Synchronization of Heinrich and Dansgaard-Oeschger Events through Ice-Ocean Interactions

Logan Elliott Mann^{1,1}, Alexander Robel^{2,2}, and Colin Meyer^{1,1}

¹Dartmouth College ²Georgia Institute of Technology

November 30, 2022

Abstract

The cause of Heinrich events and their relationship with Dansgaard-Oeschger (DO) events are not fully understood. Previous modeling studies have argued that Heinrich events result from either internal oscillations generated within ice sheets or ocean warming occurring during DO events. In this study, we present a coupled model of ice stream and ocean dynamics to evaluate the behavior of the coupled system with few degrees of freedom and minimal parameterizations. Both components of the model may oscillate independently, with stagnant versus active phases for the ice stream model and strong versus weak Atlantic Meridional Overturning Circulation (AMOC) phases for the ocean model. The ice sheet and ocean interact through submarine melt at the ice stream grounding line and freshwater flux into the ocean from ice sheet discharge. We show that these two oscillators have a strong tendency to synchronize, even when their interaction is weak, due to the amplification of small perturbations typical in nonlinear oscillators. In syn- chronized regimes with ocean-induced melt at the ice stream grounding line, Heinrich events always follow DO events by a constant time lag. We also introduce noise into the ocean system and find that ice-ocean interactions not only maintain a narrow distribu- tion of timing between Heinrich and DO events, but also regulate DO event periodic- ity against noise in the climate system. This synchronization persists across a broad range of parameters, indicating that it is a robust explanation for Heinrich events and their timing despite the significant uncertainty associated with past ice sheet conditions.

Synchronization of Heinrich and Dansgaard-Oeschger Events through Ice-Ocean Interactions

Logan E. Mann^{1,2}, Alexander A. Robel¹, Colin R. Meyer²

 $^1{\rm School}$ of Earth and Atmospheric Sciences, Georgia Institute of Technology $^2{\rm Thayer}$ School of Engineering, Dartmouth College

Key Points:

1

2

3

4 5

6

7	• The phasing of Heinrich events and DO events can be synchronized through ice-
8	ocean interactions.
9	• Synchronization can explain observed phenomena despite the broad range of pa-
10	rameter uncertainty.
11	• Ice-ocean coupling regularizes the interval between DO events against noise in the
12	climate system.

Corresponding author: Logan E. Mann, lmann7@gatech.edu

13 Abstract

The cause of Heinrich events and their relationship with Dansgaard-Oeschger (DO) events 14 are not fully understood. Previous modeling studies have argued that Heinrich events 15 result from either internal oscillations generated within ice sheets or ocean warming oc-16 curring during DO events. In this study, we present a coupled model of ice stream and 17 ocean dynamics to evaluate the behavior of the coupled system with few degrees of free-18 dom and minimal parameterizations. Both components of the model may oscillate in-19 dependently, with stagnant versus active phases for the ice stream model and strong ver-20 sus weak Atlantic Meridional Overturning Circulation (AMOC) phases for the ocean model. 21 The ice sheet and ocean interact through submarine melt at the ice stream grounding 22 line and freshwater flux into the ocean from ice sheet discharge. We show that these two 23 oscillators have a strong tendency to synchronize, even when their interaction is weak, 24 due to the amplification of small perturbations typical in nonlinear oscillators. In syn-25 chronized regimes with ocean-induced melt at the ice stream grounding line, Heinrich 26 events always follow DO events by a constant time lag. We also introduce noise into the 27 ocean system and find that ice-ocean interactions not only maintain a narrow distribu-28 tion of timing between Heinrich and DO events, but also regulate DO event periodic-29 ity against noise in the climate system. This synchronization persists across a broad range 30 of parameters, indicating that it is a robust explanation for Heinrich events and their 31 timing despite the significant uncertainty associated with past ice sheet conditions. 32

³³ Plain Language Summary

Heinrich events were collapses of the North American ice sheet during the last ice 34 age that affected the global climate significantly. Their cause is debated. Some have the-35 orized that the ice sheet grew over time from snow accumulation, while the earth warmed 36 it from below. A victim of its own success, the ice may have thickened enough to insu-37 late heat from the ground until it melted from below, lubricating its slow slide towards 38 the ocean. This would have removed ice from land, starting the process over. However, 39 this theory can not explain why Heinrich events occurred when they did. Later, it was 40 theorized that Dansgaard-Oeschger (DO) events, periods of ocean warming, played a cen-41 tral role by triggering ice sheet collapse through melt at the ice-ocean interface. Unfor-42 tunately, we lack robust evidence that conditions were just right for the ocean to trig-43 ger these collapses repeatedly. In this paper, we describe a computational model that 44 can reconcile the differences between these two competing theories. We propose that Hein-45 rich and DO events can synchronize, a phenomenon where small interactions between 46 oscillating systems can align their timing. We find that this explains many mysterious 47 aspects of the Earth's recent climate history. 48

49 1 Introduction

Heinrich events were episodic iceberg-discharge events originating from the Lau-50 rentide Ice Sheet during the last glacial period, evidenced by layers of ice-rafted debris 51 (IRD) appearing in marine sediment records every 6-8 thousand years (Heinrich, 1988). 52 The causes of Heinrich events and their relationship to other modes of millennial glacial 53 climate variability remain poorly understood. Recent findings indicate Heinrich events 54 may be causally linked to changes in the Atlantic Meridional Overturning circulation (AMOC) 55 (Hulbe et al., 2004; Marcott et al., 2011; Alvarez-Solas et al., 2013; Shaffer et al., 2004), 56 as abrupt freshwater pulses into the North Atlantic may have disrupted the AMOC (Ganopolski 57 & Rahmstorf, 2001), and changes in sea ice coverage may have amplified changes in at-58 mospheric temperature resulting from these AMOC changes. This may have triggered 59 other ice sheet discharges, further amplifying AMOC changes (Kaspi et al., 2004). Al-60 though fast ice flow and elevated ice sheet discharge are generally associated with warm 61 climates, Heinrich events occurred during cold stadials of Dansgaard-Oeschger (DO) events 62

(Bond et al., 1993), which are generally thought to have occurred as a result of AMOC
 weakening approximately every 1500 years (Schulz, 2002). Though Heinrich events typ ically occur during these cold stadials, not all DO stadials coincided with Heinrich events,
 indicating a complex interaction between these two seemingly related climate phenom ena.

An early model of Heinrich events (MacAyeal, 1993) posited that the Hudson Strait 68 Ice Stream, embedded within the Laurentide Ice Sheet, alternately stagnated and surged 69 as a result of internally generated oscillations in the temperature of ice near the bed, with-70 71 out connection to atmospheric or oceanic forcings. In the stagnant phase, the ice stream thickened due to a frozen bed that prevented sliding. The thick ice sheet eventually in-72 sulated and trapped enough geothermal heat at the ice-bed interface to initiate the surge 73 phase, where significant thawing of basal ice and sliding caused elevated ice discharge 74 evidenced by IRD layers in the North Atlantic marine sediment record. Models have demon-75 strated the capacity of ice streams to exhibit internally generated oscillatory behavior 76 and generate periodic surges of IRD-laden ice stream discharge across a wide range of 77 conditions (Tulaczyk et al., 2000b; Robel et al., 2013, 2014; Bougamont et al., 2011; Sayag 78 & Tziperman, 2009, 2011; Mantelli et al., 2016; Meyer et al., 2019). However, recent ev-79 idence shows that Heinrich events follow (rather than precede) large reductions in the 80 AMOC during DO stadials (Marcott et al., 2011), casting doubt on an exclusively ice 81 sheet driven mechnism for Heinrich events and indicating a potentially causal role for 82 the ocean in causing Heinrich events. 83

The weakening of the AMOC during DO stadials shortly before Heinrich events 84 creates a strong argument for the role of ice-ocean interactions and likely precludes an 85 exclusively glaciological explanation (Marcott et al., 2011). Subsequently, modeling stud-86 ies have sought to explain the phasing between Heinrich and DO events in one coher-87 ent framework of ice-ocean-atmosphere interactions (Marcott et al., 2011; Alvarez-Solas 88 et al., 2013; Bassis et al., 2017). The occurrence of Heinrich events during the cold at-89 mospheric phases of Dansgaard-Oeschger cycles precludes an exclusively atmospheric ex-90 planation, due to the thermal driving of ice sheet disintegration. Furthermore, the lack 91 of Heinrich events during some DO events complicates an entirely ocean-driven expla-92 nation as well. Some modeling studies have proposed that Heinrich events are a result 93 of instability induced by the collapse of a large buttressing ice-shelf during DO stadials 94 (Shaffer et al., 2004; Hulbe et al., 2004; Marcott et al., 2011; Alvarez-Solas et al., 2013), 95 but this explanation does not explain the lack of Heinrich events during some DO sta-96 dials as well as the lack of evidence for large ice shelf buttressing the Hudson Strait ice 97 stream. 98

⁹⁹ Our goal in this paper is to explain four of the more notable characteristics of Hein-¹⁰⁰rich events, DO events, and their relationship, under a highly uncertain range of con-¹⁰¹ditions and parameters, using a simple yet robust model: 1) the timing of Heinrich Events ¹⁰²during DO stadials, 2) ice sheet collapse during periods of cold atmospheric tempera-¹⁰³tures, 3) the lack of Heinrich events during some, but not most DO events, 4) the ~1500-¹⁰⁴year quasi-periodicity of DO events.

105 2 Model Description

Our approach in this study captures the coupled dynamics of the ice sheet-ocean 106 system with few degrees of freedom and minimal parameterization. We couple a flow-107 line ice stream model with a simple ocean model (Figure 1), both having the potential 108 for internally generated oscillations. The ice stream model is a hybrid of previous ice stream 109 models described in Robel et al. (2013) and Robel et al. (2018), capable of reproducing 110 the grounding line dynamics simulated in more complex ice stream models (Robel et al., 111 2014). The ocean overturning circulation is modeled with a simple two-box model of-112 ten referred to as the 'flip-flop' model of Welander (1982), which has been shown to re-113



Figure 1. A diagram of the ice stream and ocean models and their interaction. Geometry is purely illustrative.

produce the behavior of much more complex 3D ocean models (Cessi, 1996). In this model, 114 the temperature, T, and salinity, S, of the upper ocean box evolve dynamically, while 115 the deep ocean box is assumed to be sufficiently deep that its temperature and salinity 116 do not change. The oscillatory period of this model is varied through changes in a re-117 laxation time constant, γ . The ice stream and ocean models are coupled through ocean-118 induced melt of the ice stream grounding line (with strength $\dot{m}_f \text{ m/yr}^{\circ}\text{C}$) and fresh-119 water flux into the ocean associated with ice discharge at the grounding line (with strength 120 $\xi \text{ yr/m}^2$). 121

122 2.1 Ice stream model

The ice stream is represented by two boxes, one encompassing the ice stream in-123 terior and one encompassing the grounding zone. In the interior region, all spatial deriva-124 tives are averaged along the model domain, a rectangle of length L in the along-flow di-125 rection, corresponding to the grounding line position, and width W in the cross-flow di-126 rection, corresponding to width between shear margins. In initial simulations, the ice stream 127 lies on an idealized bed with a prograde bed with a linear slope, b_x , from the ice divide, 128 at elevation b_0 , to the grounding line, at depth below sea level b_q . As described in Robel 129 et al. (2018), mass conservation through the ice stream interior and the grounding zone 130 requires that evolution of ice stream thickness follows 131

$$\frac{dh}{dt} = a_c - h \frac{Q - Q_g}{h_g L} - \frac{Q_g}{L} \tag{1}$$

where h is the spatially averaged thickness of the ice stream, a_c is the accumulation rate due to snowfall, Q is the ice flux through the interior resulting from basal sliding and deformation, Q_g is the ice flux through the grounding line, h_g is the thickness of the ice stream at the grounding line, where ice is at flotation

$$h_g = \frac{\rho_w}{\rho_i} b_g \tag{2}$$

where ρ_w and ρ_i are the densities of water and ice respectively.

The grounding line position, L, evolves dynamically as a balance of fluxes. Q transports ice from the glacier interior towards the grounding line, and Q_g transports ice from the grounding line, as in Robel et al. (2018)

$$\frac{dL}{dt} = \frac{Q - Q_g}{h_g} \tag{3}$$

140

Interior flux is calculated as the sum

$$Q = Q_b + Q_d \tag{4}$$

where Q_b is the ice flux from basal ice velocity which can be approximated as $Q_b = \frac{u_b h}{L}$, where u_b is the basal velocity due to till deformation, and Q_d is the flux from the deformation of ice.

For ice streams sliding over a softly Coulomb plastic bed, the grounding line flux, Q_g can be approximated as (Tsai et al., 2015)

$$Q_g = Q_0 \frac{8A_g(\rho_i g)^n}{4^n f} \left(1 - \frac{\rho_i}{\rho_w}\right)^{n-1} h_g^{n+2}$$
(5)

where Q_0 is a numerical coefficient constrained by boundary layer analysis, A_g is the constant creep parameter, n is the Glen's Law exponent, g is the acceleration due to gravity, and f is the Coulomb friction coefficient.

¹⁴⁹ Neglecting ice deformation, Raymond (1996) calculates the centerline sliding ve-¹⁵⁰ locity of an ice stream, upstream of the grounding line, from a balance of driving stress, ¹⁵¹ τ_d , and basal shear stress, τ_b .

$$u_b = \frac{A_g W^{n+1}}{4^n (n+1)h^n} \max[\tau_d - \tau_b, 0]^n \tag{6}$$

When basal shear stress is sufficiently high, we expect most of the ice flux to be due to internal deformation within the ice column, which can be calculated as a function of driving and basal shear stresses.

$$Q_d = \frac{2A_g h^2}{n+2} \min[\tau_b, \tau_d]^n \tag{7}$$

where $\tau_d = \rho_i g \frac{\hbar^2}{L}$ approximates the driving stress over the lumped ice stream element (Cuffey & Paterson, 2010). For soft subglacial till, τ_b is modeled as a Coulumb friction law, $\tau_b = \mu N$, where N is effective pressure and μ is a friction coefficient. Tulaczyk et al. (2000a), in laboratory measurements of till strength, showed that this can be expressed directly in terms of void ratio of the subglacial till.

$$\tau_b = \begin{cases} a' \exp(-b(e - e_c)), & \text{if } w > 0\\ \infty, & \text{otherwise} \end{cases}$$
(8)

where a' is the till strength at the lower bound of void ratio, b is a constant, e is the void ratio, and e_c is the consolidation threshold of subglacial till. The meaning of the ∞ case is programmatic (not physical), and ensures that $\tau_d < \tau_b$ and $u_b = 0$ when the till is frozen. The void ratio is derived from a meltwater budget where w is the till water content and Z_s is the thickness the unfrozen till would reach if reduced to zero porosity. In the model, w and Z_s evolve dynamically, while e is calculated diagnostically as $e = w/Z_s$. The till water content and unfrozen till thickness evolve according to

$$\frac{dw}{dt} = m \tag{9}$$

167

$$\frac{dZ_s}{dt} = \begin{cases} 0, & \text{if } e > e_c \text{ or } Z_s = 0\\ \frac{m}{e_c} & \text{if } e = e_c \text{ and } Z_0 > Z_s > 0 \end{cases}$$
(10)

where m is the basal melt rate, and Z_0 is the maximum sediment thickness available. Basal melt is a balance of geothermal heat flux, G, heat conduction into the ice, and heat dissipation via friction at the bed,

$$m = \frac{1}{\rho_i L_f} \left[G + \frac{k_i (T_s - T_b)}{h} + \tau_b u_b \right] \tag{11}$$

where T_s is the surface ice temperature, T_b is the basal ice temperature, k_i is the ther-171 mal conductivity of ice, L_f is the latent heat of fusion. The second term in this equa-172 tion approximates the vertical heat diffusion through an ice stream (MacAyeal, 1993; Ro-173 bel et al., 2014). The term $\tau_b u_b$ represents the frictional heating. It follows that nega-174 tive m corresponds to the freeze-on of basal water, while positive m corresponds to melt-175 ing of basal ice (Meyer et al., 2019). When $e = e_c$, both u_b and the frictional heating 176 term are set to 0, as the till is frozen, allowing basal temperature to dynamically evolve 177 below the melting point. 178

$$\begin{cases} T_b = T_m, & \text{if } w > 0\\ \frac{dT_b}{dt} = \frac{\rho_i L_f}{C_i h_b} m, & \text{if } w = 0 \text{ and either } (T_b = T_m \text{ and } m < 0) \text{ or } (T_b < T_m) \end{cases}$$
(12)

where C_i is the heat capacity of ice and h_b is the thickness of the temperate basal ice layer.

¹⁸¹ 2.2 Ocean model

In the ocean model adapted from Welander (1982) and Cessi (1996), there is an upper ocean box and a deep ocean box. The density of the upper ocean box is determined by an equation of state, linearized about the temperature and salinity of the deep ocean box (T_0, S_0)

$$\rho/\rho_0 = 1 + \alpha_s (S - S_0) - \alpha_T (T - T_0) \tag{13}$$

where α_s and α_T are constant expansion coefficients.

The upper ocean box is subjected to external thermohaline forcing, (e.g. continental runoff, glacial discharge, atmospheric forcings) and the deep ocean box diffusively exchanges heat and salt with the upper ocean.

$$\frac{dT}{dt} = -\gamma(T - T_A) - \kappa(T - T_0) \tag{14}$$

190

$$\frac{dS}{dt} = \frac{F}{H}S_0 - \kappa(S - S_0) \tag{15}$$

where γ is a time constant for relaxation of T to atmospheric temperature T_A , κ is the vertical diffusivity of heat and salt, F is the total of evaporative, precipitative, and runoff salinity fluxes into the upper ocean, and H is the depth of the upper ocean box. The time scale of vertical diffusion, κ^{-1} , depends on the vertical density gradient.

$$\kappa = \begin{cases}
\kappa_1, & \text{if } \rho - \rho_0 \le \Delta \rho \\
\kappa_2, & \text{if } \rho - \rho_0 > \Delta \rho
\end{cases}$$
(16)

where, κ_1 is the diffusivity of heat and salt without convection, and κ_2 is the effective diffusivity associated with more rapid convective exchange between upper and deep ocean boxes. The threshold density difference, $\Delta \rho$, is a very small, negative number that activates convection, allowing rapid exchange of properties between the surface and deep boxes. The non-zero threshold is not physical, but an artifact resulting form the simplified nature of this model, though the resulting model behavior is qualitatively similar to more complex models.

2.3 Coupling of Ice Stream and Ocean Models 202

The ice stream and ocean models are coupled through the modification of the ground-203 ing line flux, Qg, in equation (5). 204

$$Q_g = Q_0 \frac{8A_g(\rho_i g)^n}{4^n f} \left(1 - \frac{\rho_i}{\rho_w}\right)^{n-1} h_g^{n+2} - \dot{m_f} T b_g$$
(17)

where the added term $\dot{m_f}Tb_q$ is ocean-induced melt of the grounding line. $\dot{m_f}$ is sen-205 sitivity of grounding line melt rate to temperature change (m yr⁻¹ $^{\circ}C^{-1}$) along the depth, 206 b_g , of the ice stream at the grounding line (after Bassis et al. (2017)). In our model runs, \dot{m}_f is specified on the order of 1-100 m yr⁻¹ °C⁻¹ of warming, consistent with observed 207 208 sensitivities of contemporary marine-terminating glaciers (Rignot et al., 2016). Such melt 209 rates, on their own, do not produce significant grounding line retreat. 210

To allow ice stream discharge to affect the ocean circulation, we consider the fresh-211 water discharge associated with ice flux at the grounding line, Q_g as a negative salin-212 ity flux, in equation (15), influencing the salinity flux balance determined by F. 213

$$\frac{dS}{dt} = (1 - \xi Q_g) \frac{F}{H} S_0 - \kappa (S - S_0)$$
(18)

where ξ is the sensitivity of upper ocean salinity to changes in ice discharge (yr m⁻²). 214

This coupling is implemented into the nondimensionalized equation of salinity bal-215 ance in the ocean model. It follows that 216

$$\frac{dy}{dt} = (1 - \xi Q_g)\mu - \nu y \tag{19}$$

The freshwater flux from ice stream discharge can prolong the period between convec-217 tive overturning events in the ocean model, influencing the periodicity of the DO events 218 and lowering the amplitude of the temperature anomaly associated with DO events, re-219 ducing the effective meltrate at the grounding zone. Therefore, submarine melt and fresh-220 water flux bidirectionally couple the ice stream and ocean models. 221

3 Model Results 222

223

3.1 Internal oscillations of the uncoupled ice stream and ocean models

When uncoupled from the ocean model, the ice stream is characterized by three 224 different behaviors. In a parameter regime with warm ice surface temperature, T_s , and 225 high geothermal heat flux, G, the ice stream basal sliding velocity, u_b , reaches an equi-226 librium, or 'steady streaming' state. For very low ice surface temperature and geother-227 mal heat, the till remains frozen, preventing basal sliding. In this 'steady creep' case, the 228 ice flux, Q, is entirely driven by deformation, resulting in a steady-state ice stream thick-229 ness and fixed grounding line position. In an intermediate parameter regime appropri-230 ate for Hudson Strait conditions during the last glacial period (see example in Figure 231 2a), geothermal heat and surface temperatures are sufficient to sustain internally gen-232 erated oscillations between stagnant and active ice stream phases, similar to MacAyeal 233 (1993). While the ice stream is thin, cold atmospheric temperatures conduct heat through 234 the ice and away from the bed, maintaining a frozen till and gradual thickening of the 235 ice stream, as a result of snowfall. Eventually, the ice stream becomes sufficiently thick 236 to insulate the base and weaken the vertical temperature gradient, until the subglacial 237 heat budget is positive, allowing basal ice to warm to its pressure-melting point. This 238 meltwater production allows basal sliding to reactivate, causing a thinning of the ice stream 239 and a temporary advance in the grounding line position, L, before rapid retreat. The 240 behavior of this model is similar to that described in Robel et al. (2013), with the most 241 relevant differences from this model resulting from the addition of deformation driven 242 ice flux, which adds the possibility of 'steady creep' behavior. 243

The ocean component of the model simulates Dansgaard-Oeschger events as self-244 sustaining oscillations in upper ocean temperature, driven by periodic strengthening and 245 weakening of the overturning circulation. When the vertical density difference exceeds 246 a threshold density difference, the system enters a convective mode, allowing the rapid 247 exchange of heat and salt between the shallow and deep ocean. This instability causes 248 the system to oscillate between convecting and non-convecting states with a correspond-249 ing change in near-surface ocean temperatures (Figure 2a). It is important to note that 250 in the real world system, sea ice changes likely amplify these modeled AMOC disrup-251 tions, as well as the resultant ocean temperature changes. 252

253

3.2 Synchronization and phase locking of the coupled ice-ocean system



Figure 2. a) A characteristic model result when the ice stream and ocean models are not coupled. The x markings identify the onset of Heinrich events and peaks of DO event warming, through the peaks in ice stream height and ocean temperature. Here, these peaks drift apart, as the models do not influence each other. b) A characteristic model result with coupling. The timing between these oscillations (hereafter referred to as 'phase difference') remains near constant after a few Heinrich cycles. c) The phase differences plotted in time for each Heinrich cycle. In the unsynchronized case, phase differences have a high degree of variance. In the synchronized case, phase differences have a low variance after a small number Heinrich cycles.

254 255 256

257

258

259

260

With the ice stream and ocean models in oscillatory regimes, mutual synchronization is a possible mechanism to explain the consistent timing of Heinrich events following DO events. Synchronization occurs when autonomous oscillators have the ability to influence each other and when the strength of their coupling is sufficient to overcome their natural frequency differences, causing the timing between oscillator phases (hereafter referred to as 'phase difference') to remain constant. The canonical case of synchronization occurs in systems like weakly coupled clocks synchronizing their pendula (Huygens,



Figure 3. a) Ice stream height and ocean temperature, after the transient, plotted in 2D space, evolving over time. In this unsyncronized case, the oscillations in ice stream thickness and ocean temperature operate independently, and have no relation. Evolving over time, different 'trajectories' occur for each cycle. b) In the synchronized system, these variables mutually cycle. The spikes in the y-axis direction represent DO events, and the quick change from high ice stream thickness to low ice stream thickness represents Heinrich events. For each cycle, these 'trajectories' remain very similar, in perpetuity.

1669). Synchronization can also occur through integer frequency-ratio phase locking, mean ing one oscillator may cycle many times for every one cycle of the other oscillator.

In our model, the ice stream and ocean synchronize when their coupling is strong 263 enough to overcome the natural frequency differences of these two autonomous oscillators. Figure 2 depicts two cases; one where the models are not coupled, and the systems 265 oscillate independently; and one where the systems are coupled and become synchronized 266 such that there are 5 DO events for each Heinrich event and DO events are suppressed 267 following Heinrich events. DO event warming precedes Heinrich events by hundreds of 268 years. In the synchronized case, the phase difference between a maximum in ocean tem-269 perature associated with a DO event and the subsequent maximum in ice discharge as-270 sociated with a Heinrich event remains constant (Figure 2b). In contrast, in the unsyn-271 chronized case (Figure 2a), the phase difference constantly drifts due to the offset be-272 tween the Heinrich and DO oscillation periods. In the synchronized example, it takes 273 a short amount of time for the system to synchronize, and the strength of the coupling 274 reduces the variation of the phase differences to near zero (Figure 2c). This 5:1 integer 275 frequency phase locking then remains indefinitely. With this mechanism, we reproduce 276 the phasing of Heinrich and DO events with minimal parameterization and realistic cou-277 pling strengths. Figure 3 plots this difference in a different way, depicting the 'trajec-278 tories' of ice stream thickness and ocean temperature in 2D phase space for the synchro-279 nized and unsynchronized cases. The synchronized system follows a consistent trajec-280 tory, while the unsynchronized system traverses many different trajectories spanning phase 281 space. 282

Synchronization will not occur in cases where the coupling is too weak and the independent oscillator frequencies are too far apart to synchronize. To characterize the robustness of synchronization behavior in this model, we sweep through parameter space of DO event period and ice-ocean coupling strength. Figure 5 shows the standard deviation of the phase difference between Heinrich events and DO events, with near-zero standard deviations indicating synchronization (i.e. the time delay from a DO event to



Figure 4. A schematic diagram of a bifurcation diagram, depicting Arnold tongues for each integer-frequency-ratio synchronization. This schematic is purely illustrative. Dark regions represent synchronized regions of phase space, where the amplitude of coupling is great enough to synchronize coupled oscillators. Light regions represent unsychronized regions of phase space, where the amplitude of the coupling is insufficient to synchronize the coupled oscillators.



Figure 5. a) A bifurcation diagram of the one directional model, with no freshwater flux into the ocean from ice stream discharges, displaying the standard deviation of phase differences between the ice stream and ocean oscillations, over 90,000 model iterations on a 300x300 grid, covering a wide area of parameter space. γ controls the period of the ocean oscillations through the relaxation time between the atmospheric and ocean temperatures. Submarine meltrate, \dot{m}_f , controls the strength of of the coupling. Arnold tongues can be seen at each of the integer-frequency pairs. b) A bifurcation diagram focusing on the 5:1 Arnold tongue at meltrates lower than 1 m/yr/°C.

the subsequent Heinrich event remains constant) for the case $\xi = 0$, allowing only ocean

melt at the grounding line and no freshwater flux into the ocean during Heinrich events. 290 This parameter sweep shows key features consistent with synchronized systems, primar-291 ily 'Arnold Tongues' (Arnol'd, 1961), large regions of synchronization in parameter space. 292 Figure 4 shows a schematic diagram of Arnold Tongues for the canonical case of two sim-293 ple, coupled oscillators (e.g., the circle map). Arnold tongues exist for each of the integer-294 frequency phase locked pairs (labelled in Figure 5a). The 5:1 tongue, most similar to the 295 average period ratio between Heinrich and DO events, corresponds to cases where the 296 model synchronizes with 5 DO events preceding every Heinrich event. We observe asym-297 metric Arnold tongues in our ice-ocean system, which is distinct from canonical Arnold 298 tongues occurring in other mutually coupled systems, as illustrated in figure 4(metronomes, 299 pendulums clocks, etc.). Ocean melting at the grounding line can only have a destabi-300 lizing effect on the ice stream (i.e. the ocean never causes grounding line advance). Thus, 301 ocean warming can trigger Heinrich events, but there is no ocean-mediated mechanism 302 to prevent or prolong Heinrich events. If the sea ice response to AMOC variability were 303 considered, there could be a potential for coupling through significant atmospheric cool-304 ing due to expanded sea ice and the effect on snowfall over the ice stream. We perform 305 another parameter sweep focused only on a very narrow range of DO event periods and 306 low melt rates (Figure 5b). This is intended to focus on very weakly coupled regions of 307 the 5:1 Arnold Tongue (well below observed sensitivities of grounding line melt to ocean 308 warming), and illustrates that, even with arbitrarily weak coupling, if the inherent fre-309 quency differences between the ice stream and ocean oscillations are small, synchroniza-310 tion occurs. The nonlinearities in the model amplify small perturbations of the coupling 311 to ensure that the ice stream and ocean remain synchronized despite weak coupling. 312



Figure 6. a) A bifurcation diagram with small freshwater fluxes enabled during ice stream discharge, covering a wide area of parameter space with respect to γ , which controls DO event period, and submarine melt rate, \dot{m}_f . This greatly increases the extent of Arnold Tongues and synchronized regions. b) A bifurcation diagram without any submarine melt of the ice stream, allowing only coupling through iceberg discharge, with respect to γ (relaxation time) and freshwater flux parameter, ξ .

313 314 315

316

317

318

Next, we consider the influence of coupling from the ice stream to the ocean, as a result of freshwater fluxes from ice stream discharge. As seen in Figure 2c, when this freshwater flux is significant, it can suppress the amplitude of DO events immediately following Heinrich events. Figure 6a plots a parameter sweep with bi-directional coupling, including a modest sensitivity of upper ocean salinity to ice stream discharge ($\xi=2 \text{ m}^2/\text{yr}$). Even when this coupling is weak, the ice to ocean coupling greatly increases the preva-

lence of synchronization in parameter space. Figure 6b depicts the parameter space of 319 the coupled system when only coupling from the ice stream to the ocean is active (\dot{m}_f 320 $= 0 \text{ m/yr}^{\circ}\text{C}$). In this case, the period between Heinrich Events remains constant, as 321 only the amplitude and period of the ocean oscillation can be affected by its ice stream 322 oscillator counterpart. The simplified nature of the ocean model when compared to the 323 ice stream model lends itself to a simpler structure of Arnold Tongues in parameter space 324 (more similar to the canonical case of the coupled circle map (Arnol'd, 1961)). In this 325 case, the Arnold Tongues are asymmetric with regard to relaxation time, γ (which con-326 trols DO event period). This differs from the canonical case of Arnold Tongues of a sim-327 ple oscillatory system, in which tongues are represented on a domain of period and cou-328 pling strength. In this case, however, the freshwater flux from ice discharge delays the 329 evolution of the ocean system, decreasing the period of DO events with increased cou-330 pling. However, when the period of DO events is recalculated, after the effects of cou-331 pling increase the period on model runs, the Arnold Tongues are fully vertical on a DO 332 event period-coupling strength parameter space (see supplement Figure S2). 333

334

3.3 Stochastic forcing of the coupled ice-ocean system



Figure 7. a,c,e,g) Power Spectral Density of ocean temperature, with respect to the period of ocean oscillations. This shows narrowing of the delta function associated with increased coupling b,d,f,h) Phase difference distribution for the stochastic model as total occurences of each phase difference range as a percent of all phase differences calculated. This shows convergence of phase difference with increased coupling.

In reality, ice sheets and the ocean are subject to noise from the atmosphere and other more rapidly fluctuating earth system processes. Previous statistical analysis of the ~1500-year period of DO events suggest that DO events are 'noise-induced'(Ditlevsen et al., 2006). This requires a consideration of noise in the ocean component of the model, as an entirely deterministic oscillation is not consistent with observations. Incorporating noise into our model could potentially disrupt synchronization of Heinrich and DO

events, as the system may not be able to maintain consistent phase differences between 341 ice stream and ocean oscillations under the influence of random noise. To test the in-342 fluence of noise on synchronization, we add white noise to the ocean model, in a simi-343 lar process to Cessi (1996) (see supplement). Figure 7a shows that even with the spec-344 tral broadening effect of noise the power spectrum for ocean temperature narrows to-345 wards a delta function around a single period as coupling sensitivity from ice discharge 346 into the ocean (ξ) increases. Figure 7b,d,f,h shows that increased coupling also narrows 347 the distribution of phase differences. Thus, coupling between ice sheets and the ocean 348 not only regulates DO event periodicity in the presence of intrinsic climate noise, but 349 also regulates the degree of synchronization, measured by consistency of phase differences 350 between Heinrich events and DO events. This result shows that coupling between ice sheets 351 and the ocean may be responsible not only for the synchronization of these oscillations, 352 but also for the ~ 1500 year DO event interval (Schulz, 2002), subject to high levels of in-353 ternal variability in the climate system. 354

355

3.4 Heinrich Events Resulting from GIA-Modulated Ocean Forcing



Figure 8. a) Ice stream height and near-surface ocean temperature as the bed evolves dynamically due to GIA. During the first 3-4 DO events, the ice stream is protected by an elevated sill, eventually advancing to depress the sill and on the next DO event. Small peaks in ice stream height can be observed in between Heinrich events, as the ice stream advances past the sill, before retreating back to the sill during DO events. b) The same model with the thermocline depth 30 meters higher. The sill does not adjusts high enough to limit Heinrich events to a 5:1 cycle. Large scale retreat instead occurs during every other DO event. c) The same model with a low melt rate. The grounding line never retreats sufficiently to be protected from DO event associated temperature increases.

Bassis et al. (2017) (hereafter B17) modeled Heinrich events forced by prescribed 356 variations in ocean temperature modulated by glacial isostatic adjustment of a subma-357 rine sill. In the B17 model, Heinrich events were driven by ocean forced terminus melt 358 and iceberg calving, rather than by the internal oscillatory dynamics of basal sliding, as 359 in our model. DO events were prescribed as sinusoidal temperature pulses according to 360 the timing of DO events in the marine sediment record. Isostatic adjustment of the bed 361 was modeled with an elastic lithosphere relaxing aesthenosphere (ELRA) model (Bueller 362 et al., 1985; Lingle & Clark, 1985). When the ice stream terminus is at its most advanced 363 position, forward of the sill, it is grounded at a depth below the fresh and cold surface 364 layer, as exists in the present-day Arctic, overlying a warmer ocean. When DO events 365 occur, the terminus rapidly retreats in response to ocean-driven terminus melt, until reach-366 ing a new equilibrium position farther upstream and beginning its slow advance. The 367 retreat and thinning of the ice stream allows the sill to rise through GIA, bringing it above 368 the depth of the thermocline, preventing the warmer subsurface water from accessing the 369 terminus during subsequent DO events. 370

By incorporating ELRA isostatic adjustment of the along-flow bed topography including a gaussian proglacial sill and a strong melt rate sensitivity, \dot{m}_f , our model can reproduce the B17 mechanism for Heinrich events (Figure 8a). The ice stream component of the model is set to a thermal regime that produces non-oscillating, deformation driven ice flow. The ocean component is set to a regime that produces near-surface ocean temperature oscillations with a ~1400 event period. Freshwater forcing of the ocean by iceberg discharge is eliminated.

In this version of our model, oscillations of the grounding line position occur, not 378 because of the internal dynamics of the ice stream, but rather due to an external ocean 379 forcing. This reproduces the conclusion of Bassis et al. (2017), that the ice stream will 380 retreat rapidly due to forcing from warm ocean water, followed by a slow advance as the 381 sill cuts off contact to the warm water resulting from subsequent DO events. In order 382 for this mechanism to reproduce the phasing of Heinrich events with DO events and the 383 periodicity of Heinrich events, it requires: (i) a high melt rate sensitivity (\dot{m}_f) , (ii) a care-384 fully tuned sill geometry relative to the thermocline depth, and (iii) rates of ice defor-385 mation tuned such that the terminus advances at a rate where it does not prematurely 386 depress the sill before 5 DO cycles are complete. In Figure 8b, the thermocline depth 387 is set slightly higher (well within the range of uncertainty or paleotopography of the Hud-388 son Strait), such that the sill never reaches an elevation sufficient to prevent grounding 389 line retreat. In Figure 8c, the melt-rate sensitivity is closer to realistic values, measured 390 at modern glacier termini (Rignot et al., 2016). The ice stream never retreats behind the 391 sill, and it instead oscillates in front of the sill during each DO event. Ultimately, the 392 model mechanism only reproduces the observations of B17 under a very narrow range 393 of parameters, some of which are not consistent with observed values. 394

Utilizing our model in this way allows consideration of GIA-modulated ocean forcings, and shows that under very specific circumstances, this mechanism can be reproduced in our model and is consistent with observations of Heinrich and DO events. However, such a model requires fine tuning of parameters in a paleoclimate with a broad range of parameter uncertainty. Mutual synchronization can explain observed phenomena with far fewer degrees of freedom and withouth such fine tuning of parameters, and can reproduce observations over a far greater range of parameter uncertainties.

402 **4 Discussion**

In our coupled model of the interaction between an ice stream and the ocean, the occurrence of synchronization, across wide swaths of parameter space, offers a potential unification of the two types of Heinrich event theories: ice-sheet only driven mechanisms and ocean-driven changes in the ice sheet. In our theory, Heinrich events are driven by the ice sheet, DO events are driven by the ocean, and the timing of the two distinct phenomena are brought into phase by ice-ocean interactions. This synchronization mechanism explains four puzzling characteristics of observations: 1) the timing of Heinrich
events during DO stadials 2) ice sheet collapse during periods of cold atmospheric temperatures 3) the lack of Heinrich events following some DO events 4) the ~1500-year quasiperiodicity of DO events.

This model also has key advantages over other physical explanations of Heinrich 413 events, primarily in its ability to describe observed phenomena with fewer degrees of free-414 415 dom and without fine tuning of parameters. For example, incorporating GIA into our model to simulate Heinrich events caused by ocean forcing and modulated by isostatic 416 adjustment, we can meet all four criteria outlined above by carefully tuning model pa-417 rameters. However, models of Heinrich events which are tuned to match observations 418 may not continue to match observations under minor variations in parameters within the 419 broad range of parameter uncertainty under paleoclimatic conditions. Synchronization 420 provides a mechanism that can reproduce many of the most puzzling characteristics of 421 observations over a wider range of possible parameter regimes. For example, in B17 and 422 other models with large ocean-mediated ice stream retreats, sensitivity to melt must be 423 high. In contrast, synchronization can explain the consistent phasing of Heinrich and DO 424 events, even with very small meltrates. This persistence of synchronization under very 425 weak coupling is a well-known feature of a broad class of coupled nonlinear oscillators 426 found in nature (Winfree, 2001), and has previously been found in models of the glacial 427 climate system (Tziperman et al., 1994; Gildor & Tziperman, 2000; Timmermann et al., 428 2005; Tziperman et al., 2006; Read & Castrejón-Pita, 2010; Corrick et al., 2020). Thus 429 it is perhaps unsurprising that two highly nonlinear systems with the tendency to gen-430 erate internal oscillatory behavior will synchronize when coupled even weakly. At more 431 realistic meltrates, and with bi-directional coupling, synchronized regions cover much of 432 the parameter space, indicating that synchronization of Heinrich and DO events is not 433 just possible, but probable. 434

Our synchronized system is also resilient to noise that we would expect to arise in
the chaotic climate system. Coupling not only phase locks Heinrich and DO events, but
also regularizes DO event oscillation period against noise in the ocean system. In cases
with noise, coupling can still result in phase differences between Heinrich and DO events
that, while not constant as in the deterministic model, are narrowly distributed, as in
observations (Schulz, 2002).

There is potential for synchronization with other components of the glacial period 441 climate system through coupling with atmospheric temperature and sea ice changes. Changes 442 in sea ice extent likely amplify both atmospheric temperature changes and disruptions 443 of AMOC during periods of ice sheet discharge, resulting in abrupt climate changes (Kaspi 444 et al., 2004; Mahajan et al., 2011; Zhu et al., 2014; Sévellec et al., 2017). Though our 445 study does not model atmospheric temperature or sea ice, it deserves future study, as 446 it may strengthen the case that synchronization regulates these aspects of the climate 447 system as well. Observations have identified IRD of European origin and IRD in the East-448 ern Pacific shortly before Laurentide IRD in the sediment record (Grousset et al., 2000; 449 Walczak et al., 2020). These observations have previously cast doubt on oscillatory glacial 450 dynamics as a cause for Heinrich events, as it is highly unlikely that different ice sheets 451 would independently reach their thermally determined maximum at similar times. How-452 ever, Kaspi et al. (2004) model synchronization as a mechanism to explain the similar 453 timings of these disparate ice sheet discharge events. Evaluating the glacial period cli-454 mate system as a coupled set of nonlinear oscillators opens up a world of possibilities, 455 as these distant ice sheet discharge events may amplify the disruption of AMOC dur-456 ing Heinrich events, and changes in sea ice during periods of reduced AMOC may am-457 plify changes in atmospheric temperature, further coupling these systems. 458

459 5 Conclusion

In our model, we reconcile two disparate theories for Heinrich events and their relationship with DO events that resolves problems in prior theories. We provide explanations for several puzzling characteristics of the marine sediment record, in a way that remains robust over a wide range of parameters and does not require prescribed forcing. The robustness of these findings, even considering noise in the Earth system, indicates that synchronization is a strong potential explanation for Heinrich events and their relationship to DO events.

With simple models, the coupled dynamics of the ice sheet-ocean system can be 467 evaluated with fewer degrees of freedom and minimal parameterization. While this study 468 does not present a fully dynamic model of the Laurentide ice sheet or AMOC, many find-469 ings of the study could be applied to fully dynamic models. Similarly, the study does not 470 account for changes in sea ice coverage or atmospheric temperature occurring during Hein-471 rich and DO events. However, it is likely that further study of sea ice feedback on at-472 mospheric temperature could strengthen the case, as these changes would amplify cou-473 pling. Further study of synchronous ice sheet collapses could also act as an amplifier of 474 AMOC disruptions occurring during Heinrich events. 475

Synchronization is a relevant phenomenon in this system and many other geophys-476 ical phenomena with oscillatory components. Applications of this phenomenon have been 477 applied to the El Niño-Southern Oscillation (Tziperman et al., 1994), Milankovitch cycles (Gildor 478 & Tziperman, 2000), and as a mechanism to trigger global abrupt climate changes dur-479 ing the last glacial period (Corrick et al., 2020; Kaspi et al., 2004). Under the right con-480 ditions, synchronization can greatly amplify the effects of even very weak interactions, 481 common in nonlinear systems. Investigation of interacting oscillatory modes within the 482 Earth system requires the consideration of these effects to better understand their inter-483 related dynamics. With the increasing practicality of fully coupled dynamic ice sheet and 484 climate models, operating on paleoclimatic timescales, the role of synchronization should 485 be further investigated, both in this system and in others. 486

487 Acknowledgments

Thanks to Jean Lynch-Stieglitz and Charles Gertler for discussions during completion of this work and comments on the manuscript. Logan Mann and Alex Robel were sup-

⁴⁹⁰ ported by startup funds from the Georgia Institute of Technology and utilized comput-

⁴⁹¹ ing resources provided by the Partnership for an Advanced Computing Environment (PACE)

⁴⁹² at the Georgia Institute of Technology, Atlanta.

⁴⁹³ Data Availability Statement

All MATLAB code and plotting scripts are available as public repositories from: https:// zenodo.org/record/5396953#collapseCitations (DOI:10.5281/zenodo.5396953)

496 **References**

- Alvarez-Solas, J., Robinson, A., Montoya, M., & Ritz, C. (2013). Iceberg discharges
 of the last glacial period driven by oceanic circulation changes. Proceedings
 of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America, 110,
 16350-16354.
- Arnol'd, V. I. (1961). Small denominators. 1. mapping the circle onto itself. *Bulletin* of the Russian Academy of Sciences, 25, 21-86.
- Bassis, J. N., Petersen, S. V., & Cathles, L. M. (2017). Heinrich events riggered by
 ocean foring and modulated by isostatic adjustment. *Nature*, 542, 332–334.
- ⁵⁰⁵ Bond, G., Wallace, B., Johnsen, S., McManus, J., Labeyrie, L., Jouzel, J., & Bonani,

506	G. (1993). Correlations between climate records from north atlantic sediments
507	and greenland ice. Nature, 365, 143-147.
508	Bougamont, M., Price, S., Christoffersen, P., & Payne, A. (2011). Dynamic patterns
509	of ice stream flow in a 3-d higher-order ice sheet model with plastic bed and
510	simplified hydrology. Journal of Geophysical Research, 116.
511	Bueller, E., Lingle, C. S., & Brown, J. (1985). Fast computation of a viscoelastic
512	deformable earth model for ice-sheet simulations. Annals of Glaciology, 46, 97-
513	105.
514	Cessi, P. (1996). Convective adjustment and thermohaline excitability. Journal of
515	Physical Oceanography, 26, 481–491.
516	Corrick, E. C., Drysdale, R. N., Hellstrom, J. C., Capron, E., Rasmussen, S. O.,
517	Zhang, X., Wolff, E. (2020). Synchronous timing of abrupt climate changes
518	during the last glacial period. Science, 369(6506), 963–969.
519	Cuffey, K., & Paterson, W. S. B. (2010). The physics of glaciers (4th ed.). Elsevier
520	Scientific Publishing Company.
521	Ditlevsen, P., Andersen, K., & Svensson, A. (2006). The do-climate events are noise
522	induced: statistical investigation of the claimed 1470 years cycle. <i>Climate of</i>
523	the Past Discussions, $2(6)$, $1277-1292$.
524	Ganopolski, A., & Bahmstorf, S. (2001). Bapid changes of glacial climate simulated
525	in a coupled climate model. <i>Nature</i> , 409, 153-158.
526	Gildor H & Tziperman E (2000) Sea ice as the glacial cycles' climate switch:
527	Role of seasonal and orbital forcing. <i>Paleoceanography</i> , 15(6), 605–615.
528	Grousset F E Puiol C Laberrie L Auffret G & Boelaert A (2000) Were
520	the north atlantic heinrich events triggered by the behavior of the european ice
530	sheets? Geology, 28(2), 123–126.
530	Heinrich H (1988) Origin and consequences of cyclic ice rafting in the northeast
532	atlantic ocean during the past 130,000 years. <i>Quaternary Research</i> , 29, 142-
532	atiantic ocean during the past 130,000 years. Quaternary Research, 29, 142- 152.
532 533 534	 atlantic ocean during the past 130,000 years. Quaternary Research, 29, 142-152. Hulbe, C. L., MacAveal, D. R., Denton, G. H., Kleman, J., & Lowell, T. V. (2004).
532 533 534 535	 atlantic ocean during the past 130,000 years. Quaternary Research, 29, 142-152. Hulbe, C. L., MacAyeal, D. R., Denton, G. H., Kleman, J., & Lowell, T. V. (2004). Catastrophic ice shelf breakup as the source of heinrich event icebergs. Paleo-
532 533 534 535 536	 atlantic ocean during the past 130,000 years. Quaternary Research, 29, 142-152. Hulbe, C. L., MacAyeal, D. R., Denton, G. H., Kleman, J., & Lowell, T. V. (2004). Catastrophic ice shelf breakup as the source of heinrich event icebergs. Paleo- ceanography, 19.
532 533 534 535 536 537	 atlantic ocean during the past 130,000 years. Quaternary Research, 29, 142-152. Hulbe, C. L., MacAyeal, D. R., Denton, G. H., Kleman, J., & Lowell, T. V. (2004). Catastrophic ice shelf breakup as the source of heinrich event icebergs. Paleo-ceanography, 19. Huvgens, C. (1669). Instructions concering the use of pendulum-watches for finding
532 533 534 535 536 537 538	 atlantic ocean during the past 130,000 years. Quaternary Research, 29, 142-152. Hulbe, C. L., MacAyeal, D. R., Denton, G. H., Kleman, J., & Lowell, T. V. (2004). Catastrophic ice shelf breakup as the source of heinrich event icebergs. Paleoceanography, 19. Huygens, C. (1669). Instructions concering the use of pendulum-watches for finding the longitude at sea., 937-976.
532 533 534 535 536 537 538 539	 atlantic ocean during the past 130,000 years. Quaternary Research, 29, 142-152. Hulbe, C. L., MacAyeal, D. R., Denton, G. H., Kleman, J., & Lowell, T. V. (2004). Catastrophic ice shelf breakup as the source of heinrich event icebergs. Paleo-ceanography, 19. Huygens, C. (1669). Instructions concering the use of pendulum-watches for finding the longitude at sea., 937-976. Kaspi, Y., Savag, R., & Tziperman, E. (2004). A "triple sea-ice state" mechanism
532 533 534 535 536 537 538 539 540	 atlantic ocean during the past 130,000 years. Quaternary Research, 29, 142-152. Hulbe, C. L., MacAyeal, D. R., Denton, G. H., Kleman, J., & Lowell, T. V. (2004). Catastrophic ice shelf breakup as the source of heinrich event icebergs. Paleoceanography, 19. Huygens, C. (1669). Instructions concering the use of pendulum-watches for finding the longitude at sea., 937-976. Kaspi, Y., Sayag, R., & Tziperman, E. (2004). A "triple sea-ice state" mechanism for the abrupt warming and synchronous ice sheet collapses during heinrich
532 533 534 535 536 537 538 539 540 541	 atlantic ocean during the past 130,000 years. Quaternary Research, 29, 142-152. Hulbe, C. L., MacAyeal, D. R., Denton, G. H., Kleman, J., & Lowell, T. V. (2004). Catastrophic ice shelf breakup as the source of heinrich event icebergs. Paleoceanography, 19. Huygens, C. (1669). Instructions concering the use of pendulum-watches for finding the longitude at sea. , 937-976. Kaspi, Y., Sayag, R., & Tziperman, E. (2004). A "triple sea-ice state" mechanism for the abrupt warming and synchronous ice sheet collapses during heinrich events. Paleoceanography, 19.
532 533 534 535 536 537 538 539 540 541 542	 atlantic ocean during the past 130,000 years. Quaternary Research, 29, 142-152. Hulbe, C. L., MacAyeal, D. R., Denton, G. H., Kleman, J., & Lowell, T. V. (2004). Catastrophic ice shelf breakup as the source of heinrich event icebergs. Paleoceanography, 19. Huygens, C. (1669). Instructions concering the use of pendulum-watches for finding the longitude at sea. , 937-976. Kaspi, Y., Sayag, R., & Tziperman, E. (2004). A "triple sea-ice state" mechanism for the abrupt warming and synchronous ice sheet collapses during heinrich events. Paleoceanography, 19. Lingle, C. S., & Clark, J. A. (1985). A numerical model of interactions between
532 533 534 535 536 537 538 539 540 541 541 542 543	 atlantic ocean during the past 130,000 years. Quaternary Research, 29, 142-152. Hulbe, C. L., MacAyeal, D. R., Denton, G. H., Kleman, J., & Lowell, T. V. (2004). Catastrophic ice shelf breakup as the source of heinrich event icebergs. Paleoceanography, 19. Huygens, C. (1669). Instructions concering the use of pendulum-watches for finding the longitude at sea., 937-976. Kaspi, Y., Sayag, R., & Tziperman, E. (2004). A "triple sea-ice state" mechanism for the abrupt warming and synchronous ice sheet collapses during heinrich events. Paleoceanography, 19. Lingle, C. S., & Clark, J. A. (1985). A numerical model of interactions between a marine ice sheet and the solid earth: Application to a west antarctic ice
532 533 534 535 536 537 538 539 540 541 542 542 543 544	 atlantic ocean during the past 130,000 years. Quaternary Research, 29, 142-152. Hulbe, C. L., MacAyeal, D. R., Denton, G. H., Kleman, J., & Lowell, T. V. (2004). Catastrophic ice shelf breakup as the source of heinrich event icebergs. Paleoceanography, 19. Huygens, C. (1669). Instructions concering the use of pendulum-watches for finding the longitude at sea., 937-976. Kaspi, Y., Sayag, R., & Tziperman, E. (2004). A "triple sea-ice state" mechanism for the abrupt warming and synchronous ice sheet collapses during heinrich events. Paleoceanography, 19. Lingle, C. S., & Clark, J. A. (1985). A numerical model of interactions between a marine ice sheet and the solid earth: Application to a west antarctic ice stream. Journal of Geophysical Research, 90, 1100-1114.
532 533 534 535 536 537 538 539 540 541 542 543 544 545	 atlantic ocean during the past 130,000 years. Quaternary Research, 29, 142-152. Hulbe, C. L., MacAyeal, D. R., Denton, G. H., Kleman, J., & Lowell, T. V. (2004). Catastrophic ice shelf breakup as the source of heinrich event icebergs. Paleoceanography, 19. Huygens, C. (1669). Instructions concering the use of pendulum-watches for finding the longitude at sea., 937-976. Kaspi, Y., Sayag, R., & Tziperman, E. (2004). A "triple sea-ice state" mechanism for the abrupt warming and synchronous ice sheet collapses during heinrich events. Paleoceanography, 19. Lingle, C. S., & Clark, J. A. (1985). A numerical model of interactions between a marine ice sheet and the solid earth: Application to a west antarctic ice stream. Journal of Geophysical Research, 90, 1100-1114. MacAyeal, D. R. (1993). Binge/purge oscillations of the laurentide ice sheet as a
532 533 534 535 536 537 538 539 540 541 542 542 543 544 545 546	 atlantic ocean during the past 130,000 years. Quaternary Research, 29, 142-152. Hulbe, C. L., MacAyeal, D. R., Denton, G. H., Kleman, J., & Lowell, T. V. (2004). Catastrophic ice shelf breakup as the source of heinrich event icebergs. Paleoceanography, 19. Huygens, C. (1669). Instructions concering the use of pendulum-watches for finding the longitude at sea., 937-976. Kaspi, Y., Sayag, R., & Tziperman, E. (2004). A "triple sea-ice state" mechanism for the abrupt warming and synchronous ice sheet collapses during heinrich events. Paleoceanography, 19. Lingle, C. S., & Clark, J. A. (1985). A numerical model of interactions between a marine ice sheet and the solid earth: Application to a west antarctic ice stream. Journal of Geophysical Research, 90, 1100-1114. MacAyeal, D. R. (1993). Binge/purge oscillations of the laurentide ice sheet as a cause of the north atlantic's heinrich events. Paleoceanography and Paleoclima-
532 533 534 535 536 537 538 539 540 541 542 543 544 545 544 545 546 547	 atlantic ocean during the past 130,000 years. Quaternary Research, 29, 142-152. Hulbe, C. L., MacAyeal, D. R., Denton, G. H., Kleman, J., & Lowell, T. V. (2004). Catastrophic ice shelf breakup as the source of heinrich event icebergs. Paleoceanography, 19. Huygens, C. (1669). Instructions concering the use of pendulum-watches for finding the longitude at sea., 937-976. Kaspi, Y., Sayag, R., & Tziperman, E. (2004). A "triple sea-ice state" mechanism for the abrupt warming and synchronous ice sheet collapses during heinrich events. Paleoceanography, 19. Lingle, C. S., & Clark, J. A. (1985). A numerical model of interactions between a marine ice sheet and the solid earth: Application to a west antarctic ice stream. Journal of Geophysical Research, 90, 1100-1114. MacAyeal, D. R. (1993). Binge/purge oscillations of the laurentide ice sheet as a cause of the north atlantic's heinrich events. Paleoceanography and Paleoclimatology, 8, 775-784.
532 533 534 535 536 537 538 539 540 541 542 544 544 545 546 547 548	 atlantic ocean during the past 130,000 years. Quaternary Research, 29, 142-152. Hulbe, C. L., MacAyeal, D. R., Denton, G. H., Kleman, J., & Lowell, T. V. (2004). Catastrophic ice shelf breakup as the source of heinrich event icebergs. Paleoceanography, 19. Huygens, C. (1669). Instructions concering the use of pendulum-watches for finding the longitude at sea. , 937-976. Kaspi, Y., Sayag, R., & Tziperman, E. (2004). A "triple sea-ice state" mechanism for the abrupt warming and synchronous ice sheet collapses during heinrich events. Paleoceanography, 19. Lingle, C. S., & Clark, J. A. (1985). A numerical model of interactions between a marine ice sheet and the solid earth: Application to a west antarctic ice stream. Journal of Geophysical Research, 90, 1100-1114. MacAyeal, D. R. (1993). Binge/purge oscillations of the laurentide ice sheet as a cause of the north atlantic's heinrich events. Paleoceanography and Paleoclimatology, 8, 775-784. Mahajan, S., Zhang, R., & Delworth, T. L. (2011). Impact of the atlantic meridional
532 533 534 535 536 537 538 539 540 541 542 543 544 545 546 545 546 547 548 549	 atlantic ocean during the past 130,000 years. Quaternary Research, 29, 142-152. Hulbe, C. L., MacAyeal, D. R., Denton, G. H., Kleman, J., & Lowell, T. V. (2004). Catastrophic ice shelf breakup as the source of heinrich event icebergs. Paleoceanography, 19. Huygens, C. (1669). Instructions concering the use of pendulum-watches for finding the longitude at sea., 937-976. Kaspi, Y., Sayag, R., & Tziperman, E. (2004). A "triple sea-ice state" mechanism for the abrupt warming and synchronous ice sheet collapses during heinrich events. Paleoceanography, 19. Lingle, C. S., & Clark, J. A. (1985). A numerical model of interactions between a marine ice sheet and the solid earth: Application to a west antarctic ice stream. Journal of Geophysical Research, 90, 1100-1114. MacAyeal, D. R. (1993). Binge/purge oscillations of the laurentide ice sheet as a cause of the north atlantic's heinrich events. Paleoceanography and Paleoclimatology, 8, 775-784. Mahajan, S., Zhang, R., & Delworth, T. L. (2011). Impact of the atlantic meridional overturning circulation (amoc) on arctic surface air temperature and sea ice
532 533 534 535 536 537 538 539 540 541 542 543 544 545 545 546 547 548 549 550	 atlantic ocean during the past 130,000 years. Quaternary Research, 29, 142-152. Hulbe, C. L., MacAyeal, D. R., Denton, G. H., Kleman, J., & Lowell, T. V. (2004). Catastrophic ice shelf breakup as the source of heinrich event icebergs. Paleoceanography, 19. Huygens, C. (1669). Instructions concering the use of pendulum-watches for finding the longitude at sea. , 937-976. Kaspi, Y., Sayag, R., & Tziperman, E. (2004). A "triple sea-ice state" mechanism for the abrupt warming and synchronous ice sheet collapses during heinrich events. Paleoceanography, 19. Lingle, C. S., & Clark, J. A. (1985). A numerical model of interactions between a marine ice sheet and the solid earth: Application to a west antarctic ice stream. Journal of Geophysical Research, 90, 1100-1114. MacAyeal, D. R. (1993). Binge/purge oscillations of the laurentide ice sheet as a cause of the north atlantic's heinrich events. Paleoceanography and Paleoclimatology, 8, 775-784. Mahajan, S., Zhang, R., & Delworth, T. L. (2011). Impact of the atlantic meridional overturning circulation (amoc) on arctic surface air temperature and sea ice variability. Journal of Climate, 24(24), 6573-6581.
532 533 534 535 536 537 538 539 540 541 542 543 544 545 546 547 548 549 550 551	 atlantic ocean during the past 130,000 years. Quaternary Research, 29, 142-152. Hulbe, C. L., MacAyeal, D. R., Denton, G. H., Kleman, J., & Lowell, T. V. (2004). Catastrophic ice shelf breakup as the source of heinrich event icebergs. Paleoceanography, 19. Huygens, C. (1669). Instructions concering the use of pendulum-watches for finding the longitude at sea., 937-976. Kaspi, Y., Sayag, R., & Tziperman, E. (2004). A "triple sea-ice state" mechanism for the abrupt warming and synchronous ice sheet collapses during heinrich events. Paleoceanography, 19. Lingle, C. S., & Clark, J. A. (1985). A numerical model of interactions between a marine ice sheet and the solid earth: Application to a west antarctic ice stream. Journal of Geophysical Research, 90, 1100-1114. MacAyeal, D. R. (1993). Binge/purge oscillations of the laurentide ice sheet as a cause of the north atlantic's heinrich events. Paleoceanography and Paleoclimatology, 8, 775-784. Mahajan, S., Zhang, R., & Delworth, T. L. (2011). Impact of the atlantic meridional overturning circulation (amoc) on arctic surface air temperature and sea ice variability. Journal of Climate, 24(24), 6573-6581. Mantelli, E., Bertagni, M. B., & Ridolfi, L. (2016). Stochastic ice stream dynamics.
532 533 534 535 536 537 538 539 540 541 542 543 544 545 544 545 546 547 548 549 550 551 552	 attantic ocean during the past 130,000 years. Quaternary Research, 29, 142-152. Hulbe, C. L., MacAyeal, D. R., Denton, G. H., Kleman, J., & Lowell, T. V. (2004). Catastrophic ice shelf breakup as the source of heinrich event icebergs. Paleoceanography, 19. Huygens, C. (1669). Instructions concering the use of pendulum-watches for finding the longitude at sea., 937-976. Kaspi, Y., Sayag, R., & Tziperman, E. (2004). A "triple sea-ice state" mechanism for the abrupt warming and synchronous ice sheet collapses during heinrich events. Paleoceanography, 19. Lingle, C. S., & Clark, J. A. (1985). A numerical model of interactions between a marine ice sheet and the solid earth: Application to a west antarctic ice stream. Journal of Geophysical Research, 90, 1100-1114. MacAyeal, D. R. (1993). Binge/purge oscillations of the laurentide ice sheet as a cause of the north atlantic's heinrich events. Paleoceanography and Paleoclimatology, 8, 775-784. Mahajan, S., Zhang, R., & Delworth, T. L. (2011). Impact of the atlantic meridional overturning circulation (amoc) on arctic surface air temperature and sea ice variability. Journal of Climate, 24 (24), 6573-6581. Mantelli, E., Bertagni, M. B., & Ridolfi, L. (2016). Stochastic ice stream dynamics. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, 113(32), E4594-E4600.
532 533 534 535 536 537 538 539 540 541 542 544 543 544 545 546 545 546 547 548 549 550 551 552 553	 atiantic ocean during the past 130,000 years. Quaternary Research, 29, 142-152. Hulbe, C. L., MacAyeal, D. R., Denton, G. H., Kleman, J., & Lowell, T. V. (2004). Catastrophic ice shelf breakup as the source of heinrich event icebergs. Paleoceanography, 19. Huygens, C. (1669). Instructions concering the use of pendulum-watches for finding the longitude at sea. , 937-976. Kaspi, Y., Sayag, R., & Tziperman, E. (2004). A "triple sea-ice state" mechanism for the abrupt warming and synchronous ice sheet collapses during heinrich events. Paleoceanography, 19. Lingle, C. S., & Clark, J. A. (1985). A numerical model of interactions between a marine ice sheet and the solid earth: Application to a west antarctic ice stream. Journal of Geophysical Research, 90, 1100-1114. MacAyeal, D. R. (1993). Binge/purge oscillations of the laurentide ice sheet as a cause of the north atlantic's heinrich events. Paleoceanography and Paleoclimatology, 8, 775-784. Mahajan, S., Zhang, R., & Delworth, T. L. (2011). Impact of the atlantic meridional overturning circulation (amoc) on arctic surface air temperature and sea ice variability. Journal of Climate, 24(24), 6573-6581. Mantelli, E., Bertagni, M. B., & Ridolfi, L. (2016). Stochastic ice stream dynamics. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, 113(32), E4594-E4600. Marcott, S. A., Clark, P. U., Padman, L., Klinkhammer, G. P., Springer, S. R., Liu.
532 533 534 535 536 537 538 539 540 541 542 543 544 545 544 545 546 545 550 551 552 553 554	 atiantic ocean during the past 130,000 years. Quaternary Research, 29, 142-152. Hulbe, C. L., MacAyeal, D. R., Denton, G. H., Kleman, J., & Lowell, T. V. (2004). Catastrophic ice shelf breakup as the source of heinrich event icebergs. Paleoceanography, 19. Huygens, C. (1669). Instructions concering the use of pendulum-watches for finding the longitude at sea. , 937-976. Kaspi, Y., Sayag, R., & Tziperman, E. (2004). A "triple sea-ice state" mechanism for the abrupt warming and synchronous ice sheet collapses during heinrich events. Paleoceanography, 19. Lingle, C. S., & Clark, J. A. (1985). A numerical model of interactions between a marine ice sheet and the solid earth: Application to a west antarctic ice stream. Journal of Geophysical Research, 90, 1100-1114. MacAyeal, D. R. (1993). Binge/purge oscillations of the laurentide ice sheet as a cause of the north atlantic's heinrich events. Paleoceanography and Paleoclimatology, 8, 775-784. Mahajan, S., Zhang, R., & Delworth, T. L. (2011). Impact of the atlantic meridional overturning circulation (amoc) on arctic surface air temperature and sea ice variability. Journal of Climate, 24(24), 6573-6581. Mantelli, E., Bertagni, M. B., & Ridolfi, L. (2016). Stochastic ice stream dynamics. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, 113(32), E4594-E4600. Marcott, S. A., Clark, P. U., Padman, L., Klinkhammer, G. P., Springer, S. R., Liu, Z., Schmittner, A. (2011). Ice-shelf collapse from subsurface warming as a
 532 533 534 535 536 537 538 539 540 541 542 543 544 545 546 547 548 549 550 551 552 553 554 555 	 atlantic ocean during the past 130,000 years. Quaternary Research, 29, 142-152. Hulbe, C. L., MacAyeal, D. R., Denton, G. H., Kleman, J., & Lowell, T. V. (2004). Catastrophic ice shelf breakup as the source of heinrich event icebergs. Paleoceanography, 19. Huygens, C. (1669). Instructions concering the use of pendulum-watches for finding the longitude at sea. , 937-976. Kaspi, Y., Sayag, R., & Tziperman, E. (2004). A "triple sea-ice state" mechanism for the abrupt warming and synchronous ice sheet collapses during heinrich events. Paleoceanography, 19. Lingle, C. S., & Clark, J. A. (1985). A numerical model of interactions between a marine ice sheet and the solid earth: Application to a west antarctic ice stream. Journal of Geophysical Research, 90, 1100-1114. MacAyeal, D. R. (1993). Binge/purge oscillations of the laurentide ice sheet as a cause of the north atlantic's heinrich events. Paleoceanography and Paleoclimatology, 8, 775-784. Mahajan, S., Zhang, R., & Delworth, T. L. (2011). Impact of the atlantic meridional overturning circulation (amoc) on arctic surface air temperature and sea ice variability. Journal of Climate, 24 (24), 6573-6581. Mantelli, E., Bertagni, M. B., & Ridolfi, L. (2016). Stochastic ice stream dynamics. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, 113 (32), E4594-E4600. Marcott, S. A., Clark, P. U., Padman, L., Klinkhammer, G. P., Springer, S. R., Liu, Z., Schmittner, A. (2011). Ice-shelf collapse from subsurface warning as a trigger for heinrich events. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the statemy of Science
 532 533 534 535 536 537 538 539 540 541 542 543 544 545 546 547 548 549 550 551 552 553 554 555 556 	 atlantic ocean during the past 130,000 years. Quaternary Research, 29, 142-152. Hulbe, C. L., MacAyeal, D. R., Denton, G. H., Kleman, J., & Lowell, T. V. (2004). Catastrophic ice shelf breakup as the source of heinrich event icebergs. Paleoceanography, 19. Huygens, C. (1669). Instructions concering the use of pendulum-watches for finding the longitude at sea. , 937-976. Kaspi, Y., Sayag, R., & Tziperman, E. (2004). A "triple sea-ice state" mechanism for the abrupt warming and synchronous ice sheet collapses during heinrich events. Paleoceanography, 19. Lingle, C. S., & Clark, J. A. (1985). A numerical model of interactions between a marine ice sheet and the solid earth: Application to a west antarctic ice stream. Journal of Geophysical Research, 90, 1100-1114. MacAyeal, D. R. (1993). Binge/purge oscillations of the laurentide ice sheet as a cause of the north atlantic's heinrich events. Paleoceanography and Paleoclimatology, 8, 775-784. Mahajan, S., Zhang, R., & Delworth, T. L. (2011). Impact of the atlantic meridional overturning circulation (amoc) on arctic surface air temperature and sea ice variability. Journal of Climate, 24(24), 6573-6581. Mantelli, E., Bertagni, M. B., & Ridolfi, L. (2016). Stochastic ice stream dynamics. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, 113(32), E4594-E4600. Marcott, S. A., Clark, P. U., Padman, L., Klinkhammer, G. P., Springer, S. R., Liu, Z., Schmittner, A. (2011). Ice-shelf collapse from subsurface warming as a trigger for heinrich events. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the Value Academy of Sciences of the United States of America, 108, 13415-13419.
532 533 534 535 536 537 538 539 540 541 542 543 544 542 543 544 545 546 547 548 549 550 551 552 553 554 555 556 557	 atiantic ocean during the past 130,000 years. Quaternary Research, 29, 142-152. Hulbe, C. L., MacAyeal, D. R., Denton, G. H., Kleman, J., & Lowell, T. V. (2004). Catastrophic ice shelf breakup as the source of heinrich event icebergs. Paleoceanography, 19. Huygens, C. (1669). Instructions concering the use of pendulum-watches for finding the longitude at sea., 937-976. Kaspi, Y., Sayag, R., & Tziperman, E. (2004). A "triple sea-ice state" mechanism for the abrupt warming and synchronous ice sheet collapses during heinrich events. Paleoceanography, 19. Lingle, C. S., & Clark, J. A. (1985). A numerical model of interactions between a marine ice sheet and the solid earth: Application to a west antarctic ice stream. Journal of Geophysical Research, 90, 1100-1114. MacAyeal, D. R. (1993). Binge/purge oscillations of the laurentide ice sheet as a cause of the north atlantic's heinrich events. Paleoceanography and Paleoclimatology, 8, 775-784. Mahajan, S., Zhang, R., & Delworth, T. L. (2011). Impact of the atlantic meridional overturning circulation (amoc) on arctic surface air temperature and sea ice variability. Journal of Climate, 24 (24), 6573-6581. Mantelli, E., Bertagni, M. B., & Ridolfi, L. (2016). Stochastic ice stream dynamics. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, 113 (32), E4594-E4600. Marcott, S. A., Clark, P. U., Padman, L., Klinkhammer, G. P., Springer, S. R., Liu, Z., Schmittner, A. (2011). Ice-shelf collapse from subsurface warming as a trigger for heinrich events. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America, 108, 13415-13419. Meyer, C. R., Robel, A. A., & Rempel, A. W. (2019). Frozen fringe explains sed-
 532 533 534 535 536 537 538 539 540 541 542 543 544 545 546 551 552 554 555 556 557 558 	 atlantic ocean during the past 130,000 years. Quaternary Research, 29, 142-152. Hulbe, C. L., MacAyeal, D. R., Denton, G. H., Kleman, J., & Lowell, T. V. (2004). Catastrophic ice shelf breakup as the source of heinrich event icebergs. Paleoceanography, 19. Huygens, C. (1669). Instructions concering the use of pendulum-watches for finding the longitude at sea. , 937-976. Kaspi, Y., Sayag, R., & Tziperman, E. (2004). A "triple sea-ice state" mechanism for the abrupt warming and synchronous ice sheet collapses during heinrich events. Paleoceanography, 19. Lingle, C. S., & Clark, J. A. (1985). A numerical model of interactions between a marine ice sheet and the solid earth: Application to a west antarctic ice stream. Journal of Geophysical Research, 90, 1100-1114. MacAyeal, D. R. (1993). Binge/purge oscillations of the laurentide ice sheet as a cause of the north atlantic's heinrich events. Paleoceanography and Paleoclimatology, 8, 775-784. Mahajan, S., Zhang, R., & Delworth, T. L. (2011). Impact of the atlantic meridional overturning circulation (amoc) on arctic surface air temperature and sea ice variability. Journal of Climate, 24 (24), 6573-6581. Mantelli, E., Bertagni, M. B., & Ridolfi, L. (2016). Stochastic ice stream dynamics. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, 113(32), E4594-E4600. Marcott, S. A., Clark, P. U., Padman, L., Klinkhammer, G. P., Springer, S. R., Liu, Z., Schmittner, A. (2011). Ice-shelf collapse from subsurface warming as a trigger for heinrich events. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the Vational Academy of Sciences of the United States of America, 108, 13415-13419. Meyer, C. R., Robel, A. A., & Rempel, A. W. (2019). Frozen fringe explains sediment freeze-on during heinrich events. Earth and Planetary Science Letters,

- Raymond, C. (1996). Shear margins in glaciers and ice sheets. Journal of Glaciology, 42(140), 90–102.
- Read, P. L., & Castrejón-Pita, A. A. (2010). Synchronization in climate dynamics
 and other extended systems. In Nonlinear dynamics and chaos: Advances and
 perspectives (pp. 153–176). Springer.
- Rignot, E., Xu, Y., Menemenlis, D., Mouginot, J., Scheuchl, B., Li, X., ... de
- Fleurian, B. (2016). Modeling of ocean-induced ice melt rates of five west greenland glaciers over the past two decades. *Geophysical Research Letters*, 43, 6374-6382.
- Robel, A. A., Degiuli, E., Schoof, C., & Tziperman, E. (2013). Dynamics of ice
 stream temporal variability: Modes, scales, and hysteresis. Journal of Geophys *ical Research: Earth Surface*, 118(2), 925–936.
- Robel, A. A., Roe, G. H., & Haseloff, M. (2018). Response of marine-terminating
 glaciers to forcing: Time scales, sensitivities, instabilities, and stochastic dynamics. Journal of Geophysical Research: Earth Surface, 123(9), 2205–2227.
- Robel, A. A., Schoof, C., & Tziperman, E. (2014). Rapid grounding line migration
 induced by internal ice stream variability. Journal of Geophysical Research:
 Earth Surface, 119(11), 2430-2447.
- Sayag, R., & Tziperman, E. (2009). Spatiotemporal dynamics of ice streams due to
 a triple-valued sliding law. *Journal of Fluid Mechanics*, 640.
- Sayag, R., & Tziperman, E. (2011). Interaction and variability of ice streams under
 a triple-valued sliding law and non-newtonian rheology. Journal of Geophysical Research, 116.
- Schulz, M. (2002). On the 1470-year pacing of dansgaard-oeschger warm events. *Pa-leoceanography*, 17.
- Sévellec, F., Fedorov, A. V., & Liu, W. (2017). Arctic sea-ice decline weakens the
 atlantic meridional overturning circulation. Nature Climate Change, 7(8), 604–
 610.
 - Shaffer, G., Olsen, S. M., & Bjerrum, C. J. (2004). Ocean subsurface warming as a mechanism for coupling dansgaard-oeschger climate cycles and ice-rafting events. *Geophysical Research Letters*, 31.

588

589

590

- Timmermann, A., Krebs, U., Justino, F., Goosse, H., & Ivanochko, T. (2005).
 Mechanisms for millennial-scale global synchronization during the last glacial period. *Paleoceanography*, 20(4).
- Tsai, V. C., Stewart, A. L., & Thompson, A. F. (2015). Marine ice-sheet profiles and
 stability under coulomb basal conditions. *Journal of Glaciology*, 61(226), 205–215.
- Tulaczyk, S., Kamb, W. B., & Engelhardt, H. F. (2000a). Basal mechanics of ice
 stream b, west antarctica: 1. till mechanics. Journal of Geophysical Research:
 Solid Earth, 105, 463–481.
- Tulaczyk, S., Kamb, W. B., & Engelhardt, H. F. (2000b). Basal mechanics of ice
 stream b, west antarctica 2. undrained plastic bed model. *Journal of Geophysical Research: Solid Earth*, 105, 483–494.
- Tziperman, E., Raymo, M. E., Huybers, P., & Wunsch, C. (2006). Consequences of pacing the pleistocene 100 kyr ice ages by nonlinear phase locking to milankovitch forcing. *Paleoceanography*, 21(4).
- Tziperman, E., Stone, L., Cane, M. A., & Jarosh, H. (1994). El niño chaos:
 Overlapping of resonances between the seasonal cycle and the pacific oceanatmosphere oscillator. *Science*, 264 (5155), 72–74.
- Walczak, M. H., Mix, A. C., Cowan, E. A., Fallon, S., Fifield, L. K., Alder, J. R., ...
 others (2020). Phasing of millennial-scale climate variability in the pacific and atlantic oceans. *Science*, 370(6517), 716–720.
- Welander, P. (1982). A simple heat-salt oscillator. Dynamics of Atmospheres and
 Oceans, 6, 233-242.

- ⁶¹⁴ Winfree, A. T. (2001). *The geometry of biological time* (2nd ed.). Springer-Verlag ⁶¹⁵ New York.
- Zhu, J., Liu, Z., Zhang, X., Eisenman, I., & Liu, W. (2014). Linear weakening of the amoc in response to receding glacial ice sheets in ccsm3. *Geophysical Research Letters*, 41(17), 6252–6258.

Supporting Information for "Synchronization of Heinrich and Dansgaard-Oeschger Events through Ice-Ocean Interactions"

Logan E. Mann^{1,2}, Alexander A. Robel¹, Colin R. Meyer²

 $^1\mathrm{School}$ of Earth and Atmospheric Sciences, Georgia Institute of Technology

²Thayer School of Engineering, Dartmouth College

Contents of this file

- 1. Text S1 to S4
- 2. Figures S1 to S4

Introduction

This supporting information provides greater detail in text on some of the methods and results in the main text of "Synchronization of Heinrich and Dansgaard-Oeschger Events through Ice-Ocean Interactions", as well as supporting figures that describe these methods and results. This document describes: 1) The nondimensionalization of the ocean model, which elaborates on the implementation and parameter selection of the ocean model from the main text, 2) The model implementation of stochastic noise, which details the numerical methods used and the code implementation, 3) The model implementation of ELRA

glacial isostatic adjustment, which describes the bed topography and the implementation of ELRA GIA in the ocean forced version of the model, and 4) The Numerical methods for simulations.

:

Text S1. Nondimensionalization of the ocean model

Cessi (1996) shows that it is possible to nondimensionalize the ocean model of Welander (1982) and constrain parameters for oscillatory behavior in the model. This will aid in the determination of appropriate parameter regimes and in the implementation of coupling. Variables are nondimensionalized as

$$x = \frac{T - T_0}{T_A - T_0} \tag{S1}$$

$$y = \frac{\alpha_S(S - S_0)}{\alpha_T(T_A - T_0)} \tag{S2}$$

$$t' = t\gamma \tag{S3}$$

where x is the nondimensional temperature balance, y is the nondimensional salinity balance, and t' is a nondimensional time variable. Equations 14-15 in the main text are nondimensionalized as

$$\frac{dx}{dt} = 1 - x - \nu x \tag{S4}$$

$$\frac{dy}{dt} = \mu - \nu y \tag{S5}$$

where $\nu = \kappa / \gamma$ is the ratio of the relaxation and diffusion time constants and μ measures the ratio of surface salinity flux to surface temperature flux.

$$\mu = \frac{F\alpha_s S_0}{H\gamma\alpha_T (T_A - T_0)} \tag{S6}$$

 ν is taken to be a function of the nondimensional density gradient, y - x

$$\nu = \begin{cases} \nu_1, & \text{if } y - x \le \epsilon \\ \nu_2, & \text{if } y - x > \epsilon \end{cases}$$
(S7)

 $\nu_1 = \kappa_1/\gamma$ is assumed to be << 1, because diffusion time, κ_1^{-1} is much longer than relaxation time $\gamma_1^{-1}\nu_2 = \kappa_2/\gamma$ is an order of magnitude greater than ν_1 . ϵ represents the

X - 4

threshold vertical density gradient beyond which convection occurs, $\epsilon = \Delta \rho_0 / [\alpha_T (T_A - T_0)]$. ϵ is a very small negative number.

The advantage of this nondimensionalization is that the behavior is governed by one parameter, μ . The system will oscillate if $\mu_2 > \mu > \mu_1$, where

$$\mu_1 = \frac{\nu_1}{1 + \nu_1} + \epsilon \nu_1 \tag{S8}$$

$$\mu_2 = \frac{\nu_2}{1+\nu_2} + \epsilon \nu_2 \tag{S9}$$

In this study, μ is set close to μ_2 , $\mu = \mu_2 - \nu_2 \delta$. As long as $\delta > 0$ and $\delta << 1$, the model remains in an oscillatory regime (Figure S1).

Text S2. Model implementation of stochastic noise

As in Cessi (1996), the ratio surface salinity flux to surface temperature flux, μ , is the sum of $\bar{\mu}$, which is equivalent to μ in the deterministic model, and Gaussian noise, $\mu'(t)$.

$$\mu = \bar{\mu} + \mu'(t) \tag{S10}$$

with the forward Euler implementation of stochastic noise being

$$\langle \mu'^2 \rangle = \sigma_s^2 / \Delta t \tag{S11}$$

where $\langle \rangle$ indicate an ensemble average.

In our implementation, the random function in MATLAB is used to add gaussian pseudorandom noise scaled to the square root of timestep Δt and standard deviation of noise σ_s . It follows that

$$\mu'(t) = \operatorname{randn} \cdot \sigma_s / \sqrt{\Delta t} \tag{S12}$$

A characteristic result for the stochastic model can be seen in Figure S3.

Text S3. Model implementation of ELRA glacial isostatic adjustment

A one-dimensional bed is initialized along the x-axis, through the addition of a gaussianshaped sill to a linear, prograde slope (Figure S4):

$$b(x) = b_0 + b_x x + \frac{H_S}{\sigma_S \sqrt{2\pi}} \exp\left[-\frac{1}{2} \left(\frac{x - \mu_S}{\sigma_S}\right)^2\right]$$
(S13)

where b_0 is the ice divide height, b_x is the slope of the prograde bed, H_S is a unitless parameter that scales the height of the sill, σ_S determines the sill width, and μ_S determines the sill position.

The model implements an Elastic Lithospere Relaxing Aesthenosphere model (Lingle & Clark, 1985), to consider glacial isostatic adjustment under a single ice stream:

$$\rho_r g w + D \nabla^4 w = \sigma_{zz} \tag{S14}$$

$$\frac{\partial u}{\partial t} = -\frac{u-w}{\tau} \tag{S15}$$

where ρ_r represents the density of the aesthenosphere, g is the gravitational constant, Drepresents the flexural rigidity of the lithosphere, ∇^4 is the biharmonic operator, and σ_{zz} represents the ice load stress per unit area, which is a function of ice stream height, $\sigma_{zz} = -\rho_i gh$. u represents the vertical displacement of the bed, which decays to equillibrium plate displacement w on a time span determined by relaxation time, τ .

As the model here is one-dimensional with respect to x, Equation S14 is rearranged to

$$\rho_r g w + D \frac{\partial^4 w}{\partial x^4} = \sigma_{zz} \tag{S16}$$

This is discretized with the boundary conditions

$$\frac{\partial w}{\partial x} \left(x = -x_{\max} \right) = 0 \tag{S17}$$

$$\frac{\partial w}{\partial x}\left(x = x_{\max}\right) = 0 \tag{S18}$$

and solved numerically on each timestep for w(x) using a fourth order finite difference method at n_x finite grid points. This solution can then be used to on the right hand side of equation S15. Each grid point of $\partial u/\partial t$ is treated as its own ODE $(du/dt_1, du/dt_2, ..., du/dt_{n_x})$ and solved alongside the other prognostic equations. To evaluate the system far from the boundary conditions, far field points are added to the bed geometry at the initial condition such that $B(x < 0) = B_0$ and slope decreases to zero at $\frac{3}{4}x_{\text{max}}$.

Text S4. Numerical methods for simulations

Ordinary differential equations (ODEs) are solved in MATLAB with the ode113 function, a variable-step, variable-order (VSVO) Adams-Bashforth-Moulton PEVE solver. Absolute and Relative error tolerances are set to 10^{-9} . In the stochastic model, ODEs are solved with Forward Euler with a timestep of 1 yr. In the implementation of ELRA GIA, equation S15 is solved with a fourth order finite difference method, and each grid point of equation S14 is treated as its own ODE, solved alongside the other prognostic equations using ode113.

References

- Cessi, P. (1996). Convective adjustment and thermohaline excitability. *Journal of Physical Oceanography*, 26, 481–491.
- Lingle, C. S., & Clark, J. A. (1985). A numerical model of interactions between a marine ice sheet and the solid earth: Application to a west antarctic ice stream. *Journal of Geophysical Research*, 90, 1100-1114.
- Welander, P. (1982). A simple heat-salt oscillator. Dynamics of Atmospheres and Oceans, 6, 233-242.



:

Figure S1. Self sustained thermohaline oscillations



:

Figure S2. The results of a parameter sweep with only ice stream to ocean coupling, recalculated to the domain of DO event period and freshwater flux sensitivity (ξ yr m⁻²). The domain is non rectangular, because the sweep is performed on the domain of relaxation time and coupling strength, and increased coupling strength alters the DO event period. This shows that Arnold Tongues are vertical on this domain. White spaces on either side are outside the domain of this sweep.



Figure S3. The stochastic model of near-surface ocean temperature with white noise with a standard deviation of $\sigma_s = 10^{-3} \text{ yr}^{(1/2)}$ and no coupling between ice stream and ocean systems, showing a) the nondimensional temperature variable evolving with white noise, b) the nondimensional salinity variable evolving with white noise, and c) near surface ocean temperature calculated from nondimensional parameters.



Figure S4. a) The Bed Geometry along the entire domain. Grid points below x = 0 km are initialized as $B_0=500$ m. Grid points between 0 and 5000 km are initialized with a linear prograde slope with a gaussian shaped sill near the typical grounding line position. The slope is initialized as 0 beyond the 5000 km grid point. b) The region of the bed topography initialized with a prograde slope. The weight of the ice stream eventually depresses this prograde slope into a retrograde slope, ending with the sill.