Circumpolar variations in the chaotic nature of Southern Ocean eddy dynamics

Andrew McC. Hogg¹, Thierry Penduff², Sally E. Close³, William K. Dewar⁴, Navid C Constantinou¹, and Josué Martínez-Moreno¹

¹Australian National University ²Laboratoire de Glaciologie et Geophysique de l'Environnement, CNRS ³Laboratore d'Oceanographie Physique et Spatiale (LOPS), University of Brest/IFREMER/IRD/CNRS ⁴Florida State University

November 23, 2022

Abstract

Circulation in the Southern Ocean is unique. The strong wind stress forcing and buoyancy fluxes, in concert with the lack of continental boundaries, conspire to drive the Antarctic Circumpolar Current replete with an intense eddy field. The effect of Southern Ocean eddies on the ocean circulation is significant – they modulate the momentum balance of the zonal flow, and the meridional transport of tracers and mass. The strength of the eddy field is controlled by a combination of forcing (primarily thought to be wind stress) and intrinsic, chaotic, variability associated with the turbulent flow field itself. Here, we present results from an eddy-permitting ensemble of ocean model simulations to investigate the relative contribution of forced and intrinsic processes in governing the variability of Southern Ocean eddy kinetic energy. We find that variations of the eddy field are mostly random, even on longer (interannual) timescales. Where correlations between the wind stress forcing and the eddy field exist, these interactions are dominated by two distinct timescales – a fast baroclinic instability response; and a multi-year process owing to feedback between bathymetry and the mean flow. These results suggest that understanding Southern Ocean eddy dynamics and its larger-scale impacts requires an ensemble approach to eliminate intrinsic variability, and therefore may not yield robust conclusions from observations alone.

Circumpolar variations in the chaotic nature of Southern Ocean eddy dynamics

Andrew McC. Hogg¹, Thierry Penduff², Sally E. Close^{2,4}, William K. Dewar³, Navid C. Constantinou¹, and Josué Martínez-Moreno^{1,4}

5	¹ Research School of Earth Sciences and ARC Centre of Excellence for Climate Extremes,
6	Australian National University, Canberra, Australia
7	² Université Grenoble Alpes, CNRS, IRD, Grenoble-INP, Institut des Géosciences de l'Environnement
8	(IGE), Grenoble, France
9	³ Florida State University, Tallahassee, FL, USA
10	⁴ Now at: Laboratoire d'Océanographie Physique et Spatiale (LOPS), University of
11	Brest/IFREMER/IRD/CNRS, Brest, France

Key Points:

1

2

3

4

12

18

13	•	Monthly-to-interannual variability in the Southern Ocean eddy field is dominated by
14		chaotic, rather than atmospherically-forced processes.
15	•	The forced component of the eddy kinetic energy variance is significantly correlated
16		with the local wind stress input.
17	•	The forced changes in the eddy field lag the wind stress, with two timescales emerging:

•, one at 4-6 months, and one at 2-3 years.

 $Corresponding \ author: \ Andrew \ McC. \ Hogg, \ \texttt{Andy.Hogg@anu.edu.au}$

19 Abstract

Circulation in the Southern Ocean is unique. The strong wind stress forcing and buoyancy 20 fluxes, in concert with the lack of continental boundaries, conspire to drive the Antarctic 21 Circumpolar Current replete with an intense eddy field. The effect of Southern Ocean eddies 22 on the ocean circulation is significant – they modulate the momentum balance of the zonal 23 flow, and the meridional transport of tracers and mass. The strength of the eddy field is 24 controlled by a combination of forcing (primarily thought to be wind stress) and intrinsic, 25 chaotic, variability associated with the turbulent flow field itself. Here, we present results 26 from an eddy-permitting ensemble of ocean model simulations to investigate the relative 27 contribution of forced and intrinsic processes in governing the variability of Southern Ocean 28 eddy kinetic energy. We find that variations of the eddy field are mostly random, even 29 on longer (interannual) timescales. Where correlations between the wind stress forcing 30 and the eddy field exist, these interactions are dominated by two distinct timescales – a 31 fast baroclinic instability response; and a multi-year process owing to feedback between 32 bathymetry and the mean flow. These results suggest that understanding Southern Ocean 33 eddy dynamics and its larger-scale impacts requires an ensemble approach to eliminate 34 intrinsic variability, and therefore may not yield robust conclusions from observations alone. 35

³⁶ Plain language summary

The Southern Ocean is the most turbulent part of the world's oceans. This turbulence, 37 often referred to as *eddies*, is critical to the evolution of the Southern Ocean under climate 38 change. But it's hard to get information about these eddies, because they occur on small 39 scales in a large ocean basin that is poorly observed. In addition, the observational record is 40 quite short, which makes it more difficult to use these observations to study what controls 41 variations of these eddies. For this reason, we take an eddy-permitting ocean model, and run 42 it 50 times with the same forcing (but a slightly different initial state). The chaotic nature 43 of the turbulent ocean means that these model runs exhibit different evolutions. Then we 44 use these simulations to study which eddy processes occur as a consequence of the chaotic 45 nature of turbulence and which are forced by the external factors that are common to all 46 model runs (such as wind stress). We conclude that monthly-to-interannual fluctuations 47 of the Southern Ocean eddy field are dominated by chaotic processes; but that the forced 48 variability responds to wind on particular timescales that are controlled by the mechanisms 49 that generate ocean turbulence. 50

51 **1 Introduction**

The Southern Ocean is unique in the global ocean; it is the one region without continents 52 on its zonal boundaries, giving rise to the Antarctic Circumpolar Current (ACC) that flows 53 eastward around the globe. The ACC acts to connect the other major basins and thereby 54 regulates climate and nutrients. The Southern Ocean region is also a place where mid-55 and high-latitude ventilation of the oceans occurs, leading to carbon and heat uptake and 56 controlling deep ocean stratification (Rousselet et al., 2021; Morrison et al., 2022). However, 57 the Southern Ocean is also poorly observed (compared with other ocean basins) and its 58 unique properties mean that the dynamics of this region (with the aim of predicting future 59 responses to climate change) need to be urgently constrained. 60

Another unique feature of the Southern Ocean is that it has a strong eddy field (Fu et al., 61 2010). This eddy field has been suggested to be important in the Southern Ocean's response 62 to change. For example, the eddy saturation hypothesis (Hallberg & Gnanadesikan, 2006; 63 Meredith & Hogg, 2006; Munday et al., 2013; Constantinou & Hogg, 2019) suggests that the 64 role of eddies in facilitating vertical momentum transport acts to limit the response of ACC 65 transport to changing winds. A similar dynamics, known as eddy compensation, describes 66 the role of eddies in moderating the effect of wind-driven change on the Southern Ocean 67 overturning circulation (Morrison & Hogg, 2013). Therefore, the response of mesoscale 68

transient motion in the Southern Ocean is likely important to characterising the dynamics of this region.

The strength of the Southern Ocean eddy field is usually characterised by extracting 71 the kinetic energy of transient motions; referred to by oceanographers as eddy kinetic energy 72 (EKE). It is important to highlight that EKE includes all transient motion, not just coherent 73 vortices (Martínez-Moreno et al., 2019), and thus care needs to be taken in interpreting this 74 metric. Eddy kinetic energy has a complex relationship with the forces that drive the ocean 75 circulation. Meredith & Hogg (2006) found significant variations in the area-averaged eddy 76 77 field in some regions, and argued for a 2-3 year lag between wind stress forcing variations and EKE anomalies that follow. Patara et al. (2016), using a realistic high-resolution ocean 78 model found that EKE does have a lagged response to wind stress anomalies, but that 79 this relationship varies in strength around the Southern Ocean. Idealised model studies 80 over a wide range of parameter space (Sinha & Abernathey, 2016) have highlighted that 81 the timescale of the perturbation is critical in determining the EKE response, with shorter 82 perturbations having a faster, Ekman-related response. Thus, current knowledge suggests 83 that there is a relationship between wind forcing and the Southern Ocean, but that the 84 nature of this relationship needs to be clarified. 85

On longer timescales, it has also been proposed that EKE has increased over recent 86 decades (Hogg et al., 2015; Martínez-Moreno et al., 2019; Martínez-Moreno, Hogg, England, 87 Constantinou, et al., 2021). The robustness of this wind-EKE relationship in the Southern 88 Ocean was recently investigated by Zhang et al. (2021), who used crossover data from 89 satellite observations (as in Hogg et al., 2015) to better estimate the EKE on regional 90 scales. By fine-graining these calculations it was found that only a single region (30°) -wide 91 in longitude) expressed a significant long-term trend in EKE. This finding suggests that 92 previous characterisations of the response may have been dominated by a small number of 93 regional events, calling into question the robustness of previous studies. 94

The dynamical importance of the Southern Ocean eddy field, and uncertainty over the 95 robustness of its variability and trends, motivate a deeper investigation into the processes 96 that control Southern Ocean eddies. A key issue here is the extent to which the eddy field 97 purely responds to external (atmospheric) forcing, versus the role of chaotic and intrinsic 98 variability in determining eddy energy. The fact that high-frequency eddy variability is qq random and chaotic is well-known, and even non-eddying ocean models can produce (a 100 small amount of) intrinsic variability via large-scale baroclinic instability (e.g. de Verdière 101 & Huck, 1999; Constantinou & Hogg, 2021). At longer timescales intrinsic variability can 102 emerge from oceanic non-linearities under constant or seasonal forcing and persists under 103 variable forcing (Leroux et al., 2018). Such intrinsic variability has a random phase (that is, it 104 is chaotic in character); it mostly emerges at mesoscale and can cascade toward interannual 105 time scales and O(1000 km) space scales (Sérazin et al., 2018). One of the goals of this work 106 is to characterise the spatiotemporal extent of chaotic, intrinsic, variability in determining 107 Southern Ocean EKE. 108

A primary complication in understanding Southern Ocean EKE is the limitation of 109 inference from an admittedly short satellite record; in particular, whether individual events 110 can be attributed to forcing changes, or to intrinsic variability, or a combination of the 111 two. In this paper, we address this question by examining the intrinsic variability of the 112 Southern Ocean eddy field in a large ensemble of eddy-permitting ocean simulations. We 113 use the OceaniC Chaos – ImPacts, strUcture, predicTability (OCCIPUT) ensemble of global 114 ocean/sea-ice hindcast simulations (Penduff et al., 2014; Leroux et al., 2018), a 50-member 115 ensemble of hindcast simulations. We examine both the intrinsic variance of the eddy field, 116 117 and extract the "forced" (ensemble mean) component of the variability. This variability is examined on a circumpolar and regional basis, to better understand the regional differences 118 and processes which contribute to the eddy field. 119

120 2 Methods

2.1 The OCCIPUT ensemble

The methodology employed in this study is derived from the probabilistic approach to ocean modelling outlined by Bessières et al. (2017). We use output from the OCCIPUT ensemble of 50 eddy-permitting global ocean-sea ice simulations, based on the ORCA025 implementation (e.g. Barnier et al., 2006) of the NEMO modelling system (Madec, 2012). The model grid has a 1/4° horizontal resolution and 75 geopotential levels. The approach involves:

- The 50 ensemble members are initialized in 1960 from a single-member 21-year spinup;
 The ensemble spread is seeded by activating a stochastic perturbation (Brankart et al., 2015) over one year (1960), after which the perturbation is terminated;
- 131 132

133

138

148

153

156

157

121

3. The 50 ensemble members are integrated from 1960 to 2015, driven by the same realistic atmospheric forcing function based on the ERA-40 and ERA-Interim reanalyses (Drakkar Forcing Set DFS5.2; Dussin et al. (2016)).

In these simulations the wind stress is computed without ocean current feedbacks, hence ensuring that the same momentum fluxes are applied to all members. We focus our analyses on the period 1980-2015, thus yielding an effective spinup duration of 41 years in each member.

2.2 Estimating geostrophic eddy velocity

For each ensemble member, the sea surface height, η_i , is saved as a 5-daily average (where *i* represents the ensemble member). For each ensemble member, the member's global mean sea level anomaly is subtracted from all grid points at every time step to correct for spurious terms introduced by the use of the Boussinesq approximation (Greatbatch, 1994). The model drift, which is potentially nonlinear, is then corrected for by detrending using a LOWESS filter (Cleveland, 1979) in combination with a 5th-order spline; full details of this preprocessing may be found in Close et al. (2020).

The sea level anomaly, η'_i , is calculated as the transient component of sea level in ensemble member *i*, given by

$$\eta_i' = \eta_i - \overline{\eta_i},\tag{1}$$

where $\bar{\cdot}$ represents the temporally filtered, detrended sea level (Close et al., 2020). The sea level anomaly is then used to calculate the eddy velocity field. Surface eddy velocity in each ensemble member, $\mathbf{u}'_i = (u'_i, v'_i)$ is estimated from the detrended sea level anomaly via the geostrophic relation,

$$u'_i = -\frac{g}{f} \frac{\partial \eta'_i}{\partial y} \quad \text{and} \quad v'_i = \frac{g}{f} \frac{\partial \eta'_i}{\partial x},$$
 (2)

where g is the acceleration due to gravity and f is the local Coriolis parameter. Anomalous values of \mathbf{u}'_i close to coastlines are removed.

The surface eddy kinetic energy for each ensemble member is calculated as

$$E_i = \frac{1}{2}(u_i'^2 + v_i'^2), \tag{3}$$

and subsampled at monthly temporal resolution. It is notable that E_i contains a large component of seasonal variation which dominates the statistics (Martínez-Moreno, Hogg, & England, 2021). To look at the forced response, we therefore deseasonalise E_i , by removing mean seasonal cycle. We then proceed to compute ensemble statistics from this deseasonalised EKE.

¹⁶³ 2.3 Ensemble eddy statistics

166

171

175

178

1

19

197

The eddy kinetic energy can be averaged over the N ensemble members to give the ensemble mean EKE, written as

 $\langle E \rangle = \frac{1}{N} \sum_{i=1}^{N} E_i.$ (4)

The argument can be made that, since each ensemble member is forced with identical atmospheric conditions, the forced EKE response is captured by this ensemble mean quantity. On the other hand, the intrinsic variability of EKE in each ensemble member is found by taking the difference from the ensemble mean for each member,

$$E_i^* = E_i - \langle E \rangle, \tag{5}$$

where \cdot^* is used to indicate departure from the ensemble mean. With these expressions in hand, we follow Leroux et al. (2018) to define the time-variance of the ensemble-mean EKE,

$$\sigma_{\langle E \rangle}^2 = \frac{1}{T} \sum_{t=1}^T \left(\langle E \rangle - \overline{\langle E \rangle} \right)^2, \tag{6}$$

which represents the variance of the forced eddy response. Analogously, the intrinsic variance
 emerges from the variance,

$$\epsilon^{2}(t) = \frac{1}{N} \sum_{i=1}^{N} E_{i}^{*}(t)^{2}, \tag{7}$$

indicating the spread of each member from the ensemble mean. The fraction of intrinsic
 variance is then computed as the ratio of the intrinsic variance to the total variance,

$$R_i = \frac{\overline{\epsilon^2}}{\overline{\epsilon^2} + \sigma_{\langle E \rangle}^2}.$$
(8)

¹⁸² When R_i approaches unity, the system is dominated by intrinsic variability, while at the ¹⁸³ limit of $R_i \rightarrow 0$ the system is solely responding to forced variability induced by atmospheric ¹⁸⁴ forcing.

To examine the relationship between the EKE (of either the ensemble mean, or from individual ensemble members) we are guided by previous work which emphasises the role of wind stress in governing the eddy variability at different timescales (e.g. Hogg et al., 2015; Sinha & Abernathey, 2016). Thus, we look at the correlation coefficient, r, at a range of lags between the wind stress $|\tau|$ (which is identical for all ensemble members) and EKE. For each correlation we evaluate the statistical significance of the correlation (following, e.g. Santer et al., 2000). We first calculate the effective sample size, N_e , where

$$N_e \equiv N \frac{1 - r_1 r_2}{1 + r_1 r_2},\tag{9}$$

where N is the total number of samples (444 months for this timeseries), r_1 is the lag-1 autocorrelation for EKE and r_2 is the lag-2 autocorrelation for wind stress. We use the Students t-test to infer statistical significance (at the 95%-level) based on this effective sample size, when

$$T = \frac{r\sqrt{N_e}}{\sqrt{1 - r^2}} > 2.$$
 (10)

Lagged correlation estimates indicate when this significance test is satisfied.

¹⁹⁹ 3 Results

The intensity of the Southern Ocean eddy field is not uniform. A snapshot of eddy 200 kinetic energy from the model used here (Fig. 1a) show the occurrence of strong eddies 201 which appear in the lee of subsurface topography and at the outlet from western boundary 202 currents such as the Agulhas retroflection and Malvinas current. The same patterns are 203 evident in the ensemble and temporal mean of the EKE ($\langle E \rangle$; Fig. 1b), although the signal 204 of individual eddies is no longer apparent. The strongest band of EKE approximately 205 follows the path of the Antarctic Circumpolar Current, and EKE is weak south of 60°S. 206 207 The patterns of EKE in this model broadly match the regional variations of EKE observed from satellite altimetry, albeit at slightly lower intensity, as expected in an eddy-permitting 208 model (e.g. Kiss et al., 2020). 209



Figure 1. (a) Snapshot (5-day average) from a single ensemble member showing Southern Ocean EKE, E_i , and (b) time-averaged ensemble mean EKE, $\overline{\langle E \rangle}$.

For each of the 50 members of the OCCIPUT ensemble we take the EKE averaged over 212 the entire Southern Ocean $(40^{\circ}-60^{\circ}S)$, and plot the deseasonalised EKE anomalies from 213 each ensemble member in thin grey lines in Fig. 2(a). This plot highlights the considerable 214 spread in EKE, even when averaged over the full circumpolar belt; in other words, there is 215 a significant component of chaotic (intrinsic) variability in the Southern Ocean eddy field. 216 Nonetheless, when averaged over all ensemble members (red line in Fig. 2a) the existence 217 of a coherent (forced) component of eddy variability is revealed. Averaged over this wide 218 region the fraction, R_i , of intrinsic variance is 0.82, confirming the visual impression that 219 intrinsic processes dominate the variability in the eddy field averaged over the basin. 220

Although Southern Ocean EKE variability is strongly intrinsic, there remains a com-226 ponent of forced variability (red line in Fig. 2a). Previous studies have inferred that there 227 is a strong contribution of wind stress forcing upon EKE, and we therefore compare the 228 forced variability with the variations in wind stress averaged over the same circumpolar belt 229 (black line in Fig. 2a). This comparison suggests a relationship in which wind stress leads 230 variations in EKE, consistent with previously published results. However, the time-lagged 231 correlations between wind stress and EKE implies that this relationship is complex. The in-232 trinsically variable nature of Southern Ocean eddies means that for some ensemble members, 233 there is no meaningful correlation between wind stress and eddies (grey lines in Fig 2b). On 234 the other hand, ensemble member 5 (magenta line) has a clear (and significant; T = 5.5) 235



Figure 2. Eddy kinetic energy statistics over the Southern Ocean (40°S–60°S). (a) Spatially averaged deseasonalised EKE anomaly (relative to climatology) for individual ensemble members (grey) and the ensemble mean (red) along with wind stress (black); and (b) Time-lagged correlation between wind stress and EKE for the ensemble mean (red) and individual ensemble members (grey) – with two individual ensemble members highlighted in magenta and orange.

correlation with a 4-month lag, while member 25 (orange line) is weakly correlated at 6 months, and significantly correlated (T = 4.2) at a 24-month lag. These isolated examples highlight the differing behaviour of each ensemble member. The ensemble mean (red line in Fig 2b) includes a significant correlation at ~4 months and a second significant peak at ~30 months. Thus, two distinct timescales of response of the Southern Ocean eddy field to wind stress are present in this model, overprinted by a dominanent and complex influence of chaotic variability.

The ensemble of simulations shown here allow us to look in more detail at smaller 253 regions of the Southern Ocean. Calculating the variability of EKE in a smaller region 254 has the advantage of isolating the individual processes which may occur in differing regions 255 (for example, stronger topographic steering in places with steep bathymetry). However, this 256 advantage is partly offset by higher intrinsic variability; if the region of interest is sufficiently 257 small, then an individual eddy or event can have a large influence over the EKE timeseries. 258 In balancing these competing issues, we examine the variability within regions that span 259 $15-20^{\circ}$ in latitude and $30-40^{\circ}$ in longitude, as shown in Figure 3(a). We analyse the EKE 260 timeseries averaged over these boxes – including individual member EKE, ensemble mean 261 EKE and lagged correlations between local wind stress forcing and the ensemble mean EKE 262 in Fig. 3(b-e). 263

We first examine a region in the lee of Kerguelen Plateau in the Southeast Indian Ocean 264 (cyan box in Fig. 3a). This region is characterised by high-frequency (~ 1 year) variations in 265 EKE, with a relatively large forced component (the intrinsic variance fraction, $R_i = 0.63$, is 266 smaller than the Southern Ocean average; Fig. 3b). The forced variation is clearly evident 267 in the timeseries of individual ensemble members; and this forced component is related 268 to wind stress. The lag between wind stress variations and ensemble mean EKE is short 269 $(\sim 5 \text{ months}; \text{ cyan line in Fig. 3c})$ with a single clear and significant peak in the lagged 270 correlation. There is a second, weaker but significant, correlation at 30 months lag. This 271 region highlights a regime in which the eddy field primarily responds rapidly to variations 272 in the local wind stress. 273

In the Southeast Pacific Ocean (red box in Fig. 3a) the situation clearly differs. Here, the intrinsic variance fraction is larger than in the Southeast Indian Ocean ($R_i = 0.78$)



Figure 3. Eddy kinetic energy statistics within sub-regions of the Southern Ocean. (a) Map 243 showing ensemble mean EKE, along with 3 boxes over which a regional EKE analysis is applied; 244 (b) Regional analysis of the Southeast Indian Ocean showing ensemble mean EKE in cyan, indi-245 vidual ensemble members EKE in grey and local wind stress averaged over the region in black; (c) 246 Lagged correlation of ensemble mean EKE in each of the three regions; (d) Regional analysis of the 247 Southwest Pacific Ocean showing ensemble mean EKE in red, individual ensemble members EKE 248 in grey and local wind stress averaged over the region in black; and (e) Regional analysis of the 249 South Atlantic Ocean showing ensemble mean EKE in orange, individual ensemble members EKE 250 in grey and local wind stress averaged over the region in black. The fraction of intrinsic variance 251 in each region is shown in the caption of panels (b), (d) and (e). 252

and the timescale of the variability is much longer; there is no significant response to wind
stress variations which occur at sub-annual scales (Fig. 3d). The maximum values in the
lag correlation occur over a broad band from 9-24 months in this region, without a single
clear peak. Thus, this region varies slowly and consistently to interannual variations in wind
stress, albeit with a strong chaotic component.

In the South Atlantic Ocean (orange box in Fig. 3a) the system is again dominated by intrinsic variance ($R_i = 0.74$) and is poorly correlated with wind stress forcing (Fig. 3c,e), reinforcing the circumpolar heterogeneity of the EKE response to wind. Other regions (see Fig. 4) highlight different aspects of the local eddy response; with almost no correlation with wind forcing over the Central South Pacific (Fig. 4b) or the Southwest Indian Ocean (the Agulhas meander region; Fig. 4e). In both of these regions, intrinsic variability largely dominates the signal and correlations are weak and insignificant. On the other hand, the



Eddy kinetic energy statistics within sub-regions of the Southern Ocean. (a) Map Figure 4. 295 showing ensemble mean EKE, along with 3 boxes over which a regional EKE analysis is applied; 296 (b) Regional analysis of the Central South Pacific Ocean showing ensemble mean EKE in cyan, 297 individual ensemble members EKE in grey and local wind stress averaged over the region in black; (c) Lagged correlation of ensemble mean EKE in each of the three regions; (d) Regional analysis 299 of the Southeast Pacific Ocean showing ensemble mean EKE in red, individual ensemble members 300 EKE in grey and local wind stress averaged over the region in black; and (e) Regional analysis of 301 the Southwest Indian Ocean showing ensemble mean EKE in orange, individual ensemble members 302 EKE in grey and local wind stress averaged over the region in black. The fraction of intrinsic 303 304 variance in each region is shown in the caption of panels (b), (d) and (e).

Southeast Pacific (north of the main pathway of the ACC) shows a strong and coherent multi-year response to wind stress, with smaller intrinsic variance fraction and a peak lag at 30 months. It is notable that this region, which is north of the mean ACC pathway, has a weak EKE signal (one tenth the magnitude of the core of the ACC). The circumpolar contrasts in both EKE response times and intrinsic variability suggests that the two-timescale response seen in Fig. 2 may be created by different processes, which each dominate in different regions of the Southern Ocean.

The heterogeneity in correlations between local wind and the ensemble mean EKE ($\langle E \rangle$) shows that, where forced variability in Southern Ocean EKE occurs, it can be partly explained by variations in wind stress. However, these correlations are based purely on local wind stress – averaged over the same area as the EKE statistics. The existence of multi-year lags between the wind and the EKE suggests that local winds may not be the only source



Figure 5. The spatial correlation of wind stress with $\langle E_i \rangle$ in (a) the Southeast Indian Ocean at 5-month lag; (b) the Southeast Indian Ocean at 30-month lag; (c) the Southwest Pacific ocean at 15-month lag and (d) the South Atlantic Ocean at 17-month lag.

of energy for eddy generation; in particular, it is possible that energy could be advected 313 a considerable distance downstream during this lag period. To investigate this question 314 we now take each of the regions outlined in Fig. 3 and look at the spatial distribution 315 of temporal correlations between wind stress and the local ensemble mean EKE (Fig. 5). 316 To make this calculation, wind stress is first coarsened to a $4^{\circ} \times 4^{\circ}$ grid, and wind stress 317 in each of those coarsened grid cells correlated with ensemble mean EKE at different lags. 318 In the Southeast Indian Ocean, Fig. 3(c) shows correlation maxima at 5 months and 30 319 months; the spatial variation of this correlation is shown in Fig. 5(a,b) respectively. These 320 figures highlight a key feature of Southern Ocean wind stress, which is that there are strong 321 autocorrelations between wind stress along a line of latitude; nonetheless, the maximum 322 correlation between wind stress and $\langle E \rangle$ occurs within the EKE-averaging region. This 323 correlation is lower in magnitude at 30 months (consistent with Fig. 3c), but at both 5 324 and 30 month lags the correlation with wind upstream of the EKE-averaging region is not 325 stronger than within the EKE-averaging region. A similar result is found in the Southwest 326



Figure 6. (a) The intrinsic variance fraction, R_i , averaged onto a $4^{\circ} \times 4^{\circ}$ grid and with a 12month rolling mean; (b) amplitude of variability due to forced processes and (c) amplitude of variability due to intrinsic processes.

Pacific Ocean (Fig. 5c); wind stress correlations are relatively uniform across the Pacific 327 Ocean owing to the autocorrelation of winds, but the correlations are less circumpolar than 328 the Southeast Indian Ocean. Importantly, there is no suggestion of a strong correlation 329 with wind stress upstream of the EKE-averaging region. In the South Atlantic, $\langle E \rangle$ is not 330 strongly correlated with wind stress, either in the local region or elsewhere in the Southern 331 Ocean (Fig. 5d). Thus, these spatial maps demonstrate that, where strong forced variability 332 in the ensemble mean EKE exists, it is most strongly linked to local wind stress, with no 333 suggestion of upstream or remote wind input playing a strong role. 334

335 4 Discussion and Conclusions

The simulations shown here advocate for a probabilistic approach to understanding 336 the Southern Ocean eddy field. The 50-member ensemble of eddy-permitting ocean-sea ice 337 model simulations investigated here demonstrate that inference about the EKE response of 338 a single ensemble member to variable forcing in a localised region is not robust, broadly con-339 sistent with the findings of Zhang et al. (2021). This point is clarified in Fig. 6 which shows 340 a map of the intrinsic fraction of interannual variance, R_i , from eddy statistics interpolated 341 onto a coarse $(4^{\circ} \times 4^{\circ})$ grid, with eddy contributions filtered using a 12-month rolling mean. 342 Here, even at interannual timescales, the chaotic variance dominates over most of the band 343 of elevated EKE in the Southern Ocean. Subpanels (b) and (c) confirm the predominance 344 of intrinsic eddy variability at this scale, highlighting that at small ($\sim 4^{\circ}$) scales we can 345 place little reliability on the results from an individual ensemble member, or from actual 346 observations. 347

When averaged over larger regions, the fraction of intrinsic variance can be smaller than shown in Fig. 6. For example, in the Southeast Indian Ocean, in the lee of the Kerguelen Plateau, a strong and rapid response of EKE to the local wind stress can be observed (Fig. 3b,c). On the other hand, slower but significant responses in EKE are found in the Southwest Pacific Ocean, near Campbell Plateau (Fig. 3c,d). Both of these regions are locations where topography acts to sharpen and energise fronts. However, in many
 other regions, EKE variability appears to be almost entirely chaotic. This heterogeneity,
 consistent with the findings of Patara et al. (2016), acts to emphasise the differing flow
 regimes which are found in different parts of the Southern Ocean.

Averaged over the entire Southern Ocean two significant timescales of correlation are found between wind stress and the ensemble mean EKE: one at 4-6 months, and the other at ~30 months. The rapid timescale is the expected Ekman response, in which wind stress tilts isopycnals to store available potential energy, which is then released to EKE through baroclinic instability (e.g. Sinha & Abernathey, 2016). This mechanism is the direct eddy response to wind stress changes via baroclinic instability.

The slower timescale is similar to that proposed by Meredith & Hogg (2006), based 366 on a single large Southern Ocean wind event in 1999. This timescale is consistent with the 367 topographic feedback mechanism of Hogg & Blundell (2006). Under this mechanism, the 368 system first responds directly, via baroclinic instability, as described above. The stronger 369 eddy field acts to increase the vertical momentum transfer which enables topography to steer 370 the current and thereby increase the meridional component of the mean flow. Currents with 371 a non-zonal component are more susceptible to baroclinic instability which thus produces 372 a delayed amplification of the EKE response. This second mechanism describes a positive 373 feedback between the eddy field and the mean currents which acts to enhance EKE over 374 longer timescales. 375

The ensemble approach thus leads to the conclusion that changes in eddy activity in the 376 Southern Ocean have a strong random character, even when averaged over a large spatial 377 area and up to interannual time scales. This result argues for caution in interpreting obser-378 vations of Southern Ocean eddies, which are necessarily based on a single, short realisation 379 of the natural world. Given that eddies are critical for the Southern Ocean circulation, this 380 result implies that predictability of the future Southern Ocean may be weaker than previ-381 ously thought. The results outlined here also highlight the difficulty faced in distinguishing 382 the processes that govern eddy dynamics in this system, and point to more systematic eddy 383 identification and modelling studies to better isolate these processes. 384

385 Acknowledgments

AMH is gratefully to the MEOM team at IGE, Université Grenoble Alpes, who supported 386 his sabbatical and which led to this work. The results of this research have been achieved 387 using the PRACE Research Infrastructure resource CURIE based in France at TGCC. 388 This work is a contribution to the OCCIPUT and PIRATE projects. OCCIPUT has been 389 funded by ANR through contract ANR-13-BS06-0007-01. PIRATE has been funded by 390 CNES through the Ocean Surface Topography Science Team (OST-ST). WKD was funded 391 by ANR-18-MPGA-0002 and NSF grants OCE-182956 and OCE-2023585. NCC was funded 392 by the Australian Research Council DECRA Fellowship DE210100749. This research was 393 undertaken with the assistance of resources and services from the National Computational 394 Infrastructure (NCI), which is supported by the Australian Government. 395

The model output used in this study can be downloaded from the Zenodo repository at doi: 10.5281/zenodo.5835168. The full OCCIPUT model dataset is available on request (Thierry.Penduff@cnrs.fr).

399 References

Barnier, B., Madec, G., Penduff, T., Molines, J.-M., Treguier, A.-M., Le Sommer, J., ...
others (2006). Impact of partial steps and momentum advection schemes in a global
ocean circulation model at eddy-permitting resolution. Ocean Dyn., 56(5), 543–567. doi:
doi:10.1007/s10236-006-0082-1

Bessières, L., Leroux, S., Brankart, J.-M., Molines, J.-M., Moine, M.-P., Bouttier, P.-A.,

- ... Sérazin, G. (2017). Development of a probabilistic ocean modelling system based 405 on NEMO 3.5: application at eddying resolution. Geosci. Model Dev., 10(3), 1091-1106. 406 doi: doi:10.5194/gmd-10-1091-2017 407 Brankart, J.-M., Candille, G., Garnier, F., Calone, C., Melet, A., Bouttier, P.-A., ... Verron, 408 J. (2015). A generic approach to explicit simulation of uncertainty in the nemo ocean 409 model. Geosci. Model Dev., 8(5), 1285-1297. doi: doi:10.5194/gmd-8-1285-2015 410 Cleveland, W. S. (1979). Robust Locally Weighted Regression and Smoothing Scatterplots. 411 J. Am. Stat. Assoc., 74 (368), 829-836. doi: doi:10.1080/01621459.1979.10481038 412 Close, S., Penduff, T., Speich, S., & Molines, J.-M. (2020, may). A means of estimat-413 ing the intrinsic and atmospherically-forced contributions to sea surface height variabil-414 ity applied to altimetric observations. Progress in Oceanography, 184, 102314. doi: 415 doi:10.1016/j.pocean.2020.102314 416 Constantinou, N. C., & Hogg, A. M. (2019). Eddy saturation of the Southern Ocean: a 417 baroclinic versus barotropic perspective. Geophys. Res. Lett., 46(21), 12202-12212. doi: 418 doi:10.1029/2019GL084117 419 Constantinou, N. C., & Hogg, A. M. (2021). Intrinsic oceanic decadal variability of upper-420 ocean heat content. J. Clim., 34(15), 6175–6189. doi: doi:10.1175/JCLI-D-20-0962.1 421 de Verdière, A. C., & Huck, T. (1999). Baroclinic instability: An oceanic wavemaker for 422 interdecadal variability. J. Phys. Oceanogr., 29, 893–910. 423 Dussin, R., Barnier, B., Brodeau, L., & Molines, J. M. (2016). The making of 424 DRAKKAR forcing set DFS5. DRAKKAR/MyOcean Rep. 01-04-16. (available at 425 https://www.drakkar-ocean.eu/publications/reports/report_DFS5v3_April2016.pdf) 426 Fu, L.-L., Chelton, D. B., Le Traon, P.-Y., & Morrow, R. (2010). Eddy dynamics from 427 satellite altimetry. Oceanography, 23(4), 14–25. 428 Greatbatch, R. J. (1994). A note on the representation of steric sea level in models that 429 conserve volume rather than mass. Journal of Geophysical Research: Oceans, 99(C6), 430 12767-12771. doi: doi:10.1029/94JC00847 431 Hallberg, R., & Gnanadesikan, A. (2006). The role of eddies in determining the structure and 432 response of the wind-driven Southern Hemisphere overturning: Results from the modeling 433 eddies in the Southern Ocean (MESO) project. J. Phys. Oceanogr., 36, 2232-2252. doi: 434 doi:10.1175/JPO2980.1 435 Hogg, A. M., & Blundell, J. R. (2006). Interdecadal variability of the Southern Ocean. J. 436 Phys. Oceanogr., 36, 1626-1645. doi: doi:10.1175/JPO2934.1 437 Hogg, A. M., Meredith, M. P., Chambers, D. P., Abrahamsen, E. P., Hughes, C. W., & 438 Morrison, A. K. (2015). Recent trends in the Southern Ocean eddy field. J. Geophys. 439 Res.-Oceans, 120, 1-11. doi: doi:10.1002/2014JC010470 440 Kiss, A. E., Hogg, A. M., Hannah, N., Boeira Dias, F., Brassington, G. B., Chamberlain, 441 M. A., ... Zhang, X. (2020). ACCESS-OM2 v1.0: A global ocean-sea ice model at three 442 resolutions. Geosci. Model Dev., 13(2), 401-442. doi: doi:10.5194/gmd-13-401-2020 443 Leroux, S., Penduff, T., Bessières, L., Molines, J. M., Brankart, J. M., Sérazin, G., ... Ter-444 ray, L. (2018). Intrinsic and atmospherically forced variability of the AMOC: Insights from 445 a large-ensemble ocean hindcast. J. Climate, 31(3), 1183–1203. doi: doi:10.1175/JCLI-446 D-17-0168.1 447 Madec, G. (2012). NEMO ocean general circulation model reference manuel. Intern. Rep., 448 27(1-386).449 Martínez-Moreno, J., Hogg, A. M., England, M. E., Constantinou, N. C., Kiss, A. E., & 450 Morrison, A. K. (2021). Global changes in oceanic mesoscale currents over the satellite 451 altimetry record. Nat. Clim. Chang., 11, 397-403. doi: doi:10.1038/s41558-021-01006-9 452 Martínez-Moreno, J., Hogg, A. M., & England, M. H. (2021).A near-global cli-453 matology of oceanic coherent eddies. J. Geophys. Res.-Oceans. (submitted) doi: doi:10.1002/essoar.10506866.1 455 Martínez-Moreno, J., Hogg, A. M., Kiss, A. E., Constantinou, N. C., & Morrison, A. K. 456 (2019). Kinetic energy of eddy-like features from sea surface altimetry. J. Adv. Model. 457
- *Earth Sy.*, 11(10), 3090-3105. doi: doi:10.1029/2019MS001769

- Meredith, M. P., & Hogg, A. M. (2006). Circumpolar response of Southern Ocean eddy
 activity to a change in the Southern Annular Mode. *Geophys. Res. Lett.*, 33(16). doi:
 doi:10.1029/2006GL026499
- Morrison, A. K., & Hogg, A. M. (2013). On the relationship between Southern Ocean
 overturning and ACC transport. J. Phys. Oceanogr., 43, 140-148. doi: doi:10.1175/JPOD-12-057.1
- Morrison, A. K., Waugh, D. W., Hogg, A. M., Jones, D. C., & Abernathey, R. P. (2022). Ventilation of the Southern Ocean Pycnocline. Ann. Rev. Mar. Sci., 14(1). doi: doi:10.1146/annurev-marine-010419-011012
- Munday, D. R., Johnson, H. L., & Marshall, D. P. (2013). Eddy saturation of equilibrated
 circumpolar currents. J. Phys. Oceanogr., 43, 507-532. doi: doi:10.1175/JPO-D-12-095.1
- Patara, L., Böning, C. W., & Biastoch, A. (2016). Variability and trends in Southern Ocean
 eddy activity in 1/12° ocean model simulations. *Geophys. Res. Lett.*, 43(9), 4517–4523.
 doi: doi:10.1002/2016GL069026
- Penduff, T., Barnier, B., Terray, L., Bessières, L., Sérazin, G., Grégorio, S., ... Brasseur,
 P. (2014). Ensembles of eddying ocean simulations for climate. *CLIVAR Exchanges No.*65, Special Issue on High Resolution Ocean Climate Modelling, 19(2), 26-29.
- Rousselet, L., Cessi, P., & Forget, G. (2021). Coupling of the mid-depth and abyssal components of the global overturning circulation according to a state estimate. *Sci. Adv.*, $\gamma(21)$, eabf5478. doi: doi:10.1126/sciadv.abf5478
- Santer, B. D., Wigley, T., Boyle, J., Gaffen, D. J., Hnilo, J., Nychka, D., ... Taylor,
 K. (2000). Statistical significance of trends and trend differences in layer-average atmospheric temperature time series. J. Geophys. Res.-Atmospheres, 105(D6), 7337–7356.
 doi: doi:10.1029/1999JD901105
- Sérazin, G., Penduff, T., Barnier, B., Molines, J.-M., Arbic, B. K., Müller, M., & Terray,
 L. (2018). Inverse cascades of kinetic energy as a source of intrinsic variability: A global
 OGCM study. J. Phys. Oceanogr., 48(6), 1385-1408. doi: doi:10.1175/JPO-D-17-0136.1
- Sinha, A., & Abernathey, R. P. (2016). Time scales of Southern Ocean eddy equilibration.
- 487 J. Phys. Oceanogr., 46(9), 2785–2805. doi: doi:10.1175/JPO-D-16-0041.1
- Zhang, Y., Chambers, D., & Liang, X. (2021). Regional trends in Southern Ocean eddy
 kinetic energy. J. Geophys. Res.-Oceans. doi: doi:10.1029/2020jc016973