# Long-term Trends in the Upper atmosphere using the incoherent scatter radar observations over Arecibo

Selvaraj Dharmalingam<sup>1</sup>, Michael P. Sulzer<sup>2</sup>, Shun-Rong Zhang<sup>3</sup>, Christiano Garnett Marques Brum<sup>4</sup>, and Nestor Aponte<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Arecibo Observatory / UCF <sup>2</sup>Arecibo Observatory <sup>3</sup>MIT Haystack Observatory <sup>4</sup>Arecibo Observatory/University of Central Florida

November 22, 2022

### Abstract

Upper atmospheric long-term trends could be examined in the ion temperatures (\$T\_i\$) at the ionospheric F-region altitudes by the close coupling between neutrals and ions. We have analyzed the \$T\_i\$ data sets of Arecibo Observatory (AO) incoherent scatter radar (18\textdegree20'N, 66\textdegree45'W) from 1985 to 2019, to examine the long-term trends of the ion temperature as a function of height from \$\sim\$140 km to \$\sim\$677 km. For this, the responses of \$T\_i\$ to solar and geomagnetic activities have been taken into account as forcings of the \$T\_i\$ behavior as well the annual and semi-annual oscillations. By removing the known forcing that govern the Ti behavior by the difference between the \$T\_i\$ data and a climatological model, our results indicate that the upper atmosphere/ionosphere over Arecibo is cooling over the 35 years studied. Around 350 km, our findings also show that the rate of cooling over Arecibo is lower than previously reported for high latitudes, suggesting a latitudinal dependency. These cooling trends are believed to be the result of increasing green house gases, but the observed cooling trends exceed the magnitude of the cooling expected from green house gases. We have made an attempt to find the additional driver for observed cooling trends by linking the these upper atmospheric trends to lower atmospheric weather phenomena. We found that gravity waves in the lower atmosphere associated with terrestrial weather phenomena might be contributing to the observed cooling trends in the upper atmosphere.











### Long-term Trends in the Upper atmosphere using the incoherent scatter radar observations over Arecibo

### D. Selvaraj<sup>1</sup>, Michael P. Sulzer<sup>1</sup>, Shun-Rong Zhang<sup>2</sup>, Christiano G. M. Brum<sup>1</sup>, and Nestor Aponte<sup>1</sup>

 $^1{\rm Arecibo}$  Observatory, University of Central Florida (UCF), Arecibo, Puerto Rico $^2{\rm Haystack}$  Observatory, Massachusetts Institute of Technology, Westford, Massachusetts, USA

### Key Points:

1

2

3

5

7 8 9

10

| • | Long | g-terr | n trer | nds of | ion t | empera | ature   | $\operatorname{at}$ | Arecibo | $\operatorname{show}$ | upper | $\operatorname{atm}$ | ospher | e is co | ool- |
|---|------|--------|--------|--------|-------|--------|---------|---------------------|---------|-----------------------|-------|----------------------|--------|---------|------|
|   | ing. |        |        |        |       |        |         |                     |         |                       |       |                      |        |         |      |
|   | m i  | 1 (    | ••     |        |       | 1      | 1 . • . | 1.                  | 1 1     | 1                     |       | · 11                 |        | 0501    |      |

- Trends of ion temperature show latitudinal dependency especially at  $\sim 350$  km.
- Gravity waves may be one of the contributing factor to the observed cooling over
   Arecibo; these waves might be generated by lower atmospheric weather phenom ena.

 $Corresponding \ author: \ Selvaraj \ Dharmaling am, \ {\tt selvaraj@naic.edu}$ 

### 14 Abstract

Upper atmospheric long-term trends could be examined in the ion temperatures  $(T_i)$  at 15 the ionospheric F-region altitudes by the close coupling between neutrals and ions. We 16 have analyzed the  $T_i$  data sets of Arecibo Observatory (AO) incoherent scatter radar (18°20'N, 17  $66^{\circ}45'W$ ) from 1985 to 2019, to examine the long-term trends of the ion temperature as 18 a function of height from  $\sim 140$  km to  $\sim 677$  km. For this, the responses of  $T_i$  to solar 19 and geomagnetic activities have been taken into account as forcings of the  $T_i$  behavior 20 as well the annual and semi-annual oscillations. By removing the known forcing that gov-21 ern the Ti behavior by the difference between the  $T_i$  data and a climatological model, 22 our results indicate that the upper atmosphere/ionosphere over Arecibo is cooling over 23 the 35 years studied. Around 350 km, our findings also show that the rate of cooling over 24 Arecibo is lower than previously reported for high latitudes, suggesting a latitudinal de-25 pendency. These cooling trends are believed to be the result of increasing green house 26 gases, but the observed cooling trends exceed the magnitude of the cooling expected from 27 green house gases. We have made an attempt to find the additional driver for observed 28 cooling trends by linking the these upper atmospheric trends to lower atmospheric weather 29 phenomena. We found that gravity waves in the lower atmosphere associated with ter-30 restrial weather phenomena might be contributing to the observed cooling trends in the 31 upper atmosphere. 32

### **1 Introduction**

The concentration of greenhouse gases in the lower atmosphere is increasing as a 34 result man made activity. These anthropogenic greenhouse gases lead to the global warm-35 ing in the lower atmosphere, but are expected to cool the upper atmosphere (Roble & 36 Dickinson, 1989; Laštovička, 2021; Laštovička, 2015; Laštovička et al., 2006). However, 37 this cooling could also be additionally caused by long-term changes in geomagnetic ac-38 tivity (Mikhailov, 2006; Liu et al., 2021), changes in the earth's magnetic field (Cnossen 39 & Maute, 2020; Cnossen, 2014; Qian et al., 2021; Yue et al., 2018), gravity wave activ-40 ities (Oliver et al., 2013; Yiğit & Medvede, 2009), and also other drivers which are in 41 debate (Oliver et al., 2013, 2014, 2015; Laštovička, 2015). 42

Studies of long-term changes of the upper atmosphere/ionosphere have started af-43 ter the modeling work of Roble and Dickinson (1989), who presented the changes in tem-44 perature and density from doubling of the CO2 and CH4 concentrations, finding both 45 atmospheric cooling and density decreases. Also they found lowered E- and F- layer peak 46 densities and reduction of atmospheric drag on satellites. Rishbeth (1990) also predicted 47 a decrease in thermospheric density in response to an increase in the concentration of 48 greenhouse gases. Long-term changes in the densities were studied using the near-Earth 49 space objects of 1996-2001, in the height range of 200-700 km in order to understand in-50 fluences by the cooling effect of increased greenhouse gases (Emmert et al., 2004). It 51 was found that the densities are decreasing (Emmert et al., 2004, 2008, 2010; Emmert, 52 2015; Keating et al., 2000; Cai et al., 2019) in the range of -2% to -5% per decade at those 53 heights as predicted by the theory. Density decrease is also seen  $\sim 350$  km when the ef-54 fect of solar variability was avoided by evaluating only the solar minimum years (Emmert 55 et al., 2004). 56

Lowering of peak height of the F2-layer (hmF2) was found in ionospheric long-term 57 trend studies, (Bremer, 1992; Santos et al., 2011; Brum et al., 2011), which could be as-58 sociated to the changes of the meridional neutral wind component that became more pole-59 ward as reported by (Brum et al., 2012). It may be mentioned that stronger zonal winds 60 are connected with larger gravity wave amplitudes in the mesosphere over mid-latitude 61 (Jacobi, 2014). The long-term trends of ionosonde based studies used the values of hmF2, 62 but changes in it could be caused not only by the neutral temperature and aforemen-63 tioned winds, but possibly also by electric fields (Holt & Zhang, 2008). Holt and Zhang 64

(2008) pointed out a few more disadvantages in using the hmF2 for inferring the trends of neutral temperature, and also they stated that the ion temperature  $(T_i)$  is good representative of neutral temperature at certain heights where there exists a close coupling between neutrals and ion components (Holt & Zhang, 2008).

Holt and Zhang (2008) used  $T_i$  data from the Millstone Hill Incoherent Scatter Radar 69 (ISR) from 1978 to 2007 for long-term studies,  $T_i$  and  $T_n$  (-5 K/year) from 375 km have 70 negative trend much greater than anticipated from Roble and Dickinson (1989). This 71 trend of  $T_i$  matches with that of the St. Santin ISR at the same altitude (Donaldson 72 73 et al., 2010). Four solar cycle of Millstone Hill ISR data (1968-2006) was analysed for the long-term trend at noon in the altitude range of 100-550 km. A cooling trend was 74 found above 200 km and it increases with altitude; also a warming trend was also found 75 below 200 km (Zhang et al., 2011). Zhang et al. (2011) stated that their height vari-76 ation patterns are in agreement with the models predicting the response of the ionosphere 77 to the changes in concentration of greenhouse gas. Ogawa et al. (2014) have found com-78 parable values but not exact values of observed  $T_i$  trends with the model predictions; 79 they used the ISR observations of EISCAT UHF radar at Tromso during 1981-2013. 80

(Zhang & Holt, 2013) used Millstone Hill ISR data to understand the long-term 81 cooling as functions of local time, season, solar activity and geomagnetic activity. Zhang 82 and Holt (2013) found stronger cooling trends during daytime than nighttime. They also 83 found negligible seasonal variation in the  $T_i$  trend, in agreement with the negligible sea-84 sonal variation in neutral density trends of Emmert et al. (2004) (Zhang & Holt, 2013). 85 Strong cooling trends were found during solar minimum whereas less cooling or warm-86 ing were found during solar maximum. It was speculated that a fraction of cooling trend 87 was due to gradual shifting of Millstone Hill away from sub-auroral region (Zhang & 88 Holt, 2013). 89

Zhang et al. (2016) analyzed two high-latitude ISR site data sets (Sondrestrom
during 1990–2015, Chatanika/Poker Flat during 1976–2015 with a gap in 1983–2006) for
a comprehensive study on long-term trends and also for a comparison with the Millstone
Hill ISR data. Zhang et al. (2016) concluded that the upper atmosphere is cooling globally, especially above 200 km. Above 275 km, cooling trends have geomagnetic latitudinal dependency. The cooling trends were found to be much greater than the model predicated for the increase in the concentration of greenhouse gases.

Discrepancy between model predicated values and observed trends of cooling are 97 not yet fully understood. Lack of understanding in long-term trends could be due to the 98 limited amount of well-calibrated data and its availability (Ogawa et al., 2014). It may 99 need further studies to understand the variability in derived cooling trends as mentioned 100 by Zhang et al. (2016). In order to understand the long-term trend of ion temperature 101 in the upper atmosphere and its geomagnetic latitude dependency, we made an attempt 102 to find the long-terms trends of  $T_i$  over Arecibo using Arecibo Observatory ISR data sets 103 from 1985-2019. And then we compared them with the long-term trends of Debye ra-104 dius  $(L_d)$ , Debye number $(L_n)$  and Mean-Free-Path  $(L_{mfp})$  for local midnight in order 105 to understand the influence of cooling and density depletion on the plasma parameters. 106 In order to understand the geomagnetic latitude dependency of  $T_i$  trends, we have com-107 pared the estimated  $T_i$  trends of AO-ISR (Arecibo Observatory incoherent scatter radar) 108 with those of other ISRs. 109

### <sup>110</sup> 2 Data Analysis

111

### 2.1 Estimation of $T_i$ Residuals

<sup>112</sup> We have analysed the ion temperature  $(T_i)$  from ion-line data sets which were ob-<sup>113</sup> tained from the Arecibo Observatory Incoherent Scatter Radar (AO-ISR) (18°20'N, 66°45'W). <sup>114</sup> The AO-ISR ion-line data sets were processed in different ways. We use the data which

were processed by the world day standard algorithm. These data sets are available from 115 October 1985, and so throughout three solar cycles. We use the ISR data from 1985 to 116 2019 at all zenith angles; the AO-ISR could steer the beam up to  $20^{\circ}$  of off-zenith, and 117 these data cover all the hours and months as shown in Figure 1, especially in the fig-118 ure of hour vs month. No ISR data is available during 1996 and 2007 as shown in year 119 vs hour of data distribution. There are data gaps which are represented by white/blank 120 space in the figure of year vs month. It can be mentioned that hourly median values are 121 used to generate this data distribution. Since AO-ISR observations had different time 122 and altitude resolutions, altitude resolution is fixed to be  $\sim 36$  km in order to bin the  $T_i$ 123 data into 19 altitude bins from  $\sim 100$  to  $\sim 750$  km. Three altitude bins, the first bin and 124 last two bins, were removed from further analysis since there were few data points. Hence, 125  $T_i$  trends are calculated for 16 altitude bins which center at 140, 176, 212, 247, 283, 319, 126 355, 391, 427, 462, 498, 534, 570, 606, 642, and 677. 127



**Figure 1.** Temporal distribution of ion temperatures from 1985 to 2019 over Arecibo; (a) year Vs local time, (b) year Vs month, and (c) hour Vs month. The scale represents number of hours.

128 129 130

131

132

133

Climatological models could be less reliable when there are geomagnetic disturbed conditions or extremely high solar activity. In order to remove such effects, we rejected the  $T_i$  values corresponding to the solar flux at 10.7 cm at  $F_{10.7} > 300$  and geomagnetic activity at ap > 80. Monthly median values of  $T_i$  are estimated for the  $T_i$  trend calculations in order to eliminate the issues in observations such as short-term correlations over days/hours, oversampling and outliers (Holt & Zhang, 2008; Zhang et al., 2016). For the  $T_i$  trend calculations, minimum number of data points are set to be more than 6 points in each altitude bin. (Holt & Zhang, 2008; Zhang et al., 2016).

 $T_i$  data are binned into altitude and monthly bins for constructing a  $T_i$  model.  $T_i$ s corresponding to local mid-noon (16 UT) and mid-night (4 UT) are taken within ±3 hours of these times for comparison between day and night, (Zhang et al., 2016).



Figure 2. Monthly medians of ion temperature within  $\pm 3$  hour of local noon (black dot) at various altitudes (the red crosses represents the yearly medians). The two bottom panels of each column are solar flux and geomagnetic activity corresponding to the study period.

Figure 2 shows the monthly median of  $T_i$  (black dot) at various altitudes along 139 with corresponding  $F_{10.7}$  and  $A_p$  index. The  $T_i$  values are within  $\pm 3$  hours of local noon. 140 Night values are not presented here but those also have similar dependence on  $F_{10.7}$  and 141  $A_p$  index. Red-plus-symbols indicate the yearly medians. Monthly and yearly medians 142 of ISR observed  $T_i$  have trends similar to those of the  $F_{10.7}$  and  $A_p$  indices. Variation 143 of  $T_i$  shows the strong dependence on  $F_{10,7}$ . This means that the influences of solar and 144 magnetic activity on  $T_i$  need to be removed in order to reveal the trend caused by un-145 known drivers. It can be mentioned that continuous observations of  $T_i$  are not available 146 for all the the day and night. So that there are data gaps, especially above  $\sim 620$  km 147

in day and below  $\sim 200$  km in night (not shown here). Those altitude ranges are included instead of removing, to have a consistency in altitude ranges during day and night.

For a given altitude bin,  $T_i$  variations are modeled for each time bin based on a least square fitting using the monthly median of the ISR observed  $T_i$ , monthly median of solar flux at 10.7 cm and monthly median of  $A_p$  index (Holt & Zhang, 2008; Zhang et al., 2011; Zhang & Holt, 2013; Zhang et al., 2016) while taking into account the annual- and semi- annual oscillations also. Variation of  $T_i$  is modeled based on the equation given by Zhang et al. (2016), as shown in Equation 1:

$$T_{i} = T_{b} + t(y - \bar{y}) + \sum_{n=1}^{2} [a_{n} \sin(2\pi nd/365) + b_{n} \cos(2\pi nd/365)] + f_{1}(F_{10.7} - \overline{F_{10.7}}) + f_{2}(F_{10.7} - \overline{F_{10.7}})^{2} + a(Ap - \overline{Ap}) + R$$
(1)

where,  $T_b$  - background constant term, y - floating-point year,  $\overline{y}$  - mean floating year, t - long-term trend, d - day number of the year,  $F_{10.7}$  - monthly solar flux in sfu,  $\overline{F_{10.7}}$ - mean of solar flux over entire time series,  $A_p - A_p$  index,  $\overline{A_p}$  - mean of  $A_p$  index over entire time series, R - fitting residual. The coefficients  $T_b$ , t,  $f_1$ ,  $f_2$  and a are estimated for each altitude bin by least-square fitting method.

156

178

179

For a given component (long-term trend  $/F_{10.7}$   $/A_p$  index), the  $T_i$  residuals are ob-162 tained by removing contribution of the other two components (estimated) from the ISR 163 observed  $T_i$ . The detailed procedures to obtain the  $T_i$  residual are given in Holt and Zhang 164 (2008); Zhang et al. (2011); Zhang and Holt (2013); Zhang et al. (2016). In order to make 165 the comparison of  $T_i$  trends among the ISR sites, a similar method has been used in this 166 study for error estimations also as in Holt and Zhang (2008); Zhang et al. (2011); Zhang 167 and Holt (2013); Zhang et al. (2016). In error estimation, 10000 bootstrap samples are 168 used in order to compute the errors in 95% confidence intervals. 169

# 2.2 Estimation of Debye Parameters, Mean-Free-Path and its Residu als

<sup>172</sup> Debye radius  $(L_d)$ , Debye number $(L_n)$  and Mean-Free-Path $(L_{mfp})$  are calculated <sup>173</sup> at the condition of thermal equilibrium when ratio of electron temperature to ion tem-<sup>174</sup> perature is one. Since it occurs at nighttime; we have calculated the Debye radius  $(L_d)$ , <sup>175</sup> Debye number $(L_n)$  and Mean-Free-Path $(L_{mfp})$  for local mid-night (4 UT) with  $\pm 3$  hour <sup>176</sup> by following the Equations 2, 3, and 4 given by Livadiotis (2019); Goldston and Ruther-<sup>177</sup> ford (1995)

$$L_d = \sqrt{\frac{\epsilon_0 k_B T_e}{N_e e^2}} \tag{2}$$

$$L_n = \frac{4\pi}{3} N_e L_d^3 \tag{3}$$

$$L_{mfp} = \frac{64\sqrt{6\pi}\epsilon_0^2 (k_B T_e)^2}{e^4 N_e * ln(9L_n)}$$
(4)

where  $\epsilon_0$  is the free space permittivity,  $k_B$  is the Boltzmann constant,  $T_e$  is the electron temperature,  $N_e$  is the ISR retrieved electron density, and e is the charge of electron.

In order to calculate the trend residual of  $L_d$ ,  $L_n$ , and  $L_{mfp}$ , we have used the Equation 1 by replacing the temperature term with  $L_d$ ,  $L_n$ , and  $L_{mfp}$ , respectively. Also a negative sign was assigned in the equation for solar the flux and  $A_p$  index, since a negative correlation coefficient is found in relation with  $L_d$ ,  $L_n$ , and  $L_{mfp}$ , even though it is small value as shown in Figure 3.



**Figure 3.** Dispersion diagram of  $L_d$ ,  $L_n$ , and  $L_{mfp}$  against solar flux (F10.7) and geomagnetic activity ( $A_p$  index) (upper and bottom rows, respectively). (a)  $F_{10.7}$  Vs  $L_d$ , (b)  $A_p$  Vs  $L_d$ , (c)  $F_{10.7}$  Vs  $L_n$ , (d)  $A_p$  Vs  $L_n$ , (e)  $F_{10.7}$  Vs  $L_{mfp}$ , (f)  $A_p$  Vs  $L_{mfp}$ ,

### 188 **3 Results**

#### 189 190

# 3.1 $T_i$ trend and dependency of $T_i$ on solar activity and geomagnetic activity

The  $T_i$  residuals are presented in Figure 4 for daytime. The  $T_i$  residuals are cal-191 culated by removing the contributions from annual, semi-annual oscillation, as well as 192 solar and geomagnetic activity. In Figure 4,  $T_i$  residuals (monthly median-black and yearly 193 median-green) are shown at various altitudes from  $\sim$ 122-700 km along with number of 194 months (No.), trend line (solid black line) and its slope (m), error (confidence level of 195 95%), and correlation coefficient (r) between  $T_i$  and floating year.  $T_i$  residuals spread 196 around the trend line which means that those residuals are origin of ionospheric weather 197 rather than statistical noise. Altitudes above  $\sim 480$  km are having larger errors (-2K/year) 198 relatively than lower altitudes. Other than the highest altitude which does not have enough 199 data points to represent the 3 solar cycles, the largest error is found to be -5.98 corre-200 sponding to 67 points at the altitude bin of  $\sim 623.6-659.5$  km. Most of the times, very 201 large errors are associated with too few data points. In order to eliminate such bias in 202 interpretation, we have removed the trends of those altitudes (day:  $\sim$ 516.1-695.3 km; 203 night:  $\sim 122-193.7$  km) in further analysis whose errors are more (< -2.7 which is the al-204 lowed largest error taken from largest error nighttime). Even with the large error, 205 we preserve the altitude of 122-157.9 km during daytime which has positive trend (for 206 sake of discussion). 207

All the altitudes having the cooling  $T_i$  trends, which vary from -0.31 K/year to -9.96 K/year during the daytime except the altitude bin of ~122-158 km. Strong cooling of -9.96 K/year occurs at the altitude bin of ~623.6-659.5 km where high errors are seen. Weakest cooling of -0.31 K/year occurring at ~193.7-229.5 km with error of 0.56 K/year.

<sup>213</sup>  $T_i$  residuals during nighttime for components of year is shown in figure 5. First <sup>214</sup> two lower altitude bins (~122-158 km & ~158-194 km) fewer than 60 samples. In the <sup>215</sup> altitude bin of ~194-230 km, a weak warming trend is found. Above ~230 km, cooling



Temperature residuals (K) during Day

Figure 4. Daytime  $T_i$  Residuals as a function of year and altitude along with trend line (black solid line) and its statistics (slope (m), standard error (Err), and correlation coefficient (r) between  $T_i$  and floating year). Monthly medians are in black crosses and yearly medians are in green crosses.

trends are gradually increasing as a function of altitude. These cooling  $T_i$  trends vary 216 from -0.54 K/year to -4.59 K/year during the nighttime. Strong cooling of -4.59 K/year 217 occurring at the altitude bin of  $\sim$ 623.6-659.5 km where the strong cooling is also found 218 during daytime, but with a different magnitude. Weakest cooling of -0.54 K/year occurs 219 at the altitude bin of  $\sim$  337-372.8 km with error of 0.32 K/year. The  $T_i$  residuals for the 220 components of  $F_{10.7}$  and  $A_p$  have been calculated for each altitude as as in figure 4 & 221 5 but are not shown here. Indeed, the ratios  $\delta Ti$  /  $\delta f10.7$  (K/sfu) and  $\delta Ti$  /  $\delta Ap$  (K/ap) 222 are shown as function of altitude along with  $T_i$  trends in Figure 6. 223

In Figure 6, the estimated  $T_i$  trends, the  $F_{10.7}$  and to the  $A_p$  index for day (red) 224 and night (black) are presented as function of altitude, (a)  $T_i$  trend (K/year), (b)  $\delta T_i$ 225  $/\delta f10.7$  (K/sfu), and (c)  $\delta Ti / \delta Ap$  (K/ap). Large errors are found to occur in the lower 226 altitudes (less than  $\sim 200$  km) during nighttime whereas the same do occur in the higher 227 altitudes during daytime.  $T_i$  trends are negative in all the altitude ranges except the lower 228 altitude bin of  $\sim$ 122-158 km during daytime and  $\sim$ 194-230 km during nighttime. Esti-229 mated  $T_i$  trends are varying from -0.63 K/year to -13.5 K/year, indicating the cooling 230 trend overall ionosphere during day and night.  $T_i$  trends are almost comparable between 231 day and night in the altitude range of  $\sim 200-450$  km even though the cooling trends are 232 little stronger in daytime than nighttime. Above 480 km,  $T_i$  trends of nighttime show 233 the less cooling than daytime. 234

Figure 6(b) shows the altitude variation of  $\delta Ti / \delta f10.7$  (K/sfu). In order to check 235 the linear relation between  $\delta$ Ti and  $\delta$ f10.7, we have calculated the linear correlation co-236 efficient between them. A strong linear relationship is found between  $T_i$  residuals and 237  $F_{10.7}$ . The large values of positive linear correlation coefficients (r) are varying from 0.77 238 to 0.93 within the altitude range of  $\sim$ 158-445 km during daytime. The linear relation-239 ship is positive from  $\sim 120$  km to  $\sim 550$  km during daytime whereas the this positive re-240 lationship is found to occur in all the altitudes during nighttime. During daytime,  $\delta Ti$ 241  $/ \delta f10.7$  (K/sfu) are large around 310 km where electron density peaks during daytime. 242 and gradual decrease is found to occur around that altitude, similar to electron density 243 profile. It might be due to electron heating of the the ions through collisions. This al-244 titude variation of  $\delta Ti$  /  $\delta f10.7$  (K/sfu) during daytime is consistent with results of Son-245 drestrom Zhang et al. (2016). During nighttime, the large values of positive linear cor-246 relation coefficients(r) are varying from 0.76 to 0.95 within the altitude range of  $\sim 230$ -247 695 km. And also  $\delta Ti / \delta f10.7$  (K/sfu) are increasing gradually as a function of altitude. 248 Profiles of  $\delta Ti$  /  $\delta f10.7$  (K/sfu) are not the same during day and night. Above the peak 249 altitude of  $\sim 300$  km, the daytime profile of  $\delta Ti / \delta f10.7$  (K/sfu) is decreasing as a func-250 tion of altitude whereas it is increasing as a function of altitude during nighttime. It prob-251 ably means that the solar activity influences the ion temperatures uniformly in the al-252 titude range of  $\sim 200-700$  km during nighttime. Whereas, solar activity influences are dif-253 ferent on ion temperatures in each altitude during daytime. These day and night vari-254 ability of  $\delta Ti$  /  $\delta f10.7$  are different from Sondrestrom since Sondrestrom observed the 255 same feature of variability between day and night but with different magnitude (Zhang 256 et al., 2016). In comparison,  $T_i$  is sensitive to  $F_{10.7}$  in the altitude range of ~200-400 km 257 during day whereas nighttime  $T_i$  is sensitive to  $F_{10.7}$  above ~400 km. 258

Figure 6(c) shows the altitude variation of  $\delta Ti / \delta Ap$  (K/ap). In order to check 259 the linear relation between  $\delta Ti$  and  $\delta Ap$ , we have calculated the linear correlation co-260 efficient (r) between them. The linear relationship is found to be not strong between  $T_i$ 261 residuals and  $A_p$  since the positive-maximum of r is 0.11 (day) and 0.42 (night). Large 262 values of r are occurring around  $\sim 300$  km where peak electron density may appear; it 263 might be due to  $T_i$  is sensitive to  $A_p$ . By neglecting the large error altitudes,  $\delta \text{Ti} / \delta \text{Ap}$ 264 (K/ap) is decreasing as a function of altitude above  $\sim 300$  km during daytime and it is 265 increasing as a function of altitude above  $\sim$ 337 km during nighttime. These day and night 266 variability of  $\delta Ti / \delta Ap$  are different from Sondrestrom and Poker Flat since Sondrestrom 267 and Poker Flat observed the same feature of variability between day and night but with 268



Figure 5. Similar to Figure 4 but for nighttime period.

different magnitude (Zhang et al., 2016). In comparison,  $T_i$  is sensitive to  $A_p$  during nighttime than daytime. Probably, it might be due to the absence of polar cusp influences.



**Figure 6.**  $T_i$  trend (a) and  $T_i$  response to  $F_{10.7}$  expressed as  $\delta T_i / \delta f_{10.7}$  (K/sfu) (b) and  $A_p$  expressed as  $\delta T_i / \delta A_p(K/a_p)$  (c) for day (red) and night (black) as function of altitude.

### 3.2 Mean Free Path

To understand the effect of cooling trends on other plasma parameters of ionosphere/upper 272 atmosphere, we have estimated the Debye radius  $(L_d)$ , Debye number  $(L_n)$ , and Mean-273 Free-Path  $(L_{mfp})$  at thermal equilibrium using the Equations 2, 3, and 4, respectively. 274 Estimations are made for nighttime since thermal equilibrium occurs during this period. 275 Figure 7 shows the altitudinal variations of median plasma parameters with 25th & 75th 276 percentiles (a)  $T_i/T_e$  (K) &  $N_e$   $(m^{-3})$ , (b)  $L_d$  (m), and (c)  $L_n$   $(m^{-3})$  &  $L_{mfp}$  (km). Sta-277 tistical estimation of median, 25th & 75th percentiles are calculated using all the sam-278 ples of 1985-2019. In Figure 7(a), red-and-black and blue color lines represent the electron-279 and-ion temperature and electron density, respectively. F-region's electron densities are 280 start to increase from  $\sim 175$  km ( $\sim 1.3 \times 10^{10} m^{-3}$ ); it attains maximum density of  $\sim 4 \times 10^{11} m^{-3}$ 281 at  $\sim 350$  km; and it decreases gradually as function of altitude above  $\sim 350$ . F-region's 282 electron/ion temperatures start to increase from  $\sim 175$  km ( $\sim 625$  K); it increases rapidly 283 to  $\sim 875$  K at  $\sim 250$  km; and then it increases gradually above the altitude of  $\sim 250$ . It 284 can be mentioned Te and Ne are taken for analysis at nightime when there is thermal 285 equilibrium so that Ti are very close to Te over Arecibo. In Figure 7(b) and (c), De-286 by eradius/number (red) and mean-free-path (blue) are shown in red and blue, respec-287 tively. As like F-region's electron density profile, Debye radius and mean-free-path are 288 starting to decrease from  ${\sim}175$  km to  ${\sim}350 {\rm km}$  ( ${\sim}0.015$  m to  ${\sim}0.0025$  m &  ${\sim}17$  km to 289  $\sim$ 1.9 km); and then both are increasing gradually above the altitude of  $\sim$ 350 km. In fig-290 ure 7(c), altitude variation of Debye number is very similar to mean-free-path and De-291 by radius. It is also decreasing from  $\sim 175$  km to  $\sim 350$  km ( $\sim 1.5 \times 10^5 m^{-3}$  to  $\sim 7.5 \times 10^4 m^{-3}$ ); 292 and then it increases gradually above  $\sim 350$  km. 293



Figure 7. Altitude variations of plasma parameters for nighttime. (a)  $T_i/T_e$  (K) &  $N_e$   $(m^{-3})$ , (b)  $L_d$  (m) &  $L_{mfp}$  (km), and (c)  $L_n$   $(m^{-3})$  &  $L_{mfp}$  (km).

Figure 8 shows the residual of Debye radius for the component of year (left-side 294 panels),  $F_{10.7}$  (middle panels) and  $A_p$  (right-side panels). Debye radius trend (left-side 295 panels) varies in the range of -0.0027 mm/year to 0.0193 mm/year. High positive trend 296 is coinciding the altitude of maximum electron density in F-region at altitude bin of  $\sim$ 337-297 373 km. Large magnitudes in confidence level of 95 % indicate more errors. Debye ra-298 dius residuals for the component of  $F_{10.7}$  (middle panels) varies in the range of -0.0108 299 mm/sfu to -0.0297 mm/year. Linear correlation coefficient (r) between Debye radius resid-300 uals and  $F_{10.7}$ , varies from -0.49 to 0.72; it might be due to Debye radius is sensitive and 301 negatively respond to  $F_{10.7}$ . Whereas the linear correlation coefficient (r) of Debye ra-302 dius residuals with year and  $A_p$  varies close to zero. Debye radius might be not sensi-303 tive to  $A_p$ . The nature of linear correlation for Debye radius, Debye number and mean-304 free-path residuals with  $F_{10.7}$  and  $A_p$  are same as shown in Figure 8. 305

Sensitivity of solar activity and geomagnetic activity on ion temperature, Debye 306 radius, Debye number and mean-free-path are examined. These influences on those pa-307 rameters are removed to estimate the long-term trend. The long-term trends are found 308 to be non-zero in those parameters, which indicates a role of an unresolved driver. In-309 vestigation to search for this driver is a separate study. Here, we concentrate on the re-310 lation among ion temperature, Debye radius, Debye number and mean-free-path to un-311 derstand the influence of long-term changes on background plasma parameters. In or-312 der to compare them, the altitude profiles of trends are shown in Figure 9. In this fig-313 ure the trend of (a) Debye radius (red), (b) Debye number (red) and (c) mean-free-path 314 (red) are shown along with  $T_i$  trends (blue) during night. Debye radius is increasing in 315 the altitude ranges of  $\sim 240-500$  km, varying as much as 0.017 mm/year. The maximum 316 values occur at  $\sim$ 350 and  $\sim$ 500 km. Above  $\sim$ 500 km, Debye radius shrinks as a func-317 tion of altitude. In the F-region, weaker cooling trends occur at the altitude ( $\sim$ 350) of 318 peak electron density where the Debye radius is increasing. But simple a relation could 319 not be found between the Debye radius trend and the  $T_i$  trend since there is an enlarge-320 ment in Debye radius at the altitudes of  $\sim 400-500$  km where cooling trends are increas-321 ing as a function of altitude. In Figure 9(b), Debye number trends are negative in all 322 the altitudes except the altitude of peak electron density ( $\sim 350$ ). At  $\sim 350$ , Debye num-323 ber trend found to be 40 No./year. Above and below the peak altitude of  $\sim$ 350, the num-324 ber of particles in Debye sphere is decreasing with time. Negative trend of Debye num-325



Figure 8. Debye Radius residuals for the component of year,  $F_{10.7}$  and  $A_p$ .



Figure 9. The trend of Debye radius, Debye number and mean-free-path.

ber is decreasing from -135 per year (at  $\sim 280$ ) to 40 per year (at  $\sim 350$ ) as a function 326 of altitude at the bottom of F-region where the profile of electron density has a positive 327 gradient. Whereas, the negative trend of Debye number is increasing as a function of al-328 titude in the upper portion of F-region (above  $\sim 350$ ) to -920 per year ( $\sim 640$ ) where pro-329 file of electron density has negative gradient. Overall trends of Debye number follow the 330 altitude profile of electron density structure. The trend of Debye number and ion tem-331 perature have the similar altitude variations and both show the increasing negative-trends 332 above the peak electron density altitude. Figure 9(c) shows the profile of mean-free-path 333 trend. The trend of mean-free-path varying around zero from -9 m/year to 9 m/year in 334 the altitude range of  $\sim 280-500$ . Above  $\sim 500$ , the mean-free-path trends are negative; 335 this suggests that the mean-free-path is decreasing over year at those altitudes. The neg-336 ative trend of mean-free-path is decreasing from -9 m/year (at  $\sim 280$ ) to 8 m/year (at 337  $\sim 350$ ) as a function of altitude at the bottom of F-region where profile of electron den-338 sity has positive gradient. The trends of mean-free-path at positive gradient of F-region 339 have a similar nature to the trend of Debye radius and number. Long-term trends sug-340 gest that there are not only the changes in  $T_i$  over time, but also changes in other plasma 341 parameters such as Debye radius, Debye number and mean-free-path. 342

Long-term trends of the ion temperature from multiple ISR locations show vari-343 ations in magnetic latitude. It is useful to compare the AO-ISR trends with those re-344 ported from other ISRs because it is at geomagantic midlatitudes, while the others are 345 higher in latitude. Figure 10 shows the comparison of long term trends of  $T_i$  among var-346 ious ISR locations (pink-daytime AO, gray-nighttime AO, red-Millstone, green-St. Santin, 347 black-Poker Flat, and blue-Sondrestorm). In Figure 10(a) ISRs observed  $T_i$  trend vari-348 ations (daytime) are shown as function of altitude along with nighttime AO-ISR. Other 349 ISR trend data are from Zhang et al. (2016). The cooling trends are observed above 200 350 km. Almost all cooling trends are increasing as increasing altitude. The warming  $T_i$  trends 351 are observed within the altitude range of 150-200 km in other ISR locations than Arecibo. 352 Over Arecibo, the cooling trend is seen in that particular altitude range but is small and 353 the trend appears to be positive below. It may need further studies in order to under-354 stand it better. Zhang et al. (2016) observed cooling trend increases with increasing mag-355 netic latitudes above 275 km. It is clearly seen around 350 km (as shown in Figure 10b). 356 Above 475 km, AO-ISR observed the rapid cooling trends as a function of altitude dur-357

ing daytime than night time. Unfortunately, other ISRs are limited to 475 km and the
 AO-ISR trend estimation shows enhanced uncertainty at high altitudes. Over Arecibo,
 the nighttime trends are warmer relatively than daytime. This rapid cooling above 475
 km needs further study to understand the mechanism behind of it.



Figure 10. Comparison of  $T_i$  trend variations among the ISRs, namely, Millstone (red), St. Santin (green), Poker Flat (black), Sondrestorm (blue) and Arecibo(pink-day & gray-night). (a)  $T_i$  trend (K/year) as a function of altitude, (b)  $T_i$  trend (K/year) as a function of altitude and latitude.

### 362 3.3 Summary and Discussion

372

373

374

375

376

377

378

We have studied the long term trends in ion temperature using incoherent scatter data from the Arecibo observatory from 1985 to 2019. We have compared the trends to those from other ISR sites and discussed possible drivers causing the cooling trends. The following is a list of our results:

- 1. Ion temperatures  $(T_i)$  are found to be sensitive to solar activity (represented by the  $F_{10.7}$  flux) during both day and night. The daytime  $T_i$  solar dependence has a maximum at the altitudes of the F2 peak (~ 310 km). During nighttime,  $T_i$  solar dependence increases with altitude from about 2.2 K/sfu at ~ 300 km to 3.5 K/sfu at ~ 675 km.
  - 2. The same method used to retrieve the  $T_i$ 's dependence on solar activity was applied for its geomagnetic activity responses, but now in respect to  $A_p$  index. Little positive or non-responses of daytime  $T_i$  variation on geomagnetic activity was detected at Arecibo. On the other hand, as seen in Figure 6 (panel c), nocturnal  $T_i$  increases with the increase of  $A_p$ . Similarly, the solar activity, the  $T_i$  response to  $A_p$  increases with altitude from no responses at ~ 200 km to ~ 3 K/nT at altitudes of ~ 675km.



| 1 | 381 |            | sonal components. For daytime, it was found warming trend at low altitude (this   |
|---|-----|------------|---|
| 1 | 382 |            | altitude has more error but retained for sake of discussion) and this trend becomes   |
| 3 | 383 |            | more negative (cooling) with the increase of altitude. Similar behavior is seen for   |
| 1 | 384 |            | the nighttime period where cooling trend is increasing with altitude, reaching a  |
| 3 | 385 |            | maximum of -4K/year. Generally, the cooling trends are increasing as a function   |
| 3 | 386 |            | of altitude.  |
| 3 | 387 | 4.         | Cooling trends in the F-region might be caused by one or more drivers other than  |
| 3 | 388 |            | $F_{10,7}$ , $A_n$ , annual- and semi-annual oscillations. Further investigations are needed  |
| - | 389 |            | to find the responsible driver(s) for such trends.  |
| 1 | 390 | 5.         | Cooling trend is almost the same for day and night up to the altitude of $\sim 475$ km  |
| - | 391 | -          | with a maximum of -3.6 K/year but cooling is relatively stronger in daytime than  |
| - | 302 |            | nighttime Above $\sim 475$ km cooling trend is much stronger during daytime than  |
|   | 202 |            | nighttime   |
|   | 204 | 6          | To gain further understanding on the influence of long-term trends in background  |
|   | 394 | 0.         | parameters of ionosphere/upper atmosphere, we have performed a similar anal-  |
| - | 395 |            | via on Debye radius $(I_{-1})$ Debye number $(I_{-1})$ and mean free path $(I_{-1})$  |
|   | 396 | 7          | ysis on Debye radius $(L_d)$ , Debye number $(L_n)$ and mean-nee-path $(L_m f_p)$ .   |
| 3 | 397 | (.         | we calculated the linear correlation coefficients for $L_d$ with $F_{10.7} \otimes A_p$ , $L_n$ with  |
| 1 | 398 |            | $F_{10.7} \& A_p$ , and $L_{mfp}$ with $F_{10.7} \& A_p$ . These correlation coefficients suggest that  |
|   | 399 | ~          | Debye radius, Debye number and mean-free-path are sensitive to $F_{10.7}$ than $A_p$ .  |
| 4 | 400 | 8.         | The trends of Debye radius, Debye number and mean-free-path might be derived  |
| 4 | 401 |            | in the F-region by a driver(s) other than $F_{10.7}$ , $A_p$ , annual- and semi-annual os-  |
| 4 | 402 |            | cillations since there were a non-zero trends after removing their contributions.   |
| 4 | 403 | 9.         | The Debye radius is increasing over year up to the altitude of $\sim$ 550 km with a max-  |
| 4 | 404 |            | imum rate of 0.017 mm/year. This maximum occurs at two altitude ranges; one   |
| 4 | 405 |            | is around the peak altitude of nighttime F-region ( $\sim 350$ km) and the other is at  |
| 4 | 406 |            | ${\sim}500$ km. Above ${\sim}550$ km, Debye radius shrinks and the rate of shrinking increases  |
| 4 | 407 |            | as a function of altitude. Further, altitude variations of Debye radius trend show  |
| 4 | 408 |            | possible direct relation with $T_i$ trend around and below the peak altitude.   |
| 4 | 409 | 10.        | The Debye number decreases over time and this decreasing rate is increasing as  |
| 4 | 410 |            | a function of altitude above peak altitude of nighttime F-region. This decreasing   |
| 4 | 411 |            | rate is stronger above the peak altitude than below it. Altitude variations of the  |
| 4 | 412 |            | number trend show the direct relation with $T_i$ trend around and below the peak  |
| 4 | 413 |            | altitude, and also relative variation above that altitude.  |
| 4 | 414 | 11.        | The Mean-Free-Path trends vary around zero but having the non-zero values. Al-  |
| 4 | 415 |            | titude variations the Mean-Free-Path trend show the direct relation with $T_i$ trend  |
| 4 | 416 |            | around and below the peak altitude. Above the peak altitude, the relationship is  |
| 4 | 417 |            | not direct/simple.  |
| 4 | 418 | 12.        | Comparison of $T_i$ trends among ISRs reveals that there are both unique features   |
|   | 419 |            | in location/latitude and commonalities. In Mid- and high-latitudes, warming trends  |
|   | 420 |            | are confined below $\sim 180$ km to the E-region except St. Santin, which shows the   |
|   | 421 |            | warming trend up to the altitude of $\sim 275$ km.  |
|   |     | 13         | Above 200 km cooling trends are increasing as a function of altitude  |
| 4 | +22 | 1 <i>1</i> | Relatively, the similar values of T, trends and also the similar vertical evadient in   |
| 4 | 423 | 14.        | The transferred spin found to be in the altitudes range of $-180.250$ km events for Section 7.  |
| 4 | 424 | 15         | $T_i$ trends are found to be in the automos fange of ~160-250 km except 5t. Salitili.<br>Ti trends have latitudinal dependency above $250$ km |
| 4 | 425 | тэ.        | 11 trends have fatitudinal dependency above 250 km.   |
|   | 100 |            | Monthly medians of ion temperature residuals have a linear trend along with the   |
|   |     |            | WORDON DECLARS OF OUT LETTOPLATURE LESULIAIS DAVE A THEAT LETTO STOLD WITH THE  |

Monthly medians of ion temperature residuals have a linear trend along with the 426 superimposition of variations with time scales varying from 6 years to 11 years. These 427 variations are possibly related to the decadal activity of El Niño-Southern Oscillation 428 (ENSO) (Oliver et al., 2013). Connection between ENSO MEI index and  $T_i$  trends is 429 discussed later. Also there are variations with time scales of  $\sim 16$  years reported by Ogawa 430 et al. (2014). Most of the linear  $T_i$  trends are cooling trends. Cooling trends from ion 431 temperature residuals are found to be in all the altitudes of ionosphere/upper atmosphere 432 except its low altitudes. At lower altitudes of ionospheric F-region, the warming trends 433

are observed as like mid- and high- latitudes but in different altitudes. During daytime, 434 warming trends are below 200 km in Millstone Hill, Sondrestorm, Chatanika/Poker Flat 435 and Saint Santin (Zhang et al., 2011, 2016; Donaldson et al., 2010). Occurrence of warm-436 ing trend altitude at AO (mid-latitude station) going down to below 150 km ( $\sim$ 122-158 437 km) during daytime, lower in height than any other locations. It can be noted that this 438 altitude is the lowest altitude in this study and having just enough data points of 69 months. 439 Warming trends were also observed during nighttime at lower altitudes of ionospheric 440 F-region as like daytime. During nighttime, Millstone Hill has the warming trends be-441 low 350 km (Zhang & Holt, 2013); Sondrestorm has it below 250 km but Chatanika/Poker 442 Flat do not have data below 220 km and no warming was observed above 220 km (Zhang 443 et al., 2016). These warming trends at fixed altitudes are not due to the true warming ллл of ionosphere; it is due to downward shift in pressure level because of subsidence of the 445 warmer air with a substantial altitude gradient in temperature as is the case for lower 446 F-region (Akmaev & Fomichev, 1998; Donaldson et al., 2010; Zhang et al., 2011; Zhang 447 & Holt, 2013; Zhang et al., 2016). These warming trends are occurring at lowest alti-448 tudes during daytime whereas it occurs at higher altitudes during nighttime. These oc-449 currences are same in all the latitudes stations except Tromso (Ogawa et al., 2014; Zhang 450 et al., 2016). 451

Generally above the altitudes of 200 km, cooling trends are observed in all the lat-452 itudes (Donaldson et al., 2010; Zhang et al., 2011; Zhang & Holt, 2013; Zhang et al., 2016) 453 except high-latitude-station Tromso where warming was observed above 400 km (Ogawa 454 et al., 2014). It can also be mentioned that cooling trends are increasing with altitude 455 over Tromso from 230 km to 330 km. Above 330 km, cooling trends are decreasing as 456 a function of altitude and the trends turn into warming at just 410 km. The warming 457 trends increase above 410 km as a function of altitude (Ogawa et al., 2014). Decrease 458 of cooling trend as a function of altitude was observed in other latitudes too but in dif-459 ferent altitude ranges. It was observed as 325(night)/425(day)-450 km over Sondrestrom, 460 325-375 km over Chatanika/Poker Flat, and 266-373 km over Arecibo. These kind of re-461 duced cooling trends in altitude profiles more or less occurring at peak altitude of F-region. 462 It can be noted that Millstone Hill does not observe any such feature. Rather, Millstone 463 Hill observed increasing of cooling trends as a function of altitude which is found to be 464 in overall trends of Saint Santin, Chatanika/Poker Flat and Arecibo too. Whereas, warm-465 ing trends were observed above the peak altitude of F-region over Tromso (above 400 466 km) during daytime (Ogawa et al., 2014). 467

Comparison of  $T_i$  trends during day and night reveals that the trends are closely 468 similar values up to the altitude of 430 km over Arecibo. Whereas, the large difference 469 were observed over Millstone Hill, Sondrestrom, and Chatanika/Poker Flat (Zhang & 470 Holt, 2013; Zhang et al., 2016). Strong coolings are occurring during day than night in 471 overall altitudes over Sondrestrom and Arecibo. It was other way around over Chatanika/Poker 472 Flat such as strong cooling during night than day. Over Millstone Hill, Strong coolings 473 were observed during day than night up to the altitude of 450 km. Above the altitude 474 of 450 km, it gets into flip as strong cooling during night than day. It can be noted that 475 comparable cooling is observed  $\sim 475$  km over Millstone Hill which are observed over 476 Arecibo below this said altitude. It needs further study to find the explanations why the 477 difference should occur between both stations at mid-latitudes. Above the altitude of 478 475 km, daytime coolings are comparably stronger than the same of the night over Arecibo. 479

The observed cooling in  $T_i$  trends seem to be related with the Debye radius, Deby number and Mean-Free-Path. At the altitude of F-region peak, there is a consistent correlation among those parameters with  $T_i$  Trends. Expansion of Debye radius is observed in the altitudes from 200-550 km. Above 550 km, shrinking is observed in Debye radius. This expansions are corresponding to the decreasing the number of particles in Debye sphere. It can be noted that number of particles in Debye sphere is decreasing over year irrespective of expansion or shrinking of Debye radius. But the Mean-Free-Path is

decreasing when there is shrinking or less expansion in Debye radius. At the altitude of 487 large expansions of Debye radius trend, Mean-Free-Path is increasing over year. It is clear 488 that long-term variations of  $T_i$  and other plasma parameters might have the influences 489 by a common driver(s) but it needs further studies to understand processes that involved in expansion of Debye radius, decreasing number of particles in Debye sphere and changes 491 in Mean-Free-Path by the cooling trends of  $T_i$  at least at the altitude where  $T_i$  is con-492 siderably equal/close to  $T_n$  (225-275 km). It is the altitude range where all the profiles 493 of  $T_i$  trends from mid- and high-latitude have considerably similar cooling trends except 494 the observations of Saint Santin. 495

At the altitude of 225-325 km,  $T_i$  is approximately equal to  $T_n$ . The estimated av-496 erage  $T_i$  trend over Millstone Hill and Arecibo are -0.35 K/year and -1.775 K/year, re-497 spectively. At these altitudes, Strong cooling is exist over Arecibo than Millstone Hill 498 even both do exist at mid-latitudes. Whereas, Arecibo has weak cooling trends than Mill-499 stone and other locations of mid- and high-latitude at the altitude range of 300-400 km; 500 it is the altitude range where clear latitude dependency exist as cooling trends are as a 501 function of latitudes. It can be mentioned that these altitudes appear abnormal at Arecibo 502 as compared to altitudes above and below. For sake of discussion, latitudinal dependency 503 is very clear among the Sondrestrom, Poker Flat, and Millstone if we remove the AO trends 504 in the altitude range of 250-425 km. From high-mid latitude, the strength of cooling trends 505 is decreasing. To bring this consistent behavior(it already exists among Sondrestrom, 506 Poker Flat, and Millstone), the altitude range of  $\sim$ 350-400 km is highlighted. Notably, 507 there is also a structure around  $\sim$ 375 km in Poker Flat which is little similar to Arecibo's 508 altitude structure in that altitude range with the maginude difference of  $\sim 2$  K. Further 509 studies are needed to understand these altitude structures in context to the dynamics 510 and chemical composition if it exists with latitudinal dependency at those altitude ranges. 511

This latitudinal dependency may be starting to appear from 200 km as per the figure 10. From this altitude of 200 km to 400 km, the  $T_n$  trend was calculated to be 4-6 K/decade using neutral density trend (Akmaev, 2012). These values are 0.4-0.6 K/year which are lesser than Arecibo's  $T_i$  trends and comparable or greater than Millstone Hill's  $T_i$  trends of -0.35 K/year (Zhang & Holt, 2013). Even though the latitudinal dependency of  $T_i$  trends do exist in those altitude ranges but each location has its unique variabilities.

In the comparison of ISRs during daytime period, the observed  $T_i$  trends are hav-519 ing strong cooling (< 0.9 K/year) than the cooling from green house gases contributions 520 by global simulation predictions (-0.2 K/year). In this case, additional drivers might be 521 possible in cooling the upper atmosphere. It might be contributed by gravity wave (Oliver 522 et al., 2013). Simulations show gravity waves can cool the upper atmosphere (Yiğit & 523 Medvede, 2009) and therefore it was speculated that the anticipated long-term gravity 524 wave activity enhancement could lead to long-term cooling in the ionosphere (Oliver et 525 al., 2013). Those gravity waves are speculated to be originated from ocean surfaces since 526 there was a positive correlation between long-term trends of ion temperature and long-527 term relaxation in ENSO activity. It is shown in dashed pink line in the figure 11. 528

In figure 11, the time series of ion temperature (black-solid line) from 122-445 km 529 and its residuals (green-plus-symbols) are shown. And the Ti trend line in green-solid 530 line is shown for the altitude bin of 301-337 km where the daytime  $T_i$  trend almost matches 531 with the same of Millstone Hill. ENSO MEI Index (pink-plus-symbols) and its trends 532 (pink-dashed line-up to 2013 and pink-solid line-up to 2019) are shown in pink colors. Power 533 dissipation index (PDI) of the hurricanes (red-dashed-dot line represents PDI and red-534 535 plus-symbols represents smoothed PDI) and its trend (red-solid line) over North Atlantic basin are shown in red colors. Notably, the magnitude of the negative trend of ion tem-536 perature is different from the magnitude of the negative trend of solar flux at 10.7 cm 537 (blue color curve). In addition to the green house gases cooling, there may be also a pos-538 sible contribution from gravity waves. 539

Based on ray tracing of the gravity waves over Arecibo, (Djuth et al., 2010) sug-540 gests that the source location possibly lies in the Atlantic ocean. This source would prob-541 ably be linked with storm activities since there is an anti-correlation between the power 542 dissipation index of hurricanes over the North Atlantic basin and the long-term trend 543 of ion temperature. The increasing trend of power dissipation index of hurricanes indi-544 cates the increasing trend of hurricane activities so do storm activities. These increas-545 ing trends are also observed in sea-surface-temperatures and surface air temperatures 546 (Wu & Wang, 2019). Responsible GWs are generated not alone by ocean since ENSO 547 is a atmosphere-ocean coupling phenomenon (Huang et al., 2022). The power dissipa-548 tion index (PDI) of hurricanes is increasing over time. PDI increase is negatively cor-549 related with the  $T_i$  trends. Therefore, it could be possible that gravity waves might be 550 generated by the systems associated with the interaction of the ocean and the atmosphere. 551 These waves reach the upper atmosphere and might be contribute to the observed cool-552 ing ((Oliver et al., 2013)) by increasing the cooling trends of  $T_i$  green house gas cooling 553 alone, explaining the discrepancy between the observed cooling and that predicted in the 554 modeling studies. 555

Other ISR sites also have strong cooling trends but they are inland unlike Arecibo. 556 It is not clear how the GWs associated with weather and ocean-atmosphere interaction 557 influence the upper atmosphere of those regions. Further studies are needed to under-558 stand the latitudinal distribution of gravity wave flux and the contribution of gravity waves 559 to the thermal structure of the upper atmosphere and to  $T_i$  trends. And also further stud-560 ies are needed to investigate the source of the gravity waves and also whether those grav-561 ity waves are of lower atmospheric origin from weather phenomena and/or secondary waves 562 from middle atmosphere. 563

### 564 Acknowledgments

Solar flux F10.7 and geomagnetic activity Ap index data are taken from https://lasp 565 .colorado.edu/lisird/data/cls\_radio\_flux\_f107/ and http://wdc.kugi.kyoto-u 566 .ac.jp/kp/index.html, respectively. ISR data are taken from madrigal http://openmadrigal 567 .org website. ENSO MEI index and Power Dissipation Index are taken form https:// 568 psl.noaa.gov/enso/mei/ and www.epa.gov/climate-indicators, respectively. Au-569 thors gratefully thank the AO technical staff for their support in carrying out the ISR 570 observations reported here and also thanking the people who does analysis and main-571 tain madrigal database at AO. The AO is operated by the University of Central Florida 572 under a cooperative agreement with the National Science Foundation, and in alliance 573 with Ana G. Méndez-Universidad Metropolitana, and the Universities Space Research 574 Association. Research at MIT Haystack Observation is supported in part by NSF Geospace 575 Facility grant AGS-1952737 and NASA LWS program 80NSSC21K1315. The author would 576 like to thank his colleagues Dr. Sravani Vaddi and Dr. Alison Smith for their help in manuscript 577 reading and fruitful discussion. 578

### 579 **References**

- Akmaev, R. A. (2012). On estimation and attribution of long-term temperature trends in the thermosphere. J. Geophys. Res., 117, A09321.
- Akmaev, R. A., & Fomichev, V. I. (1998). Cooling of the mesosphere and lower
   thermosphere due to doubling of co2. Ann. Geophys., 16, 1501–1512.
- Bremer, J. (1992). Ionospheric trends in mid-latitudes as a possible indicator of
   the atmospheric greenhouse effect. Journal of Atmospheric and Terrestrial
   Physics, 54, 1505-1511.
- <sup>587</sup> Brum, C. G. M., Rodrigues, F. S., dos Santos, P. T., Matta, A. C., Aponte, N., <sup>588</sup> Gonzalez, S. A., ... Robles, E. (2011). A modeling study of  $f_o f_2$  and  $h_m f_2$ <sup>589</sup> parameters measured by the arecibo incoherent scatter radar and comparison <sup>590</sup> with iri model predictions for solar cycles 21, 22, and 23. J. Geophys. Res.,



Figure 11. Time series of ion temperature (black-solid line) from 122-445 km and its residuals (green-plus-symbols). And the  $T_i$  trend line (green-solid line) of 301-337 km where the daytime  $T_i$  trend almost matches with the same of Millstone Hill. ENSO MEI Index (pink-plus-symbols) and its trends (pink-dashed line-upto 2013 and pink-solid line-upto 2019) along with power dissipation index (PDI) (red-dashed-dot line represents PDI and red-plus-symbols represents smoothed PDI) and its trend (red-solid line) over North Atlantic basin.

| 591 | 116, A03324.   |
|-----|--|
| 592 | Brum, C. G. M., Tepley, C. A., Fentzke, J. T., Robles, E., dos Santos, P. T., & Gon-           |
| 593 | zalez, S. A. (2012). Long-term changes in the thermospheric neutral winds over                 |
| 594 | arecibo: Climatology based on over three decades of fabry-perot observations.                  |
| 595 | J. Geophus. Res., 117, A00H14.   |
| 596 | Cai, Y., Yue, X., Wang, W., Zhang, S., Liu, L., Liu, H., & Wan, W. (2019). Long-               |
| 590 | term trend of tonside ionosphericelectron density derived from dmspdata                        |
| 597 | during 1005–2017 Journal of Ceonhysical Research: Space Physics 10/                            |
| 598 | 10708 10797  |
| 599 | $\begin{array}{c} 10100 - 10121. \end{array}$  |
| 600 | Chossen, I. (2014). The importance of geomagnetic field changes versus rising co2              |
| 601 | levels for long-term change in the upper atmosphere. J. Space Weather Space                    |
| 602 | <i>Clim.</i> , 4, A18.   |
| 603 | Chossen, I., & Maute, A. (2020). Simulated trends in ionosphere-thermosphere cli-              |
| 604 | mate due to predicted main magnetic field changes from 2015 to 2065. J. Geo-                   |
| 605 | phys. Res.: Space Physics, $125(3)$ , e2773.   |
| 606 | Djuth, F. T., Zhang, L. D., Livneh, D. J., Seker, I., Smith, S. M., Sulzer, M. P.,             |
| 607 | Walterscheid, R. L. (2010). Arecibo's thermospheric gravity waves and the                      |
| 608 | case for an ocean source. J. Geophys. Res., 115, A08305.                                       |
| 609 | Donaldson, J. K., Wellman, T. J., & Oliver, W. L. (2010). Long-term change in                  |
| 610 | thermospheric temperature above saint santin. J. Geophys. Res., 115, A11305.                   |
| 611 | Emmert J T (2015) Altitude and solaractivity dependence of 1967–2005ther-                      |
| 612 | mospheric density trends derived from orbital drag I Geophys Res : Space                       |
| 612 | Physice 120 2040–2050  |
| 013 | Emport IT Leep II & Dicens IM (2010) Decend law thermospheric den                              |
| 614 | city during the 2009 solar minimum Coophys Res Lett 27 112102                                  |
| 615 | Sity during the 2008 solar minimum. Geophys. Res. Lett., $57$ , $112102$ .                     |
| 616 | Emmert, J. T., Picone, J. M., Lean, J. L., & Knowles, S. H. (2004). Global change              |
| 617 | in the thermosphere: Compelling evidnce of a secular decrease in density. J.                   |
| 618 | Geophys. Res., 109, A02301.  |
| 619 | Emmert, J. T., Picone, J. M., & Meier, R. R. (2008). hermospheric global average               |
| 620 | density trends. Geophys. Res. Lett., 35, L05101.   |
| 621 | Goldston, R., & Rutherford, P. (1995). Introduction to plasma theory. Bristol, 13-             |
| 622 | 16.  |
| 623 | Holt, J., & Zhang, S. (2008). Long-term temperature trends in the ionosphere above             |
| 624 | millstone hill. Geophys. Res. Lett., 35, L05813.   |
| 625 | Huang, Y., Yuan, N., Shi, M., Lu, Z., & Fu, Z. (2022). On the air-sea couplings                |
| 626 | over tropical pacific: An instantaneous coupling index using dynamical systems                 |
| 627 | metrics. Geophysical Research Letters, 49, e2021GL097049.                                      |
| 628 | Jacobi C $(2014)$ Long-term trends and decadal variability of upper meso-                      |
| 620 | sphere/lower thermosphere gravity waves at midlatitudes Iournal of At-                         |
| 629 | moscheric and Solar-Terrestrial Physics 118 00-05  |
| 030 | Kesting C M Talaan D II & Dradford M C (2000) Evidence of lang term                            |
| 631 | reating, G. M., Ioison, R. H., & Dradiord, M. S. (2000). Evidence of long term                 |
| 632 | giobal decime in the earth's thermospheric densities apparently related to                     |
| 633 | anthropogenic effects. Geophys. Res. Lett., 27, 1523-1526.                                     |
| 634 | Lastovička, J. (2021). Long-term trends in the upper atmosphere. Chapter 17: Geo-              |
| 635 | physical Monograph Series.   |
| 636 | Laštovička, J., Akmaev, R. A., Beig, G., Bremer, J., & Emmert, J. T. (2006).                   |
| 637 | Global change in the upper atmosphere. Science, $314(5803)$ , $1253-1254$ .                    |
| 638 | Laštovička. (2015). Comment on "long-term trends in thermospheric neutral temper-              |
| 639 | atures and density above millstone hill" by w. l. oliver et al.,. J. Geophys. Res.             |
| 640 | Space Physics, 120, 2347–2349.   |
| 641 | Liu, H., Tao, C., Jin, H., & Abe, T. (2021). Geomagnetic activity effects on co <sub>2</sub> - |
| 642 | driven trend in the thermosphere and ionosphere: Ideal model experiments                       |
| 643 | with gaia, J. Geophys. Res.: Space Physics, 126, e2020. JA028607                               |
| 644 | Livadiotis, G. (2019). Collision frequency and mean free nath for plasmas described            |
| 645 | by kappa distributions AIP Advances 9 105307-105314  |
| 045 | by mappa distributions. In $Invances$ , $\sigma$ , 100001-100014.                              |

- Mikhailov, A. V. (2006). Ionospheric long-term trends: can the geomagnetic con trol and the greenhouse hypotheses be reconciled?. Ann. Geophys., 24, 2533–
   2541.
- Ogawa, Y., Motoba, T., Buchert, S. C., Häggström, I., & Nozawa, S. (2014).
   Upper atmosphere cooling over the past 33 years. *Geophys. Res. Lett.*, 41, 5629–5635.
- Oliver, W. L., Holt, J. M., Zhang, S.-R., & Goncharenko, L. P. (2014). Long-term
   trends in thermospheric neutral temperature and density above millstone hill.
   *J. Geophys. Res. Space Physics*, 119, 7940–7946.
- Oliver, W. L., Holt, J. M., Zhang, S.-R., & Goncharenko, L. P. (2015). Reply to
   comment by jan lastovička on "long-term trends in thermospheric neutral tem perature and density above millstone hill. J. Geophys. Res. Space Physics,
   120, 2350-2352.

659

660

661

662

663

664

665

- Oliver, W. L., Zhang, S.-R., & Goncharenko, L. P. (2013). Is thermospheric global cooling caused by gravity waves? J. Geophys. Res. Space Physics, 118, 3898–3908.
- Qian, L., McInerney, J. M., Solomon, S. S., Liu, H., & Burns, A. G. (2021). Climate changes in the upper atmosphere: Contributions by the changing greenhouse gas concentrations and earth's magnetic field from the 1960s to 2010s. J. Geophys. Res.: Space Physics, 126, e2020JA029067.
- Rishbeth, H. (1990). A greenhouse effect in the ionosphere. *Planet. Space Sci.*, 38, 945–948.
- Roble, R. G., & Dickinson, R. E. (1989). How will changes in carbon dioxide and
   methane modify the mean structure of the mesosphere and thermosphere?
   *Geophys. Res. Lett.*, 16, 1441-1444.
- Santos, P. T., Brum, C. G. M., Tepley, C. A., Aponte, N., González, S. A., & Robles, E. (2011). Using incoherent scatter radar to investigate the neutral wind
  long-term trend over arecibo. J. Geophys. Res., 116, A00H13.
- Wu, R., & Wang, Y. (2019). Comparison of north atlantic oscillation-related changes
   in the north atlantic sea ice and associated surface quantities on different time
   scales. J. Geophys. Res. Space Physics, 40, 2686-2701.
- Yiğit, E., & Medvede, A. S. (2009). Heating and cooling of the thermosphere by internal gravity waves. *Geophys, Res. Lett.*, 36, L14807.
- Yue, X., Hu, L., Wei, Y., Wan, W., & Ning, B. (2018). Ionospheric trend over
   wuhan during 1947–2017: Comparison between simulation and observation.
   *Journal of Geophysical Research: Space Physics*, 123(2), 1396–1409.
- Zhang, S.-R., & Holt, J. M. (2013). Long-term ionospheric cooling: Dependency
   on local time, season, solar activity, and geomagnetic activity. J. Geophys. Res.
   Space Physics, 118, 3719-3730.
- Zhang, S.-R., Holt, J. M., Erickson, P. J., Goncharenko, L. P., Nicolls, M. J., Mc-
- Cready, M., & Kelly, J. (2016). Ionospheric ion temperature climate and
  upper atmospheric long-term cooling. J. Geophys. Res. Space Physics, 121,
  8951-8968.
- Zhang, S.-R., Holt, J. M., & Kurdzo, J. (2011). Millstone hill isr observations of
   upper atmospheric long-term changes: Height dependency. J. Geophys. Res.,
   116, A00H05.

### Long-term Trends in the Upper atmosphere using the incoherent scatter radar observations over Arecibo

### D. Selvaraj<sup>1</sup>, Michael P. Sulzer<sup>1</sup>, Shun-Rong Zhang<sup>2</sup>, Christiano G. M. Brum<sup>1</sup>, and Nestor Aponte<sup>1</sup>

 $^1{\rm Arecibo}$  Observatory, University of Central Florida (UCF), Arecibo, Puerto Rico $^2{\rm Haystack}$  Observatory, Massachusetts Institute of Technology, Westford, Massachusetts, USA

### Key Points:

1

2

3

5

7 8 9

10

| • | Long | g-terr | n trer | nds of | ion t | empera | ature   | $\operatorname{at}$ | Arecibo | $\operatorname{show}$ | upper | $\operatorname{atm}$ | ospher | e is co | ool- |
|---|------|--------|--------|--------|-------|--------|---------|---------------------|---------|-----------------------|-------|----------------------|--------|---------|------|
|   | ing. |        |        |        |       |        |         |                     |         |                       |       |                      |        |         |      |
|   | m i  | 1 (    | ••     |        |       | 1      | 1 . • . | 1.                  | 1 1     | 1                     |       | · 11                 |        | 0501    |      |

- Trends of ion temperature show latitudinal dependency especially at  $\sim 350$  km.
- Gravity waves may be one of the contributing factor to the observed cooling over
   Arecibo; these waves might be generated by lower atmospheric weather phenom ena.

 $Corresponding \ author: \ Selvaraj \ Dharmaling am, \ {\tt selvaraj@naic.edu}$ 

### 14 Abstract

Upper atmospheric long-term trends could be examined in the ion temperatures  $(T_i)$  at 15 the ionospheric F-region altitudes by the close coupling between neutrals and ions. We 16 have analyzed the  $T_i$  data sets of Arecibo Observatory (AO) incoherent scatter radar (18°20'N, 17  $66^{\circ}45'W$ ) from 1985 to 2019, to examine the long-term trends of the ion temperature as 18 a function of height from  $\sim 140$  km to  $\sim 677$  km. For this, the responses of  $T_i$  to solar 19 and geomagnetic activities have been taken into account as forcings of the  $T_i$  behavior 20 as well the annual and semi-annual oscillations. By removing the known forcing that gov-21 ern the Ti behavior by the difference between the  $T_i$  data and a climatological model, 22 our results indicate that the upper atmosphere/ionosphere over Arecibo is cooling over 23 the 35 years studied. Around 350 km, our findings also show that the rate of cooling over 24 Arecibo is lower than previously reported for high latitudes, suggesting a latitudinal de-25 pendency. These cooling trends are believed to be the result of increasing green house 26 gases, but the observed cooling trends exceed the magnitude of the cooling expected from 27 green house gases. We have made an attempt to find the additional driver for observed 28 cooling trends by linking the these upper atmospheric trends to lower atmospheric weather 29 phenomena. We found that gravity waves in the lower atmosphere associated with ter-30 restrial weather phenomena might be contributing to the observed cooling trends in the 31 upper atmosphere. 32

### **1 Introduction**

The concentration of greenhouse gases in the lower atmosphere is increasing as a 34 result man made activity. These anthropogenic greenhouse gases lead to the global warm-35 ing in the lower atmosphere, but are expected to cool the upper atmosphere (Roble & 36 Dickinson, 1989; Laštovička, 2021; Laštovička, 2015; Laštovička et al., 2006). However, 37 this cooling could also be additionally caused by long-term changes in geomagnetic ac-38 tivity (Mikhailov, 2006; Liu et al., 2021), changes in the earth's magnetic field (Cnossen 39 & Maute, 2020; Cnossen, 2014; Qian et al., 2021; Yue et al., 2018), gravity wave activ-40 ities (Oliver et al., 2013; Yiğit & Medvede, 2009), and also other drivers which are in 41 debate (Oliver et al., 2013, 2014, 2015; Laštovička, 2015). 42

Studies of long-term changes of the upper atmosphere/ionosphere have started af-43 ter the modeling work of Roble and Dickinson (1989), who presented the changes in tem-44 perature and density from doubling of the CO2 and CH4 concentrations, finding both 45 atmospheric cooling and density decreases. Also they found lowered E- and F- layer peak 46 densities and reduction of atmospheric drag on satellites. Rishbeth (1990) also predicted 47 a decrease in thermospheric density in response to an increase in the concentration of 48 greenhouse gases. Long-term changes in the densities were studied using the near-Earth 49 space objects of 1996-2001, in the height range of 200-700 km in order to understand in-50 fluences by the cooling effect of increased greenhouse gases (Emmert et al., 2004). It 51 was found that the densities are decreasing (Emmert et al., 2004, 2008, 2010; Emmert, 52 2015; Keating et al., 2000; Cai et al., 2019) in the range of -2% to -5% per decade at those 53 heights as predicted by the theory. Density decrease is also seen  $\sim 350$  km when the ef-54 fect of solar variability was avoided by evaluating only the solar minimum years (Emmert 55 et al., 2004). 56

Lowering of peak height of the F2-layer (hmF2) was found in ionospheric long-term 57 trend studies, (Bremer, 1992; Santos et al., 2011; Brum et al., 2011), which could be as-58 sociated to the changes of the meridional neutral wind component that became more pole-59 ward as reported by (Brum et al., 2012). It may be mentioned that stronger zonal winds 60 are connected with larger gravity wave amplitudes in the mesosphere over mid-latitude 61 (Jacobi, 2014). The long-term trends of ionosonde based studies used the values of hmF2, 62 but changes in it could be caused not only by the neutral temperature and aforemen-63 tioned winds, but possibly also by electric fields (Holt & Zhang, 2008). Holt and Zhang 64

(2008) pointed out a few more disadvantages in using the hmF2 for inferring the trends of neutral temperature, and also they stated that the ion temperature  $(T_i)$  is good representative of neutral temperature at certain heights where there exists a close coupling between neutrals and ion components (Holt & Zhang, 2008).

Holt and Zhang (2008) used  $T_i$  data from the Millstone Hill Incoherent Scatter Radar 69 (ISR) from 1978 to 2007 for long-term studies,  $T_i$  and  $T_n$  (-5 K/year) from 375 km have 70 negative trend much greater than anticipated from Roble and Dickinson (1989). This 71 trend of  $T_i$  matches with that of the St. Santin ISR at the same altitude (Donaldson 72 73 et al., 2010). Four solar cycle of Millstone Hill ISR data (1968-2006) was analysed for the long-term trend at noon in the altitude range of 100-550 km. A cooling trend was 74 found above 200 km and it increases with altitude; also a warming trend was also found 75 below 200 km (Zhang et al., 2011). Zhang et al. (2011) stated that their height vari-76 ation patterns are in agreement with the models predicting the response of the ionosphere 77 to the changes in concentration of greenhouse gas. Ogawa et al. (2014) have found com-78 parable values but not exact values of observed  $T_i$  trends with the model predictions; 79 they used the ISR observations of EISCAT UHF radar at Tromso during 1981-2013. 80

(Zhang & Holt, 2013) used Millstone Hill ISR data to understand the long-term 81 cooling as functions of local time, season, solar activity and geomagnetic activity. Zhang 82 and Holt (2013) found stronger cooling trends during daytime than nighttime. They also 83 found negligible seasonal variation in the  $T_i$  trend, in agreement with the negligible sea-84 sonal variation in neutral density trends of Emmert et al. (2004) (Zhang & Holt, 2013). 85 Strong cooling trends were found during solar minimum whereas less cooling or warm-86 ing were found during solar maximum. It was speculated that a fraction of cooling trend 87 was due to gradual shifting of Millstone Hill away from sub-auroral region (Zhang & 88 Holt, 2013). 89

Zhang et al. (2016) analyzed two high-latitude ISR site data sets (Sondrestrom
during 1990–2015, Chatanika/Poker Flat during 1976–2015 with a gap in 1983–2006) for
a comprehensive study on long-term trends and also for a comparison with the Millstone
Hill ISR data. Zhang et al. (2016) concluded that the upper atmosphere is cooling globally, especially above 200 km. Above 275 km, cooling trends have geomagnetic latitudinal dependency. The cooling trends were found to be much greater than the model predicated for the increase in the concentration of greenhouse gases.

Discrepancy between model predicated values and observed trends of cooling are 97 not yet fully understood. Lack of understanding in long-term trends could be due to the 98 limited amount of well-calibrated data and its availability (Ogawa et al., 2014). It may 99 need further studies to understand the variability in derived cooling trends as mentioned 100 by Zhang et al. (2016). In order to understand the long-term trend of ion temperature 101 in the upper atmosphere and its geomagnetic latitude dependency, we made an attempt 102 to find the long-terms trends of  $T_i$  over Arecibo using Arecibo Observatory ISR data sets 103 from 1985-2019. And then we compared them with the long-term trends of Debye ra-104 dius  $(L_d)$ , Debye number $(L_n)$  and Mean-Free-Path  $(L_{mfp})$  for local midnight in order 105 to understand the influence of cooling and density depletion on the plasma parameters. 106 In order to understand the geomagnetic latitude dependency of  $T_i$  trends, we have com-107 pared the estimated  $T_i$  trends of AO-ISR (Arecibo Observatory incoherent scatter radar) 108 with those of other ISRs. 109

### <sup>110</sup> 2 Data Analysis

111

### 2.1 Estimation of $T_i$ Residuals

<sup>112</sup> We have analysed the ion temperature  $(T_i)$  from ion-line data sets which were ob-<sup>113</sup> tained from the Arecibo Observatory Incoherent Scatter Radar (AO-ISR) (18°20'N, 66°45'W). <sup>114</sup> The AO-ISR ion-line data sets were processed in different ways. We use the data which

were processed by the world day standard algorithm. These data sets are available from 115 October 1985, and so throughout three solar cycles. We use the ISR data from 1985 to 116 2019 at all zenith angles; the AO-ISR could steer the beam up to  $20^{\circ}$  of off-zenith, and 117 these data cover all the hours and months as shown in Figure 1, especially in the fig-118 ure of hour vs month. No ISR data is available during 1996 and 2007 as shown in year 119 vs hour of data distribution. There are data gaps which are represented by white/blank 120 space in the figure of year vs month. It can be mentioned that hourly median values are 121 used to generate this data distribution. Since AO-ISR observations had different time 122 and altitude resolutions, altitude resolution is fixed to be  $\sim 36$  km in order to bin the  $T_i$ 123 data into 19 altitude bins from  $\sim 100$  to  $\sim 750$  km. Three altitude bins, the first bin and 124 last two bins, were removed from further analysis since there were few data points. Hence, 125  $T_i$  trends are calculated for 16 altitude bins which center at 140, 176, 212, 247, 283, 319, 126 355, 391, 427, 462, 498, 534, 570, 606, 642, and 677. 127



**Figure 1.** Temporal distribution of ion temperatures from 1985 to 2019 over Arecibo; (a) year Vs local time, (b) year Vs month, and (c) hour Vs month. The scale represents number of hours.

128 129 130

131

132

133

Climatological models could be less reliable when there are geomagnetic disturbed conditions or extremely high solar activity. In order to remove such effects, we rejected the  $T_i$  values corresponding to the solar flux at 10.7 cm at  $F_{10.7} > 300$  and geomagnetic activity at ap > 80. Monthly median values of  $T_i$  are estimated for the  $T_i$  trend calculations in order to eliminate the issues in observations such as short-term correlations over days/hours, oversampling and outliers (Holt & Zhang, 2008; Zhang et al., 2016). For the  $T_i$  trend calculations, minimum number of data points are set to be more than 6 points in each altitude bin. (Holt & Zhang, 2008; Zhang et al., 2016).

 $T_i$  data are binned into altitude and monthly bins for constructing a  $T_i$  model.  $T_i$ s corresponding to local mid-noon (16 UT) and mid-night (4 UT) are taken within ±3 hours of these times for comparison between day and night, (Zhang et al., 2016).



Figure 2. Monthly medians of ion temperature within  $\pm 3$  hour of local noon (black dot) at various altitudes (the red crosses represents the yearly medians). The two bottom panels of each column are solar flux and geomagnetic activity corresponding to the study period.

Figure 2 shows the monthly median of  $T_i$  (black dot) at various altitudes along 139 with corresponding  $F_{10.7}$  and  $A_p$  index. The  $T_i$  values are within  $\pm 3$  hours of local noon. 140 Night values are not presented here but those also have similar dependence on  $F_{10.7}$  and 141  $A_p$  index. Red-plus-symbols indicate the yearly medians. Monthly and yearly medians 142 of ISR observed  $T_i$  have trends similar to those of the  $F_{10.7}$  and  $A_p$  indices. Variation 143 of  $T_i$  shows the strong dependence on  $F_{10,7}$ . This means that the influences of solar and 144 magnetic activity on  $T_i$  need to be removed in order to reveal the trend caused by un-145 known drivers. It can be mentioned that continuous observations of  $T_i$  are not available 146 for all the the day and night. So that there are data gaps, especially above  $\sim 620$  km 147

in day and below  $\sim 200$  km in night (not shown here). Those altitude ranges are included instead of removing, to have a consistency in altitude ranges during day and night.

For a given altitude bin,  $T_i$  variations are modeled for each time bin based on a least square fitting using the monthly median of the ISR observed  $T_i$ , monthly median of solar flux at 10.7 cm and monthly median of  $A_p$  index (Holt & Zhang, 2008; Zhang et al., 2011; Zhang & Holt, 2013; Zhang et al., 2016) while taking into account the annual- and semi- annual oscillations also. Variation of  $T_i$  is modeled based on the equation given by Zhang et al. (2016), as shown in Equation 1:

$$T_{i} = T_{b} + t(y - \bar{y}) + \sum_{n=1}^{2} [a_{n} \sin(2\pi nd/365) + b_{n} \cos(2\pi nd/365)] + f_{1}(F_{10.7} - \overline{F_{10.7}}) + f_{2}(F_{10.7} - \overline{F_{10.7}})^{2} + a(Ap - \overline{Ap}) + R$$
(1)

where,  $T_b$  - background constant term, y - floating-point year,  $\overline{y}$  - mean floating year, t - long-term trend, d - day number of the year,  $F_{10.7}$  - monthly solar flux in sfu,  $\overline{F_{10.7}}$ - mean of solar flux over entire time series,  $A_p - A_p$  index,  $\overline{A_p}$  - mean of  $A_p$  index over entire time series, R - fitting residual. The coefficients  $T_b$ , t,  $f_1$ ,  $f_2$  and a are estimated for each altitude bin by least-square fitting method.

156

178

179

For a given component (long-term trend  $/F_{10.7}$   $/A_p$  index), the  $T_i$  residuals are ob-162 tained by removing contribution of the other two components (estimated) from the ISR 163 observed  $T_i$ . The detailed procedures to obtain the  $T_i$  residual are given in Holt and Zhang 164 (2008); Zhang et al. (2011); Zhang and Holt (2013); Zhang et al. (2016). In order to make 165 the comparison of  $T_i$  trends among the ISR sites, a similar method has been used in this 166 study for error estimations also as in Holt and Zhang (2008); Zhang et al. (2011); Zhang 167 and Holt (2013); Zhang et al. (2016). In error estimation, 10000 bootstrap samples are 168 used in order to compute the errors in 95% confidence intervals. 169

# 2.2 Estimation of Debye Parameters, Mean-Free-Path and its Residu als

<sup>172</sup> Debye radius  $(L_d)$ , Debye number $(L_n)$  and Mean-Free-Path $(L_{mfp})$  are calculated <sup>173</sup> at the condition of thermal equilibrium when ratio of electron temperature to ion tem-<sup>174</sup> perature is one. Since it occurs at nighttime; we have calculated the Debye radius  $(L_d)$ , <sup>175</sup> Debye number $(L_n)$  and Mean-Free-Path $(L_{mfp})$  for local mid-night (4 UT) with  $\pm 3$  hour <sup>176</sup> by following the Equations 2, 3, and 4 given by Livadiotis (2019); Goldston and Ruther-<sup>177</sup> ford (1995)

$$L_d = \sqrt{\frac{\epsilon_0 k_B T_e}{N_e e^2}} \tag{2}$$

$$L_n = \frac{4\pi}{3} N_e L_d^3 \tag{3}$$

$$L_{mfp} = \frac{64\sqrt{6\pi}\epsilon_0^2 (k_B T_e)^2}{e^4 N_e * ln(9L_n)}$$
(4)

where  $\epsilon_0$  is the free space permittivity,  $k_B$  is the Boltzmann constant,  $T_e$  is the electron temperature,  $N_e$  is the ISR retrieved electron density, and e is the charge of electron.

In order to calculate the trend residual of  $L_d$ ,  $L_n$ , and  $L_{mfp}$ , we have used the Equation 1 by replacing the temperature term with  $L_d$ ,  $L_n$ , and  $L_{mfp}$ , respectively. Also a negative sign was assigned in the equation for solar the flux and  $A_p$  index, since a negative correlation coefficient is found in relation with  $L_d$ ,  $L_n$ , and  $L_{mfp}$ , even though it is small value as shown in Figure 3.



**Figure 3.** Dispersion diagram of  $L_d$ ,  $L_n$ , and  $L_{mfp}$  against solar flux (F10.7) and geomagnetic activity ( $A_p$  index) (upper and bottom rows, respectively). (a)  $F_{10.7}$  Vs  $L_d$ , (b)  $A_p$  Vs  $L_d$ , (c)  $F_{10.7}$  Vs  $L_n$ , (d)  $A_p$  Vs  $L_n$ , (e)  $F_{10.7}$  Vs  $L_{mfp}$ , (f)  $A_p$  Vs  $L_{mfp}$ ,

### 188 **3 Results**

#### 189 190

# 3.1 $T_i$ trend and dependency of $T_i$ on solar activity and geomagnetic activity

The  $T_i$  residuals are presented in Figure 4 for daytime. The  $T_i$  residuals are cal-191 culated by removing the contributions from annual, semi-annual oscillation, as well as 192 solar and geomagnetic activity. In Figure 4,  $T_i$  residuals (monthly median-black and yearly 193 median-green) are shown at various altitudes from  $\sim$ 122-700 km along with number of 194 months (No.), trend line (solid black line) and its slope (m), error (confidence level of 195 95%), and correlation coefficient (r) between  $T_i$  and floating year.  $T_i$  residuals spread 196 around the trend line which means that those residuals are origin of ionospheric weather 197 rather than statistical noise. Altitudes above  $\sim 480$  km are having larger errors (-2K/year) 198 relatively than lower altitudes. Other than the highest altitude which does not have enough 199 data points to represent the 3 solar cycles, the largest error is found to be -5.98 corre-200 sponding to 67 points at the altitude bin of  $\sim$ 623.6-659.5 km. Most of the times, very 201 large errors are associated with too few data points. In order to eliminate such bias in 202 interpretation, we have removed the trends of those altitudes (day:  $\sim$ 516.1-695.3 km; 203 night:  $\sim 122-193.7$  km) in further analysis whose errors are more (< -2.7 which is the al-204 lowed largest error taken from largest error nighttime). Even with the large error, 205 we preserve the altitude of 122-157.9 km during daytime which has positive trend (for 206 sake of discussion). 207

All the altitudes having the cooling  $T_i$  trends, which vary from -0.31 K/year to -9.96 K/year during the daytime except the altitude bin of ~122-158 km. Strong cooling of -9.96 K/year occurs at the altitude bin of ~623.6-659.5 km where high errors are seen. Weakest cooling of -0.31 K/year occurring at ~193.7-229.5 km with error of 0.56 K/year.

<sup>213</sup>  $T_i$  residuals during nighttime for components of year is shown in figure 5. First <sup>214</sup> two lower altitude bins (~122-158 km & ~158-194 km) fewer than 60 samples. In the <sup>215</sup> altitude bin of ~194-230 km, a weak warming trend is found. Above ~230 km, cooling



Temperature residuals (K) during Day

Figure 4. Daytime  $T_i$  Residuals as a function of year and altitude along with trend line (black solid line) and its statistics (slope (m), standard error (Err), and correlation coefficient (r) between  $T_i$  and floating year). Monthly medians are in black crosses and yearly medians are in green crosses.

trends are gradually increasing as a function of altitude. These cooling  $T_i$  trends vary 216 from -0.54 K/year to -4.59 K/year during the nighttime. Strong cooling of -4.59 K/year 217 occurring at the altitude bin of  $\sim$ 623.6-659.5 km where the strong cooling is also found 218 during daytime, but with a different magnitude. Weakest cooling of -0.54 K/year occurs 219 at the altitude bin of  $\sim$  337-372.8 km with error of 0.32 K/year. The  $T_i$  residuals for the 220 components of  $F_{10.7}$  and  $A_p$  have been calculated for each altitude as as in figure 4 & 221 5 but are not shown here. Indeed, the ratios  $\delta Ti$  /  $\delta f10.7$  (K/sfu) and  $\delta Ti$  /  $\delta Ap$  (K/ap) 222 are shown as function of altitude along with  $T_i$  trends in Figure 6. 223

In Figure 6, the estimated  $T_i$  trends, the  $F_{10.7}$  and to the  $A_p$  index for day (red) 224 and night (black) are presented as function of altitude, (a)  $T_i$  trend (K/year), (b)  $\delta T_i$ 225  $/\delta f10.7$  (K/sfu), and (c)  $\delta Ti / \delta Ap$  (K/ap). Large errors are found to occur in the lower 226 altitudes (less than  $\sim 200$  km) during nighttime whereas the same do occur in the higher 227 altitudes during daytime.  $T_i$  trends are negative in all the altitude ranges except the lower 228 altitude bin of  $\sim$ 122-158 km during daytime and  $\sim$ 194-230 km during nighttime. Esti-229 mated  $T_i$  trends are varying from -0.63 K/year to -13.5 K/year, indicating the cooling 230 trend overall ionosphere during day and night.  $T_i$  trends are almost comparable between 231 day and night in the altitude range of  $\sim 200-450$  km even though the cooling trends are 232 little stronger in daytime than nighttime. Above 480 km,  $T_i$  trends of nighttime show 233 the less cooling than daytime. 234

Figure 6(b) shows the altitude variation of  $\delta Ti / \delta f10.7$  (K/sfu). In order to check 235 the linear relation between  $\delta$ Ti and  $\delta$ f10.7, we have calculated the linear correlation co-236 efficient between them. A strong linear relationship is found between  $T_i$  residuals and 237  $F_{10.7}$ . The large values of positive linear correlation coefficients (r) are varying from 0.77 238 to 0.93 within the altitude range of  $\sim$ 158-445 km during daytime. The linear relation-239 ship is positive from  $\sim 120$  km to  $\sim 550$  km during daytime whereas the this positive re-240 lationship is found to occur in all the altitudes during nighttime. During daytime,  $\delta Ti$ 241  $/\delta f10.7$  (K/sfu) are large around 310 km where electron density peaks during daytime. 242 and gradual decrease is found to occur around that altitude, similar to electron density 243 profile. It might be due to electron heating of the the ions through collisions. This al-244 titude variation of  $\delta Ti$  /  $\delta f10.7$  (K/sfu) during daytime is consistent with results of Son-245 drestrom Zhang et al. (2016). During nighttime, the large values of positive linear cor-246 relation coefficients(r) are varying from 0.76 to 0.95 within the altitude range of  $\sim 230$ -247 695 km. And also  $\delta Ti / \delta f10.7$  (K/sfu) are increasing gradually as a function of altitude. 248 Profiles of  $\delta Ti$  /  $\delta f10.7$  (K/sfu) are not the same during day and night. Above the peak 249 altitude of  $\sim 300$  km, the daytime profile of  $\delta Ti / \delta f10.7$  (K/sfu) is decreasing as a func-250 tion of altitude whereas it is increasing as a function of altitude during nighttime. It prob-251 ably means that the solar activity influences the ion temperatures uniformly in the al-252 titude range of  $\sim 200-700$  km during nighttime. Whereas, solar activity influences are dif-253 ferent on ion temperatures in each altitude during daytime. These day and night vari-254 ability of  $\delta Ti$  /  $\delta f10.7$  are different from Sondrestrom since Sondrestrom observed the 255 same feature of variability between day and night but with different magnitude (Zhang 256 et al., 2016). In comparison,  $T_i$  is sensitive to  $F_{10.7}$  in the altitude range of ~200-400 km 257 during day whereas nighttime  $T_i$  is sensitive to  $F_{10.7}$  above ~400 km. 258

Figure 6(c) shows the altitude variation of  $\delta Ti / \delta Ap$  (K/ap). In order to check 259 the linear relation between  $\delta Ti$  and  $\delta Ap$ , we have calculated the linear correlation co-260 efficient (r) between them. The linear relationship is found to be not strong between  $T_i$ 261 residuals and  $A_p$  since the positive-maximum of r is 0.11 (day) and 0.42 (night). Large 262 values of r are occurring around  $\sim 300$  km where peak electron density may appear; it 263 might be due to  $T_i$  is sensitive to  $A_p$ . By neglecting the large error altitudes,  $\delta \text{Ti} / \delta \text{Ap}$ 264 (K/ap) is decreasing as a function of altitude above  $\sim 300$  km during daytime and it is 265 increasing as a function of altitude above  $\sim$ 337 km during nighttime. These day and night 266 variability of  $\delta Ti / \delta Ap$  are different from Sondrestrom and Poker Flat since Sondrestrom 267 and Poker Flat observed the same feature of variability between day and night but with 268



Figure 5. Similar to Figure 4 but for nighttime period.

different magnitude (Zhang et al., 2016). In comparison,  $T_i$  is sensitive to  $A_p$  during nighttime than daytime. Probably, it might be due to the absence of polar cusp influences.



**Figure 6.**  $T_i$  trend (a) and  $T_i$  response to  $F_{10.7}$  expressed as  $\delta T_i / \delta f_{10.7}$  (K/sfu) (b) and  $A_p$  expressed as  $\delta T_i / \delta A_p(K/a_p)$  (c) for day (red) and night (black) as function of altitude.

### 3.2 Mean Free Path

To understand the effect of cooling trends on other plasma parameters of ionosphere/upper 272 atmosphere, we have estimated the Debye radius  $(L_d)$ , Debye number  $(L_n)$ , and Mean-273 Free-Path  $(L_{mfp})$  at thermal equilibrium using the Equations 2, 3, and 4, respectively. 274 Estimations are made for nighttime since thermal equilibrium occurs during this period. 275 Figure 7 shows the altitudinal variations of median plasma parameters with 25th & 75th 276 percentiles (a)  $T_i/T_e$  (K) &  $N_e$   $(m^{-3})$ , (b)  $L_d$  (m), and (c)  $L_n$   $(m^{-3})$  &  $L_{mfp}$  (km). Sta-277 tistical estimation of median, 25th & 75th percentiles are calculated using all the sam-278 ples of 1985-2019. In Figure 7(a), red-and-black and blue color lines represent the electron-279 and-ion temperature and electron density, respectively. F-region's electron densities are 280 start to increase from  $\sim 175$  km ( $\sim 1.3 \times 10^{10} m^{-3}$ ); it attains maximum density of  $\sim 4 \times 10^{11} m^{-3}$ 281 at  $\sim 350$  km; and it decreases gradually as function of altitude above  $\sim 350$ . F-region's 282 electron/ion temperatures start to increase from  $\sim 175$  km ( $\sim 625$  K); it increases rapidly 283 to  $\sim 875$  K at  $\sim 250$  km; and then it increases gradually above the altitude of  $\sim 250$ . It 284 can be mentioned Te and Ne are taken for analysis at nightime when there is thermal 285 equilibrium so that Ti are very close to Te over Arecibo. In Figure 7(b) and (c), De-286 by eradius/number (red) and mean-free-path (blue) are shown in red and blue, respec-287 tively. As like F-region's electron density profile, Debye radius and mean-free-path are 288 starting to decrease from  ${\sim}175$  km to  ${\sim}350 {\rm km}$  ( ${\sim}0.015$  m to  ${\sim}0.0025$  m &  ${\sim}17$  km to 289  $\sim$ 1.9 km); and then both are increasing gradually above the altitude of  $\sim$ 350 km. In fig-290 ure 7(c), altitude variation of Debye number is very similar to mean-free-path and De-291 by radius. It is also decreasing from  $\sim 175$  km to  $\sim 350$  km ( $\sim 1.5 \times 10^5 m^{-3}$  to  $\sim 7.5 \times 10^4 m^{-3}$ ); 292 and then it increases gradually above  $\sim 350$  km. 293



Figure 7. Altitude variations of plasma parameters for nighttime. (a)  $T_i/T_e$  (K) &  $N_e$   $(m^{-3})$ , (b)  $L_d$  (m) &  $L_{mfp}$  (km), and (c)  $L_n$   $(m^{-3})$  &  $L_{mfp}$  (km).

Figure 8 shows the residual of Debye radius for the component of year (left-side 294 panels),  $F_{10.7}$  (middle panels) and  $A_p$  (right-side panels). Debye radius trend (left-side 295 panels) varies in the range of -0.0027 mm/year to 0.0193 mm/year. High positive trend 296 is coinciding the altitude of maximum electron density in F-region at altitude bin of  $\sim$ 337-297 373 km. Large magnitudes in confidence level of 95 % indicate more errors. Debye ra-298 dius residuals for the component of  $F_{10.7}$  (middle panels) varies in the range of -0.0108 299 mm/sfu to -0.0297 mm/year. Linear correlation coefficient (r) between Debye radius resid-300 uals and  $F_{10.7}$ , varies from -0.49 to 0.72; it might be due to Debye radius is sensitive and 301 negatively respond to  $F_{10.7}$ . Whereas the linear correlation coefficient (r) of Debye ra-302 dius residuals with year and  $A_p$  varies close to zero. Debye radius might be not sensi-303 tive to  $A_p$ . The nature of linear correlation for Debye radius, Debye number and mean-304 free-path residuals with  $F_{10.7}$  and  $A_p$  are same as shown in Figure 8. 305

Sensitivity of solar activity and geomagnetic activity on ion temperature, Debye 306 radius, Debye number and mean-free-path are examined. These influences on those pa-307 rameters are removed to estimate the long-term trend. The long-term trends are found 308 to be non-zero in those parameters, which indicates a role of an unresolved driver. In-309 vestigation to search for this driver is a separate study. Here, we concentrate on the re-310 lation among ion temperature, Debye radius, Debye number and mean-free-path to un-311 derstand the influence of long-term changes on background plasma parameters. In or-312 der to compare them, the altitude profiles of trends are shown in Figure 9. In this fig-313 ure the trend of (a) Debye radius (red), (b) Debye number (red) and (c) mean-free-path 314 (red) are shown along with  $T_i$  trends (blue) during night. Debye radius is increasing in 315 the altitude ranges of  $\sim 240-500$  km, varying as much as 0.017 mm/year. The maximum 316 values occur at  $\sim$ 350 and  $\sim$ 500 km. Above  $\sim$ 500 km, Debye radius shrinks as a func-317 tion of altitude. In the F-region, weaker cooling trends occur at the altitude ( $\sim$ 350) of 318 peak electron density where the Debye radius is increasing. But simple a relation could 319 not be found between the Debye radius trend and the  $T_i$  trend since there is an enlarge-320 ment in Debye radius at the altitudes of  $\sim 400-500$  km where cooling trends are increas-321 ing as a function of altitude. In Figure 9(b), Debye number trends are negative in all 322 the altitudes except the altitude of peak electron density ( $\sim 350$ ). At  $\sim 350$ , Debye num-323 ber trend found to be 40 No./year. Above and below the peak altitude of  $\sim$ 350, the num-324 ber of particles in Debye sphere is decreasing with time. Negative trend of Debye num-325



Figure 8. Debye Radius residuals for the component of year,  $F_{10.7}$  and  $A_p$ .



Figure 9. The trend of Debye radius, Debye number and mean-free-path.

ber is decreasing from -135 per year (at  $\sim 280$ ) to 40 per year (at  $\sim 350$ ) as a function 326 of altitude at the bottom of F-region where the profile of electron density has a positive 327 gradient. Whereas, the negative trend of Debye number is increasing as a function of al-328 titude in the upper portion of F-region (above  $\sim 350$ ) to -920 per year ( $\sim 640$ ) where pro-329 file of electron density has negative gradient. Overall trends of Debye number follow the 330 altitude profile of electron density structure. The trend of Debye number and ion tem-331 perature have the similar altitude variations and both show the increasing negative-trends 332 above the peak electron density altitude. Figure 9(c) shows the profile of mean-free-path 333 trend. The trend of mean-free-path varying around zero from -9 m/year to 9 m/year in 334 the altitude range of  $\sim 280-500$ . Above  $\sim 500$ , the mean-free-path trends are negative; 335 this suggests that the mean-free-path is decreasing over year at those altitudes. The neg-336 ative trend of mean-free-path is decreasing from -9 m/year (at  $\sim 280$ ) to 8 m/year (at 337  $\sim 350$ ) as a function of altitude at the bottom of F-region where profile of electron den-338 sity has positive gradient. The trends of mean-free-path at positive gradient of F-region 339 have a similar nature to the trend of Debye radius and number. Long-term trends sug-340 gest that there are not only the changes in  $T_i$  over time, but also changes in other plasma 341 parameters such as Debye radius, Debye number and mean-free-path. 342

Long-term trends of the ion temperature from multiple ISR locations show vari-343 ations in magnetic latitude. It is useful to compare the AO-ISR trends with those re-344 ported from other ISRs because it is at geomagantic midlatitudes, while the others are 345 higher in latitude. Figure 10 shows the comparison of long term trends of  $T_i$  among var-346 ious ISR locations (pink-daytime AO, gray-nighttime AO, red-Millstone, green-St. Santin, 347 black-Poker Flat, and blue-Sondrestorm). In Figure 10(a) ISRs observed  $T_i$  trend vari-348 ations (daytime) are shown as function of altitude along with nighttime AO-ISR. Other 349 ISR trend data are from Zhang et al. (2016). The cooling trends are observed above 200 350 km. Almost all cooling trends are increasing as increasing altitude. The warming  $T_i$  trends 351 are observed within the altitude range of 150-200 km in other ISR locations than Arecibo. 352 Over Arecibo, the cooling trend is seen in that particular altitude range but is small and 353 the trend appears to be positive below. It may need further studies in order to under-354 stand it better. Zhang et al. (2016) observed cooling trend increases with increasing mag-355 netic latitudes above 275 km. It is clearly seen around 350 km (as shown in Figure 10b). 356 Above 475 km, AO-ISR observed the rapid cooling trends as a function of altitude dur-357

ing daytime than night time. Unfortunately, other ISRs are limited to 475 km and the
 AO-ISR trend estimation shows enhanced uncertainty at high altitudes. Over Arecibo,
 the nighttime trends are warmer relatively than daytime. This rapid cooling above 475
 km needs further study to understand the mechanism behind of it.



Figure 10. Comparison of  $T_i$  trend variations among the ISRs, namely, Millstone (red), St. Santin (green), Poker Flat (black), Sondrestorm (blue) and Arecibo(pink-day & gray-night). (a)  $T_i$  trend (K/year) as a function of altitude, (b)  $T_i$  trend (K/year) as a function of altitude and latitude.

### 362 3.3 Summary and Discussion

372

373

374

375

376

377

378

We have studied the long term trends in ion temperature using incoherent scatter data from the Arecibo observatory from 1985 to 2019. We have compared the trends to those from other ISR sites and discussed possible drivers causing the cooling trends. The following is a list of our results:

- 1. Ion temperatures  $(T_i)$  are found to be sensitive to solar activity (represented by the  $F_{10.7}$  flux) during both day and night. The daytime  $T_i$  solar dependence has a maximum at the altitudes of the F2 peak (~ 310 km). During nighttime,  $T_i$  solar dependence increases with altitude from about 2.2 K/sfu at ~ 300 km to 3.5 K/sfu at ~ 675 km.
  - 2. The same method used to retrieve the  $T_i$ 's dependence on solar activity was applied for its geomagnetic activity responses, but now in respect to  $A_p$  index. Little positive or non-responses of daytime  $T_i$  variation on geomagnetic activity was detected at Arecibo. On the other hand, as seen in Figure 6 (panel c), nocturnal  $T_i$  increases with the increase of  $A_p$ . Similarly, the solar activity, the  $T_i$  response to  $A_p$  increases with altitude from no responses at ~ 200 km to ~ 3 K/nT at altitudes of ~ 675km.



| 1 | 381 |            | sonal components. For daytime, it was found warming trend at low altitude (this   |
|---|-----|------------|---|
| 1 | 382 |            | altitude has more error but retained for sake of discussion) and this trend becomes   |
| 3 | 383 |            | more negative (cooling) with the increase of altitude. Similar behavior is seen for   |
| 1 | 384 |            | the nighttime period where cooling trend is increasing with altitude, reaching a  |
| 3 | 385 |            | maximum of -4K/year. Generally, the cooling trends are increasing as a function   |
| 3 | 386 |            | of altitude.  |
| 3 | 387 | 4.         | Cooling trends in the F-region might be caused by one or more drivers other than  |
| 3 | 388 |            | $F_{10,7}$ , $A_n$ , annual- and semi-annual oscillations. Further investigations are needed  |
| - | 389 |            | to find the responsible driver(s) for such trends.  |
| 1 | 390 | 5.         | Cooling trend is almost the same for day and night up to the altitude of $\sim 475$ km  |
| - | 391 | -          | with a maximum of -3.6 K/year but cooling is relatively stronger in daytime than  |
| - | 302 |            | nighttime Above $\sim 475$ km cooling trend is much stronger during daytime than  |
|   | 202 |            | nighttime   |
|   | 204 | 6          | To gain further understanding on the influence of long-term trends in background  |
|   | 394 | 0.         | parameters of ionosphere/upper atmosphere, we have performed a similar anal-  |
| - | 395 |            | via on Debye radius $(I_{-1})$ Debye number $(I_{-1})$ and mean free path $(I_{-1})$  |
|   | 396 | 7          | ysis on Debye radius $(L_d)$ , Debye number $(L_n)$ and mean-nee-path $(L_m f_p)$ .   |
| 3 | 397 | (.         | we calculated the linear correlation coefficients for $L_d$ with $F_{10.7} \otimes A_p$ , $L_n$ with  |
| 1 | 398 |            | $F_{10.7} \& A_p$ , and $L_{mfp}$ with $F_{10.7} \& A_p$ . These correlation coefficients suggest that  |
|   | 399 | ~          | Debye radius, Debye number and mean-free-path are sensitive to $F_{10.7}$ than $A_p$ .  |
| 4 | 400 | 8.         | The trends of Debye radius, Debye number and mean-free-path might be derived  |
| 4 | 401 |            | in the F-region by a driver(s) other than $F_{10.7}$ , $A_p$ , annual- and semi-annual os-  |
| 4 | 402 |            | cillations since there were a non-zero trends after removing their contributions.   |
| 4 | 403 | 9.         | The Debye radius is increasing over year up to the altitude of $\sim$ 550 km with a max-  |
| 4 | 404 |            | imum rate of 0.017 mm/year. This maximum occurs at two altitude ranges; one   |
| 4 | 405 |            | is around the peak altitude of nighttime F-region ( $\sim 350$ km) and the other is at  |
| 4 | 406 |            | ${\sim}500$ km. Above ${\sim}550$ km, Debye radius shrinks and the rate of shrinking increases  |
| 4 | 407 |            | as a function of altitude. Further, altitude variations of Debye radius trend show  |
| 4 | 408 |            | possible direct relation with $T_i$ trend around and below the peak altitude.   |
| 4 | 409 | 10.        | The Debye number decreases over time and this decreasing rate is increasing as  |
| 4 | 410 |            | a function of altitude above peak altitude of nighttime F-region. This decreasing   |
| 4 | 411 |            | rate is stronger above the peak altitude than below it. Altitude variations of the  |
| 4 | 412 |            | number trend show the direct relation with $T_i$ trend around and below the peak  |
| 4 | 413 |            | altitude, and also relative variation above that altitude.  |
| 4 | 414 | 11.        | The Mean-Free-Path trends vary around zero but having the non-zero values. Al-  |
| 4 | 415 |            | titude variations the Mean-Free-Path trend show the direct relation with $T_i$ trend  |
| 4 | 416 |            | around and below the peak altitude. Above the peak altitude, the relationship is  |
| 4 | 417 |            | not direct/simple.  |
| 4 | 418 | 12.        | Comparison of $T_i$ trends among ISRs reveals that there are both unique features   |
|   | 419 |            | in location/latitude and commonalities. In Mid- and high-latitudes, warming trends  |
|   | 420 |            | are confined below $\sim 180$ km to the E-region except St. Santin, which shows the   |
|   | 421 |            | warming trend up to the altitude of $\sim 275$ km.  |
|   |     | 13         | Above 200 km cooling trends are increasing as a function of altitude  |
| 4 | +22 | 1 <i>1</i> | Relatively, the similar values of T, trends and also the similar vertical evadient in   |
| 4 | 423 | 14.        | The transferred spin found to be in the altitudes range of $-180.250$ km events for Section 7.  |
| 4 | 424 | 15         | $T_i$ trends are found to be in the automos fange of ~160-250 km except 5t. Salitili.<br>Ti trends have latitudinal dependency above $250$ km |
| 4 | 425 | тэ.        | 11 trends have fatitudinal dependency above 250 km.   |
|   | 100 |            | Monthly medians of ion temperature residuals have a linear trend along with the   |
|   |     |            | WORDON DECLARS OF OUT LETTOPLATURE LESULIAIS DAVE A THEAT LETTO STOLD WITH THE  |

Monthly medians of ion temperature residuals have a linear trend along with the 426 superimposition of variations with time scales varying from 6 years to 11 years. These 427 variations are possibly related to the decadal activity of El Niño-Southern Oscillation 428 (ENSO) (Oliver et al., 2013). Connection between ENSO MEI index and  $T_i$  trends is 429 discussed later. Also there are variations with time scales of  $\sim 16$  years reported by Ogawa 430 et al. (2014). Most of the linear  $T_i$  trends are cooling trends. Cooling trends from ion 431 temperature residuals are found to be in all the altitudes of ionosphere/upper atmosphere 432 except its low altitudes. At lower altitudes of ionospheric F-region, the warming trends 433

are observed as like mid- and high- latitudes but in different altitudes. During daytime, 434 warming trends are below 200 km in Millstone Hill, Sondrestorm, Chatanika/Poker Flat 435 and Saint Santin (Zhang et al., 2011, 2016; Donaldson et al., 2010). Occurrence of warm-436 ing trend altitude at AO (mid-latitude station) going down to below 150 km ( $\sim$ 122-158 437 km) during daytime, lower in height than any other locations. It can be noted that this 438 altitude is the lowest altitude in this study and having just enough data points of 69 months. 439 Warming trends were also observed during nighttime at lower altitudes of ionospheric 440 F-region as like daytime. During nighttime, Millstone Hill has the warming trends be-441 low 350 km (Zhang & Holt, 2013); Sondrestorm has it below 250 km but Chatanika/Poker 442 Flat do not have data below 220 km and no warming was observed above 220 km (Zhang 443 et al., 2016). These warming trends at fixed altitudes are not due to the true warming ллл of ionosphere; it is due to downward shift in pressure level because of subsidence of the 445 warmer air with a substantial altitude gradient in temperature as is the case for lower 446 F-region (Akmaev & Fomichev, 1998; Donaldson et al., 2010; Zhang et al., 2011; Zhang 447 & Holt, 2013; Zhang et al., 2016). These warming trends are occurring at lowest alti-448 tudes during daytime whereas it occurs at higher altitudes during nighttime. These oc-449 currences are same in all the latitudes stations except Tromso (Ogawa et al., 2014; Zhang 450 et al., 2016). 451

Generally above the altitudes of 200 km, cooling trends are observed in all the lat-452 itudes (Donaldson et al., 2010; Zhang et al., 2011; Zhang & Holt, 2013; Zhang et al., 2016) 453 except high-latitude-station Tromso where warming was observed above 400 km (Ogawa 454 et al., 2014). It can also be mentioned that cooling trends are increasing with altitude 455 over Tromso from 230 km to 330 km. Above 330 km, cooling trends are decreasing as 456 a function of altitude and the trends turn into warming at just 410 km. The warming 457 trends increase above 410 km as a function of altitude (Ogawa et al., 2014). Decrease 458 of cooling trend as a function of altitude was observed in other latitudes too but in dif-459 ferent altitude ranges. It was observed as 325(night)/425(day)-450 km over Sondrestrom, 460 325-375 km over Chatanika/Poker Flat, and 266-373 km over Arecibo. These kind of re-461 duced cooling trends in altitude profiles more or less occurring at peak altitude of F-region. 462 It can be noted that Millstone Hill does not observe any such feature. Rather, Millstone 463 Hill observed increasing of cooling trends as a function of altitude which is found to be 464 in overall trends of Saint Santin, Chatanika/Poker Flat and Arecibo too. Whereas, warm-465 ing trends were observed above the peak altitude of F-region over Tromso (above 400 466 km) during daytime (Ogawa et al., 2014). 467

Comparison of  $T_i$  trends during day and night reveals that the trends are closely 468 similar values up to the altitude of 430 km over Arecibo. Whereas, the large difference 469 were observed over Millstone Hill, Sondrestrom, and Chatanika/Poker Flat (Zhang & 470 Holt, 2013; Zhang et al., 2016). Strong coolings are occurring during day than night in 471 overall altitudes over Sondrestrom and Arecibo. It was other way around over Chatanika/Poker 472 Flat such as strong cooling during night than day. Over Millstone Hill, Strong coolings 473 were observed during day than night up to the altitude of 450 km. Above the altitude 474 of 450 km, it gets into flip as strong cooling during night than day. It can be noted that 475 comparable cooling is observed  $\sim 475$  km over Millstone Hill which are observed over 476 Arecibo below this said altitude. It needs further study to find the explanations why the 477 difference should occur between both stations at mid-latitudes. Above the altitude of 478 475 km, daytime coolings are comparably stronger than the same of the night over Arecibo. 479

The observed cooling in  $T_i$  trends seem to be related with the Debye radius, Deby number and Mean-Free-Path. At the altitude of F-region peak, there is a consistent correlation among those parameters with  $T_i$  Trends. Expansion of Debye radius is observed in the altitudes from 200-550 km. Above 550 km, shrinking is observed in Debye radius. This expansions are corresponding to the decreasing the number of particles in Debye sphere. It can be noted that number of particles in Debye sphere is decreasing over year irrespective of expansion or shrinking of Debye radius. But the Mean-Free-Path is

decreasing when there is shrinking or less expansion in Debye radius. At the altitude of 487 large expansions of Debye radius trend, Mean-Free-Path is increasing over year. It is clear 488 that long-term variations of  $T_i$  and other plasma parameters might have the influences 489 by a common driver(s) but it needs further studies to understand processes that involved in expansion of Debye radius, decreasing number of particles in Debye sphere and changes 491 in Mean-Free-Path by the cooling trends of  $T_i$  at least at the altitude where  $T_i$  is con-492 siderably equal/close to  $T_n$  (225-275 km). It is the altitude range where all the profiles 493 of  $T_i$  trends from mid- and high-latitude have considerably similar cooling trends except 494 the observations of Saint Santin. 495

At the altitude of 225-325 km,  $T_i$  is approximately equal to  $T_n$ . The estimated av-496 erage  $T_i$  trend over Millstone Hill and Arecibo are -0.35 K/year and -1.775 K/year, re-497 spectively. At these altitudes, Strong cooling is exist over Arecibo than Millstone Hill 498 even both do exist at mid-latitudes. Whereas, Arecibo has weak cooling trends than Mill-499 stone and other locations of mid- and high-latitude at the altitude range of 300-400 km; 500 it is the altitude range where clear latitude dependency exist as cooling trends are as a 501 function of latitudes. It can be mentioned that these altitudes appear abnormal at Arecibo 502 as compared to altitudes above and below. For sake of discussion, latitudinal dependency 503 is very clear among the Sondrestrom, Poker Flat, and Millstone if we remove the AO trends 504 in the altitude range of 250-425 km. From high-mid latitude, the strength of cooling trends 505 is decreasing. To bring this consistent behavior(it already exists among Sondrestrom, 506 Poker Flat, and Millstone), the altitude range of  $\sim$ 350-400 km is highlighted. Notably, 507 there is also a structure around  $\sim$ 375 km in Poker Flat which is little similar to Arecibo's 508 altitude structure in that altitude range with the maginude difference of  $\sim 2$  K. Further 509 studies are needed to understand these altitude structures in context to the dynamics 510 and chemical composition if it exists with latitudinal dependency at those altitude ranges. 511

This latitudinal dependency may be starting to appear from 200 km as per the figure 10. From this altitude of 200 km to 400 km, the  $T_n$  trend was calculated to be 4-6 K/decade using neutral density trend (Akmaev, 2012). These values are 0.4-0.6 K/year which are lesser than Arecibo's  $T_i$  trends and comparable or greater than Millstone Hill's  $T_i$  trends of -0.35 K/year (Zhang & Holt, 2013). Even though the latitudinal dependency of  $T_i$  trends do exist in those altitude ranges but each location has its unique variabilities.

In the comparison of ISRs during daytime period, the observed  $T_i$  trends are hav-519 ing strong cooling (< 0.9 K/year) than the cooling from green house gases contributions 520 by global simulation predictions (-0.2 K/year). In this case, additional drivers might be 521 possible in cooling the upper atmosphere. It might be contributed by gravity wave (Oliver 522 et al., 2013). Simulations show gravity waves can cool the upper atmosphere (Yiğit & 523 Medvede, 2009) and therefore it was speculated that the anticipated long-term gravity 524 wave activity enhancement could lead to long-term cooling in the ionosphere (Oliver et 525 al., 2013). Those gravity waves are speculated to be originated from ocean surfaces since 526 there was a positive correlation between long-term trends of ion temperature and long-527 term relaxation in ENSO activity. It is shown in dashed pink line in the figure 11. 528

In figure 11, the time series of ion temperature (black-solid line) from 122-445 km 529 and its residuals (green-plus-symbols) are shown. And the Ti trend line in green-solid 530 line is shown for the altitude bin of 301-337 km where the daytime  $T_i$  trend almost matches 531 with the same of Millstone Hill. ENSO MEI Index (pink-plus-symbols) and its trends 532 (pink-dashed line-up to 2013 and pink-solid line-up to 2019) are shown in pink colors. Power 533 dissipation index (PDI) of the hurricanes (red-dashed-dot line represents PDI and red-534 535 plus-symbols represents smoothed PDI) and its trend (red-solid line) over North Atlantic basin are shown in red colors. Notably, the magnitude of the negative trend of ion tem-536 perature is different from the magnitude of the negative trend of solar flux at 10.7 cm 537 (blue color curve). In addition to the green house gases cooling, there may be also a pos-538 sible contribution from gravity waves. 539

Based on ray tracing of the gravity waves over Arecibo, (Djuth et al., 2010) sug-540 gests that the source location possibly lies in the Atlantic ocean. This source would prob-541 ably be linked with storm activities since there is an anti-correlation between the power 542 dissipation index of hurricanes over the North Atlantic basin and the long-term trend 543 of ion temperature. The increasing trend of power dissipation index of hurricanes indi-544 cates the increasing trend of hurricane activities so do storm activities. These increas-545 ing trends are also observed in sea-surface-temperatures and surface air temperatures 546 (Wu & Wang, 2019). Responsible GWs are generated not alone by ocean since ENSO 547 is a atmosphere-ocean coupling phenomenon (Huang et al., 2022). The power dissipa-548 tion index (PDI) of hurricanes is increasing over time. PDI increase is negatively cor-549 related with the  $T_i$  trends. Therefore, it could be possible that gravity waves might be 550 generated by the systems associated with the interaction of the ocean and the atmosphere. 551 These waves reach the upper atmosphere and might be contribute to the observed cool-552 ing ((Oliver et al., 2013)) by increasing the cooling trends of  $T_i$  green house gas cooling 553 alone, explaining the discrepancy between the observed cooling and that predicted in the 554 modeling studies. 555

Other ISR sites also have strong cooling trends but they are inland unlike Arecibo. 556 It is not clear how the GWs associated with weather and ocean-atmosphere interaction 557 influence the upper atmosphere of those regions. Further studies are needed to under-558 stand the latitudinal distribution of gravity wave flux and the contribution of gravity waves 559 to the thermal structure of the upper atmosphere and to  $T_i$  trends. And also further stud-560 ies are needed to investigate the source of the gravity waves and also whether those grav-561 ity waves are of lower atmospheric origin from weather phenomena and/or secondary waves 562 from middle atmosphere. 563

### 564 Acknowledgments

Solar flux F10.7 and geomagnetic activity Ap index data are taken from https://lasp 565 .colorado.edu/lisird/data/cls\_radio\_flux\_f107/ and http://wdc.kugi.kyoto-u 566 .ac.jp/kp/index.html, respectively. ISR data are taken from madrigal http://openmadrigal 567 .org website. ENSO MEI index and Power Dissipation Index are taken form https:// 568 psl.noaa.gov/enso/mei/ and www.epa.gov/climate-indicators, respectively. Au-569 thors gratefully thank the AO technical staff for their support in carrying out the ISR 570 observations reported here and also thanking the people who does analysis and main-571 tain madrigal database at AO. The AO is operated by the University of Central Florida 572 under a cooperative agreement with the National Science Foundation, and in alliance 573 with Ana G. Méndez-Universidad Metropolitana, and the Universities Space Research 574 Association. Research at MIT Haystack Observation is supported in part by NSF Geospace 575 Facility grant AGS-1952737 and NASA LWS program 80NSSC21K1315. The author would 576 like to thank his colleagues Dr. Sravani Vaddi and Dr. Alison Smith for their help in manuscript 577 reading and fruitful discussion. 578

### 579 **References**

- Akmaev, R. A. (2012). On estimation and attribution of long-term temperature trends in the thermosphere. J. Geophys. Res., 117, A09321.
- Akmaev, R. A., & Fomichev, V. I. (1998). Cooling of the mesosphere and lower
   thermosphere due to doubling of co2. Ann. Geophys., 16, 1501–1512.
- Bremer, J. (1992). Ionospheric trends in mid-latitudes as a possible indicator of
   the atmospheric greenhouse effect. Journal of Atmospheric and Terrestrial
   Physics, 54, 1505-1511.
- <sup>587</sup> Brum, C. G. M., Rodrigues, F. S., dos Santos, P. T., Matta, A. C., Aponte, N., <sup>588</sup> Gonzalez, S. A., ... Robles, E. (2011). A modeling study of  $f_o f_2$  and  $h_m f_2$ <sup>589</sup> parameters measured by the arecibo incoherent scatter radar and comparison <sup>590</sup> with iri model predictions for solar cycles 21, 22, and 23. J. Geophys. Res.,



Figure 11. Time series of ion temperature (black-solid line) from 122-445 km and its residuals (green-plus-symbols). And the  $T_i$  trend line (green-solid line) of 301-337 km where the daytime  $T_i$  trend almost matches with the same of Millstone Hill. ENSO MEI Index (pink-plus-symbols) and its trends (pink-dashed line-upto 2013 and pink-solid line-upto 2019) along with power dissipation index (PDI) (red-dashed-dot line represents PDI and red-plus-symbols represents smoothed PDI) and its trend (red-solid line) over North Atlantic basin.

| 591 | 116, A03324.   |
|-----|--|
| 592 | Brum, C. G. M., Tepley, C. A., Fentzke, J. T., Robles, E., dos Santos, P. T., & Gon-           |
| 593 | zalez, S. A. (2012). Long-term changes in the thermospheric neutral winds over                 |
| 594 | arecibo: Climatology based on over three decades of fabry-perot observations.                  |
| 595 | J. Geophus. Res., 117, A00H14.   |
| 596 | Cai, Y., Yue, X., Wang, W., Zhang, S., Liu, L., Liu, H., & Wan, W. (2019). Long-               |
| 590 | term trend of tonside ionosphericelectron density derived from dmspdata                        |
| 597 | during 1005–2017 Journal of Ceonhysical Research: Space Physics 10/                            |
| 598 | 10708 10797  |
| 599 | $\begin{array}{c} 10100 - 10121. \end{array}$  |
| 600 | Chossen, I. (2014). The importance of geomagnetic field changes versus rising co2              |
| 601 | levels for long-term change in the upper atmosphere. J. Space Weather Space                    |
| 602 | <i>Clim.</i> , 4, A18.   |
| 603 | Chossen, I., & Maute, A. (2020). Simulated trends in ionosphere-thermosphere cli-              |
| 604 | mate due to predicted main magnetic field changes from 2015 to 2065. J. Geo-                   |
| 605 | phys. Res.: Space Physics, $125(3)$ , e2773.   |
| 606 | Djuth, F. T., Zhang, L. D., Livneh, D. J., Seker, I., Smith, S. M., Sulzer, M. P.,             |
| 607 | Walterscheid, R. L. (2010). Arecibo's thermospheric gravity waves and the                      |
| 608 | case for an ocean source. J. Geophys. Res., 115, A08305.                                       |
| 609 | Donaldson, J. K., Wellman, T. J., & Oliver, W. L. (2010). Long-term change in                  |
| 610 | thermospheric temperature above saint santin. J. Geophys. Res., 115, A11305.                   |
| 611 | Emmert J T (2015) Altitude and solaractivity dependence of 1967–2005ther-                      |
| 612 | mospheric density trends derived from orbital drag I Geophys Res : Space                       |
| 612 | Physice 120 2040–2050  |
| 013 | Emport IT Leep II & Dicens IM (2010) Decend law thermospheric den                              |
| 614 | city during the 2009 solar minimum Coophys Res Lett 27 112102                                  |
| 615 | Sity during the 2008 solar minimum. Geophys. Res. Lett., $57$ , $112102$ .                     |
| 616 | Emmert, J. T., Picone, J. M., Lean, J. L., & Knowles, S. H. (2004). Global change              |
| 617 | in the thermosphere: Compelling evidnce of a secular decrease in density. J.                   |
| 618 | Geophys. Res., 109, A02301.  |
| 619 | Emmert, J. T., Picone, J. M., & Meier, R. R. (2008). hermospheric global average               |
| 620 | density trends. Geophys. Res. Lett., 35, L05101.   |
| 621 | Goldston, R., & Rutherford, P. (1995). Introduction to plasma theory. Bristol, 13-             |
| 622 | 16.  |
| 623 | Holt, J., & Zhang, S. (2008). Long-term temperature trends in the ionosphere above             |
| 624 | millstone hill. Geophys. Res. Lett., 35, L05813.   |
| 625 | Huang, Y., Yuan, N., Shi, M., Lu, Z., & Fu, Z. (2022). On the air-sea couplings                |
| 626 | over tropical pacific: An instantaneous coupling index using dynamical systems                 |
| 627 | metrics. Geophysical Research Letters, 49, e2021GL097049.                                      |
| 628 | Jacobi C $(2014)$ Long-term trends and decadal variability of upper meso-                      |
| 620 | sphere/lower thermosphere gravity waves at midlatitudes Iournal of At-                         |
| 629 | moscheric and Solar-Terrestrial Physics 118 00-05  |
| 030 | Kesting C M Talaan D II & Dradford M C (2000) Evidence of lang term                            |
| 631 | reating, G. M., Ioison, R. H., & Dradiord, M. S. (2000). Evidence of long term                 |
| 632 | giobal decime in the earth's thermospheric densities apparently related to                     |
| 633 | anthropogenic effects. Geophys. Res. Lett., 27, 1523-1526.                                     |
| 634 | Lastovička, J. (2021). Long-term trends in the upper atmosphere. Chapter 17: Geo-              |
| 635 | physical Monograph Series.   |
| 636 | Laštovička, J., Akmaev, R. A., Beig, G., Bremer, J., & Emmert, J. T. (2006).                   |
| 637 | Global change in the upper atmosphere. Science, $314(5803)$ , $1253-1254$ .                    |
| 638 | Laštovička. (2015). Comment on "long-term trends in thermospheric neutral temper-              |
| 639 | atures and density above millstone hill" by w. l. oliver et al.,. J. Geophys. Res.             |
| 640 | Space Physics, 120, 2347–2349.   |
| 641 | Liu, H., Tao, C., Jin, H., & Abe, T. (2021). Geomagnetic activity effects on co <sub>2</sub> - |
| 642 | driven trend in the thermosphere and ionosphere: Ideal model experiments                       |
| 643 | with gaia, J. Geophys. Res.: Space Physics, 126, e2020. JA028607                               |
| 644 | Livadiotis, G. (2019). Collision frequency and mean free nath for plasmas described            |
| 645 | by kappa distributions AIP Advances 9 105307-105314  |
| 045 | by mappa distributions. In $Invances$ , $\sigma$ , 100001-100014.                              |

- Mikhailov, A. V. (2006). Ionospheric long-term trends: can the geomagnetic con trol and the greenhouse hypotheses be reconciled?. Ann. Geophys., 24, 2533–
   2541.
- Ogawa, Y., Motoba, T., Buchert, S. C., Häggström, I., & Nozawa, S. (2014).
   Upper atmosphere cooling over the past 33 years. *Geophys. Res. Lett.*, 41, 5629–5635.
- Oliver, W. L., Holt, J. M., Zhang, S.-R., & Goncharenko, L. P. (2014). Long-term
   trends in thermospheric neutral temperature and density above millstone hill.
   *J. Geophys. Res. Space Physics*, 119, 7940–7946.
- Oliver, W. L., Holt, J. M., Zhang, S.-R., & Goncharenko, L. P. (2015). Reply to
   comment by jan lastovička on "long-term trends in thermospheric neutral tem perature and density above millstone hill. J. Geophys. Res. Space Physics,
   120, 2350-2352.

659

660

661

662

663

664

665

- Oliver, W. L., Zhang, S.-R., & Goncharenko, L. P. (2013). Is thermospheric global cooling caused by gravity waves? J. Geophys. Res. Space Physics, 118, 3898–3908.
- Qian, L., McInerney, J. M., Solomon, S. S., Liu, H., & Burns, A. G. (2021). Climate changes in the upper atmosphere: Contributions by the changing greenhouse gas concentrations and earth's magnetic field from the 1960s to 2010s. J. Geophys. Res.: Space Physics, 126, e2020JA029067.
- Rishbeth, H. (1990). A greenhouse effect in the ionosphere. *Planet. Space Sci.*, 38, 945–948.
- Roble, R. G., & Dickinson, R. E. (1989). How will changes in carbon dioxide and
   methane modify the mean structure of the mesosphere and thermosphere?
   *Geophys. Res. Lett.*, 16, 1441-1444.
- Santos, P. T., Brum, C. G. M., Tepley, C. A., Aponte, N., González, S. A., & Robles, E. (2011). Using incoherent scatter radar to investigate the neutral wind
  long-term trend over arecibo. J. Geophys. Res., 116, A00H13.
- Wu, R., & Wang, Y. (2019). Comparison of north atlantic oscillation-related changes
   in the north atlantic sea ice and associated surface quantities on different time
   scales. J. Geophys. Res. Space Physics, 40, 2686-2701.
- Yiğit, E., & Medvede, A. S. (2009). Heating and cooling of the thermosphere by internal gravity waves. *Geophys, Res. Lett.*, 36, L14807.
- Yue, X., Hu, L., Wei, Y., Wan, W., & Ning, B. (2018). Ionospheric trend over
   wuhan during 1947–2017: Comparison between simulation and observation.
   *Journal of Geophysical Research: Space Physics*, 123(2), 1396–1409.
- Zhang, S.-R., & Holt, J. M. (2013). Long-term ionospheric cooling: Dependency
   on local time, season, solar activity, and geomagnetic activity. J. Geophys. Res.
   Space Physics, 118, 3719-3730.
- Zhang, S.-R., Holt, J. M., Erickson, P. J., Goncharenko, L. P., Nicolls, M. J., Mc-
- Cready, M., & Kelly, J. (2016). Ionospheric ion temperature climate and
  upper atmospheric long-term cooling. J. Geophys. Res. Space Physics, 121,
  8951-8968.
- Zhang, S.-R., Holt, J. M., & Kurdzo, J. (2011). Millstone hill isr observations of
   upper atmospheric long-term changes: Height dependency. J. Geophys. Res.,
   116, A00H05.