# Limited Recharge of a Steady Deep Groundwater Aquifer in the Southern Highlands of Early Mars

Eric Hiatt<sup>1</sup>, Mohammad Afzal Shadab<sup>1</sup>, Sean P. S. Gulick<sup>1</sup>, Timothy Andrew Goudge<sup>1</sup>, and Marc Hesse<sup>1</sup>

<sup>1</sup>University of Texas at Austin

December 7, 2022

#### Abstract

To determine plausible groundwater recharge rates on early Mars, we develop analytic and numerical solutions for an unconfined steady-state aquifer beneath the southern highlands. We show that the aquifer's mean hydraulic conductivity, K, is the primary constraint on the plausible magnitude of mean steady recharge, r. By restricting groundwater upwelling to Arabia Terra, using a mean hydraulic conductivity of, K  $(sim)^{10}(-7)$  m/s, and varying shoreline elevations and recharge distributions, the mean recharge must be order of  $10^{-2}$  mm/yr. Recharge for other values of K can be estimated as r  $(sim)^{10}(-5)$ . Our value is near the low end of previous recharge estimates and two orders-of-magnitude below the smallest precipitation estimates. This suggests that, for a steady hydrologic cycle, most precipitation forms runoff, not groundwater recharge. It is also plausible the transient aquifer response to recharge is sufficiently slow that no upwelling occurs prior to cessation of climatic excursions causing precipitation.











# Limited Recharge of a Steady Deep Groundwater Aquifer in the Southern Highlands of Early Mars

Eric Hiatt<sup>1,2,3</sup>, Mohammad Afzal Shadab<sup>2,3,4</sup>, Sean P.S. Gulick<sup>1,2,3</sup>, Timothy A. Goudge<sup>1,3,5</sup>, Marc A. Hesse<sup>1,4</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Department of Geological Sciences, Jackson School of Geosciences, The University of Texas at Austin
 <sup>2</sup>University of Texas Institute for Geophysics, The University of Texas at Austin
 <sup>3</sup>Center for Planetary Systems Habitability, The University of Texas at Austin
 <sup>4</sup>Oden Institute for Computational Engineering and Sciences, The University of Texas at Austin
 <sup>5</sup>CIFAR Azrieli Global Scholars Program, CIFAR, Toronto, Ontario, Canada

# Key Points:

1

2

3

10

11	•	Analytic solution for an unconfined aquifer beneath Mars southern highlands pro-
12		vides first-order estimate of groundwater table elevation.
13	•	The key control on the steady groundwater table elevation is the ratio between
14		mean recharge and mean hydraulic conductivity of the aquifer.
15	•	For commonly assumed values of hydraulic conductivity the steady recharge must
16		be at the lower end of the estimated range of recharge.

Corresponding author: Eric Hiatt, eric.hiatt@utexas.edu

#### 17 Abstract

To determine plausible groundwater recharge rates on early Mars, we develop analytic 18 and numerical solutions for an unconfined steady-state aquifer beneath the southern high-19 lands. We show that the aquifer's mean hydraulic conductivity, K, is the primary con-20 straint on the plausible magnitude of mean steady recharge, r. By restricting ground-21 water upwelling to Arabia Terra, using a mean hydraulic conductivity of,  $K \sim 10^{-7}$  m/s, 22 and varying shoreline elevations and recharge distributions, the mean recharge must be 23 order of  $10^{-2}$  mm/yr. Recharge for other values of K can be estimated as  $r \sim 10^{-5} K$ . 24 Our value is near the low end of previous recharge estimates and two orders-of-magnitude 25 below the smallest precipitation estimates. This suggests that, for a steady hydrologic 26 cycle, most precipitation forms runoff, not groundwater recharge. It is also plausible the 27 transient aquifer response to recharge is sufficiently slow that no upwelling occurs prior 28 to cessation of climatic excursions causing precipitation. 29

# <sup>30</sup> Plain Language Summary

The surface of Mars shows past evidence for liquid water at its surface, however 31 the extent surface water interacted with the subsurface remains an open question. In this 32 work, we derive an idealized mathematical solution for an equation often used to study 33 groundwater flow on Earth and Mars. We use this solution to analyze and validate a com-34 puter model based approximation in a global configuration capable of examining sev-35 eral parameters that could act as first-order controls on recharge a possible Martian aquifer. 36 We use topography data along with rover and remotely sensed observations to constrain 37 the model, and find that there is a single parameter, recharge/hydraulic conductivity  $\sim$ 38  $10^{-5}$ , that controls the amount of recharge an early Martian aquifer can plausibly sus-39 tain with these constraints. This value is far less than predicted by previous literature. 40

### 41 **1** Introduction

The surface of Mars retains several planetary scale structures. One of the most strik-42 ing is the crustal dichotomy separating Mars' northern lowlands from its southern high-43 lands via an abrupt  $\sim 5$  km topographic transition. In stark contrast to the relatively smooth 44 plains in the north, the southern highlands preserve the oldest, most heavily cratered 45 terrain on the planet as well as at minimum two large scale impact basins, Hellas and 46 Argyre (Smith et al., 1999). These structures formed prior to  $\sim 3.7$  Ga, in the Noachian 47 Era, at a time when Mars is also hypothesized to have had an active hydrologic cycle 48 (Frey, 2008; Werner, 2008; Carr, 1986; Clifford, 1993a). The formation of these struc-49 tures would have impacted any possible surface and groundwater processes due to their 50 associated topographic lows. 51

There is ample evidence for liquid water on Mars' surface early in the planet's his-52 tory. The eroded remains of poorly integrated fluvial drainage systems, called "valley 53 networks", dissect the highlands (Milton, 1973; Goldspiel & Squyres, 1991; Carr, 1996; 54 Hynek & Phillips, 2001). Spectral data strengthens the inference of past surface water 55 processes with observations of hydrated silicates suggesting near surface aqueous min-56 eral alteration (Mustard et al., 2008; Ehlmann et al., 2009; Carter et al., 2013). Open 57 and closed crater lakes have been identified throughout the Noachian terrain, providing 58 further evidence of standing bodies of water on the Martian surface (Cabrol & Grin, 1999; 59 Fassett & Head, 2008b; Di Achille & Hynek, 2010). In both Argyre and Hellas, obser-60 vations have been made supporting the possible presence of large standing bodies of wa-61 ter (Parker et al., 2000; Wilson et al., 2010; Dohm et al., 2015; Hiesinger & Head, 2002; 62 Hargitai et al., 2018; Zhao et al., 2020). Many have also argued that an immense ocean 63 once existed within the northern lowlands (e.g., Parker et al., 1989, 1993; Carr & Head, 64 2003; Fassett & Head, 2008a). 65

Conclusive evidence of surface water processes and standing bodies of water nat-66 urally leads to questions regarding the formation and extent of any groundwater systems. 67 A globally connected groundwater system has been inferred in numerous geomorphic and 68 numeric modeling based studies (e.g., Clifford, 1993a; Andrews-Hanna et al., 2007; Di Achille 69 & Hynek, 2010; Salese et al., 2019). Additionally, rover and satellite based observations 70 of layered deposits in Arabia Terra (Figure 1) have been interpreted as evaporites result-71 ing from groundwater upwelling (Christensen et al., 2000; Golombek et al., 2003; Squyres 72 et al., 2004; McLennan et al., 2005; Grotzinger et al., 2005; Bibring et al., 2007; Andrews-73 Hanna et al., 2007). 74

To examine the effect of standing bodies of water on possible groundwater tables, 75 here we use mean shoreline elevations at Deuteronilus (-3790 m), Arabia (-2090 m), and 76 Meridiani (0 m) as illustrative examples (see table 1 in Carr & Head (2003)). However, 77 we will show that the existence of a northern ocean, regardless of depth, is a secondary 78 control on groundwater when compared to the geometry of the dichotomy. This is con-79 sequential due to the general contention regarding the existence of putative northern ocean(s) 80 (e.g., Malin & Edgett, 1999; Sholes et al., 2019, 2021; Sholes & Rivera-Hernández, 2022). 81 While some studies argue that the kilometer-scale deviation of equipotential shorelines 82 precludes the existence of an ocean, others have suggested that true polar wander and 83 deformation associated with the Tharsis rise can explain these discrepancies (Perron et 84 al., 2007; Citron et al., 2018; Chan et al., 2018). 85

The contention surrounding the northern ocean dictates our use of less controver-86 sial model constraints. The distribution of valley networks offers insight regarding ground-87 water table elevation. The groundwater table often sets local base level to which sed-88 imentary systems can erode. The widespread distribution of incised valley networks across 89 the highlands implies any groundwater table was likely well below the surface topogra-90 phy over much of the planet. Similarly, Arabia Terra's noticeable lack of incised valley 91 networks and the presence of inverted fluvial deposits along with layered deposits sug-92 gests that the region was a depositional environment, with the groundwater table per-93 haps at or near the surface (Davis et al., 2016) consistent with rover observations in this 94 region (e.g., McLennan et al., 2005; Grotzinger et al., 2005). Parameters such as basin 95 hydraulic head levels and recharge distributions will be compared to these observational 96 constraints. 97

Published precipitation and aquifer recharge rates vary by orders of magnitude. Es-98 timates of water availability due to snow and ice accumulation give values ranging from 99  $10^{-2}$  to  $10^3$  mm/yr (e.g., Wordsworth et al., 2015; Fastook & Head, 2015; von Paris et 100 al., 2015) and estimates associated with precipitation range from  $10^0 - 10^3 \text{ mm/yr}$  (e.g., 101 Kamada et al., 2020; Wordsworth et al., 2015). Geomorphic studies have constrained wa-102 ter associated with runoff production between  $10^2$  to  $10^5$  mm/yr (Ramirez et al., 2020; 103 Hoke et al., 2011). However, these studies only provide an upper bound on groundwa-104 ter recharge due to the unknown partitioning between surface runoff and infiltration. 105

Direct estimates of recharge from groundwater modeling studies vary between  $10^{-2}$ 106 to  $10^3$  mm/yr, but require the specification of unknown aquifer properties (Harrison & 107 Grimm, 2009; Andrews-Hanna et al., 2007, 2010; Luo et al., 2011; Horvath & Andrews-108 Hanna, 2017). Here, we individually examine the importance of unknown aquifer prop-109 erties, the effects of possible standing bodies of water, and consequences associated with 110 varying recharge distributions on the aquifer using novel analytic and numeric ground-111 water models. By comparing solutions with the inferred upwelling within Arabia Terra 112 and valley network distributions, we ask: what are plausible mean recharge estimates 113 114 for a steady-state, deep groundwater aquifer on early Mars?



Figure 1. Topography of Mars derived from Mars Orbiter Laser Altimetry (MOLA) aboard the Mars Global Surveyor (MGS) mission (Smith et al., 1999). Hellas and Argyre impact basins are labeled along with the northern lowlands. Three mean shorelines elevations are taken from Parker et al. (1989) and Carr & Head (2003). Argyre and Hellas impact basins are outlined at an elevation of -2090 m.

#### 115 2 Methodology

116

# 2.1 Model for the southern highlands aquifer

Similar to other Mars groundwater studies (Clifford, 1993b; Hanna & Phillips, 2005; Luo & Howard, 2008), we use the Dupuit-Boussinesq model (Dupuit, 1863; Forchheimer, 1901; Boussinesq, 1903) for the elevation, h, of the groundwater table above the base of the aquifer

$$-\nabla \cdot [K h \nabla h] = r \,\chi(\theta, \theta_r),\tag{1}$$

where  $\theta$  is the angle from the south pole or southern colatitude in radians and  $\chi(\theta, \theta_r)$ is an indicator function that is one for  $\theta_r \leq \theta \leq \pi - \theta_r$  and zero otherwise. The divergence and gradient operators take their standard from in spherical shell coordinates (Batchelor, 2000). We assume the flow is steady to examine the temporally averaged mean recharge rates.

The model has two physical parameters, the mean hydraulic conductivity of the 126 aquifer, K, and the mean recharge rate, r. For clarity of presentation, we assume that 127 K and r are spatially constant, although our analysis can be extended to variable con-128 ductivity and recharge. We assume recharge is evenly distributed across an equatorial 129 band of width,  $\Delta \theta_r$ , between colatitude  $\theta_r$  and  $180^\circ - \theta_r$ . Unless otherwise specified, 130 we assume  $\theta_r = 45^\circ$ , and the head, h, is measured relative to the base of the aquifer, 131 which is assumed to be at an elevation  $z_{\rm B} = -9$  km as in previous studies (Andrews-132 Hanna et al., 2010; Andrews-Hanna & Lewis, 2011). For a mean elevation of the high-133 lands of  $z_{\rm H} = 1$  km, the aquifer has a maximum thickness of  $d = z_{\rm H} - z_{\rm B} = 10$  km. 134

As a boundary condition, the groundwater table at the perimeter of our aquifer is set equal to the mean elevation,  $z_o$ , of one of the proposed shorelines,  $h(\theta_o) = h_o =$  $z_o - z_B$ . We use the three shorelines mapped in Figures 2a-2c. When present in a particular model, shoreline elevations in both Hellas and Argyre are set equal to the dichotomy
 shoreline being examined in that particular model run.

140

150

# 2.2 Analytic solution for an idealized spherical cap aquifer

<sup>141</sup> We first investigate a one-dimensional model for an idealized spherical cap aquifer. <sup>142</sup> To obtain analytic solutions for the groundwater table, we assume circumferential sym-<sup>143</sup> metry so that the solution is only a function of colatitude,  $\theta$  (Shadab et al., 2022). In <sup>144</sup> this limit, equation (1) reduces to

$$-\frac{1}{R\sin\theta}\frac{\mathrm{d}}{\mathrm{d}\theta}\left[\frac{K}{R}\sin\theta h\frac{\mathrm{d}h}{\mathrm{d}\theta}\right] = r\,\chi(\theta,\theta_r) \quad \text{on} \quad \theta \in [0,\,\theta_{\mathrm{o}}]\,,\tag{2}$$

where R is the mean radius of Mars, ~ 3,390 km (Smith et al., 1999), and  $\theta_{o}$  is the southern colatitude of the mean shoreline of the northern ocean. Here we choose  $\theta_{o}$  so that the surface area of the idealized spherical-cap aquifer is equivalent to the area enclosed by the shoreline in Figure 1. We assume a simple step in topography at the shoreline,  $\theta_{o}$ , between the mean highland elevation,  $z_{\rm H} = 1$  km, and the mean lowland elevation,  $z_{\rm L} = -4$  km (Figure 2*a*). At the south pole the groundwater table is horizontal by symmetry and along the shoreline the head is prescribed,  $h(\theta_{o}) = h_{o}$ . Integrating Equation (2) twice with these constraints, we obtain the following analytic solution for the head of the aquifer

$$h(\theta) = \sqrt{h_o^2 + 2\frac{rR^2}{K}} \underbrace{\left[ \ln \left| \frac{\sin \theta}{\sin \theta_o} \right| - \cos \theta_r \ln \left| \frac{(\cos \theta + 1) \sin \theta_o}{(\cos \theta_o + 1) \sin \theta} \right| \right]}_{\Delta(\theta, \theta_r, \theta_o)}.$$
(3)

This solution is valid for  $\theta_r \leq \theta \leq \theta_0$  and the solution for  $\theta < \theta_r$  is constant at  $h(\theta_r)$ as shown in Figures 2a-2c. Note that this solution assumes that recharge extends all the way to the shoreline,  $\theta_0 \leq 180^\circ - \theta_r$ , a more general solution is given in the Section S3 of the supplementary information (SI). The expressions for specific and total discharge are given in the SI (Figure S2).

### 2.3 Numerical Model for southern highlands aquifer

To investigate the effects of complex shorelines and impact basins on plausible recharge rates, we have developed a numerical model for the southern highlands' aquifer. We nondimensionalize Equation (1) and discretize it in spherical shell geometry. The model uses conservative finite differences on a tensor product grid with an operator-based implementation (LeVeque, 1992). The resulting non-linear system of algebraic equations is solved with the Newton-Raphson method. The numerical implementation and benchmarking against the analytic solution are provided in SI Section S4.

To obtain the locations of the shorelines in the northern lowlands and basins, MOLA topography is down-sampled to our grid pixel resolution of 1.2°. By assuming an equipotential surface across a standing body of water, the shorelines are used to divide the computational domain into the southern highlands aquifer and three open water basins. The cells within these basins are excluded from the computations and the head in these basins is set to the chosen shoreline elevation. We also examine an aquifer domain that does not consider Hellas and Argyre basins.

All numerical solutions presented below assume a hydraulic conductivity of  $K = 10^{-7}$  m/s and assume that all standing water bodies have elevations equal to the Arabia shoreline at -2090 m. Results for other shorelines are provided in the SI Section S5.3 and S5.4.



Figure 2. a-c) Analytic solution for steady unconfined aquifer on a spherical shell. Elevation of the groundwater table for the mean Meridiani, Arabia, and Deuteronilus shoreline elevations of Carr and Head, 2003. In each case, the groundwater table is shown for multiple values of recharge and the region receiving recharge is shaded blue. d) Depth of groundwater beneath mean highland elevation,  $z_{\rm H} = 1$  km for the Arabia shoreline. The parameters corresponding to solutions from panel 2b are shown by correspondingly colored circles. The maximum plausible recharge from Equation (4) is shown in red.

#### 169 3 Results

The analytical and numerical aquifer models introduced above provide complementary information about the plausible steady-state recharge values for Mars' southern highlands aquifer. The analytic solution gives insight into the relationship between recharge and hydraulic conductivity whereas the numerical results allow us to investigate the effects of complex shoreline geometry on recharge.

Neither the mean hydraulic conductivity nor the mean recharge of the southern high-175 lands aquifer on Mars are known. Our analysis shows that the solution for the head, given 176 by Equation (3), is primarily a function of the dimensionless ratio between recharge and 177 hydraulic conductivity, r/K. This ratio then allows us to estimate which values of recharge 178 are plausible given any proposed value of the mean hydraulic conductivity. For exam-179 ple, Figures 2a-2c show the elevation of the groundwater table in the spherical cap aquifer 180 for different shorelines and increasing values of recharge. For the hydraulic conductiv-181 ity of  $10^{-7}$  m/s chosen here, the analytic model predicts values of recharge on the or-182 der of  $10^{-3}$  mm/yr can raise the groundwater table to the surface using any chosen shore-183 line. 184

The absence of widespread groundwater upwelling outside Arabia Terra provides an upper bound on plausible r/K ratios. In our simplified analytic model widespread upwelling would occur if the elevation of the groundwater table exceeds the mean elevation of the highlands, assumed to be 1 km. From the analytic solution, this maximum ratio is given by

$$\left. \frac{r}{K} \right|_{\rm max} = \frac{d^2 - h_o^2}{2R^2 \Delta'(\theta_r, \theta_{\rm o})},\tag{4}$$



**Figure 3.** Effect of complex geometry for an aquifer with a recharge rate of  $10^{-2}$  mm/yr evenly distributed between -45° and 45°: *a*) Analytic solution from Equation (3) with mean Arabia shoreline. *b*) Numerical solution with Arabia shoreline. *c*) Numerical solution with Arabia shoreline and standing water in Hellas and Argyre basins. Water elevation in the basins is assumed equal to the Arabia shoreline elevation.

185	where $\Delta'(\theta_r, \theta_o) = \Delta(\theta_r, \theta_r, \theta_o)$ is a scalar defined in Equation (3). Figure 2d shows
186	the plausible combinations of hydraulic conductivity and recharge for the Arabia shore-
187	line. This illustrates that dropping the mean $K$ by an order of magnitude requires a sim-
188	ilar drop in mean $r$ to prevent widespread upwelling. The effects of varying other pa-
189	rameters, such as the chosen shoreline and the recharge distribution are minor and there-
190	fore presented in the SI (Section S3.3). For example, if the width of the recharge band,
191	$\Delta \theta_r$ , is varied by $\pm 20^\circ$ around the preferred value of $90^\circ$ for an aquifer with $K = 10^{-7}$
192	m/s the maximum plausible values of mean recharge for all three shorelines vary only
193	between $6 \times 10^{-3}$ and $1.6 \times 10^{-2}$ mm/yr (Figure S3).

Analysis of the simplified spherical cap aquifer model demonstrates that the elevation of the groundwater table is primarily a function of the r/K ratio. Although the mean K of the southern highlands is not known, reasonable values in the range of  $10^{-6}$ to  $10^{-8}$  m/s (Hanna & Phillips, 2005) require very low rates of groundwater recharge to avoid widespread groundwater upwelling (Figure 2d). This conclusion is relatively insensitive to the particular shoreline chosen, the latitudinal width of the precipitation band, or the depth of the aquifer base. The particular value of the ratio r/K is primarily set by the large surface area of the highlands relative to the cross-sectional area of the aquifer, as discussed in Section 4.

To explore the effect of complex aquifer boundaries we present numerical solutions 203 with the Arabia shoreline for  $K = 10^{-7}$  m/s and  $r = 10^{-2}$  mm/yr (Figure 3). First 204 we explore the effect of the shoreline of the northern ocean alone and then consider the 205 influence of adding Hellas and Argyre basins. Comparing the analytic solution for the 206 spherical cap aquifer (Figure 3a) with the numerical solution for the Arabia shoreline 207 (Figure 3b) we observe an overall drop in the elevation of the groundwater table. The 208 complex shoreline generates a local maximum in the groundwater elevation at the fur-209 thest location from a shoreline within the precipitation band. The complex shoreline has 210 an increased shoreline length and reduces the distance to drain into a basin which re-211 sults in more effective drainage compared to the equivalent mean shoreline. The pres-212 ence of large impact basins further lowers the head in the aquifer (Figure 3c). These basins 213 provide additional shorelines within the highlands that help to drain the aquifer. 214

Overall, our numerical model demonstrates that complex shorelines lower the head 215 in the aquifer and therefore increase the plausible value of mean recharge. However, these 216 geometric effects do not change the order-of-magnitude of the plausible range of r/K. 217 As such, the unknown mean hydraulic conductivity of the highlands remains the dom-218 inant control on the mean recharge. In Figure 4, we explore the location and extent of 219 groundwater upwelling in the southern highlands as function of mean recharge in an aquifer 220 bounded by the Arabia shoreline at the dichotomy and shorelines of equivalent eleva-221 tion in Hellas and Argyre. Figure 4a-4c shows the depth, compared to topography, of 222 the groundwater table for a succession of simulations with increasing amounts of recharge. 223 Areas with blue colors are submerged while areas of incipient groundwater upwelling are 224 shown in white. For  $r = 10^{-2}$  mm/yr the highlands do not experience significant ground-225 water upwelling outside of some deep craters (Figure 4a), suggesting r is too low. In-226 creasing recharge to  $3 \times 10^{-2}$  mm/yr a region of groundwater upwelling forms in Ara-227 bia Terra (Figure 4b), where geomorphic and geochemical observations suggest upwelling 228 has occurred (e.g., McLennan et al., 2005; Grotzinger et al., 2005). A further increase 229 in recharge to only  $10^{-1}$  mm/yr results in large areas of the highlands becoming flooded, 230 a scenario not supported by existing observations (Figure 4c), indicating that r is too 231 high. 232

The area of the highlands that experiences groundwater upwelling grows rapidly 233 with increasing recharge (Figure 4d). The geologic observation that groundwater upwelling 234 has been restricted to primarily Arabia Terra therefore places a constraint on the plau-235 sible r/K ratio on Mars. For the mean hydraulic conductivity  $K = 10^{-7}$  m/s, the best 236 match with the inferred area of groundwater upwelling in Arabia Terra is a recharge of 237 approximately  $3 \times 10^{-2}$  mm/yr, which leads to 6.3% of the highlands experiencing up-238 welling (Figure 4b). This corresponds to  $r/K \sim 10^{-5}$  that can be used to estimate plau-239 sible values of r for any preferred value of K. 240

#### 241 4 Discussion

Our results show that a groundwater aquifer beneath the highlands requires very 242 low values of recharge to avoid groundwater upwelling occurring outside areas suggested 243 by observational evidence. We show that the plausible steady-state recharge increases 244 linearly with the assumed mean hydraulic conductivity of the aquifer. As such, plausi-245 ble recharge values for any preferred hydraulic conductivity can be estimated as  $r \sim 10^{-5} K$ . 246 This relationship is evident from the analytic solution (Equation 4) and confirmed by 247 numerical models of varying complexity. Whereas the geometry of the shorelines has a 248 small effect on the overall magnitude of recharge, Mars' topography requires upwelling 249 to occur first in Arabia Terra as recharge rates increase, as indicated in previous work 250 (Andrews-Hanna et al., 2007). If upwelling is constrained to Arabia Terra and the cho-251



Figure 4. Groundwater upwelling as function of recharge for an aquifer bounded by the Arabia shoreline and equal elevation shorelines in Hellas and Argyre. Recharge, r, is evenly distributed between  $-45^{\circ}$  and  $45^{\circ}$  and  $K = 10^{-7}$  m/s. a)  $r = 1 \times 10^{-2}$  mm/yr. b)  $r = 3 \times 10^{-2}$  mm/yr. c)  $r = 1 \times 10^{-1}$  mm/yr. d) Percentage of the southern highlands area experiencing groundwater upwelling as function of recharge with estimates of water availability (Stucky de Quay et al., 2021).

sen K value is held constant, the range of plausible recharge rates varies by less than one order of magnitude (Figure 4d)

Previous studies of global-scale groundwater flow estimate recharge rates from  $\sim$ 254  $10^{-2}$  mm/yr (Andrews-Hanna et al., 2007) to ~  $10^{-1}$  mm/year (Andrews-Hanna & Lewis, 255 2011) for comparable mean hydraulic conductivities, see SI Section S5.1. These estimates 256 are consistent with our results and suggest that they are not strongly dependent on model 257 assumptions. For example, previous models do not allow for ponded surface water and 258 the resulting shorelines. In our model recharge is prescribed as an input where in pre-259 260 vious work it is calculated as a dynamic output. Finally, we assume a constant hydraulic conductivity, while previous models apply a decay of permeability with depth. Despite 261 these differences, our recharge estimates are comparable. 262

We suggest that these low values of mean recharge are simply due to the large surface area,  $A_s$ , of the aquifer relative to its small cross-sectional area,  $A_x$ . This geometric control can be understood by a volume balance over a spherical cap aquifer at steady state. The total rate of recharge is  $Q_r = A_s r$  and the total discharge out of the aquifer is  $Q_d = A_x q_\theta$ , where  $q_\theta$  is volumetric flux from Darcy's law. Total volume balance requires that  $Q_d = Q_r$ , so that

$$\frac{r}{K} = \frac{A_{\rm x}}{A_s} q_\theta \sim \frac{d\Delta h}{R^2} \sim 10^{-5},\tag{5}$$

where  $R \sim 10^6$  m is the radius of Mars,  $d \sim 10^4$  m is the thickness of the aquifer and  $\Delta h \sim 10^3$  m is the elevation change of the groundwater table across the aquifer. Here we have approximated  $A_s \sim R^2$  and  $A_x \sim R$  and Darcy's law as  $q_\theta \sim K\Delta h/R$ . This simple estimate is identical to the r/K ratio obtained from the analytic solution and computed from the numerical models. For a detailed discussion of the total volume balance see SI Section S1.

While previous work has computed specific values of recharge for specific model 269 parameters, our contribution demonstrates the linear relation between r and K that al-270 lows estimates of plausible steady recharge for any presumed value of K. This is valu-271 able precisely because K is highly uncertain and the linear relationship allows investi-272 gation of different scenarios. For example, consider a steady hydrologic cycle where a sig-273 nificant fraction of the precipitation infiltrates and recharges the aquifer, but ground-274 water upwelling is limited to Arabia Terra. To align with published precipitation esti-275 mates, this scenario would require an increase in recharge by almost two orders of mag-276 nitude (Figure 4d). The linear relation between r and K would thus require a two or-277 der of magnitude increase in the mean conductivity of the aquifer to keep upwelling re-278 stricted to Arabia Terra. 279

While local variations in K by several orders of magnitude are not unusual, the K280 in our equations is the average over the entire aquifer. This average includes rapid de-281 cay of the conductivity with depth. As such, it is much less likely that the mean K of 282 the aquifer would increase to the value of  $10^{-5}$  m/s, required to make recharge compa-283 rable to precipitation estimates of more than 1 mm/yr. If conductivity is lower, than as-284 sumed here and in previous work (Clifford, 1993b; Clifford & Parker, 2001; Hanna & Phillips, 285 2005), the r/K-relation requires that groundwater recharge in a steady hydrologic cy-286 cle is orders of magnitude less than published precipitation estimates (Kamada et al., 287 2020; Wordsworth et al., 2015). The difference between estimates of precipitation and 288 groundwater recharge requires that most precipitation becomes overland flow and run 289 off. This implies that surface and subsurface hydrology are only weakly coupled in this 290 particular scenario. 291

All of the above considerations assume a steady hydrological system, because the the model presented here is at steady state. However, Mars hydrological activity is generally thought to occur during short climatic excursions that produce conditions favorable for precipitation (Grotzinger et al., 2014; Wordsworth et al., 2015). In this context, our recharge estimates should be interpreted as average over hydrologically active and
 inactive periods. As such, the recharge during the active periods may exceed the steady state values.

The transient response of the groundwater table to individual ephemeral precipitation events is another possible explanation for the low calculated mean recharge values when compared to previous estimates (Figure 4d). If the transient response time of the aquifer is longer than the timescale of climate excursions producing larger values of recharge, the groundwater table may not breach the surface before the excursion ends and recharge declines. The transient aquifer response will be examined in future work, but this response is likely dependent on initial water table elevations at the beginning of a given climate excursion.

One other consideration is Mars' total water budget, and how that compares to wa-307 ter volumes in our model simulations. With the Arabia Terra shoreline, and our preferred 308 recharge value of  $3 \times 10^{-2}$  mm/yr, the total volume of water contained in the Mars south-309 ern highlands aquifer is  $\sim 670$  m GEL (global equivalent layer) see SI Section S5.2 for 310 calculation. This is a median value when compared to literature values ranging from 100 311 to 1500 m (e.g., Scheller et al., 2021). If the overall water volumes of Mars are sufficient 312 to form standing bodies of surface water, as reflected by the proposed shorelines, then 313 our results show that even very low rates of background groundwater recharge would be 314 sufficient to elevate the water table. This would result in high groundwater tables at the 315 beginning of a climate excursion and may limit the amount of transient recharge pos-316 sible to avoid a wide-spread upwelling scenario. 317

# 318 5 Conclusions

Our analytical and numerical solutions for the Martian highlands aquifer show that 319 the elevation of the groundwater table is controlled by the ratio of the mean recharge 320 to the mean hydraulic conductivity of the aquifer. This allows estimates of plausible recharge 321 rates given any preferred aquifer conductivity. For commonly assumed conductivities of 322 ~  $10^{-7}$  m/s (permeability ~  $10^{-14}$  m<sup>2</sup>) the mean groundwater recharge on the high-323 lands is  $\sim 10^{-2}$  mm/yr. This value is at the low end of previously proposed estimates 324 of aquifer recharge and two orders-of-magnitude below estimates of precipitation. If the 325 hydrologic cycle is at steady-state and published precipitation estimates are correct, then 326 our groundwater models imply that most precipitation must form runoff. 327

# 328 6 Open Research

The code is currently available on Github (https://github.com/ehiatt/Limited -Recharge-of-a-Deep-Groundwater-Aquifer-In1-the-Southern-Highlands-of-Early -Mars). The final version of the code will be uploaded to Zenodo after the review process has completed.

#### 333 Acknowledgments

M.A.H. acknowledges support from NASA Emerging World Grant number 18-EW18\_2-

- <sup>335</sup> 0027. E.H acknowledges support from the Gale White Fellowship from the University
- of Texas Institute for Geophysics (UTIG), #XXXX, and the Fellowship in Planetary Hab-
- itability from the Center for Planetary Systems Habitability (CPSH), #XXXX.

# 338 References

 Andrews-Hanna, & Lewis. (2011). Early Mars hydrology: 2. Hydrological evolution
 in the Noachian and Hesperian epochs. Journal of Geophysical Research E: Planets, 116(2), 1–20. doi: 10.1029/2010JE003709

- Andrews-Hanna, Phillips, R. J., & Zuber, M. T. (2007). Meridiani Planum and the 342 global hydrology of Mars. Nature, 446 (7132), 163–166. doi: 10.1038/nature05594 343 Andrews-Hanna, Zuber, M. T., Arvidson, R. E., & Wiseman, S. M. (2010). Early 344 Mars hydrology: Meridiani playa deposits and the sedimentary record of Ara-345 Journal of Geophysical Research E: Planets, 115(6), 1–22. bia Terra. doi: 346 10.1029/2009JE003485 347 Batchelor, G. (2000). An Introduction to Fluid Dynamics. Cambridge University 348 Press. 349 Bibring, J.-P., Arvidson, R., Gendrin, A., Gondet, B., Langevin, Y., Le Mouelic, 350 S., ... others (2007). Coupled ferric oxides and sulfates on the martian surface. 351 science, 317(5842), 1206–1210. 352 Boussinesq, J. (1903). Théorie Analytique de la Chaleur. Paris: Gauthier-Villars. 353 Cabrol, N. A., & Grin, E. A. (1999). Distribution, classification, and ages of martian 354 impact crater lakes. Icarus, 142(1), 160–172. 355 Carr, M. H. (1986). Mars: A water-rich planet? *Icarus*, 68(2), 187–216. 356 Carr, M. H. (1996). Water on mars. New York: Oxford University Press. 357 Carr, M. H., & Head, J. W. (2003). Oceans on Mars: An assessment of the obser-358 vational evidence and possible fate. Journal of Geophysical Research E: Planets, 359 108(5), 1-28. doi: 10.1029/2002 je001963 360 Carter, J., Poulet, F., Bibring, J.-P., Mangold, N., & Murchie, S. (2013). Hydrous 361 minerals on mars as seen by the crism and omega imaging spectrometers: Up-362 dated global view. Journal of Geophysical Research: Planets, 118(4), 831–858. 363 Chan, N.-H., Perron, J. T., Mitrovica, J. X., & Gomez, N. A. (2018). New evidence 364 of an ancient martian ocean from the global distribution of valley networks. Jour-365 nal of Geophysical Research: Planets, 123(8), 2138–2150. 366 Christensen, P. R., Bandfield, J., Clark, R., Edgett, K., Hamilton, V., Hoefen, T., 367 ... others (2000).Detection of crystalline hematite mineralization on mars by 368 the thermal emission spectrometer: Evidence for near-surface water. Journal of 369 Geophysical Research: Planets, 105(E4), 9623–9642. 370 Citron, R. I., Manga, M., & Hemingway, D. J. (2018).Timing of oceans on mars 371 from shoreline deformation. Nature, 555(7698), 643–646. 372 (1993a). A model for the hydrologic and climatic behavior of water on Clifford, S. 373 mars. Journal of Geophysical Research: Planets, 98(E6), 10973–11016. 374 Clifford, S. (1993b). A model for the hydrologic and climatic behavior of water 375 on Mars. Journal of Geophysical Research, 98(E6), 10973–11016. doi: 10.1029/ 376 93je00225 377 Clifford, S., & Parker, T. (2001). The evolution of the martian hydrosphere: Im-378 plications for the fate of a primordial ocean and the current state of the northern 379 plains. Icarus, 154(1), 40–79. 380 Davis, J., Balme, M., Grindrod, P., Williams, R., & Gupta, S. (2016).Extensive 381 noachian fluvial systems in arabia terra: Implications for early martian climate. 382 Geology, 44(10), 847-850.383 Di Achille, G., & Hynek, B. M. (2010). Ancient ocean on mars supported by global 384 distribution of deltas and valleys. Nature Geoscience, 3(7), 459–463. 385 Dohm, J., Hare, T., Robbins, S., Williams, J.-P., Soare, R., El-Maarry, M. R., ... 386
- others (2015). Geological and hydrological histories of the argyre province, mars. *Icarus*, 253, 66–98.
- Dupuit, J. (1863). Etudes théoriques et pratiques sur le mouvement des eaux dans les canaux découverts et àtravers les terrains perméable (2nd ed.). Paris: Dunod.
- Ehlmann, B. L., Mustard, J. F., Swayze, G. A., Clark, R. N., Bishop, J. L., Poulet,
   F., ... others (2009). Identification of hydrated silicate minerals on mars using
   mro-crism: Geologic context near nili fossae and implications for aqueous alter ation. Journal of Geophysical Research: Planets, 114 (E2).
- Fassett, C., & Head, J. W. (2008a). The timing of martian valley network activity:

- Constraints from buffered crater counting. Icarus, 195(1), 61-89.
- Fassett, C., & Head, J. W. (2008b). Valley network-fed, open-basin lakes on mars:
   Distribution and implications for noachian surface and subsurface hydrology.
   *Icarus*, 198(1), 37–56.
- Fastook, J. L., & Head, J. W. (2015). Glaciation in the late noachian icy highlands: Ice accumulation, distribution, flow rates, basal melting, and top-down melting
  rates and patterns. *Planetary and Space Science*, 106, 82-98. Retrieved from https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0032063314003924
  doi: https://doi.org/10.1016/j.pss.2014.11.028
- Forchheimer, P. (1901). Wasserbewegung durch Boden. Zeitschrift des Vereins
   Deutscher Ingenieure, 45, 1782–1788.
- Frey, H. (2008). Ages of very large impact basins on Mars: Implications for the
  late heavy bombardment in the inner solar system. *Geophysical Research Letters*,
  35(13), 1–4. doi: 10.1029/2008GL033515
- Goldspiel, J. M., & Squyres, S. W. (1991). Ancient aqueous sedimentation on mars. *Icarus*, 89(2), 392–410.
- 412 Golombek, M., Grant, J. A., Parker, T., Kass, D., Crisp, J., Squyres, S. W., ...
- others (2003). Selection of the mars exploration rover landing sites. Journal of
   Geophysical Research: Planets, 108(E12).
- Grotzinger, J. P., Arvidson, R., Bell Iii, J., Calvin, W., Clark, B., Fike, D., ... others (2005). Stratigraphy and sedimentology of a dry to wet eolian depositional
  system, burns formation, meridiani planum, mars. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 240(1), 11–72.
- Grotzinger, J. P., Sumner, D. Y., Kah, L., Stack, K., Gupta, S., Edgar, L., ... others (2014). A habitable fluvio-lacustrine environment at yellowknife bay, gale crater, mars. *Science*, 343(6169), 1242777.
- Hanna, & Phillips, R. J. (2005). Hydrological modeling of the Martian crust with
  application to the pressurization of aquifers. Journal of Geophysical Research E:
  Planets, 110(1), 1–19. doi: 10.1029/2004JE002330
- Hargitai, H. I., Gulick, V. C., & Glines, N. H. (2018). Paleolakes of northeast hellas:
  Precipitation, groundwater-fed, and fluvial lakes in the navua-hadriacus-ausonia
  region, mars. Astrobiology, 18(11), 1435–1459.
- Harrison, K. P., & Grimm, R. E. (2009, 4). Regionally compartmented groundwater
  flow on Mars. Journal of Geophysical Research E: Planets, 114(4). doi: 10.1029/
  2008JE003300
- Hiesinger, H., & Head, J. W. (2002). Topography and morphology of the argyre
  basin, mars: implications for its geologic and hydrologic history. *Planetary and Space Science*, 50(10-11), 939–981.
- Hoke, M. R., Hynek, B. M., & Tucker, G. E. (2011). Formation timescales of large martian valley networks. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 312(1-2), 1–12.
- Horvath, D. G., & Andrews-Hanna, J. C. (2017). Reconstructing the past climate at
  gale crater, mars, from hydrological modeling of late-stage lakes. *Geophysical Research Letters*, 44 (16), 8196–8204.
- Hynek, B. M., & Phillips, R. J. (2001). Evidence for extensive denudation of the
  martian highlands. *Geology*, 29(5), 407–410.
- 441 Kamada, A., Kuroda, T., Kasaba, Y., Terada, N., Nakagawa, H., & Toriumi, K.
- (2020). A coupled atmosphere–hydrosphere global climate model of early mars:
  A 'cool and wet' scenario for the formation of water channels. *Icarus*, 338,
  113567. Retrieved from https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/
  pii/S0019103518300927 doi: https://doi.org/10.1016/j.icarus.2019.113567
- LeVeque, R. (1992). Numerical Methods for Conservation Laws. Birkhaeuser Verlag.
- Luo, W., Grudzinski, B., & Pederson, D. (2011). Estimating hydraulic conductivity
- for the martian subsurface based on drainage patterns—a case study in the mare tyrrhenum quadrangle. *Geomorphology*, 125(3), 414–420.

- Luo, W., & Howard, A. (2008, 5). Computer simulation of the role of groundwater seepage in forming Martian valley networks. *Journal of Geophysical Re- search*, 113(E5), E05002. Retrieved from http://doi.wiley.com/10.1029/
  2007 JE002981 doi: 10.1029/2007 JE002981
- Malin, M. C., & Edgett, K. S. (1999). Oceans or seas in the martian northern low lands: High resolution imaging tests of proposed coastlines. *Geophysical Research Letters*, 26(19), 3049–3052.
- <sup>457</sup> McLennan, S. M., Bell Iii, J., Calvin, W., Christensen, P., Clark, B. d., De Souza,
- P.,... others (2005). Provenance and diagenesis of the evaporite-bearing burns formation, meridiani planum, mars. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 240(1), 95–121.
- Milton, D. J. (1973). Water and processes of degradation in the martian landscape. Journal of Geophysical Research, 78(20), 4037–4047.
  - Mustard, J. F., Murchie, S. L., Pelkey, S., Ehlmann, B., Milliken, R., Grant, J. A.,

463

464

465

- $\dots$  others (2008). Hydrated silicate minerals on mars observed by the mars reconnaissance orbiter crism instrument. *Nature*, 454(7202), 305–309.
- Parker, T., Clifford, S., & Banerdt, W. (2000). Argyre planitia and the mars global
  hydrologic cycle. In *Lunar and planetary science conference* (p. 2033).
- Parker, T., Gorsline, D., Saunders, R., Pieri, D. C., & Schneeberger, D. M. (1993).
   Coastal geomorphology of the Martian northern plains. Journal of Geophysical Research, 98(E6), 11061–11078. Retrieved from http://doi.wiley.com/
   10.1029/93JE00618 doi: 10.1029/93JE00618
- Parker, T., Saunders, S., & Schneeberger, D. (1989). Transitional morphology
  in west deuteronilus mensae, mars: Implications for modification of the lowland/upland boundary. *Icarus*, 82(1), 111–145.
- Perron, J., Mitrovica, J., Manga, M., Matsuyama, I., & Richards, M. (2007). Evidence for an ancient martian ocean in the topography of deformed shorelines. Nature, 447(7146), 840–843. doi: 10.1038/nature05873
- Ramirez, R. M., Craddock, R. A., & Usui, T. (2020). Climate simulations of early
   mars with estimated precipitation, runoff, and erosion rates. Journal of Geophysi *cal Research: Planets*, 125(3), e2019JE006160.
- Salese, F., Pondrelli, M., Neeseman, A., Schmidt, G., & Ori, G. G. (2019). Geological evidence of planet-wide groundwater system on mars. *Journal of Geophysical Research: Planets*, 124 (2), 374–395.
- Scheller, E., Ehlmann, B., Hu, R., Adams, D., & Yung, Y. (2021). Long-term drying of mars by sequestration of ocean-scale volumes of water in the crust. *Science*,
  372(6537), 56–62.
- Shadab, M., Hiatt, E., & Hesse, M. (2022). Estimates of martian mean recharge rates from analytic groundwater models. LPI Contributions, 2678, 1775.
- Sholes, S. F., Dickeson, Z. I., Montgomery, D. R., & Catling, D. C. (2021). Where
  are mars' hypothesized ocean shorelines? large lateral and topographic offsets between different versions of paleoshoreline maps. Journal of Geophysical Research:
  Planets, 126(5), e2020JE006486.
- Sholes, S. F., Montgomery, D. R., & Catling, D. C. (2019). Quantitative high resolution reexamination of a hypothesized ocean shoreline in cydonia mensae on
   *Journal of Geophysical Research: Planets*, 124 (2), 316–336.
- Sholes, S. F., & Rivera-Hernández, F. (2022). Constraints on the uncertainty, timing, and magnitude of potential mars oceans from topographic deformation
   models. *Icarus*, 378, 114934. Retrieved from https://www.sciencedirect.com/
   science/article/pii/S0019103522000550 doi: https://doi.org/10.1016/
   j.icarus.2022.114934
- <sup>501</sup> Smith, D. E., Zuber, M. T., Solomon, S. C., Phillips, R. J., Head, J. W., Garvin, <sup>502</sup> J. B., ... others (1999). The global topography of mars and implications for
- surface evolution. *science*, 284(5419), 1495-1503.

- Squyres, S. W., Grotzinger, J. P., Arvidson, R. E., Bell III, J. F., Calvin, W., Chris-504 tensen, P. R., ... others (2004). In situ evidence for an ancient aqueous environ-505 ment at meridiani planum, mars. science, 306(5702), 1709–1714. 506 Stucky de Quay, G., Goudge, T. A., Kite, E. S., Fassett, C. I., & Guzewich, S. D. 507 (2021). Limits on runoff episode duration for early mars: Integrating lake hydrol-508 ogy and climate models. Geophysical Research Letters, 48(15), e2021GL093523. 509 von Paris, P., Petau, A., Grenfell, J., Hauber, E., Breuer, D., Jaumann, R., ... 510 Tirsch. D. (2015).Estimating precipitation on early mars using a radiative-511 convective model of the atmosphere and comparison with inferred runoff from 512 geomorphology. Planetary and Space Science, 105, 133-147. Retrieved from 513 https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0032063314003778 514 doi: https://doi.org/10.1016/j.pss.2014.11.018 515 Werner, S. (2008). The early martian evolution—constraints from basin formation 516 ages. Icarus, 195(1), 45-60. 517 Wilson, S. A., Moore, J. M., Howard, A. D., & Wilhelms, D. E. (2010). Evidence for 518 ancient lakes in the hellas region. Lakes on Mars, 195–222. 519 Wordsworth, R. D., Kerber, L., Pierrehumbert, R. T., Forget, F., & Head, J. W. 520
- <sup>521</sup> (2015, 6). Comparison of "warm and wet" and "cold and icy" scenarios for early
- 522
   Mars in a 3-D climate model.
   Journal of Geophysical Research: Planets, 120(6),

   523
   1201-1219. Retrieved from http://doi.wiley.com/10.1002/2015JE004787
   doi:

   524
   10.1002/2015JE004787
- Zhao, J., Xiao, L., & Glotch, T. D. (2020). Paleolakes in the northwest hellas re gion, mars: Implications for the regional geologic history and paleoclimate. Jour nal of Geophysical Research: Planets, 125(3), e2019JE006196.

-15-