on both 279 orbits shown in Panels B and E are slightly lower than the NRLMSISE-00 values. The difference 280 between observed neutral and ion temperatures above 150 km is larger than that predicted by the 281 FLIP model. The model calculations are most accurate in these low-altitude equatorial regions 282 because vertical ion motion and vertical energy flow are restricted by the near horizontal field 283 lines. This means that plasma and energy transport uncertainties are negligible, and the densities 284 and temperatures should be close to their local equilibrium values. Away from the equatorial 285 region, downward heat flow significantly contributes to model temperature uncertainty, even 286 below 200 km.

287

288 The observed ion temperatures are lower than the neutral temperatures on orbit 2935, 289 below about 145 km (Figure 1, Panel F). Given our current understanding of the rapid transfer of 290 heat between ions and neutrals, we expect the ion temperature to lie between the electron and 291 neutral temperatures and to be within a few degrees of the neutral temperature below 200 km 292 altitude. The model results from FLIP (red dashed lines in Panels C and F) show nearly equal ion 293 and neutral temperatures below 150 km. Instrumental uncertainty or spatial/temporal aliasing is 294 the probable explanation that the observed ion temperature is lower than the nearly coincident 295 observed neutral temperature. The AE-C in-situ neutral temperatures were obtained from a 296 quadrupole mass spectrometer using both a baffle and velocity scan techniques (Spencer et al. 297 1973). Neutral temperatures from state-of-the-art quadrupole mass spectrometers (e.g., the 298 MAVEN NGIMS instrument, Mahaffey et al. 2015) now provide higher temporal resolution by 299 integrating a non-reactive gas' density profile assuming hydrostatic balance (e.g., Stone et al. 300 2018, Snowden et al. 2013).

301

The temperatures shown in Figure 1 and the temperature differences in panels C and F demonstrate that thermal equilibrium between the ions, electrons, and the neutrals occurs below 135 km, the lowest altitude sampled by the AE-C spacecraft.

305



306

Figure 1: Modeled and Atmosphere Explorer-C satellite plasma density and ion, electron, and neutral temperature altitude profiles from orbits 2929 (upper row) and 2935 (lower row) on August 25 and 26, 1974, respectively. FLIP model calculations are denoted by dashed lines, and observations are denoted by symbols. Panels A and D show plasma densities; Panels B and E show electron, ion, and neutral temperatures; Panels C and F report ion-neutral and electronneutral temperature differences below 150 km. See text for more details.

- 313
- 314 Millstone Hill Ionospheric Radar
- 315

Figure 2 presents observed and modeled temperature and density profiles on March 8, 2006, over the Millstone Hill (MH) incoherent scatter radar (ISR) at 43°N, 288°E, along with TIMED/GUVI limb scans from orbits 23006 (top row) and 23007 (bottom row). Geomagnetic conditions were quiet for both intervals. The planetary magnetic (A<sub>P</sub>) index was 4, and the solar  $F_{10.7}$  index was 71.5 for both intervals.

320 321

322 The observed and modeled values shown in Figure 2 are not exactly spatially and 323 temporally coincident. Gridded Te, Ti, and density data from the MH radar archives for the 324 interval 18:45 to 19:00 UT are shown in the top row and from 20:30 to 20:45 UT in the bottom row. The neutral temperature profiles are from GUVI limb scans. The tangent longitudes at the 325 lowest altitude of the GUVI scan were 11.0° east of MH on orbit 23006 at 18:53:38 UT and 13.5° 326 west of MH on orbit 23007 at 20:30:30 UT. The tangent latitudes were equal to those of MH. 327 328 The FLIP model calculations were carried out for 19:00 (top row) and 20:30 UT (bottom row) along magnetic field lines that go through a point 250 km altitude directly above Millstone Hill. 329 330

Panels A, B, D, and E report observed and modeled density and temperature values from
100 to 250 km. Panels A and D report plasma density as a function of altitude. MH data are
shown as plus (+) signs; the FLIP model results as dashed lines; and the TIE-GCM model results

#### Manuscript submitted to Geophysics Research Letters, January 2023

334 as solid lines. Panels B and E show temperature profiles of Te (black), Ti (red), and Tn (blue). 335 Observations of Te are shown as black plus (+) signs, Ti as red multiplication (×) signs, and Tn 336 as blue boxes. One-sigma error ranges are shown as horizontal lines for neutral (blue) and ion 337 (red) temperatures. Error ranges for electron temperature are available but not shown. As 338 explained by Evans (1969), uncertainties in the electron temperature are larger than the 339 uncertainties in the ion temperature. Note that the FLIP model calculation indicates that the 340 atomic to molecular ion density ratio is too small to affect the accuracy of the ISR Te analysis 341 below ~170 km altitude. 342

Panels A and D show that the TIE-GCM model slightly underestimates the ISR density
above 200 km, whereas the FLIP model matches the ISR density well. Both models
progressively underestimate the density below 150 km. This underestimation of the E-region
density is a well-known problem with models. Panels B and E show that both models agree well
with the measured ion temperature, and they give electron temperatures that are higher by
~130°K (11%) on average above 150 km altitude.

349

350 Panels C and F report the observed and modeled temperature differences from 100 to 150 351 km. Te-Tn values are color-coded black; Ti-Tn values are color-coded red. Observed Te-Tn 352 values are shown as plus (+) signs; Ti-Tn are shown as asterisks (\*). The horizontal red lines 353 show the 1 sigma uncertainty of the difference between the ion and neutral temperatures. FLIP 354 model results are dashed lines, and TIE-GCM model results are solid lines. Observationally there 355 are extended altitude ranges for both intervals where the measured ion and electron temperatures 356 are lower than the neutral temperatures. The most probable explanation for ion temperatures 357 being lower than the nearly coincident neutral temperatures is that these temperatures varied on 358 temporal and spatial scales shorter than those sampled by the MH radar and by GUVI limb 359 scans.

360

Ultimately, the error bars on the temperature observations presented in Figure 2 do not allow a strong conclusion about the altitude of thermal equilibrium other than it is below ~140 km. The TIE-GCM (solid lines) and FLIP (dashed lines) model runs predict the highest altitude of thermal equilibrium in these events is at ~115 km. The observations shown cannot confirm or refute the model results.





Figure 2. Nearly coincident modeled and observed temperature and density profiles on March 8, 2006, from the Millstone Hill incoherent scatter radar and TIMED/GUVI limb scans from orbits 23006 (top row) and 23007 (bottom row). The model results are along field lines at MH for 19:00 (top row) and 20:30 (bottom row). Observations are denoted as symbols and TIE-GCM and FLIP model results as solid and dashed lines, respectively. Panels A and D show plasma densities; Panels B and E show electron, ion, and neutral temperatures; Panels C and F report ion-neutral and electron-neutral temperature differences. See text for remaining details.

#### 375 Discussion

376

377 Observing and predicting the altitude of thermal equilibrium in the daytime ionosphere is 378 a basic test of our understanding of energy transfer from solar EUV radiation to the neutral 379 atmosphere. Some of the earliest observations of the space age unexpectedly showed that the 380 electron temperature was higher than the ion and neutral temperature in the daytime ionosphere 381 and thus demonstrated that photoelectrons were heating the thermal electrons (e.g., Lejeune and 382 Petit, 1969) faster than they could cool. Observing and quantitatively understanding the transfer 383 of energy from the solar EUV-generated photoelectrons to the ions and neutrals was a goal of the 384 AE project in the 1970's. This goal has only been partially attained. 385

At high latitudes, in the auroral zone, polar cap, and magnetospheric cusp regions, energy input from solar EUV radiation is often not the most significant energy source. That is why we focus on sub-auroral latitudes during geomagnetically quiet intervals where high latitude processes such as Joule heating do not contribute to neutral and ion heating.

390

Figures 1 and 2 show examples of ion, electron, and neutral temperature profiles obtained at sub-auroral latitudes during geomagnetically quiet intervals from public data archives. These 393 profiles demonstrate that there is not yet a quantitative understanding of the altitude where

394 thermal equilibrium occurs. Current ionosphere/thermosphere models generally agree with the

electron, ion, and neutral temperature profiles, as shown in Figures 1 and 2. These models

396 predict altitudes for thermal equilibrium, but these predictions have yet to be validated with an 397 adequate observational database of simultaneous ion, electron, and neutral temperatures in the

altitude range below  $\sim 135$  km where thermal equilibrium occurs.

399

There are no simultaneous *in-situ* neutral, ion, and electron temperature measurements near the expected altitude of thermal equilibrium. The observations from the AE-C mission in Figure 1 and those from the Mars MAVEN mission (Hanley et al. 2021) illustrate that current missions cannot get to the altitude of thermal equilibrium. Sarris et al. (2020) address the many technical and programmatic issues that need to be resolved to produce a mission that can obtain *in-situ* neutral, ion, and electron temperature profiles closer to the altitude of thermal equilibrium.

407

408 There are numerous simultaneous electron and ion temperature profiles in the 100 to 200 409 km range from radar observations discussed by Evans (1969) and many others. In this study, we 410 have identified several near simultaneous neutral temperature profiles from EUV limb scans 411 from TIMED/GUVI over the MH radar site when archived data exist. Two examples are 412 presented in Figure 2. The different spatial and temporal scales of neutral temperature profiles 413 from limb observations and the ion and electron temperature profiles from the MH radar 414 introduce uncertainties in determining the altitude of thermal equilibrium. Additionally, the radar 415 modes and codes used to obtain survey ion and electron temperature profiles shown in Figure 2 416 are not specifically optimized for altitudes below about 200 km. Furthermore, measurement 417 uncertainties are limited by the radar's design specifications (e.g. power-aperture product) as 418 well as the timescale of inherent ionospheric variability, as this limits the maximum averaging 419 time that can be used to maintain statistical, stationary conditions and hence sets a floor on 420 temperature uncertainties.

The FLIP and TIE-GCM model temperature profiles agree well with the available
observations, but the uncertainties and poor spatial/temporal overlap of existing remote sensing
observations, such as those presented in Figure 2, are not adequate to place strong constraints on
the models. Radar observations can be optimized to be more precise below 140 km within design
limitations. Neutral temperatures from UV limb scan technology from future satellites can be
better coordinated with ground radar sites and their operational modes.

428

429 Temperature profiles in Figures 1 and 2 show altitude ranges where the observed ion 430 temperatures are significantly lower than the observed neutral temperatures. We note that neither 431 our current physical understanding nor either model predicts any instances where Ti < Tn. As 432 stated above, the probable reason for these unexpected cool ion temperatures (or unexpected 433 warm neutral temperatures) comes from the limitations of the observational techniques. A 434 closely related explanation could be that either the ion or neutral temperatures vary significantly 435 on temporal and/or spatial scales smaller than those of the observations. The intervals selected 436 for analysis, however, were chosen to be from geomagnetically quiet intervals equatorward of 437 the auroral oval where significant spatial and temporal variations in the neutral atmosphere and 438 ionosphere that could produce the results shown in Figures 1 and 2 are not expected.

439

440 The data and analysis presented here cannot determine if the examples of Ti < Tn in three 441 of the four temperature profiles presented in Figures 1 and 2 are real. As suggested in the

442 previous paragraph they most probably are the result of instrumental and observational

443 limitations. However, if the observations of Ti < Tn in the 100-130 km range are real and

commonly occur, they would result from unexpected and unexplored physical processes. A
 candidate process might include large amplitude, high altitude gravity waves (e.g., England et

- candidate process might include large amplitude, high altitude gravity waves (e.g., England et al.
  2020). A quantitative understanding of sub-solar temperature profiles in the 100-130 km range
- based on validated models and observations does not exist, so we are left with the possibility that
- 448 regions where Ti < Tn can occur in the 100-130 km range.
- 449

# 450 Conclusions

451

452 Systematically investigating and modeling the processes that heat neutrals above the
453 mesopause and below the altitude of thermal equilibrium requires a robust understanding of the
454 upper boundary conditions on those processes, such as ion, electron, and neutral temperature
455 profiles in the 100-130 km range.

The data and analysis presented here show that the altitude of thermal equilibrium, where the electron, ion, and neutral temperatures are equal, as well as its variability under various geophysical conditions, has not yet been observationally established. It follows that models predicting this altitude at sub-auroral latitudes during geomagnetically quiet intervals have not been validated. This is because *in-situ* and remote sensing of simultaneous ion, electron, and neutral temperature profiles in the 110 to 140 km range with sufficient resolution to identify the altitude at thermal equilibrium is challenging.

464

465 Progress in quantitatively understanding neutral heating and the altitude of thermal
466 equilibrium at sub-auroral latitudes during geomagnetically quiet intervals in the 80 to 140 km
467 region requires new robust measurements of neutral, ion, and electron temperature profiles with
468 subsequent model validation.

## 469 Acknowledgements

470

471 WKP acknowledges helpful discussions with Panos Pirnaris, Theodore Saris, Gwen 472 Hanley, Richard Eastes, Bill McClintock, Phil Chamberlin, Tom Woods, Skylar Shaver, Marcin 473 Pilinski, Katelynn Greer, and Laila Andersson. We thank NASA's Community Coordinated 474 Modeling Center (CCMC) for providing access to the TIE-GCM model via its runs on request 475 service. WKP was supported by NASA Grant 80NSSC20K0594. AWY was supported by 476 Canadian Space Agency Grant 16SUSTSSPI. PGR is comfortably retired. PJE support for radar 477 operations and analysis at the Millstone Hill Geospace Facility, and the Madrigal distributed 478 database system archiving these observations, are provided to the community by the 479 Massachusetts Institute of Technology under a series of National Science Foundation grants

- 480 including AGS-1952737.
- 481
- 482

#### 483 Open Research:

484

485 Data presented here are from public data archives. Atmosphere Explorer–C data are 486 available at https://omniweb.gsfc.nasa.gov/ftpbrowser/ae c.html. Millstone Hill radar data are 487 archived on the Madrigal system and can be found at: http://millstonehill.haystack.mit.edu/. The 488 GUVI Level 2B neutral density profile IDL save sets used here are documented in the file: 489 http://guvitimed.jhuapl.edu/sites/default/files/data/documents/readme GUVI Version 13 Limb 490 Retrievals.pdf. They are available at: http://guvitimed.jhuapl.edu/data fetch l2b ndp idlsave. 491 The FORTRAN source code for the FLIP software used in this research is available from PGR 492 upon request.

493

### 494 References:

- Andersson, L, Christopher Fowler, Bob Ergun, Roger Yelle, Thomas Edwards Cravens, Ed
   Thiemann, et al. (2019), Hot electron temperature layer in the Martian atmosphere,
   ESSOAR, https://doi.org/10.1002/essoar.10501096.1
- Brace, L.H., R.G. Theis, and A. Dalgarno (1973), The cylindrical electrostatic probes for
   Atmosphere Explorer -C, -D, and -E, Radio Science, 8,341-348,
- 500 https://doi.org/10.1029/RS008i004p00341
- 501 Christensen, A. B., et al. (2003), Initial observations with the Global Ultraviolet Imager (GUVI)
  502 in the NASA TIMED satellite mission, J. Geophys. Res., 108(A12), 1451,
  503 doi:10.1029/2003JA009918.
- Dalgarno, A, W.B. Hanson, N.W. Spencer, and E.R. Schmerling (1973), The Atmosphere
   Explorer mission, Radio Science, 8, 263-266, <u>https://doi.org/10.1029/RS008i004p00263</u>
- 506 England, S. L., Greer, K. R., Solomon, S. C., Eastes, R. W., McClintock, W. E., & Burns, A. G.
  507 (2020). Observation of thermospheric gravity waves in the Southern Hemisphere with
  508 GOLD. Journal of Geophysical Research: Space Physics, 125, e2019JA027405.
  509 https://doi.org/10.1029/2019JA027405
- 510 Ergun, R. E., Andersson, L. A., Fowler, C. M., Thaller, S. A., & Yelle, R. V. (2021). In-situ
  511 measurements of electron temperature and density in Mars' dayside ionosphere.
  512 *Geophysical Research Letters*, 48, e2021GL093623.
  513 https://doi.org/10.1029/2021GL093623
- Evans, J.V. (1969), Theory and Practice of Ionosphere Study by Thomson Scatter Radar,
   Proceedings of the IEEE, 57, 496
- Hanley, K. G., McFadden, J. P., Mitchell, D. L., Fowler, C. M., Stone, S. W., Yelle, R. V., et al.
  (2021). In situ measurements of thermal ion temperature in the Martian ionosphere.
  Journal of Geophysical Research: Space Physics, 126, e2021JA029531.
- 519 https://doi.org/10.1029/2021JA029531
  520 Hanson, W.B., D.R. Zuccaro, C.R. Lippincott, and S. Sanata
- Hanson, W.B., D.R. Zuccaro, C.R. Lippincott, and S. Sanatani (1973), The retarding-potential
   analyzer on Atmosphere Explorer, Radio Science, 8, 333-340,
   <u>https://doi.org/10.1029/RS008i004p00333</u>
- Heelis, R. A., & Maute, A. (2020). Challenges to understanding the Earth's ionosphere and
  thermosphere. Journal of Geophysical Research: Space Physics, 125, e2019JA027497.
  https://doi.org/10.1029/2019JA027497 doi.org/10.1029/2019JA027497

526	Huba, J. D., and Drob, D. (2017), SAMI3 prediction of the impact of the 21 August 2017 total
527	solar eclipse on the ionosphere/plasmasphere system, Geophys. Res. Lett., 44, 5928-
528	5935, doi:10.1002/2017GL073549.
529	Hysell, D. L., Fang, T. W., & Fuller-Rowell, T. J. (2022). Modeling equatorial F-region
530	ionospheric instability using a regional ionospheric irregularity model and WAM-IPE.
531	Journal of Geophysical Research: Space Physics, 127, e2022JA030513.
532	https://doi.org/10.1029/2022JA030513
533	Jakosky, B.M., R.P. Lin, J.M. Grebowsky, J.G. Luhmann, D.F. Mitchel et al. (2015), The Mars
534	Atmosphere and Volatile Evolution (MAVEN) Mission, Space Sci. Rev., 195:3-48.
535	Jones Jr., McArthur, J.T. Emmert, Quan Gan, and Jia Yue, (2022), On the importance of neutral
536	composition and temperature measurements in the 100–200 km altitude region, Front.
537	Astron. Space Sci., 29 November 2022, https://doi.org/10.3389/fspas.2022.1062967.
538	Kelley, Michael C. (2009), The Earth's Ionosphere: Plasma Physics and Electrodynamics,
539	Second Edition, Elsevier, ISBN 13: 978-0-12-088425-4
540	Kotov, D., V. Truhlík, P. G. Richards, S. Stankov, O. V. Bogomaz, L. F. Chernogor, I. F.
541	Domnin, Night-time light ion transition height behaviour over the Kharkiv (50°N, 36°E)
542	IS radar during the equinoxes of 2006–2010, J. Atmos. Solar-Terr. Phys,
543	http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.jastp.2015.06.004, 1364-6826, 2015.
544	Lejeune, G. and M. Petit (1969), A study of the daytime electron temperature, Planet. Space Sci.,
545	17,1763-1780, https://doi.org/10.1016/0032-0633(69)90053-1
546	Liu, HL., Bardeen, C. G., Foster, B. T., Lauritzen, P., Liu, J., Lu, G., Wang, W. (2018).
547	Development and validation of the Whole Atmosphere Community Climate Model with
548	thermosphere and ionosphere extension (WACCM-X 2.0). Journal of Advances in
549	Modeling Earth Systems, 10, 381–402. https://doi.org/10.1002/2017MS001232
550	Matta, M., M. Galand, L. Moore, M. Mendillo, and P. Withers (2014), Numerical simulations of
551	ion and electron temperatures in the ionosphere of Mars: Multiple ions and diurnal
552	variations, Icarus, 277, 78-88, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.icarus.2013.09.006.
553	Mahaffy, P. R., Benna, M., King, T., Harpold, D. N., Arvey, R., Barciniak, M., et al. (2015). The
554	neutral gas and ion mass spectrometer on the Mars atmosphere and volatile evolution
555	mission. Space Science Reviews, 195(1-4), 49–73. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11214-014-
556	0091-1
557	Mahajan, K.K., (1967), Extent of non-equilibrium in the ionosphere, J. Atmos. And Terrestrial
558	Phys, 29, 1137-1151.
559	Meier R. R., et al. (2015) Remote Sensing of Earth's Limb by TIMED/GUVI: Retrieval of
560	thermospheric composition and temperature, Earth and Space Science, 2, 1–37, doi:
561	10.1002/2014EA000035.
562	Millward, G. H., R. J. Moffett, S. Quegan, and T. J. Fuller-Rowell, A coupled thermosphere-
563	ionosphere-plasmasphere model (CTIP), in STEP Handbook on Ionospheric Models, Ed.
564	R. W. Schunk, Utah State University, 239, 1996.
565	Nagy, A. F., and P. M. Banks (1970), Photoelectron fluxes in the ionosphere, J. Geophys. Res.,
566	75(31), 6260–6270.
567	Palmroth, M. et al. (2020), Lower-thermosphere-ionosphere (LTI) quantities: current status of
568	measuring techniques and models, Ann. Geophys., 39, 189-237,
569	https://doi.org/10.5194/angeo-39-189-2021

570	Peterson, W. K., Andersson, L., Ergun, R., Thiemann, E., Pilinski, M., Thaller, S., et al (2020).
571	Subsolar electron temperatures in the lower Martian ionosphere. Journal of Geophysical
572	Research: Space Physics, 125, e2019JA027597. https://doi.org/10.1029/2019JA027597
573	Peterson WK (2021) Perspective on Energetic and Thermal Atmospheric Photoelectrons. Front.
574	Astron. Space Sci. 8:655309. doi: 10.3389/fspas.2021.655309
575	Picone, J. M., A. E. Hedin, D. P. Drob, and A. C. Aikin (2002), NRLMSISE-00 empirical model
576	of the atmosphere: Statistical comparisons and scientific issues, J. Geophys. Res.,
577	107(A12), 1468.
578	Oian, L., Burns, A.G., Emery, B.A., Foster, B., Lu, G., Maute, A., Richmond, A.D., Roble, R.G.,
579	Solomon, S.C. and Wang, W. (2014). The NCAR TIE-GCM. In Modeling the
580	Ionosphere–Thermosphere System (eds J. Huba, R. Schunk and G. Khazanov).
581	https://doi.org/10.1002/9781118704417.ch7
582	Richards, P. G. (2001), Seasonal and solar cycle variations of the ionospheric peak electron
583	density: Comparison of measurement and models, J. Geophys. Res., 106(A7), 12803-
584	12819.
585	Richards, P. G., et al. (2009), Measured and Modeled Ionospheric densities, temperatures, and
586	winds during the IPY, J. Geophys. Res., 114, A12317, doi:10.1029/2009JA014625.
587	Richards, P. G., R. R. Meier, and P. J. Wilkinson (2010), On the compatibility of satellite
588	measurements of thermospheric composition and solar EUV irradiance with ground-
589	based ionospheric electron density data, J. Geophys. Res., 115, A10309,
590	doi:10.1029/2010JA015368.
591	Richards, P. G. (2011), Reexamination of ionospheric photochemistry, J. Geophys. Res., 116,
592	A08307, doi:10.1029/2011JA016613.
593	Richards, P. G. (2012), Reevaluation of thermosphere heating by solar EUV and UV radiation,
594	Can. J. Phys., 90(8): 759-767, 10.1139/p11-109, 2012
595	Richards, P.G. (2022), Ionospheric photoelectrons: A lateral thinking approach, Front. Astron.
596	Space Sci., 22 July 2022 Sec. Space Physics, https://doi.org/10.3389/fspas.2022.952226
597	Richmond, A.D. (1995), Ionospheric electrodynamics using magnetic apex coordinages, J.
598	Geomag. Geoelectr., 47, 192-212, https://doi.org/10.5636/jgg.47.191
599	Roble, R. G., Ridley, E. C., and Dickinson, R. E. (1987), On the global mean structure of the
600	thermosphere, J. Geophys. Res., 92(A8), 8745–8758, doi: <u>10.1029/JA092iA08p08745</u> .
601	Sarris, T.E. et al, (2020), Daedalus: a low-flying spacecraft for in situ exploration of the lower
602	thermosphere-ionosphere, Geosci. Instrum. Method. Data Syst., 9, 153-191,
603	https://doi.org/10.5194/gi-9-153-2020
604	Schunk, R. W., and A. F. Nagy (1978), Electron Temperatures in F-Region of Ionosphere –
605	Theory and Observations, Reviews of Geophysics, 16(3), 355–399.
606	Schunk, Robert and Andrew Nagy (2009), Ionospheres: Physics, Plasma Physics, and Chemistry,
607	Second Edition, Cambridge University Press, ISBN: 978-0-521-87706-0
608	Spencer, N.W., H.B. Niemann and G.R. Carignan (1973), The neutral-atmosphere temperature
609	instrument, Radio Science, 8, 284-296, <u>https://doi.org/10.1029/RS008i004p00287</u>
610	Smithtro, C. G., and S. C. Solomon (2008), An improved parameterization of thermal electron
611	heating by photoelectrons, with application to an X17 flare, J. Geophys. Res., 113,
612	A08307, doi:10.1029/2008JA013077.
613	Snowden, D., Yelle, R. V., Cui, J., Wahlund, JE., Edberg, N. J. T., and Ågren, K. (2013). The
614	thermal structure of Titan's upper atmosphere, I: Temperature profiles from Cassini
615	INMS observations. Icarus, 226(1), 552–582 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.icarus.2013.06.006

- Stone, S. W., Yelle, R. V., Benna, M., Elrod, M. K., & Mahaffy, P. R. (2018). Thermal structure
  of the Martian upper atmosphere from MAVEN NGIMS. Journal of Geophysical
  Research: Planets, 123, 2842–2867. <u>https://doi.org/10.1029/2018JE005559</u>
- 619 Smithtro, C. G., and J. J. Sojka (2005), A new global average model of the coupled thermosphere
  620 and ionosphere, J. Geophys. Res., 110, A08305, doi:10.1029/2004JA010781.
- Swartz, W. E., and J. S. Nisbet (1972), Revised calculations of F region ambient electron heating
   by photoelectrons, J. Geophys. Res., 77, 6259.
- VanZandt, T.E., Clark, W.L., and Warnock, J.M. (1972). Magnetic Apex Coordinates: A
   magnetic coordinate system for the ionospheric F2 layer, Journal of Geophysical
   Research, 77, 2406-2411.
- Woods, T. N., et al. (2008), XUV photometer system (XPS): improved solar irradiance algorithm
  using Chianti spectral models, Solar Phys, 250, 235–267, doi:10.1007/s11207-008-91966.
- 629 Zhang, S.-R., et al (2005), October 2002 30-day incoherent scatter radar experiments at
- Millstone Hill and Svalbard and simultaneous GUVI/TIMED observations, *Geophys. Res. Lett.*, 32, L01108, doi:10.1029/2004GL020732.
- 632
- 633

Figure 1.



Figure 2.

