## Linking Intra-Plate Volcanism to Lithospheric Structure and Asthenospheric Flow

Thomas Duvernay<sup>1</sup>, D. Rhodri Davies<sup>1</sup>, Christopher Robert Mathews<sup>1</sup>, Angus H. Gibson<sup>1</sup>, and Stephan C Kramer<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Australian National University <sup>2</sup>Imperial College London

November 23, 2022

#### Abstract

Several of Earth's intra-plate volcanic provinces are hard to reconcile with the mantle plume hypothesis. Instead, they exhibit characteristics that are more compatible with shallower processes that involve the interplay between uppermost mantle flow and the base of Earth's heterogeneous lithosphere. The mechanisms most commonly invoked are edge-driven convection (EDC) and shear-driven upwelling (SDU), both of which act to focus upwelling flow and the associated decompression melting adjacent to steps in lithospheric thickness. In this study, we undertake a systematic numerical investigation, in both 2-D and 3-D, to quantify the sensitivity of EDC, SDU, and the associated melting to key controlling parameters. Our simulations demonstrate that the spatio-temporal characteristics of EDC are sensitive to the geometry and material properties of the lithospheric step, in addition to the magnitude and depth-dependence of upper mantle viscosity. These simulations also indicate that asthenospheric shear can either enhance or reduce upwelling velocities and the associated melting, depending upon the magnitude and orientation of flow relative to the lithospheric step. When combined, such sensitivities explain why step changes in lithospheric thickness, which are common along cratonic edges and passive margins, only produce volcanism at isolated points in space and time. Our predicted trends of melt production suggest that, in the absence of potential interactions with mantle plumes, EDC and SDU are viable mechanisms only for Earth's shorter-lived, lower-volume intra-plate volcanic provinces.

## Linking Intra-Plate Volcanism to Lithospheric Structure and Asthenospheric Flow

# Thomas Duvernay<sup>1</sup>, D. Rhodri Davies<sup>1</sup>, Christopher R. Mathews<sup>1</sup>, Angus H. Gibson<sup>1</sup>, Stephan C. Kramer<sup>2</sup>

 $^1 \rm Research$ School of Earth Sciences, The Australian National University, Canberra, ACT, Australia $^2 \rm Department$  of Earth Science and Engineering, Imperial College London, London, UK

### Key Points:

1

2

3

5

7

8	•	Edge-driven convection is sensitive to upper-mantle viscosity and the geometry
9		and material properties of lithospheric steps.
10	•	Asthenospheric flow magnitude and orientation dictate whether edge-driven cells
11		are enhanced through asthenospheric shear or suppressed.
12	•	Melting associated with edge-related processes can account for Earth's shorter-
13		lived and lower-volume intra-plate volcanic provinces.

 $Corresponding \ author: \ Thomas \ Duvernay, \verb"thomas.duvernay@anu.edu.au"$ 

#### 14 Abstract

Several of Earth's intra-plate volcanic provinces are hard to reconcile with the mantle 15 plume hypothesis. Instead, they exhibit characteristics that are more compatible with 16 shallower processes that involve the interplay between uppermost mantle flow and the 17 base of Earth's heterogeneous lithosphere. The mechanisms most commonly invoked are 18 edge-driven convection (EDC) and shear-driven upwelling (SDU), both of which act to 19 focus upwelling flow and the associated decompression melting adjacent to steps in litho-20 spheric thickness. In this study, we undertake a systematic numerical investigation, in 21 both 2-D and 3-D, to quantify the sensitivity of EDC, SDU, and the associated melt-22 ing to key controlling parameters. Our simulations demonstrate that the spatio-temporal 23 characteristics of EDC are sensitive to the geometry and material properties of the litho-24 spheric step, in addition to the magnitude and depth-dependence of upper mantle vis-25 cosity. These simulations also indicate that asthenospheric shear can either enhance or 26 reduce upwelling velocities and the associated melting, depending upon the magnitude 27 and orientation of flow relative to the lithospheric step. When combined, such sensitiv-28 ities explain why step changes in lithospheric thickness, which are common along cra-29 tonic edges and passive margins, only produce volcanism at isolated points in space and 30 time. Our predicted trends of melt production suggest that, in the absence of potential 31 interactions with mantle plumes, EDC and SDU are viable mechanisms only for Earth's 32 shorter-lived, lower-volume intra-plate volcanic provinces. 33

#### <sup>34</sup> Plain Language Summary

Intra-plate volcanoes, which occur away from plate boundaries, are common across 35 Earth's surface (e.g. Hawaii, Reunion, Cameroon, Eastern Australia), but their origin 36 remains debated. The classically invoked hypothesis for their genesis centres around man-37 tle plumes – buoyant columns of hot rock that ascend through Earth's mantle. Upon reach-38 ing the base of tectonic plates, plumes generate extensive melting and remain compar-39 atively fixed, providing a mechanism for generating linear volcanic tracks that grow older 40 in the direction of plate motion. Several intra-plate volcanic regions, however, exhibit 41 characteristics that are inconsistent with the mantle plume hypothesis: their eruptions 42 are usually short-lived, non-age-progressive, and only generate minor volumes of lava. 43 Therefore, they are more likely to be driven by shallower processes, such as small-scale 44 convective instabilities that develop adjacent to step-changes in the thickness of Earth's 45 lithosphere, its rigid outermost shell. In this study, we utilise both 2-D and 3-D com-46 putational models to simulate these shallow processes, and we analyse their sensitivity 47 to a range of key controlling parameters. Our results help to solve the puzzle of why such 48 processes only produce volcanism at isolated locations and, in the absence of interactions 49 with mantle plumes, limit their applicability to Earth's shorter-lived, lower-volume vol-50 canic provinces. 51

#### 52 1 Introduction

Most of Earth's volcanism is concentrated at tectonic plate boundaries, represent-53 ing the surface manifestation of either passive decompression melting at mid-ocean ridges 54 (e.g. Sengör & Burke, 1978; Phipps Morgan et al., 1987) or volatile-induced melting at 55 subduction zones (e.g. Tatsumi et al., 1986; Peacock, 1990). However, a significant and 56 widespread class of volcanism occurs within plates or across plate boundaries. These so-57 called *intra-plate* volcanic provinces cannot be explained through plate tectonic processes 58 and require an alternative generation mechanism. Mantle plumes – hot, buoyant columns 59 that rise from Earth's core-mantle boundary to its surface (e.g. Morgan, 1971) – are com-60 monly invoked to explain age-progressive volcanic tracks that grow older in the direc-61 tion of plate motion. At the young end of these tracks, volcanism localises within a ra-62 dius of a few tens of kilometres and has persisted for tens of millions of years, implying 63

a self-renewing source that lies below the region where the mantle moves with the sur-64 face plate (e.g. Richards et al., 1989; Farnetani & Richards, 1995; Courtillot et al., 2003; 65 Davies & Davies, 2009; French & Romanowicz, 2015). Classic examples include the vol-66 canic tracks terminating at Hawaii in the Pacific, Reunion in the Indian Ocean and Cosgrove in eastern Australia (e.g. Duncan & Richards, 1991; Davies et al., 2015; Jones et 68 al., 2017; Bredow et al., 2017). However, many intra-plate volcanic provinces are hard 69 to reconcile with the mantle plume hypothesis, for example the Colorado Plateau in North 70 America, the Moroccan Atlas Mountains in northern Africa and the Newer Volcanics Province 71 of southeastern Australia (e.g. Demidjuk et al., 2007; Missenard & Cadoux, 2012; Davies 72 & Rawlinson, 2014; Klöcking et al., 2018). At these locations, volcanism is often short-73 lived ( $< 20 \,\mathrm{Myr}$ ), non-age-progressive, and of low eruptive volume, all of which point to-74 wards alternative generation mechanisms (e.g. King & Ritsema, 2000; Conrad et al., 2011; 75 Davies & Rawlinson, 2014; Ballmer et al., 2015). 76

Most proposed mechanisms involve the interplay between shallow mantle flow and 77 the base of Earth's heterogeneous lithosphere. The two most commonly invoked are (i) 78 edge-driven convection (EDC) – a small-scale convective instability, associated with a 79 step in lithospheric thickness, driven by lateral density variations between a thick litho-80 sphere and adjacent asthenosphere (e.g. Buck, 1986; King & Anderson, 1998; King & 81 Ritsema, 2000; Till et al., 2010; Davies & Rawlinson, 2014; Ballmer et al., 2015; Liu & 82 Chen, 2019); and (ii) shear-driven upwelling (SDU) – defined here as a sub-lithospheric 83 ascending flow, induced by topography at the base of the lithosphere in the presence of 84 asthenospheric shear (e.g. Conrad et al., 2010, 2011; Bianco et al., 2011; Davies & Rawl-85 inson, 2014; Ballmer et al., 2015). For the latter, we acknowledge that Conrad et al. (2010) 86 formulated SDU in the context of low-viscosity pockets within the shallow asthenosphere, 87 but we focus solely on the role of lithospheric topography herein. While both EDC and 88 SDU have been linked to the generation of intra-plate volcanism, their applicability and 89 relative importance remain unclear and likely vary from one volcanic province to the next, 90 owing to regional differences in their primary controlling parameters (e.g. King & Rit-91 sema, 2000; Conrad et al., 2011; Davies & Rawlinson, 2014). To complicate matters fur-92 ther, EDC and SDU may interact with upwelling mantle plumes and pockets of low-viscosity 93 asthenosphere to produce intricate volcanic patterns at the surface (e.g. Conrad et al., 94 2011; Davies et al., 2015; Kennett & Davies, 2020). 95

To better assess the origin of some of Earth's intra-plate volcanic provinces and un-96 derstand possible interactions between different driving mechanisms, it is necessary to 97 analyse, in isolation, how EDC, SDU, and their associated melting depend on several plau-98 sible controlling parameters. Accordingly, in this study, we use a systematic series of 2-D and 3-D numerical models to quantify the sensitivity of EDC and SDU to a subset 100 of these parameters. We focus on the role of (i) the topography of the lithosphere-asthenosphere 101 boundary (LAB), especially the geometry and orientation of lithospheric steps and their 102 material properties; (ii) uppermost mantle viscosity, both in terms of its magnitude and 103 depth-dependence; and (iii) the intensity, depth distribution and orientation of plate mo-104 tion and asthenospheric flow. These models allow us to identify the fundamental con-105 trols on shallow edge-related processes and highlight, in particular, what determines the 106 location and intensity of melt production at depth. Our results allow us to place quan-107 titative bounds on the conditions under which EDC and SDU can explain intra-plate vol-108 canism in the absence of other melt-generating processes. 109

#### 110 2 Methods

111

#### 2.1 Governing Equations and Solution Strategy

We set up a numerical study of thermo-chemical convection applied to Earth's mantle in both 2-D and 3-D Cartesian domains with dimensions 4000:[4000]:1000 km (x:[y]:z). We use Fluidity – a finite-element, control-volume computational modelling framework

(e.g. Davies et al., 2011; Kramer et al., 2012) – to solve the equations governing man-115 tle convection for pressure, velocity, temperature and material volume fraction fields, on 116 anisotropic, adaptive, simplex meshes. Mesh optimisation is controlled by a metric that 117 depends on the Hessian of the temperature, velocity and material volume fraction fields. 118 It provides increased resolution in areas of dynamical significance, with coarser resolu-119 tion elsewhere, thus ensuring computational efficiency whilst maintaining solution ac-120 curacy (e.g. Davies et al., 2007). The resulting mesh satisfies a minimum edge-length 121 condition of 5 km, a maximum edge-length of 200 km and a 20% edge-length gradation 122 (i.e. the maximum allowable jump in edge-length from element to element). 123

We simulate incompressible (Boussinesq) Stokes flow in an Eulerian reference frame, incorporating spatial variations of viscosity. In this context, we solve the following governing equations:

$$0 = \nabla \cdot \boldsymbol{u},\tag{1}$$

$$\mathbf{0} = \nabla p - \nabla \cdot \left[ \mu \left( \nabla \boldsymbol{u} + (\nabla \boldsymbol{u})^{\mathsf{T}} \right) \right] + \left[ \rho_0 \alpha \left( T - T_S \right) - \Delta \rho_c \right] \boldsymbol{g}, \tag{2}$$

$$\mu = \left[ A_1 \times \exp\left( -\frac{E^* + \rho_0 g z \, V_1^*}{RT^*} \right) + A_2 \times \exp\left( -\frac{E^* + \rho_0 g z \, V_2^*}{RT^*} \right) \right]^{-1}, \qquad (3)$$

$$T^* = \overline{T} + \psi z. \tag{4}$$

We model energy conservation through a simple advection-diffusion equation including a heat source term:

$$\frac{\partial T}{\partial t} + \boldsymbol{u} \cdot \nabla T = \kappa \Delta T + \phi.$$
(5)

Distinct materials are initialised and tracked using material volume fraction fields (Wilson,
 2009; Garel et al., 2014), described by a linear advection equation:

$$\frac{\partial \Gamma}{\partial t} + \boldsymbol{u} \cdot \nabla \Gamma = 0. \tag{6}$$

In the above equations,  $\boldsymbol{u}$  denotes velocity, p dynamic pressure,  $\mu$  dynamic viscosity, T131 temperature, z depth,  $\rho$  density,  $\Delta \rho_c$  the density contrast between different materials, 132 and  $\Gamma$  volume fraction. Other symbol names and values are presented in Tables 1 and 133 2. Although our models are incompressible, when determining viscosity, we update tem-134 perature to account for an adiabatic gradient (Equation 4); a similar update is performed 135 to determine melt fractions (Section 2.4). Our computational domain includes three dif-136 ferent materials: continental crust, continental lithosphere (excluding the crust) and man-137 tle (incorporating oceanic lithosphere). Each has a distinct density (Table 1; Artemieva, 138 2009), but they all obey the same viscosity law, albeit with continental lithosphere that 139 is intrinsically 100 times more viscous than adjacent mantle (e.g. Lenardic & Moresi, 1999; 140 Currie & van Wijk, 2016). 141

142 2.2

#### 2.2 2-D Reference Case

We begin by simulating idealised 2-D flow around thermally and compositionallydefined steps in lithospheric thickness, which separate thick continental lithosphere from thin oceanic lithosphere – this is analogous to a passive margin setting.

<sup>146</sup> We consider viscosity,  $\mu$ , to be isotropic and model it through a diffusion creep rhe-<sup>147</sup> ology. To describe this mechanical behaviour, we combine two empirical Arrhenius laws <sup>148</sup> (Hirth & Kohlstedt, 2004; Korenaga & Karato, 2008) inside which we account for both <sup>149</sup> the temperature increase through the adiabatic gradient,  $\psi$ , and the effect of lithostatic <sup>150</sup> pressure (Equations 3 and 4). We fix a common activation energy,  $E^* = 350 \,\text{kJ}\,\text{mol}^{-1}$ , <sup>151</sup> for both laws but vary the activation volumes,  $V_i^*$ , and viscosity pre-factors,  $A_i$ . Setting <sup>152</sup> distinct  $V_1^*$  and  $V_2^*$  in Equation 3 allows us to incorporate a low-viscosity channel in the

Namo	Symbol	Value	Units
Wallie	Symbol	value	011105
Reference Density	$ ho_0  ho_0^{Cont}  ho_0^{Crust}$	$3370   3300   2900^{\mathrm{a}}$	${ m kgm^{-3}}$
Gravity	g	9.8	${ m ms^{-2}}$
Gas Constant	$\mathbf{R}$	8.3145	$ m JK^{-1}mol^{-1}$
Thermal Expansion	$\alpha$	$3 \times 10^{-5 \mathrm{b}}$	$\mathrm{K}^{-1}$
Surface Temperature	$T_S$	290	Κ
Mantle Temperature	$T_M$	$1650^{\rm c,d}$	Κ
Adiabatic Gradient	$\psi$	$4 \times 10^{-4 \mathrm{e}}$	${ m Km^{-1}}$
Thermal Diffusion	$\kappa$	$6 \times 10^{-7  \mathrm{f}}$	${ m m}^2{ m s}^{-1}$
Internal Heating (Cont. Crust)	$\phi$	$2.6 \times 10^{-13}{ m g}$	${ m Ks^{-1}}$
Internal Heating (Elsewhere)	$\phi$	$4 \times 10^{-15 \mathrm{h}}$	${ m Ks^{-1}}$
Activation Energy	$E^*$	$350^{i}$	${ m kJmol^{-1}}$
Upper Mantle Viscosity at ULME	$\mu_{660}$	$10^{21}$	Pas
Lower Mantle Viscosity	$\mu_{LM}$	$2 \times 10^{22}$	Pas
Viscosity Bounds	$\mu_{min} \mu_{max}$	$10^{18} \mid 10^{24}$	Pas
Water Content (Melting)	$X_{H_2O}$	300	ppm

 Table 1. Model parameters common to all simulations

*Note.* Parameters for the rheological law are guided by Korenaga and Karato (2008); additional values used in the upper mantle can be found in Table 2.

<sup>a</sup> Artemieva (2009). <sup>b</sup> Ye et al. (2009). <sup>c</sup> Putirka (2016). <sup>d</sup> Sarafian et al. (2017). <sup>e</sup> Katsura et al. (2010). <sup>f</sup> Gibert et al. (2003).  $g \equiv 1.3 \times 10^{-6} \text{ W m}^{-3}$  (Jaupart & Mareschal, 2005). <sup>h</sup>  $\equiv 2 \times 10^{-8} \text{ W m}^{-3}$  (Pollack & Chapman, 1977). <sup>i</sup> A value of 550 kJ mol<sup>-1</sup> is used for the dislocation creep regime (Section 2.3.1).

sub-lithospheric mantle (e.g. Richards et al., 2001). Conversely, specifying identical pa-153 rameters leads to a single law with a pre-factor twice as large. Either way, to determine 154  $V_i^*$  and  $A_i$  and, thereby, establish our upper mantle viscosity profile, we consider the ther-155 mal structure generated by a half-space cooling model (Parsons & Sclater, 1977) of age 156 40 Myr. Then, we define target values that the profile should satisfy: (i)  $\mu_{660}$ , the value 157 at the upper-lower mantle boundary (ULMB), which we set to  $10^{21}$  Pas (e.g. Mitrovica 158 & Forte, 2004); and (ii)  $\mu_{min}^{0}$ , the profile's minimum value in the sub-lithospheric man-159 tle (e.g. Iaffaldano & Lambeck, 2014). Using these constraints, we iteratively determine 160 the values of  $A_i$  and  $V_i^*$  (Table 2). To complete our profile, we fix the lower-mantle vis-161 cosity,  $\mu_{LM}$ , to  $2 \times 10^{22}$  Pas, resulting in a factor of 20 increase through the ULMB. Fi-162 nally, we restrict viscosity values between  $\mu_{min} = 10^{18} \text{ Pas}$  and  $\mu_{max} = 10^{24} \text{ Pas}$ . The 163 resulting reference profile (representative of our initial oceanic domain), alongside the 164 other profiles examined (Section 2.3.1), are illustrated in Figure 1a. All profiles are com-165 patible with estimates derived from models of global isostatic adjustment (e.g. Paulson 166 & Richards, 2009). 167

For our reference model, we impose no-slip velocity boundary conditions at the bot-168 tom of the domain and free-slip boundary conditions elsewhere. Temperature is set to 169  $T_S = 290 \text{ K}$  at the surface and  $T_M = 1650 \text{ K}$  at the base, with insulating sidewalls  $-\frac{\partial T}{\partial n} = 0$ . Initial temperature conditions incorporate a sub-lithospheric mantle of tem-170 171 perature  $T_M$  and differentiate between oceanic and continental realms (Figure 1c). Oceanic 172 lithosphere is treated as a surface thermal boundary layer, where the temperature dis-173 tribution follows a half-space cooling model of age 40 Myr; the 1620 K isotherm, which 174 we use to identify the LAB, is located at a depth of 90 km. Thicker continental litho-175 sphere, including a 41 km-thick crust, extends down to 200 km depth and is described 176 by a conductive geotherm (e.g. Pollack & Chapman, 1977), which we determine by solv-177 ing a 1-D steady-state heat equation. We use a value of  $3 \,\mathrm{W}\,\mathrm{m}^{-1}\,\mathrm{K}^{-1}$  for the thermal 178 conductivity (Schatz & Simmons, 1972) and account for internal heat generation through 179 an exponential decrease of characteristic length-scale 9 km (e.g. Lachenbruch, 1970). We 180

set the surface crustal heat production to  $6 \times 10^{-6} \,\mathrm{W m^{-3}}$  (McLaren et al., 2003), which 181 is compatible with the internal heating,  $\phi$ , defined in Equation 5 as it yields a compa-182 rable heat flux upon spatial integration (Nicolaysen et al., 1981; Jaupart & Mareschal, 183 2005). Oceanic and continental segments are connected via two 200 km-wide thermo-chemical 184 steps located between  $1150 \,\mathrm{km}$  and  $1350 \,\mathrm{km}$  to the left, and  $2650 \,\mathrm{km}$  and  $2850 \,\mathrm{km}$  to the 185 right of the continent; the material boundary is halfway through both steps. Within these 186 steps, the depth of a given isotherm follows an error function of the horizontal coordi-187 nate, x. Such a definition ensures a smooth, diffusive transition between the continen-188 tal area and adjacent lithosphere (Figure 1c), and it leads to instabilities that develop 189 as they would naturally do in this type of system. 190

- <sup>191</sup> 2.3 Parameter Space
- 192 2.3.1 2-D Cases

To assess possible expressions of flow adjacent to lithospheric steps, we first conduct a systematic study around our reference case, exploring the effect of varying val-



Figure 1. 2-D model setup: (a) Viscosity profiles considered in the 2-D parameter space study, calculated according to the temperature distribution of the reference 40 Myr old oceanic lithosphere. These profiles are for representation purposes only: our models include strong lateral viscosity contrasts. (b) Velocity profile within the oceanic realm resulting from a purely platedriven model (solid black line) and its simplified counterpart (dashed black line), which is used as a basis for inflow boundary conditions (Section 2.3.1). Remaining profiles incorporate additional asthenospheric shear (number between parentheses), either aligned with (+ sign) or opposite to (- sign) the direction of plate motion. (c) Initial distribution of viscosity (left) and temperature (right) inside the 2-D domain. The viscosity inset illustrates the separation between continent and ocean through the ×100 continental viscosity increase, while the temperature inset highlights the smooth paths taken by isotherms at the step.

	(	Geometry	
Name (Abbreviation)		Values	Units
Oceanic Lithosphere Age	(Oce.)	20 and <b>40</b>	Myr
Continent Depth (Cont.)		140 and <b>200</b>	$\rm km$
Step Width (Step)		<b>200</b> and 400	$\rm km$
Step Material Proportion	(Step) <b>E</b>	Equal and $\frac{2}{3}$ Oce.	_
Viscosity <sup>a</sup>			
$\begin{array}{c} \text{Profile}^{\text{b}} & \underset{\mu_{min}^{0}}{\text{Minimum viscosi}} \\ \end{array} $	ty Channel	Activation volume $V_1^*, V_2^* \ (\mathrm{m}^3 \mathrm{mol}^{-1})^{\mathrm{c}}$	$\frac{\text{Pre-factor } A_1, A_2}{(\text{Pas})^{\text{c}}}$
<b>10</b> <sup>19</sup>	No	$6.8 imes10^{-6}$	$1.9 imes10^{-8}$
$10^{19}$	Yes	$25 \times 10^{-6},  3 \times 10^{-6}$	$2.1 \times 10^{-6},  2.1 \times 10^{-10}$
$10^{20}$	No	$4.7  imes 10^{-6}$	$1.1 \times 10^{-9}$
$10^{20}$	Yes	$25 \times 10^{-6},  3 \times 10^{-6}$	$2 \times 10^{-7},  2.1 \times 10^{-10}$
Plate Motion			
Name		Values	Units
Plate Speed		<b>0</b> , 2, 4 and 6	${ m cmyr^{-1}}$
Additional Shear		-2, <b>0</b> , 1 and 2	${ m cmyr^{-1}}$

 Table 2.
 Model Parameters Varied Across 2-D Simulations

Note. Reference case values are in bold.

<sup>a</sup> Diffusion creep regime only; refer to Section 2.3.1 for the composite regime.

<sup>b</sup> Refer to Figure 1a for visualisation of the profiles.

<sup>c</sup> In the absence of a channel, activation volumes and pre-factors are identical in both laws (Equation 3).

ues for potential key controlling parameters (Table 2). We vary four geometric param-195 eters: the initial age of oceanic lithosphere (i.e. the thickness of the lithospheric lid), the 196 depth of the continent (i.e. the extent of the continental guide), the width of the litho-197 spheric step (effectively changing its slope), and the location of the material interface 198 between continent and ocean within the step (modifying the density distribution within 199 the step). We also examine cases with five distinct viscosity configurations (Figure 1a): 200 four account for diffusion creep only, as described in Section 2.2, and differ in their value 201 of  $\mu_{min}^0$  and the inclusion or exclusion of a sub-lithospheric viscosity channel (Table 2), 202 while the remaining case accounts for deformation through a composite diffusion and dis-203 location creep rheology, calculated via a harmonic mean: 204

$$\mu = 2 \times \left(\frac{1}{\mu_{diff}} + \frac{1}{\mu_{disl}}\right)^{-1}.$$
(7)

The diffusion creep component,  $\mu_{diff}$ , is identical to the reference case (Equation 3), while the dislocation creep component,  $\mu_{disl}$ , introduces a (non-linear) dependence on the second invariant of the strain-rate tensor,  $\dot{\epsilon}_{II}$ , according to

$$\mu_{disl} = \left[ A \times \dot{\epsilon}_{II}^{\frac{n-1}{n}} \times \exp\left(-\frac{E^* + \rho_0 g z \, V^*}{n R T^*}\right) \right]^{-1}.$$
(8)

For dislocation creep, we increase the activation energy to  $550 \text{ kJ mol}^{-1}$ , the activation volume to  $12 \times 10^{-6} \text{ m}^3 \text{ mol}^{-1}$  and set the values of A and n to  $2.2 \times 10^{-4} \text{ Pas}$  and 3.6 respectively, guided by Korenaga and Karato (2008).

In addition, we investigate the effect of plate motion and asthenospheric shear through kinematic boundary conditions. We first consider purely plate-driven cases by impos-

ing horizontal motion of 2, 4 and  $6 \,\mathrm{cm}\,\mathrm{yr}^{-1}$  at the surface and opening both side bound-213 aries (whilst imposing a lithostatic pressure condition); the flow generated is akin to a 214 classical Couette profile. We subsequently explore the effect of asthenospheric shear whilst 215 keeping plate motion imposed. To do so, we consider the horizontal velocity profile gen-216 erated within the oceanic realm in the  $4 \,\mathrm{cm}\,\mathrm{yr}^{-1}$  plate-driven case (solid black line, Fig-217 ure 1b) and generate an equivalent, albeit simplified, profile. We impose a constant ve-218 locity, equal to the plate speed, from the surface down to the LAB at 90 km depth, and 219 we close side-boundaries in the lower mantle. For the upper mantle, we integrate the plate-220 driven velocity profile between depths of 90 km and 660 km, and average the result over 221 that depth range. Using the obtained value ( $\approx 1.15 \,\mathrm{cm}\,\mathrm{yr}^{-1}$ ) as an asthenospheric in-222 flow boundary condition (dashed black line, Figure 1b), we replicate the dynamical be-223 haviour produced by the plate-driven case (Figures S1 and S2), demonstrating that re-224 sults are largely insensitive to the depth-dependence of the inflow profile prescribed within 225 the asthenosphere – the flow is redistributed in line with the underlying physics. Sub-226 sequently, to provide additional shear either in the direction of plate motion, or oppo-227 site to it, we increase, or decrease, the constant asthenospheric flow by  $2 \,\mathrm{cm}\,\mathrm{yr}^{-1}$ . Ad-228 ditionally, to illustrate the balance between the plate-driven flow and asthenospheric shear, 229 we include a case with a smaller  $1 \,\mathrm{cm}\,\mathrm{yr}^{-1}$  increase (Figure 1b). For completeness, we 230 also consider an end-member case that incorporates shear only by using our increased 231 asthenospheric flow scenario and setting the coefficient of thermal expansion to zero, which 232 prevents the development of edge-driven instabilities. For all cases incorporating plate 233 motion, we prescribe the temperature at the inflow boundary using the initial thermal 234 structure of oceanic lithosphere. We also increase the domain size from  $4000 \,\mathrm{km}$  to  $6000 \,\mathrm{km}$ 235 to prevent any interaction between the continental block and sidewalls of the domain. 236

2.3.2 3-D Cases

237

We extend our analyses to 3-D to quantify the sensitivity of EDC and SDU to more complex continental geometries and a broader spectrum of plate motion and asthenospheric flow directions, relative to the continent. Other model parameters remain identical to our reference 2-D case.

We examine four continental geometries for which the shape of the continent is based 242 on a 200 km-thick cuboid located between x, y = 1250 km and x, y = 2750 km (Figure 243 2). Similar to our 2-D models, lithospheric steps connect continent to ocean along con-244 tinental boundaries, including the four 'corners'. Each case differs in the following way: 245 (i) Case U400 incorporates a 400 km-wide oceanic indent inside the continent, between 246 x = 2350 km, y = 1800 km and x = 2750 km, y = 2200 km, with additional steps at in-247 ner edges and corners; (ii) Case U600 is similar to Case U400, albeit with a wider in-248 dent of 600 km, located between x = 2150 km, y = 1700 km and x = 2750 km, y = 2300 km; 249 (iii) Case U400-Grad builds on Case U400 but differs by the presence of a linear gra-250 dient in the y-direction, from z = 130 km to z = 230 km depth, to represent the conti-251 nental LAB; (iv) Case Complex does not incorporate an indent but, instead, combines 252 a similar gradient as Case U400-Grad (same direction, different amplitude) with sinu-253 solidal variations and local anomalies to define the continental LAB. In particular, the 254 smaller-scale variations in LAB topography included in Case Complex allow us to inves-255 tigate the flow regime and melt patterns in a more realistic scenario that better approx-256 imates the nature of the LAB inferred through seismic techniques and probabilistic in-257 version of combined geophysical datasets (e.g. Afonso et al., 2016; Rawlinson et al., 2017). 258

To explore the effects of background asthenospheric flow, we select Case U400 as our basis and impose both plate motion and asthenospheric inflow in four different directions: positive x at x = 0 km, negative x at x = 6000 km, positive y at y = 0 km and both positive x and y (which we will refer to as oblique) at x, y = 0 km. We follow the same strategy to produce the velocity inflow profile as for our 2-D cases but only consider 4 cm yr<sup>-1</sup> plate motion with a 2 cm yr<sup>-1</sup> increase of the constant asthenospheric in-



Figure 2. Initial topography of the LAB, as delineated by the 1620 K isotherm, for continental geometries used in our 3-D simulations. On each panel, the view is from below, looking at the base of the continent. (a) Case U400. (b) Case U600. (c) Case U400-Grad. (d) Case Complex.

flow (Section 2.3.1). In the oblique case, we also apply the inflow profile at the outflow boundaries to ensure flow remains oblique inside the domain.

#### 267 2.4 Model Diagnostics

#### 268 2.4.1 Edge-Driven Cells

For our 2-D cases, we identify the edge-driven cells generated adjacent to steps in 269 lithospheric thickness and quantify their strength. When plate motion and asthenospheric 270 shear are imposed, we uncover cells by subtracting from the velocity field a vertical pro-271 file of  $u_x$ , sampled through the centre of the continental realm. Following Coltice et al. 272 (2018), we calculate at each mesh node the angle of the velocity vector relative to the 273 x-axis and the horizontal derivative of the vertical component of velocity,  $\frac{\partial u_z}{\partial x}$ . We next 274 divide the domain into large squares inside which we analyse angle and derivative val-275 ues. For a cell to exist, velocity vectors must be oriented such that they form the shape 276 of an ellipse. Accordingly, we require the equivalent condition that vector directions dis-277 tribute in all four quadrants of the unit circle, which we interpret in terms of the dis-278 tribution of angles. Moreover, we apply a threshold to the absolute value of the deriva-279 tive (e.g.  $3 \times 10^{-15} \,\mathrm{s}^{-1}$  for the reference viscosity profile), filtering out squares with only 280 low-intensity features. We test each square for both conditions and either discard those 281 that do not meet our criteria or decompose others into four sub-squares. We iterate through 282 the process until we reach the desired threshold of squares with 10 km sides. At this stage, 283 we consider the remaining squares to contain the centre of a cell, approximately defined 284

by the square's centroid. With the centre of each cell accurately known, relevant velocity profiles can be drawn and compared across multiple cases.

#### 2.4.2 Melting

287

To track the occurrence of melting, we use the particle-in-cell method recently im-288 plemented and validated in Fluidity (Mathews, 2021). We adopt the batch melting pa-289 rameterization for wet upper-mantle peridotite from Katz et al. (2003), which addresses 290 both the exhaustion of clinopyroxene and water saturation in the rock. Our implemen-291 tation considers the pressure to be lithostatic, incorporates the adiabatic temperature 292 increase with depth (similar to our viscosity formulation) and makes use of an algorithm 293 for root-finding (Brent, 2013). Moreover, to account for the latent heat of fusion, we cou-294 ple the melting parameterisation of Katz et al. (2003) to a modified version of the ther-295 modynamic framework from McKenzie (1984) (Supplementary Information). 296

Particles are randomly initialised throughout the domain, with a denser distribu-297 tion adjacent to lithospheric steps where melting is expected. We typically use  $2 \times 10^5$ 298 and  $2 \times 10^7$  particles in 2-D and 3-D simulations, respectively. For each particle, we de-299 termine the onset of melting and track the evolution of both melt fraction, F, and the 300 temperature change due to the latent heat of fusion. At the beginning of the simulation, 301 F is calculated according to the pressure and temperature conditions of the initial state. 302 Particles subsequently record a new value of F at each time-step and keep track of the 303 maximum value experienced,  $F_{max}$ , with melting only occurring when the current F is 304 greater than any previous F (i.e.  $F > F_{max}$ ). A melting rate, M, is calculated using 305 the current time-step,  $\delta t$ : 306

$$M = max \left(0, \frac{F - F_{max}}{\delta t}\right). \tag{9}$$

As melting occurs, the temperature on a particle not only varies according to the local temperature gradient but also changes through latent heating; both contributions can be distinguished. Consequently, temperatures on nodes of the underlying finite element mesh are updated through the source term of the heat equation (Equation 5). We do not attempt to simulate melt extraction or 're-freezing'.

For all simulations, we calculate the cumulative melt production beneath a region 312 of interest, surrounding the continent. To do so, at each time-step, we select particles 313 within a given depth range where melting is occurring (e.g. between 30 km and 160 km) 314 and construct a piecewise linear interpolant from the obtained melting rate. We then 315 evaluate the interpolant onto a 5 km-resolution structured grid and use Simpson's rule 316 to integrate along any space dimension, as well as multiply by the current model time-317 step to integrate in time. We obtain cumulative melt thicknesses/areas/volumes by sum-318 ming results from each time-step. To account for continental motion in cases with a pre-319 scribed inflow, we advect the grid according to the displacement of a particle that is lo-320 cated within the rigid continent. We ignore melting from the first time-step as it rep-321 resents an equilibration process between the originally unmolten rocks and the pressure-322 temperature-velocity conditions of the model. 323

#### 324 **3 Results**

325

#### 3.1 Two-Dimensional Simulations

We first examine results from our 2-D simulations. Our reference case incorporates 40 Myr old oceanic lithosphere, a 200 km thick continent and 200 km wide steps, with the material interface between continent and ocean halfway along the step. The initial viscosity distribution, purely in the diffusion creep regime, reaches a minimum of 10<sup>19</sup> Pa s in the sub-lithospheric oceanic mantle and does not include a low-viscosity channel; domain boundaries are closed.

We focus on the dynamics at the right step, illustrated for 30 Myr in Figure 3. A 332 cell-like flow develops, adjacent to the continent, driven by the negative buoyancy of oceanic 333 material at the step. Flow rapidly intensifies, with peak vertical velocities increasing by 334 a factor of  $\sim 3$  from 7 to 15 Myr. Continental lithosphere, owing to its lower density and 335 increased viscosity, guides downward motion that, in turn, generates upwelling beneath 336 adjacent oceanic lithosphere. A secondary instability initiates away from the step after 337  $\sim 15$  Myr and persists throughout the remainder of the model's evolution. Melting oc-338 curs where upwelling material impinges beneath oceanic lithosphere, leading to melting 339 rates of, on average, a few  $100 \,\mathrm{ppm}\,\mathrm{Myr}^{-1}$ , with some particles recording over  $\sim 1 \,\% \,\mathrm{Myr}^{-1}$ 340 at 30 Myr; melt fractions reach maximum values of 1%. Melting is initially induced by 341 the main edge-driven flow and subsequently sustained by the secondary instability, which 342 delays lithospheric thickening and locally enhances upwelling velocities. 343

We next examine the role of background asthenospheric flow using a 4 cm yr<sup>-1</sup> platedriven case, alongside two cases with additional 2 cm yr<sup>-1</sup> shear in the asthenosphere, aligned with, or opposite to, the direction of plate motion, and a similar case with 2 cm yr<sup>-1</sup> shear aligned with plate motion for which the coefficient of thermal expansion is set to 0. Figure 4 compares the dynamics around both lithospheric steps after 20 Myr, with arrow glyphs illustrating a modified velocity field: the horizontal component is relative to



Figure 3. Development of an instability adjacent to the right step of the reference 2-D case. Background colours represent temperature, with the current and initial location of the 1640 K isotherm – a convenient proxy for downwellings – highlighted by solid grey and dashed black lines, respectively. Black dots depict the location of continental mantle. Arrow glyphs highlight the areas of most intense velocity, where the magnitude is higher than  $0.5 \text{ mm yr}^{-1}$ , as indicated by their colour. Areas experiencing melting are represented as a superimposed surface, coloured by melting rate. The red cross denotes the centre of the cell.



Figure 4. Effect of asthenospheric flow on edge-related dynamics. (a) & (b)  $4 \text{ cm yr}^{-1}$  purely plate-driven scenario. (c) & (d) A case with additional shear in the asthenosphere, directed opposite to plate motion. (e) & (f) Similar to (c) & (d), but with asthenospheric shear aligned with plate motion direction. (g) & (h) Similar to (e) & (f), but with the coefficient of thermal expansion set to 0, thus negating edge-driven instabilities. All models are displayed after 20 Myr of model evolution. Graphics illustration as in Figure 3, with the horizontal component of velocity relative to that of a vertical transect through the centre of the continent.

that of the profile beneath the centre of the continent (refer to Figure S3 for the full ve-350 locity field). In the purely plate-driven case (Figure 4a-b), the location of the 1640 K isotherm 351 indicates that instabilities develop at both steps, although a clear cell is only identifi-352 able adjacent to the left step. For this simulation, relative to the overlying plate, the Cou-353 ette flow-component associated with plate motion (Figure S2) drives asthenospheric ma-354 terial to the left. As such, at the left step, the instability is displaced sideways, away from 355 the step, and asthenospheric flow enhances the upwelling component of the edge-driven 356 cell. Conversely, at the right step, asthenospheric motion acts against the cell, with the 357 resulting downwelling driven horizontally below the continent. The differences between 358 left and right steps increase in proportion to the magnitude of imposed plate motion, as 359 reflected in Figure 5a-b where we plot the vertical component of velocity along a hor-360 izontal transect through the centre of each cell. These flow patterns explain why melt-361 ing is enhanced at the left step relative to the right (quantified in Figure 6a-d and dis-362 cussed further below). 363

Additional shear in the asthenosphere, in the direction opposite to plate motion 364 (Figure 4c-d), increases the aforementioned contrast in behaviour between left and right 365 steps. Under this scenario, both Couette and asthenospheric shear components act in 366 the same direction, relative to the overlying plate. As such, at the left step, edge-driven 367 convection, Couette flow and shear-driven flow combine to increase upwelling rates ('4 368 (-2) curve on Figure 5a). We note that the style of upwelling is modified – upwelling flow 369 becomes dominantly shear-driven, as reflected in the lateral displacement of the insta-370 bility and the limited depth extent of the edge-driven cell. Regardless, melting is enhanced 371 (both in intensity and spatial extent), with the melt region displaced away from the step. 372 Conversely, at the right step, Couette and shear-driven flow combine to drive material 373 beneath the continent, preventing upwelling (and melting) in this region. 374

The case where asthenospheric shear is aligned with the direction of plate motion 375 incorporates counteracting flow regimes: at the left step, the Couette component of flow, 376 associated with plate motion, acts to enhance the edge-driven cell, but the asthenospheric 377 shear component acts to dampen it, with opposite trends at the right step. Nonetheless, 378 as illustrated in Figure 4e-f, the asthenospheric shear component dominates on both steps, 379 forcing material below the continent and shutting off melting at the left step, but increas-380 ing upwelling rates and melting adjacent to the right step. Interestingly, across the pa-381 rameter space examined, the largest upwelling velocity recorded along the cell-centre tran-382 sects (Figure 5) occurs for this specific model ((4 (+2))) where Couette and shear com-383 ponents of flow counteract. In this case, the edge-driven instability is able to develop more 384 naturally: the drip descends more vertically and acquires a larger volume than in the '4 385 (-2)' case where flow components combine (compare Figure 4c with Figure 4f). We note 386 that relative motion between continental lithosphere and underlying asthenosphere is far 387 greater when they move in opposite directions (relative motion of  $5 \,\mathrm{cm}\,\mathrm{yr}^{-1}$  in case '4 388 (-2)' compared to 1 cm yr<sup>-1</sup> in case '4 (+2)', at 250 km depth – see Figure S2). As such, 389 EDC is able to operate alongside asthenospheric shear in case '4 (+2)', rather than be-390 ing completely dominated by it. Nevertheless, melting intensity is similar between these 391 two cases, albeit occurring over a smaller spatial extent in case '4 (+2)'. 392

To further highlight the delicate balance between different flow components, we il-393 lustrate in Figure 4g-h the temperature and flow fields for a case identical to (4 (+2)), 394 except that the coefficient of thermal expansion has been set to 0. As a result, temper-395 ature gradients no longer generate the density changes required to drive an edge insta-396 bility at either step. Consequently, the shear-driven flow simply dives beneath the continent at the left step and rises at the right step. However, it is noteworthy that, dur-398 ing the first  $\sim 7.5$  Myr, maximum upwelling velocities at the right step are elevated com-399 pared to the case that incorporates buoyancy, indicating that the descending edge-driven 400 instability partially counteracts shear-driven upwelling at this step (Figure S6). Over time, 401 this situation reverses: upwelling velocities increase for the case that does incorporate 402



Figure 5. Comparison of vertical velocity in the vicinity of the cell centre (see Figure S4 for computed locations) at the right step (if not specified) for the 2-D simulations examined herein. As instabilities develop over different time-scales for different cases, we identify the centre of the cell in each simulation (Figure S4) at the time of maximum downwelling velocity (Figure S5), prior to the onset of secondary instabilities, to provide a meaningful comparison. Each profile represents a 400 km horizontal transect passing through the centre of the cell. (a) & (b) Influence of background asthenospheric flow – 'Reference' corresponds to an enclosed simulation. At the right step, purely plate-driven cases do not develop a full circulating cell and, accordingly, velocity profiles are displayed at depths picked to allow for illustration of upwelling velocities in a way that is comparable to other cases. Moreover, the case with SDU only does not generate a cell at all and we use the cell centre from the equivalent case ('4 (+2)') to draw the profile to allow for a representative comparison. (c) Effect of step geometry – 'Reference' corresponds to '40 Myr Oce.', '200 km Step', '200 km Cont.', and a material boundary halfway along the step. (d) Role of viscosity – 'Reference' corresponds to a purely diffusion creep channel-free profile with a minimum viscosity of 10<sup>19</sup> Pa s.

buoyancy, as the instability grows, but upwelling velocities systematically decrease in the 403 SDU-only case, as the upper thermal boundary layer thickens through diffusion, reduc-404 ing the pressure difference between regions of thick and thin lithosphere. As a consequence, 405 after  $\sim 15$  Myr, the lid has sufficiently thickened to prevent any decompression melting in the SDU-only case (Figure 6c). The interplay between buoyancy and mantle flow at 407 lithospheric steps is further reflected in case '4 (+1)' (Figure 5a), for which asthenospheric 408 shear is sufficient to counteract the Couette component of flow: horizontal flow within 409 and just below the continent are of similar intensity (Figure S2). As a result, edge-driven 410 instabilities develop akin to these of the reference case, and a weak cell is observed at 411 the left step, despite it being strongly modulated by asthenospheric shear. Nevertheless, 412 the presence of a weak cell enhances melting as it focuses upwelling velocities at shal-413 lower depths, closer to the solidus. Taken together, these results highlight that there is 414 a threshold point at which EDC and SDU combine to maximise upwelling velocities ad-415 jacent to lithospheric steps. Where the shear-driven component is reduced, relative to 416 this point, upwelling velocities decrease. Conversely, where the shear-driven component 417 is increased, relative to this point, downwelling instabilities are unable to develop at litho-418 spheric steps and, accordingly, the contribution from EDC is eliminated and upwelling 419 is purely shear-driven. 420

We next compare the vigour of edge-driven instabilities across the remainder of our 421 parameter space. Although we have examined a broad suite of models, we focus on rep-422 resentative end-members for clarity. As illustrated in Figure 5c, geometric parameters 423 generally have only a moderate influence on the downwelling velocity, upwelling veloc-424 ity and cell width (i.e. the distance between maximum downwelling and upwelling speeds 425 along the profile) along these horizontal transects, with all profiles displaying similar char-426 acteristics. Nonetheless, in comparison to the reference case, the thinner continent ('140 km 427 Cont.') yields a smaller cell, both in depth and lateral extent, with peak downwelling 428 velocities reduced but peak upwelling velocities enhanced. Such differences arise primar-429 ily from the shorter continental guide at depth, which limits instability growth and down-430 welling velocities. As a result, flow circulation concentrates closer to the step and the 431 extent of horizontal motion beneath the lithosphere decreases, facilitating an earlier on-432 set of secondary instabilities. Accordingly, although peak upwelling velocities are initially 433 smaller, they eventually overcome those of the reference case. In general, we find that 434 increased space available along the continental guide (e.g. '20 Myr Oce.') and greater vol-435 umes of unstable oceanic lithosphere (e.g. '400 km Step' and ' $\frac{2}{3}$  Oce. Step') lead to slightly 436 stronger downwelling instabilities. Corresponding peak upwelling velocities, however, are 437 not necessarily higher, but the lateral extent of the cells increases. In Figure 5d, we il-438 lustrate the important role of upper mantle viscosity and its depth-dependence. At a min-439 imum viscosity of  $10^{20}$  Pa s no comparable cell forms over the simulation times examined. 440 The presence of a low-viscosity channel limits the vertical space over which an instabil-441 442 ity can develop and, accordingly, stabilises the lithosphere, reducing the intensity and scale of edge-driven instabilities. In the composite diffusion-dislocation creep regime, the 443 intensity of the cell is enhanced, as a result of lower viscosities in the vicinity of the drip: 444 a voluminous and focussed instability forms, generating a broad, robust upwelling (Fig-445 ure S7). 446

To understand how these flow patterns influence melting, we present both instan-447 taneous melting rates and cumulative melt diagnostics in Figure 6. Melting trends in cases 448 with plate motion and asthenospheric shear are generally consistent with the flow fields 449 highlighted above. For the first  $\sim 20 \,\mathrm{Myr}$  of model evolution, instantaneous melting rates 450 are enhanced at the left step for cases with plate motion, and further enhanced when favourable 451 asthenospheric shear is included. At the right step, plate-driven cases generate less melt-452 ing than the reference case, but favourable asthenospheric shear once again enhances melt 453 production. We note that a small amount of melting occurs at the left step for case '4 454 (+1), as expected from the flow field highlighted above. For all cases with plate motion 455 or asthenospheric shear, the onset of secondary instabilities is delayed and, hence, the 456



Figure 6. (a), (c), (e) & (g) Integrated melting rate measured at the right step (if not specified), as a function of time. Values correspond to the full integral in space of interpolated melting rates as recorded by particles. (b), (d), (f) & (h) Cumulative melt area, corresponding to the cumulative sum of melting rate additionally integrated in time. (a), (b), (c) & (d) Influence of asthenospheric flow – 'Reference' corresponds to an enclosed simulation. (e) & (f) Effect of step geometry – 'Reference' corresponds to '40 Myr Oce.', '200 km Step', '200 km Cont.', and a material boundary halfway along the step. (g) & (h) Role of viscosity – 'Reference' corresponds to a purely diffusion creep channel-free profile with a minimum viscosity of  $10^{19}$  Pa s.

lithospheric lid thickens more rapidly than in cases without shear. As a consequence, instantaneous melting rates drop below the reference case beyond ~20 Myr of model evolution – melting occurs over a shorter temporal duration for cases with a large component of asthenospheric shear. Such trends are further amplified in the absence of EDC,
as illustrated by the SDU only case.

We find that most of the alternative step geometries analysed generate a compa-462 rable 'melt area' to that of the reference case, apart from the thinner lid ('20 Myr Oce') 463 which enhances decompression melting (Figure 6e-f). Nonetheless, in the case of a wider 464 step ('400 km Step'), melting rates are  $\sim 50\%$  less than the reference case: the more gradual step generates a more-rounded cell, with upwelling flow less vertical at the LAB and, 466 accordingly, less intense melting. Geometries such as '140 km Cont.' promote a more rapid 467 onset of secondary instabilities, which thin the lithospheric lid and locally increase up-468 welling velocities. Such cases, therefore, initially display lower instantaneous melting rates, 469 but eventually melt more than the reference case. Finally, cases with a minimum vis-470 cosity of  $10^{20}$  Pas exhibit no, or very limited, melting, whilst the incorporation of a low-471 viscosity channel reduces melting rates significantly, as expected from the aforementioned 472 flow field (Figure 6g-h). In the composite viscosity regime, melting rates are higher for 473 the first  $\sim 15$  Myr of model evolution. However, the broader and more intense cell de-474 lays the onset of secondary instabilities (due to increased shear beneath the lithosphere) 475 and, thus, the cumulative melt curve flattens after  $\sim 15$  Myr, leading to a similar melt 476 area to that of the reference case after 30 Myr. 477

478

#### 3.2 Three-Dimensional Simulations

Our 2-D results highlight the importance of the orientation of asthenospheric shear
in controlling the flow regime and associated melt production at lithospheric steps. Nonetheless, the 2-D geometry limits the range of scenarios that can be examined. Accordingly,
we extend our analyses to 3-D, allowing for the incorporation of more complex geometries and greater flexibility in the orientation of asthenospheric flow. We separate our
results into cases that neglect (Section 3.2.1) or incorporate (Section 3.2.2) background
asthenospheric flow, respectively.

486

## 3.2.1 No Prescribed Asthenospheric Flow

We first examine the velocity field generated after 15 Myr: this is sufficient to cap-487 ture the development of primary instabilities whilst avoiding complications linked to the 488 onset of secondary instabilities, allowing us to focus upon 3-D effects that arise from more 489 complex continental geometries. Nonetheless, for completeness, we illustrate through Fig-490 ure S8, which is directly comparable to Figure 2, the development of secondary insta-491 bilities after 30 Myr in all 3-D geometries examined. Figure 7a displays the flow regime 492 for Case U400, which exhibits edge-driven instabilities of comparable intensity adjacent 493 to the entire continental boundary, except within the indent where darker red glyphs high-494 light more vigorous upwelling. At this location, the geometry of the interface between 495 ocean and continent brings upwelling flows associated with three adjacent steps into close 496 proximity: these coalesce (Figure S9a), enhancing upwelling velocities by as much as 70%497 in comparison to those in other parts of the domain (Table 3). 498

Figure 7b displays results for Case U600. Although similar high-intensity upwelling 499 velocities are present within the indent, they are restricted to the inner corners: in this 500 case, the distance between edge-driven cells exceeds the width of the cells and, accord-501 ingly, cells on opposite steps are unable to coalesce and influence each other to the same 502 extent as in Case U400 (Figure S9b). Figure 7c illustrates results from Case U400-Grad, 503 with a complementary cross-section presented in Figure S10. Consistent with our 2-D 504 cases (Figure 5c), downwelling velocities are enhanced adjacent to thicker parts of the 505 continent, with upwellings broader and marginally less vigorous. Figure 7d illustrates 506



flow patterns for Case Complex and clearly demonstrates that regions of anomalously thin continental thickness trigger localised and strong upwelling flows. However, only moderate downwelling flows develop adjacent to the anomalously thick continental area: continental material resists deformation through its higher viscosity. Instabilities along continental boundaries are consistent with those in Case U400-Grad, as expected.

We now analyse the cumulative melt production for these cases. Results, presented 512 in Figure 8, are expressed as a cumulative thickness, which results from the integration 513 of melting rates both in time (over 15 Myr) and along the vertical axis (Section 2.4). Most 514 515 melting occurs between 90 km and 120 km depth, consistent with the 2-D cases, except where the lithosphere is sufficiently thin to host shallower melting. For Case U400 (Fig-516 ure 8a), we observe three distinct melting trends: (i) weak melting, adjacent to the ex-517 ternal corners of the continent, producing less than  $\sim 0.12 \,\mathrm{km}$  of melt; (ii) moderate melt-518 ing, at external steps away from the corners, producing up to  $\sim 0.20 \,\mathrm{km}$  of melt; and (iii) 519 enhanced melting, within the indent, producing up to  $\sim 0.45$  km of melt, with the most 520 intense melting concentrated at the indent's inner corners. Full spatial integration around 521 the indent's lower-left corner (Figure 8a, 150 km-side black square) yields a cumulative 522 volume of  $\sim 3000 \,\mathrm{km^3}$  distributed over an area of  $\sim 15,600 \,\mathrm{km^2}$  (Table 3). Melt fractions 523 peak at 1%, consistent with our 2-D cases. These trends are as expected from the in-524 tensity of upwelling at these locations. 525

In Figure 8b, we illustrate the spatial distribution of melt obtained for Case U600. 526 We observe similar trends as for Case U400 and note, in particular, that comparable melt-527 ing is recorded adjacent to the indent's inner corners, despite weaker flow coalescence 528 (Figure S9), indicating that the geometry of the corners is sufficient to sustain melting. 529 For Case U400-Grad (Figure 8c), steps adjacent to thicker parts of the continent gen-530 erate around 30% more melt than those adjacent to thinner parts, with a gradient in 531 between, in agreement with Figure 6c – recall how the primary melting of '140 km Cont.', 532 relative to our reference case, is initially reduced, but eventually enhanced through the 533 action of secondary instabilities. Finally, for Case Complex (Figure 8d), trends at ex-534 ternal steps are consistent with Case U400-Grad. Within the continent, significant melt-535

Case	$\begin{array}{c} \text{Maximum} \\ \text{downwelling} \\ \text{inside}     \text{outside} \\ \text{indent}   (\text{cm}  \text{yr}^{-1}) \end{array}$	$\begin{array}{c} \text{Maximum} \\ \text{upwelling} \\ \text{inside}     \text{outside} \\ \text{indent}   (\text{cm}  \text{yr}^{-1}) \end{array}$	$\begin{array}{c} \text{Maximum melt} \\ \text{thickness}^a \\ \text{inside}     \text{outside} \\ \text{indent}   (\text{km}) \end{array}$	Melt volume <sup><math>b</math></sup> (km <sup>3</sup> ) & area <sup><math>c</math></sup> (km <sup>2</sup> ) at the indent's corner
U400	$-1.03 \mid -1.10$	$0.70 \mid 0.42$	$0.47 \mid 0.20$	2976 & 15,594
U600	$-1.01 \mid -1.11$	$0.67 \mid 0.42$	$0.47 \mid 0.20$	2977 & 15,861
U400-Grad	$-1.07 \mid -1.15$	$0.64 \mid 0.49$	$0.46 \mid 0.20$	2951 & 15,850
$\operatorname{Complex}^d$	$-0.61 \mid -1.17$	$0.87 \mid 0.48$	$0.70 \mid 0.20$	3936 & 15,256
Pos. x	$-0.97 \mid -1.40$	$1.31 \mid 0.84$	$0.66 \mid 0.33$	5646 & 20,044
Neg. x	$-1.13 \mid -1.41$	$0.39 \mid 0.92$	$0.21 \mid 0.35$	837 & 7389
Pos. y	-1.19   $-1.37$	$1.11 \mid 0.91$	$0.60 \mid 0.33$	$4676 \& 18,\!689$
Oblique	$-0.96 \mid -1.75$	$1.75 \mid 0.95$	$0.81 \mid 0.31$	8103 & 21,080

<sup>a</sup> Cumulative thickness over the first 15 Myr of model evolution, obtained by integration of the melting rate carried by particles both in time and along the vertical axis (Figures 8 and 10). <sup>b</sup> Integration of the cumulative thickness in both x and y directions; only nodes (Section 2.4) with a cumulative thickness greater than 0.04 km and that are closest to the bottom-left inner corner of the indent (e.g. black square in Figure 8a) are considered. <sup>c</sup> Area defined by the nodes considered in the melt volume calculation. <sup>d</sup> For the first three columns, 'inside | outside the indent' is swapped for 'inside | outside the continent', while the last column 'indent's corner' is replaced by 'right trough' (black rectangle in Figure 8d).

ing is restricted to the two anomalous troughs, in agreement with the vigorous upwellings
highlighted in Figure 7d. As a result of the initially thin continental lithosphere at these
locations (60 km in places, as opposed to 90 km for surrounding oceanic lithosphere), we
record up to 0.7 km of cumulative melt production, which is 50% higher than observed
at the indent's inner corners in Case U400. Additionally, melt volume within the right
trough, recorded over a similar area (Table 3), is 30% higher.



**Figure 8.** Cumulative melt production adjacent to the continent for cases without plate motion, after 15 Myr. Surface colours correspond to the depth of the 1620 K isotherm, our proxy for lithospheric depth; lithospheric erosion is identified by the grey tone, which depicts portions thinner than 100 km. Purple-to-yellow colours represent the cumulative melt production as obtained after integration along the vertical axis (Section 2.4); major locations of melting are indicated by the green tone. Black rectangles illustrate zones of interest used for calculations in Table 3. (a) Case U400. (b) Case U600. (c) Case U400-Grad. (d) Case Complex.

#### <sup>542</sup> 3.2.2 Prescribed Asthenospheric Flow

We next examine cases that incorporate prescribed asthenospheric flow and focus on how its orientation, relative to the continent, affects dynamical instabilities throughout the domain. We use Case U400 as our reference and systematically prescribe flow in the positive x, negative x, positive y, and both positive x and y (oblique) directions. We illustrate our results initially through the flow field (Figure 9) and, subsequently, through its influence on melting (Figures 10 and 11).

We find that velocities align with the prescribed inflow direction, in agreement with 549 2-D behaviour (Figure S3). Accordingly, to better highlight buoyancy-driven instabil-550 ities and allow for a consistent comparison with our 2-D cases, we modify the velocity 551 field such that, at all depths, horizontal components are relative to those sampled on a 552 vertical profile transecting through the centre of the continent. Figure 9a illustrates the 553 resulting dynamics when asthenospheric shear is prescribed in the positive x-direction. 554 Compared to Case U400 (Figure 7a), we observe enhanced upwelling velocities, increas-555 ing by up to  $\sim 90\%$  inside the indent and  $\sim 100\%$  where the asthenosphere flows away 556 from the continent (i.e. the trailing edge). Conversely, where the asthenosphere flows to-557 ward the continent (i.e. the leading edge), upwelling velocities are reduced substantially 558 by  $\sim 70$  %. The leading edge exhibits a clear downwelling, no associated upwelling, and 559 divergent flow at continental corners. Conversely, intense upwelling takes place along the 560 trailing edge and flow is convergent around the corners. Divergent and convergent flows 561 at the continent's external corners occur due to the higher pressure beneath the conti-562 nent, which drives material around continental margins and, accordingly, also contributes 563 toward upwelling flow at the continent's lateral edges. 564

Figure 9b illustrates the flow field resulting from prescribed inflow in the negative 565 x-direction. Trends are generally identical to the previous case on leading, trailing and 566 outer lateral steps. However, upwelling velocities within the indent are no greater than 567 those along the continent's lateral margins (Table 3): asthenospheric shear of this mag-568 nitude and orientation overcomes the dynamics of edge-driven convection imposed by 569 the indent's geometric configuration. In Figure 9c, we illustrate the effect of incorporat-570 ing shear in the positive y-direction. Both strong upwelling and downwelling velocities 571 are observed within the indent (compared to Figure 7a), as the flow first upwells from 572 below and then dives beneath the continent. Peak upwelling velocity is intermediate be-573 tween Case U400 and the positive-x inflow case. For our oblique case (Figure 9d), the 574 notion of leading and trailing edges evolves into the idea of pairs of edges adjacent to 575 leading and trailing corners. Accordingly, downwellings concentrate alongside outer edges 576 connected to the leading corner, whereas upwellings distribute adjacent to the opposite 577 edges. Within the indent, we observe intense upward motion. Flow within the astheno-578 sphere is favourably oriented to enhance upwellings at both steps adjacent to the lower-579 left inner corner (Figure 10d). Consequently, the vertical velocities recorded are the largest 580 across all cases examined, a  $\sim 250\%$  increase relative to Case U400. 581

We next analyse the cumulative melt production for these cases. In Figure 10a, we 582 recover the three melting trends previously described for our reference 3-D case (Case 583 U400). However, relative to the reference case, melting is absent at the continent's lead-584 ing edge and enhanced at its trailing edge (by  $\sim 65\%$ ). Inside the indent, the maximum 585 melt thickness increases by  $\sim 40\%$  relative to Case U400, and melting takes place over 586 a larger area, leading to a  $\sim 90\%$  increase in local melt volume (Table 3). Inflow prescribed 587 in the opposite direction (Figure 10b) yields similar trends at leading, trailing and lat-588 eral edges. In this case, melt production inside the indent is comparable to that observed 589 at the continent's lateral edges and is less than that observed at the trailing edge. The 590 calculated melt volume at the indent's lower-left corner falls to  $\sim 840 \,\mathrm{km}^3$ , equivalent to 591 a  $\sim 70\%$  decrease from Case U400. For inflow in the positive v-direction (Figure 10c), 592 the distribution of melt production corresponds closely to locations of upwelling flow, 593 especially within the indent where the recorded melt volume at the lower-left inner cor-594





ner represents  $\sim 80\%$  of that measured for the positive-x inflow. For our oblique case (Fig-595 ure 10d), melting is absent at the pair of edges adjacent to the leading corner. At op-596 posite edges, melt production is marginally lower than at a trailing edge experiencing 597 purely normal flow (e.g. in the case of positive x-inflow) but still noticeably higher than 598 at a comparable edge in the absence of asthenospheric flow (e.g. Case U400). As expected 599 from the velocity field, a large area around the lower-left inner corner of the indent dis-600 plays intense melt production, up to  $\sim 70\%$  higher than in Case U400. The calculated 601 cumulative melt volume in this region is  $\sim 270 \%$  higher than Case U400 and is the high-602 est recorded across the parameter space examined. 603



**Figure 10.** Cumulative melt production adjacent to the continent for cases with prescribed inflow, after 15 Myr. Graphic illustration is similar to Figure 8. Additionally, large white arrows represent both the direction of plate motion and the direction of asthenospheric flow relative to the continent, thereby pointing from the leading edge to the trailing edge. (a) Positive x. (b) Negative x. (c) Positive y. (d) Oblique.

Finally, we compare the spatial distribution of melts produced in our 3-D cases that 604 incorporate asthenospheric flow (Figure 10) with Case U400 (Figure 8a). For each panel 605 in Figure 10, we subtract the melt production from Figure 8a and illustrate the result 606 in the corresponding panel of Figure 11. We make several important observations: (i) 607 the leading edge of a continent is identified by a substantial decrease in melt production 608 (dark pink colours) as material descends beneath the continent; (ii) trailing edges dis-609 play an increase in melt production (green tones) as material rises from beneath the con-610 tinent; (iii) lateral edges see no significant change in melt production; and (iv) the ef-611 fect of flow direction is reflected in melting locations within the indent, with melting in-612



Figure 11. Relative production of melt between cases with prescribed inflow and Case U400. Each panel is generated as a difference between the corresponding panel in Figure 10 and Figure 8a; values in the range -0.02 km to 0.02 km are not represented. Pink tones denote areas where melting is weakened by asthenospheric flow, while green tones highlight zones of enhanced melting. Large white arrows are consistent with Figure 10. (a) Positive x. (b) Negative x. (c) Positive y. (d) Oblique.

creasing significantly where interactions between upwelling currents are facilitated by the geometric configuration.

#### 615 4 Discussion

We have quantitatively examined mantle flow and melt generation in the vicinity of lithospheric steps, using a suite of 2-D and 3-D numerical models. Our models reveal the dominant controls on edge-driven convection (EDC) and shear-driven upwelling (SDU), how these shallow processes interact, and under which conditions they can be linked to intra-plate volcanism.

We find that EDC is strongly sensitive to uppermost mantle viscosity and its depth 621 dependence. At minimum viscosities  $\geq 10^{20}$  Pa s, only weak edge-driven cells develop over 622 the timescales of our simulations. If low viscosities are restricted to a narrow astheno-623 spheric channel, the length-scale and vigour of edge-driven cells are reduced. These find-624 ings are consistent with several previous studies, which report that significant small-scale 625 convection only develops at viscosities of less than  $10^{19}$ - $10^{20}$  Pas (e.g. van Hunen et al., 626 2003; Currie et al., 2008; Le Voci et al., 2014; Davies et al., 2016). We find that the ge-627 ometry and material properties of the step are also important in controlling EDC. Con-628 tinental lithosphere guides downwelling flow and, thus, cases with deeper continental guides 629 drive larger-scale cells. Other geometrical parameters, including the width of the step, 630 the age (thickness) of oceanic lithosphere and the location of the interface between con-631 tinent and ocean along the step, control the volume of lithospheric instabilities and, hence, 632 the rate at which they develop and the vigour of the resulting cell. These findings build 633 on those across a number of previous studies (e.g. Farrington et al., 2010; Till et al., 2010; 634 Ballmer et al., 2011; Davies & Rawlinson, 2014; Kaislaniemi & van Hunen, 2014; Rawl-635 inson et al., 2017). 636

By analysing EDC in the presence of plate-motion and asthenospheric shear, we 637 have been able to shed light on how EDC and SDU interact. In 2-D, we find that Cou-638 ette flow, induced by plate-motion, can enhance EDC where the asthenosphere flows away 639 from the lithospheric step and suppress it where the asthenosphere flows toward the step. 640 Depending upon its orientation, the addition of further asthenospheric shear can enhance 641 or diminish the contrast in dynamics between leading and trailing continental edges. Where 642 both processes combine, we find that melting is enhanced, even if the contribution from 643 EDC is minimal. Under this scenario, EDC drives a small-scale upwelling at shallow depths, 644 close to the step (e.g. Figure 4c), which enhances decompression melting. We empha-645 size that there is a threshold beyond which SDU dominates and EDC is suppressed: in 646 our models with an imposed surface velocity, we find that EDC is largely overcome when 647 relative motion between the continent and underlying asthenosphere exceeds  $\sim 2 \,\mathrm{cm}\,\mathrm{yr}^{-1}$ . 648 At this stage, downwelling instabilities cannot drip vertically and are swept horizontally, 649 with the morphology of upwelling flow also modified as a result. Although we have not 650 undertaken an exhaustive parameter space study, we note that this threshold is sensi-651 tive to a number of parameters, including the geometry and material properties of the 652 step, as well as uppermost mantle viscosity and its depth-dependence. Interestingly, as 653 one approaches this threshold point, the negative buoyancy of lithospheric material at 654 the step partially counteracts shear-driven upwelling: at times, upwelling velocities at 655 depth are reduced in comparison to cases where buoyancy is not considered (Figure S6). 656

In 3-D, we find that the distribution of lithospheric steps and their relative orientation exert a key control on the system's dynamics: edge-driven cells at steps that are in close proximity can coalesce and, thereby, enhance and localise upwelling flow, with our models yielding upwelling velocities that are up to  $\sim 70$  % higher than would otherwise be the case – this corroborates the conclusions of Davies and Rawlinson (2014). In addition, cells are strongly sensitive to the orientation of background mantle flow. Consistent with our 2-D results, we find that edge-driven upwelling currents are strength-

ened through SDU where asthenospheric mantle flows away from the continent, but are 664 suppressed where the asthenosphere flows toward the continent. Moreover, where astheno-665 spheric flow is parallel to a lithospheric step, the modulation of edge-driven instabilities 666 by asthenospheric shear does not strongly affect melting. We emphasise, however, that 667 this may not be the case with more vigorous asthenospheric flow than examined herein. 668 Our results demonstrate that, although lithospheric steps are an essential prerequisite 669 for the development of edge-driven cells, the orientation and strength of asthenospheric 670 flow determines whether or not these cells can form, their spatial extent and, ultimately, 671 the location and degree of decompression melting. As an example, even though the struc-672 ture of the indent is consistent across all 3-D cases examined, the orientation of the ve-673 locity field, relative to the continent, either promotes or impedes magmatism, leading 674 to an order of magnitude variation in cumulative melt production at the indent's lower-675 left corner (Table 3). 676

The strong sensitivity of EDC and the associated melting to asthenospheric flow 677 has important implications for our understanding of spatial and temporal patterns of intra-678 plate volcanism at lithospheric steps. Importantly, our results imply that magnatism, 679 generated in the presence of SDU, should be shorter-lived than that induced by EDC, 680 given that increased shear at the LAB delays the development of secondary instabilities, 681 which this overlying lithosphere and, thus, prolong decompression melting. In addition, 682 we find that magmatism induced by SDU is displaced further away from lithospheric steps, 683 in the direction of asthenospheric shear. In Earth's vigorously convecting mantle, astheno-684 spheric flow directions and magnitudes are likely to be time-dependent (e.g. Coltice et 685 al., 2018; Iaffaldano et al., 2018; Coltice et al., 2019), with a strong sensitivity to changes 686 in plate motion (e.g. Müller et al., 2016) and the shallow Poiseuille component of mantle flow (e.g. Phipps Morgan et al., 1995; Höink et al., 2011; Stotz et al., 2017, 2018). 688 Our simulations suggest that these changes in asthenospheric flow directions and mag-689 nitudes will strongly modulate edge-driven cells and the associated magmatism. To il-690 lustrate this further, in Figure S11 we present results from an additional 3-D simulation, 691 where the direction of plate motion and asthenospheric shear is rotated by  $90^{\circ}$  after 16 Myr. 692 Under such a scenario, edge-driven flow and the associated magmatism could be enhanced, 693 reduced or even suppressed, within only a few million years of the plate motion change, 694 at any given location along a lithospheric step. In particular, an edge that was originally 695 orientated parallel to asthenospheric mantle flow records a clear and substantial increase 696 (decrease) in melt production as it has transitioned to a trailing (leading) edge. We note 697 that these trends are visible in our melting diagnostics within only a few million years 698 of the plate motion change (Figure S11b-c). It is noteworthy that the original leading 699 edge does not display a substantial increase in melt production following the plate mo-700 tion change, suggesting a longer lag for steps dominated by downwelling currents prior 701 to a change in the asthenospheric flow direction, thus pointing towards a history depen-702 dence in the system. The history of mantle flow, therefore, becomes important to un-703 derstanding why specific locations generate magmatic trends that deviate from their ex-704 pected behaviour based upon present-day estimates of lithospheric geometries, plate mo-705 tion and asthenospheric flow directions. This reinforces the notion that volcanic provinces 706 likely controlled by EDC and SDU will be comparatively short lived and time-dependent. 707 We note that these mechanisms are in addition to those identified in previous studies 708 that lead to a periodicity in edge-driven melting (e.g. Kaislaniemi & van Hunen, 2014). 709

Our study builds on and complements previous studies, for example, Till et al. (2010) 710 and Davies and Rawlinson (2014), by (i) examining the interaction between EDC and 711 asthenospheric shear over a wider range of asthenospheric flow intensities, distributions 712 and orientations; (ii) examining more complex lithospheric structures and step geome-713 tries in 3-D, which allow for the coalescence and localisation of upwelling; (iii) incorpo-714 rating an improved treatment of mantle melting that accounts for melt history using La-715 grangian particles; and (iv) accounting for the time-dependence of these systems, which 716 differs from the instantaneous flow models of Davies and Rawlinson (2014). Nonethe-717

less, consistent with these, and other, studies, our results support EDC and SDU as vi-718 able mechanisms for intra-plate volcanism in the vicinity of lithospheric steps, partic-719 ularly where the geometry, material properties and orientation of these steps, relative 720 to each other and asthenospheric mantle flow, are favourable. Over 15 Myr of model evo-721 lution, our simulations neglecting the role of asthenospheric shear predict melt thicknesses 722 of up to 0.20 km adjacent to continental margins, up to 0.47 km at an indent's inner cor-723 ner, and  $0.70 \,\mathrm{km}$  inside the anomalous continental trough of our more complex LAB case 724 (Table 3). When asthenospheric flow is incorporated, trailing edges, where the astheno-725 sphere flows away from the continent, record up to  $0.35 \,\mathrm{km}$ , while production at the in-726 dent's inner corners increases up to 0.81 km. Although melt volumes recorded adjacent 727 to the indent's inner corners are reasonably consistent for all cases that neglect astheno-728 spheric flow ( $\sim 3000 \,\mathrm{km^3}$ ), they are strongly modulated by the orientation of astheno-729 spheric flow when it is present: up to  $\sim 8100 \,\mathrm{km^3}$ , within an area of  $\sim 21,100 \,\mathrm{km^2}$  (Ta-730 ble 3), is predicted for the 3-D oblique case over 15 Myr of model evolution. Such a vol-731 ume corresponds to a mean magmatic production rate of  $\sim 0.54 \,\mathrm{km^3 \, kyr^{-1}}$ . We note that 732 these rates are further modulated by secondary instabilities. 733

Our predicted melt volumes and melting rates suggest that, in isolation, EDC and SDU are suitable mechanisms only for Earth's lower-volume intra-plate volcanic provinces. Taking into account the sensitivity of melting to the thickness of the overlying lid (Figure 6c), the composition and water content of upper-mantle rocks, in addition to the potential impact of rheological uncertainties in our models (as indicated by different melting rates in our diffusion versus composite viscosity models), our results suggest that EDC



Figure 12. Long-term eruptive flux for a selection of intra-plate volcanic fields (building on van den Hove et al., 2017). Vertical grey arrows indicate the expected long-term flux that can be accounted for by given melt-generating mechanisms; we infer that mantle plumes are required to explain the largest fluxes observed. Values for province fluxes are taken from van den Hove et al. (2017), or as follows: Kilauea (Dvorak & Dzurisin, 1993), Iceland (Thordarson & Höskuldsson, 2008), Piton de la Fournaise (Roult et al., 2012), Cape Verde (Holm et al., 2008), Siroua (Missenard & Cadoux, 2012).

or SDU, in isolation, can account for magmatic production rates of up to  $\sim 1 \,\mathrm{km^3 \, kyr^{-1}}$ , 740 whilst EDC enhanced by SDU should sustain up to  $\sim 2.5 \,\mathrm{km^3 \, kyr^{-1}}$ , the latter value be-741 ing a simple  $\times 2.5$  increase as deduced from Table 3. Accordingly, such shallow processes 742 cannot explain, for example, eruptive rates at Earth's largest intra-plate volcanic provinces, 743 including the Hawaiian Ridge, Iceland, Reunion and Cape Verde, where effusion rates 744 exceed  $10 \,\mathrm{km^3 \, kyr^{-1}}$  (e.g. Dvorak & Dzurisin, 1993; Thordarson & Höskuldsson, 2008; 745 Holm et al., 2008; Roult et al., 2012). However, as illustrated in Figure 12, the magmatic 746 rates predicted herein are comparable to those determined from field observations at a 747 number of Earth's smaller intra-plate volcanic provinces, including the Newer Volcanics 748 Province of Victoria and South Australia, the old Springerville volcanic field within the 749 Southern Colorado Plateau, and the Siroua volcanic field of the Morrocan Atlas Moun-750 tains, all of which lie in close proximity to step-changes in lithospheric thickness and ex-751 hibit a long-term eruptive flux smaller than  $0.2 \,\mathrm{km^3 \, kyr^{-1}}$  (e.g. Condit et al., 1989; Mis-752 senard & Cadoux, 2012; van den Hove et al., 2017; Cas et al., 2017). 753

It is important to emphasise that such comparisons should be nuanced and are in-754 dicative only. Firstly, our models yield magmatic fluxes at depth, whereas observations 755 focus on eruptive fluxes at the surface. In addition, many of our chosen model param-756 eters may not be appropriate at a given location. For example, in our 3-D simulations, 757 we set the initial depth of oceanic lithosphere to  $\sim 90$  km, which increases over time through 758 thermal diffusion – most of the aforementioned provinces are located above thinner litho-759 sphere, which would increase predicted melting rates and volumes (e.g. Davies & Rawl-760 inson, 2014; Priestley et al., 2018). Furthermore, all numerical models have limitations, 761 and some of our model assumptions may influence results. In particular: 762

- 1. In our melting calculations, for simplicity, we assume a peridotitic composition 763 magmatism may be locally enhanced (or reduced) through the presence of more 764 enriched (or depleted) compositions. Furthermore, we assume a wet peridotite batch 765 melting parameterisation and make no attempt to simulate the dynamics of melt 766 transport and extraction. Whilst melt extraction has been considered in other mod-767 elling studies (e.g. Ballmer et al., 2011; Jain et al., 2019), the strategies used to 768 model this process remain under development, particularly in the context of single-769 phase Stokes flow. 770
- Although our models capture the effect of latent heating, they do not include direct feedbacks between melting and key material properties, such as density and
  viscosity. The low melting rates observed in our simulations, however, suggest that
  such feedbacks will have only a minor impact on our model predictions.
- 7753. We model the continent as a rigid and viscous block, that is not dramatically im-<br/>pacted by edge-driven processes. It is possible that parts of the continental edge777behave weakly, modifying the edge-driven process and associated melting (e.g. Liu<br/>& Chen, 2019).
- 4. Our study has focused on simulations with short evolution times, to isolate the 779 sensitivity of EDC and SDU to the controlling parameters examined. In reality, 780 lithospheric steps, particularly those at cratonic margins, are likely long-lived (e.g. 781 Hoggard et al., 2020). Simulations with longer evolution times develop secondary 782 instabilities that make it more challenging to isolate the signals highlighted herein. 783 However, as illustrated in Figure S12 which compares both flow dynamics and melt-784 ing patterns for Case U400 after 15 Myr and 30 Myr, the first order trends that 785 we predict should remain consistent, with melting enhanced within the indent rel-786 ative to external steps. 787
- 5. The strength and scale of edge-driven cells in our simulations is strongly dependent on the magnitude and depth-dependence of viscosity, which remain uncertain (e.g. Korenaga & Karato, 2008; Paulson & Richards, 2009; Iaffaldano & Lambeck, 2014; Rudolph et al., 2015). Nonetheless, we have examined the sensitivity

of our results under a range of different scenarios, all of which are within the estimated range (e.g. Iaffaldano & Lambeck, 2014; Lau et al., 2016).
6. We neglect other important aspects of mantle convection, including compressibil-

ity, phase transitions, global mantle flow and the impact of mantle plumes (e.g. Tackley et al., 1993; Gassmöller et al., 2020).

Each of these points requires further investigation to quantify their effect on the 797 flow field and associated melting diagnostics. Nonetheless, our results suggest that EDC 798 and SDU are capable of generating magmatic rates of  $0.1-2.5 \,\mathrm{km^3 \, kyr^{-1}}$  under favourable 799 conditions. As illustrated in Figure 12, this is compatible with eruptive rates determined 800 for a number of intra-plate volcanic provinces on Earth that lie adjacent to step-changes 801 in lithospheric thickness, supporting EDC and SDU as viable mechanisms. At other provinces, 802 where substantially enhanced melting rates are measured, alternative mechanisms, such 803 as mantle plumes, are likely more applicable. Additionally, there is increasing evidence 804 that the shallow mechanisms examined herein interact with upwelling mantle plumes at 805 some locations to produce complex volcanic patterns at the surface (e.g. Davies et al., 806 2015; Rawlinson et al., 2017; Kennett & Davies, 2020). Understanding these interactions 807 is an important avenue for future research. 808

#### 5 Conclusion

795

796

This study systematically documents the behaviour of EDC and SDU in 2-D and 3-D geodynamical models. Our 2-D simulations demonstrate that EDC, which results from the negative buoyancy of lithospheric mantle adjacent to a rigid continental block at a lithospheric step, is sensitive to the geometry and material properties of that step, in addition to the upper mantle viscosity profile – given sufficient space, EDC cells can develop at viscosities below 10<sup>20</sup> Pa s. Furthermore, we have highlighted how EDC can be enhanced, suppressed or, under certain conditions, completely eclipsed by SDU.

By examining the interaction between EDC and SDU in 3-D, we have demonstrated 817 that edge-driven cells developing at adjacent lithospheric steps can modulate each other 818 to enhance and localise upwelling. Additionally, flow in the asthenosphere can either in-819 tensify or weaken edge-driven upwellings, depending on the intensity of asthenospheric 820 currents and their orientation relative to the moving continent. In our models, these flow 821 patterns control the observed melting trends: increased melting occurs at locations of 822 intense upwelling. Our predicted melt volumes suggest that, in the absence of potential 823 interactions with mantle plumes, EDC and SDU are viable mechanisms only for Earth's 824 shorter-lived and lower-volume intra-plate volcanic provinces. Altogether, our results il-825 lustrate the importance of local variations in lithospheric thickness and the orientation 826 and magnitude of asthenospheric flow in controlling the location and timing of EDC and 827 SDU-generated intra-plate volcanism. Most importantly, although changes in lithospheric 828 thickness provide a favourable setting for EDC, edge-driven cells can be enhanced, dis-829 placed or overwhelmed by asthenospheric flow. As such, our study helps to explain why 830 step changes in lithospheric thickness, which are common along cratonic edges and pas-831 sive margins, only produce volcanism at isolated points in space and time. 832

#### **Acknowledgments**

T.D. is funded by an ANU PhD Scholarship (International) Full-Time (737/2018). D.R.D.

acknowledges support from the Australian Research Council (ARC), under FT140101262.

C.R.M is funded by an Australian Government Research Training Program Domestic

Scholarship. D.R.D., S.C.K. and T.D. acknowledge support from the ARC under DP170100058.

<sup>838</sup> Numerical simulations were undertaken on the NCI National Facility in Canberra, Aus-

tralia, which is supported by the Australian Commonwealth Government. The Fluid-

<sup>840</sup> ity computational modelling framework, including source code and documentation, is avail-

able from https://fluidityproject.github.io/; the latest release (tag 4.1.18), which

was used for the simulations presented herein, has been archived at Zenodo (Kramer et 842 al., 2021). Similarly, example input files required to reproduce the simulations presented 843 herein have been made available (Duvernay, 2021). The authors are grateful to two anony-844 mous reviewers for their constructive and detailed comments, which led to significant im-845 provements in the manuscript. Additionally, we would like to thank Patrick Ball, Brian 846 Kennett, Ian Campbell, Nick Rawlinson, Caroline Eakin, Marthe Klöcking, Siavash Ghe-847 lichkan and Cian Wilson for fruitful discussions at various stages of this research. Fig-848 ures have been prepared using Matplotlib, ParaView and Inkscape. 849

#### 850 **References**

873

874

883

885

- Afonso, J. C., Rawlinson, N., Yang, Y., Schutt, D. L., Jones, A. G., Fullea, J., &
  Griffin, W. L. (2016). 3-D multiobservable probabilistic inversion for the
  compositional and thermal structure of the lithosphere and upper mantle: III.
  Thermochemical tomography in the Western-Central US. Journal of Geophysical Research: Solid Earth, 121 (10), 7337–7370.
- Artemieva, I. M. (2009). The continental lithosphere: reconciling thermal, seismic, and petrologic data. *Lithos*, 109(1-2), 23–46.
- Ballmer, M. D., Conrad, C. P., Smith, E. I., & Johnsen, R. (2015). Intraplate volcanism at the edges of the Colorado Plateau sustained by a combination of triggered edge-driven convection and shear-driven upwelling. *Geochemistry*, *Geophysics*, *Geosystems*, 16(2), 366–379.
- Ballmer, M. D., Ito, G., Van Hunen, J., & Tackley, P. J. (2011). Spatial and tem poral variability in Hawaiian hotspot volcanism induced by small-scale convection. *Nature Geoscience*, 4(7), 457–460.
- Bianco, T. A., Conrad, C. P., & Smith, E. I. (2011). Time dependence of intraplate
  volcanism caused by shear-driven upwelling of low-viscosity regions within the
  asthenosphere. Journal of Geophysical Research: Solid Earth, 116(B11).
- Bredow, E., Steinberger, B., Gassmöller, R., & Dannberg, J. (2017). How plume ridge interaction shapes the crustal thickness pattern of the Réunion hotspot
   track. *Geochemistry, Geophysics, Geosystems, 18*(8), 2930–2948.
- Brent, R. P. (2013). Algorithms for minimization without derivatives. Courier Corporation.
  - Buck, W. R. (1986). Small-scale convection induced by passive rifting: the cause for uplift of rift shoulders. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 77(3-4), 362–372.
- Cas, R., Van Otterloo, J., Blaikie, T., & Van Den Hove, J. (2017). The dynamics of
  a very large intra-plate continental basaltic volcanic province, the Newer Volcanics Province, SE Australia, and implications for other provinces. *Geological Society, London, Special Publications*, 446(1), 123–172.
- Coltice, N., Husson, L., Faccenna, C., & Arnould, M. (2019). What drives tectonic
   plates? Science advances, 5(10), eaax4295.
- Coltice, N., Larrouturou, G., Debayle, E., & Garnero, E. J. (2018). Interactions of
   scales of convection in the Earth's mantle. *Tectonophysics*, 746, 669–677.
  - Condit, C. D., Crumpler, L., Aubele, J. C., & Elston, W. E. (1989). Patterns of volcanism along the southern margin of the Colorado Plateau: The Springerville field. Journal of Geophysical Research: Solid Earth, 94(B6), 7975–7986.
- Conrad, C. P., Bianco, T. A., Smith, E. I., & Wessel, P. (2011). Patterns of in traplate volcanism controlled by asthenospheric shear. Nature Geoscience,
   4(5), 317–321.
- <sup>889</sup> Conrad, C. P., Wu, B., Smith, E. I., Bianco, T. A., & Tibbetts, A. (2010). Shear <sup>890</sup> driven upwelling induced by lateral viscosity variations and asthenospheric
   <sup>891</sup> shear: A mechanism for intraplate volcanism. *Physics of the Earth and Plane-* <sup>892</sup> tary Interiors, 178(3-4), 162–175.
- Courtillot, V., Davaille, A., Besse, J., & Stock, J. (2003). Three distinct types of
   hotspots in the Earth's mantle. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 205(3-4),

295 - 308.895 Currie, C. A., Huismans, R. S., & Beaumont, C. (2008).Thinning of continental 896 backarc lithosphere by flow-induced gravitational instability. Earth and Plane-897 tary Science Letters, 269(3-4), 436-447. 898 Currie, C. A., & van Wijk, J. (2016). How craton margins are preserved: Insights 899 from geodynamic models. Journal of Geodynamics, 100, 144–158. 900 Davies, D. R., & Davies, J. H. (2009). Thermally-driven mantle plumes reconcile 901 multiple hot-spot observations. Earth and Planetary Science Letters, 278(1-2), 902 50-54.903 Davies, D. R., Davies, J. H., Hassan, O., Morgan, K., & Nithiarasu, P. (2007).904 Investigations into the applicability of adaptive finite element methods to two-905 dimensional infinite Prandtl number thermal and thermochemical convection. 906 Geochemistry, Geophysics, Geosystems,  $\mathcal{S}(5)$ . 907 Davies, D. R., Le Voci, G., Goes, S., Kramer, S. C., & Wilson, C. R. (2016).The 908 mantle wedge's transient 3-D flow regime and thermal structure. Geochemistry, 909 Geophysics, Geosystems, 17(1), 78–100. 910 Davies, D. R., & Rawlinson, N. (2014). On the origin of recent intraplate volcanism 911 in Australia. Geology, 42(12), 1031–1034. 912 Davies, D. R., Rawlinson, N., Iaffaldano, G., & Campbell, I. H. (2015). Lithospheric 913 controls on magma composition along Earth's longest continental hotspot 914 track. Nature, 525(7570), 511-514. 915 Davies, D. R., Wilson, C. R., & Kramer, S. C. (2011). Fluidity: A fully unstructured 916 anisotropic adaptive mesh computational modeling framework for geodynam-917 ics. Geochemistry, Geophysics, Geosystems, 12(6). 918 Demidjuk, Z., Turner, S., Sandiford, M., George, R., Foden, J., & Etheridge, M. 919 U-series isotope and geodynamic constraints on mantle melting pro-(2007).920 cesses beneath the Newer Volcanic Province in South Australia. Earth and 921 Planetary Science Letters, 261(3), 517–533. 922 Duncan, R. A., & Richards, M. (1991). Hotspots, mantle plumes, flood basalts, and 923 true polar wander. Reviews of Geophysics, 29(1), 31-50. 924 Patol75/Linking-Intra-Plate-Volcanism-to-Lithospheric-Duvernay, T. (2021).925 Structure-and-Asthenospheric-Flow: Submission to Geochemistry, Geo-926 physics, Geosystems. Zenodo. Retrieved from https://doi.org/10.5281/ 927 zenodo.4896782 doi: 10.5281/zenodo.4896782 928 Dvorak, J. J., & Dzurisin, D. (1993). Variations in magma supply rate at Kilauea 929 Volcano, Hawaii. Journal of Geophysical Research: Solid Earth, 98(B12), 930 22255-22268. 931 Farnetani, C. G., & Richards, M. A. (1995). Thermal entrainment and melting in 932 mantle plumes. Earth and Planetary Science Letters, 136(3-4), 251–267. 933 Farrington, R., Stegman, D., Moresi, L., Sandiford, M., & May, D. (2010). Inter-934 actions of 3D mantle flow and continental lithosphere near passive margins. 935 Tectonophysics, 483(1-2), 20–28. 936 French, S. W., & Romanowicz, B. (2015). Broad plumes rooted at the base of the 937 Earth's mantle beneath major hotspots. *Nature*, 525(7567), 95. 938 Garel, F., Goes, S., Davies, D. R., Davies, J. H., Kramer, S. C., & Wilson, C. R. 939 Interaction of subducted slabs with the mantle transition-zone: A (2014).940 regime diagram from 2-D thermo-mechanical models with a mobile trench and 941 an overriding plate. Geochemistry, Geophysics, Geosystems, 15(5), 1739–1765. 942

- Gassmöller, R., Dannberg, J., Bangerth, W., Heister, T., & Myhill, R. (2020). On
   formulations of compressible mantle convection. *Geophysical Journal Interna- tional*, 221(2), 1264–1280.
- Gibert, B., Seipold, U., Tommasi, A., & Mainprice, D. (2003). Thermal diffusivity
   of upper mantle rocks: Influence of temperature, pressure, and the deformation
   fabric. Journal of Geophysical Research: Solid Earth, 108(B8).
- Hirth, G., & Kohlstedt, D. (2004). Rheology of the upper mantle and the mantle

950	wedge: A view from the experimentalists. Inside the Subduction Factory, 138,
951	60-100.
952	lighthan S (2020) Clobal distribution of acdiment hosted metals controlled
953	human, S. (2020). Global distribution of sediment-nosted metals controlled by easter advantability. Nature Conscience, $12(7)$ , 504, 510
954	Höink T Jollingk A M fr Longridie A (2011) Viscous coupling at the
955	lithesphere asthenosphere houndary <i>Coophenistry Coophenies Coophenies</i>
956	19(10)
957	Holm P. M. Grandvuinet T. Friis, I. Wilson, I. B. Barker, A. K. & Plesner, S.
958	(2008) An 40Ar-39Ar study of the Cape Verde hot spot: Temporal evolution
959	in a semistationary plate environment <u>Journal of Geonhusical Research</u> : Solid
960	Earth 113(B8)
962	Iaffaldano G Davies D B & DeMets C (2018) Indian ocean floor deformation
963	induced by the Reunion plume rather than the Tibetan Plateau. Nature Geo-
964	science, 11(5), 362–366.
965	Iaffaldano, G., & Lambeck, K. (2014). Pacific plate-motion change at the time of
966	the Hawaiian-Emperor bend constrains the viscosity of Earth's asthenosphere.
967	Geophysical Research Letters, 41(10), 3398–3406.
968	Jain, C., Rozel, A. B., Tackley, P. J., Sanan, P., & Gerva, T. V. (2019). Grow-
969	ing primordial continental crust self-consistently in global mantle convection
970	models. Gondwana Research, 73, 96–122.
971	Jaupart, C., & Mareschal, J. (2005). Production from heat flow data. The Crust, 3,
972	65 - 84.
973	Jones, T., Davies, D. R., Campbell, I., Iaffaldano, G., Yaxley, G., Kramer, S., &
974	Wilson, C. (2017). The concurrent emergence and causes of double volcanic
975	hotspot tracks on the Pacific plate. Nature, $545(7655)$ , $472$ .
976	Kaislaniemi, L., & van Hunen, J. (2014). Dynamics of lithospheric thinning and
977	mantle melting by edge-driven convection: Application to Moroccan Atlas
978	mountains. Geochemistry, Geophysics, Geosystems, $15(8)$ , $3175-3189$ .
979	Katsura, T., Yoneda, A., Yamazaki, D., Yoshino, T., & Ito, E. (2010). Adiabatic
980	temperature profile in the mantle. Physics of the Earth and Planetary Interi-
981	ors, 183(1-2), 212–218.
982	Katz, R. F., Spiegelman, M., & Langmuir, C. H. (2003). A new parameterization of
983	hydrous mantle melting. Geochemistry, Geophysics, Geosystems, 4(9).
984	Kennett, B., & Davies, D. (2020). Intra-plate volcanism in North Queensland and
985	eastern new Guinea: A cryptic mantie plume? Gonawana Research, 79, 209–
986	Z10. King S. D. & Anderson D. I. (1008) Edge driven convection. Earth and Planetony.
987	King, S. D., & Anderson, D. L. (1998). Edge-driven convection. Earth and Fidneidry Science Letters 160(3.4) 280-206
988	Science Letters, $100(0-4)$ , $209-290$ .
989	tion in the upper mentle beneath cratons Science $200(5404)$ 1137–1140
990	Klöcking M White N Maclennan I McKenzie D & Fitton I (2018) Ouan-
991	titative relationships between basalt geochemistry shear wave velocity and
992	asthenospheric temperature beneath western North America Geochemistry
994	Geophysics. Geosustems, 19(9), 3376–3404.
995	Korenaga, J., & Karato, SI. (2008). A new analysis of experimental data on olivine
996	rheology. Journal of Geophysical Research: Solid Earth, 113(B2).
997	Kramer, S. C., Wilson, C., Davies, R., Mathews, C., Gibson, A., Duvernay, T.,
998	Ham, D. (2021). Fluidityproject/fluidity: Zenodo release. Zen-
999	odo. Retrieved from https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.4896641 doi:
1000	10.5281/zenodo.4896641
1001	Kramer, S. C., Wilson, C. R., & Davies, D. R. (2012). An implicit free surface algo-
1002	rithm for geodynamical simulations. Physics of the Earth and Planetary Interi-
1003	$ors, \ 194, \ 25-37.$
1004	Lachenbruch, A. H. (1970). Crustal temperature and heat production: Implications

1005	of the linear heat-flow relation. Journal of Geophysical Research, $75(17)$ , $3291$ –
1006	3300.
1007	Lau, H. C., Mitrovica, J. X., Austermann, J., Crawford, O., Al-Attar, D., & Laty-
1008	chev, K. (2016). Inferences of mantle viscosity based on ice age data sets:
1009	Radial structure. Journal of Geophysical Research: Solid Earth, 121(10),
1010	6991 - 7012.
1011	Lenardic, A., & Moresi, LN. (1999). Some thoughts on the stability of cratonic
1012	lithosphere: Effects of buoyancy and viscosity. Journal of Geophysical Re-
1013	search: Solid Earth, 104 (B6), 12747–12758.
1014	Le Voci, G., Davies, D. R., Goes, S., Kramer, S. C., & Wilson, C. R. (2014). A
1015	systematic 2-D investigation into the mantle wedge's transient flow regime and
1016	thermal structure: Complexities arising from a hydrated rheology and thermal
1017	buovancy. Geochemistry. Geophysics. Geosustems, 15(1), 28–51.
1018	Liu, D., & Chen, L. (2019). Edge-driven convection and thinning of craton litho-
1019	sphere: Two-dimensional thermal-mechanical modeling. Science China Earth
1020	Sciences, $62(12)$ , $2106-2120$ .
1021	Mathews C $(2021)$ Methods for tracking material properties within an unstruc-
1021	tured adaptive mesh computational modelling framework with application
1022	to simulating the development of seismic anisotrony at spreading centres and
1023	transform faults (Unpublished doctoral dissertation)
1024	University
1025	McKenzie D (1984) The generation and compaction of partially molten rock
1020	<i>Iournal of Petrology</i> 25(3) 713–765
1027	McLaron S. Sandiford M. Hand M. Noumann N. Wyborn I. & Bastrakova
1028	I = (2003) The hot southern continent: host flow and host production in Aus
1029	tralian Protorozoic torranos Special Papers geological Society of America
1030	157–168
1031	137-100. Missonard V & Cadoux A (2012) Can Maragaan Atlas lithespharis thinning and
1032	wissenard, 1., & Cadoux, A. (2012). Can Moroccan Atlas introspheric timining and volcanism be induced by edge driven convection? Terra Neva $2/(1)$ 27–33
1033	Mitrovica I X fr Forto A (2004) A new inference of mentle viscosity based upon
1034	ioint inversion of convection and glacial isostatic adjustment data <i>Farth and</i>
1035	Planetary Science Letters 005(1 2) 177-180
1030	Margan W. I. (1071). Convection plumos in the lower month. Nature $020(5292)$ .
1037	Morgan, W. J. (1971). Convection prunies in the lower manue. $Nature, 250(5288)$ ,
1038	42. Müller P. D. Seten M. Zahirovie S. Williams S. F. Matthewa K. I. Wright
1039	Numer, R. D., Seton, M., Zamrović, S., Winnams, S. E., Matthews, K. J., Winght,
1040	N. M., others (2010). Ocean basin evolution and global-scale plate reorga-
1041	Sciences // 107 128
1042	Sciences, 44, 107-138.
1043	Nicolaysen, L., Hart, R., & Gale, N. (1981). The Vredefort radioelement profile
1044	extended to supracrustal strata at Carletonville, with implications for con-
1045	tinental neat now. Journal of Geophysical Research: Solia Earth, 80 (B11),
1046	10003-10001.
1047	Parsons, B., & Sclater, J. G. (1977). An analysis of the variation of ocean floor
1048	bathymetry and heat flow with age. Journal of geophysical research, $82(5)$ ,
1049	803-827.
1050	Paulson, A., & Richards, M. A. (2009). On the resolution of radial viscosity struc-
1051	ture in modelling long-wavelength postglacial rebound data. Geophysical Jour-
1052	nal International, $179(3)$ , $1516-1526$ .
1053	Peacock, S. A. (1990). Fluid processes in subduction zones. Science, 248(4953),
1054	329–337.
1055	Phipps Morgan, J., Morgan, W. J., Zhang, YS., & Smith, W. H. (1995). Ob-
1056	servational hints for a plume-fed, suboceanic asthenosphere and its role in
1057	mantle convection. Journal of Geophysical Research: Solid Earth, 100(B7),
1058	12753 - 12767.
1059	Phipps Morgan, J., Parmentier, E., & Lin, J. (1987). Mechanisms for the origin of

1060	mid-ocean ridge axial topography: Implications for the thermal and mechani-
1061	cal structure of accreting plate boundaries. Journal of Geophysical Research:
1062	Solid Earth, $92(B12)$ , $12823-12836$ .
1063	Pollack, H. N., & Chapman, D. S. (1977). On the regional variation of heat flow,
1064	geotherms, and lithospheric thickness. Tectonophysics, $38(3-4)$ , 279–296.
1065	Priestley, K., McKenzie, D., & Ho, T. (2018). A lithosphere-asthenosphere
1066	boundary–a global model derived from multimode surface-wave tomography
1067	and petrology. Lithospheric discontinuities, 111–123.
1068	Putirka, K. (2016). Rates and styles of planetary cooling on Earth, Moon, Mars, and
1069	Vesta, using new models for oxygen fugacity, ferric-ferrous ratios, olivine-liquid
1070	Fe-Mg exchange, and mantle potential temperature. American Mineralogist,
1071	101(4), 819-840.
1072	Rawlinson, N., Davies, D. R., & Pilia, S. (2017). The mechanisms underpinning
1073	memory and good mamin medaling <u>Coordinate Records Letters</u> (1(10)
1074	19 19 19 19 19 19 19 19 19 19 19 19 19 1
1075	Bichards M A Duncan R A $\ell_z$ Courtillot V E (1080) Elood baselts and hot
1070	spot tracks: plume heads and tails Science $2/6(4926)$ 103–107
1077	Bichards M A Vang W-S Baumgardner J B & Bunge H-P (2001) Bole of
1070	a low-viscosity zone in stabilizing plate tectonics: Implications for comparative
1080	terrestrial planetology. Geochemistry. Geophysics. Geosustems, 2(8).
1081	Roult, G., Peltier, A., Taisne, B., Staudacher, T., Ferrazzini, V., Di Muro, A., et
1082	al. (2012). A new comprehensive classification of the Piton de la Fournaise
1083	activity spanning the 1985–2010 period. search and analysis of short-term pre-
1084	cursors from a broad-band seismological station. Journal of Volcanology and
1085	Geothermal Research, 241, 78–104.
1086	Rudolph, M. L., Lekić, V., & Lithgow-Bertelloni, C. (2015). Viscosity jump in
1087	Earth's mid-mantle. Science, 350(6266), 1349–1352.
1088	Sarafian, E., Gaetani, G. A., Hauri, E. H., & Sarafian, A. R. (2017). Experimen-
1089	tal constraints on the damp peridotite solidus and oceanic mantle potential
1090	temperature. <i>Science</i> , <i>355</i> (6328), 942–945.
1091	Schatz, J. F., & Simmons, G. (1972). Thermal conductivity of earth materials at
1092	high temperatures. Journal of Geophysical Research, 77(35), 6966–6983.
1093	Sengor, A., & Burke, K. (1978). Relative timing of rifting and volcanism on Earth $a_{11}$ and $b_{12}$ and $b_{13}$ and $b_{12}$ and $b_{12}$ and $b_{13}$ and b_{13} a
1094	and its tectonic implications. Geophysical Research Letters, $5(0)$ , $419-421$ .
1095	Stotz, I. L., Ianaidano, G., & Davies, D. R. (2017). Late Miocene Pacific plate kine-
1096	matic change explained with coupled global models of mantle and itnosphere
1097	Stotz I I Jaffaldana C & Davies D P (2018) Programs driven Deisenville flow
1098	A major component of the torque balance governing Pacific plate motion.
1099	nhusical Research Letters /5(1) 117–125
1100	Tackley P I Stevenson D I Glatzmaier G A & Schubert G (1993) Effects
1101	of an endothermic phase transition at 670 km depth in a spherical model of
1102	convection in the Earth's mantle. <i>Nature</i> , 361(6414), 699.
1104	Tatsumi, Y., Hamilton, D., & Nesbitt, R. (1986). Chemical characteristics of
1105	fluid phase released from a subducted lithosphere and origin of arc magmas:
1106	evidence from high-pressure experiments and natural rocks. Journal of Vol-
1107	canology and Geothermal Research, 29(1-4), 293–309.
1108	Thordarson, T., & Höskuldsson, Á. (2008). Postglacial volcanism in Iceland. Jökull,
1109	58(198), e228.
1110	Till, C. B., Elkins-Tanton, L. T., & Fischer, K. M. (2010). A mechanism for low-
1111	extent melts at the lithosphere-asthenosphere boundary. Geo-
1112	physics, Geosystems, 11(10).
1113	van den Hove, J. C., Van Otterloo, J., Betts, P. G., Ailleres, L., & Cas, R. A.
1114	(2017). Controls on volcanism at intraplate basaltic volcanic fields. Earth

- and Planetary Science Letters, 459, 36–47. van Hunen, J., Huang, J., & Zhong, S. (2003). The effect of shearing on the onset and vigor of small-scale convection in a Newtonian rheology. *Geophysical re*search letters, 30(19).
- Wilson, C. (2009). Modelling multiple-material flows on adaptive unstructured
   meshes (Unpublished doctoral dissertation). Imperial College London.
- Ye, Y., Schwering, R. A., & Smyth, J. R. (2009). Effects of hydration on thermal expansion of forsterite, wadsleyite, and ringwoodite at ambient pressure. *American Mineralogist*, 94(7), 899–904.

# Supporting Information for 'Linking Intra-Plate Volcanism to Lithospheric Structure and Asthenospheric Flow'

## DOI: 10.1002/2021GC009953

Thomas Duvernay<sup>1</sup>, D. Rhodri Davies<sup>1</sup>, Christopher R. Mathews<sup>1</sup>, Angus H.

## Gibson<sup>1</sup>, Stephan C. Kramer<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Research School of Earth Sciences, The Australian National University, Canberra, ACT, Australia

 $^{2}\mathrm{Department}$  of Earth Science and Engineering, Imperial College London, London, UK

## Contents of this file

- 1. Melting Parameterisation
- 2. Figures S1 to S12

Corresponding author: Thomas Duvernay, Research School of Earth Sciences, The Australian National University, 142 Mills Rd, Acton ACT 0200, Australia. (thomas.duvernay@anu.edu.au)

### Melting Parameterisation

McKenzie (1984) defined a framework to calculate the amount of melt produced through decompression at constant entropy. Writing the total differential of entropy as a function of temperature, pressure and melt fraction, the following two governing equations are obtained:

$$\frac{dF}{dP}\Big|_{S} = \frac{-\frac{c_{P}}{T}\frac{dT}{dP}\Big|_{F} + \frac{\alpha_{s}}{\rho_{s}} + F\left(\frac{\alpha_{f}}{\rho_{f}} - \frac{\alpha_{s}}{\rho_{s}}\right)}{\Delta S + \frac{c_{P}}{T}\frac{dT}{dF}\Big|_{P}},\tag{1}$$

$$\frac{dT}{dP}\Big|_{S} = \frac{\frac{\alpha_{s}}{\rho_{s}} + F\left(\frac{\alpha_{f}}{\rho_{f}} - \frac{\alpha_{s}}{\rho_{s}}\right) - \Delta S \frac{dF}{dP}\Big|_{S}}{\frac{c_{P}}{T}}.$$
(2)

In the above expressions, P, T and F represent the pressure, temperature and fraction of melt, respectively. The coefficient of thermal expansion, density and the specific heat at constant pressure are denoted by  $\alpha$ ,  $\rho$  and  $c_P$ , while S corresponds to entropy and  $\Delta S$  to the entropy of fusion. Subscripts s and f differentiate between the solid and fluid phase, respectively, while derivative sub-scripts indicate variables that are held constant.

In the absence of melting, Equations 1 and 2 become:

$$\left. \frac{dF}{dP} \right|_S = 0,\tag{3}$$

$$\left. \frac{dT}{dP} \right|_S = \frac{\alpha_s T}{\rho_s c_P}.\tag{4}$$

In particular, Equation 4 represents the temperature change of a parcel of rock ascending adiabatically through Earth's mantle. However, in our numerical models, we can already calculate a temperature change as we are solving the heat equation for temperature. To ensure consistency between the evolution of temperature obtained through the melting

framework and the thermal state of our model, we modify the framework's governing equations: we replace the adiabatic gradient term by the actual temperature gradient derived from the temperature field calculated by Fluidity. Mathematically, using thermodynamical identities, our modification translates to

$$\frac{\alpha}{\rho} = -\frac{dS}{dP}\Big|_{T} = \frac{dS}{dT}\Big|_{P}\frac{dT}{dP}\Big|_{S} \sim \frac{c_{P}}{T}\frac{dT}{dP}\Big|^{Fluidity}$$

and, in the absence of melting, it leads to

$$\left. \frac{dT}{dP} \right|_S \sim \left. \frac{dT}{dP} \right|^{Fluidity}.$$

Incorporating this change within Equations 1 and 2, we obtain the following system of coupled equations:

$$\frac{dF}{dP}\Big|_{S} = \frac{\frac{dT}{dP}\Big|_{F}^{Fluidity} - \frac{dT}{dP}\Big|_{F}^{Katz}}{\frac{T\Delta S}{c_{P}} + \frac{dT}{dF}\Big|_{P}^{Katz}}$$

$$\frac{dT}{dP}\Big|_{S} = \frac{dT}{dP}\Big|_{Fluidity}^{Fluidity} - \frac{T\Delta S}{c_{P}}\frac{dF}{dP}\Big|_{S}.$$
(5)

In the above expressions, derivative super-scripts signal where the expression/value for the derivative is sourced from.

## References

McKenzie, D. (1984). The generation and compaction of partially molten rock. *Journal* of Petrology, 25(3), 713–765.



Figure S1. Velocity inflow profiles considered in the study (solid lines) and their counterparts used to demonstrate equivalent flow patterns (dashed lines). The '4 (0)' profile is measured within the oceanic realm of the purely plate-driven model. The '4 (0) Simplified' profile corresponds to a step-like version of the '4 (0)' profile, with plate velocity imposed from the surface down to 90 km (our initial LAB), constant velocity imposed within the asthenosphere (where the integral of velocity is identical to the '4 (0)' profile over this depth range), and zero flow imposed in the lower mantle. Profiles '4 (-2)' and '4 (+2)' build on the '4 (0) Simplified' profile by adding 2 cm yr<sup>-1</sup> asthenospheric shear, either aligned with (+2) or opposite to (-2) plate motion. Profiles '4 (-2) Equivalent' are measured within the oceanic realm, from simulations where the '4 (-2)' and '4 (+2)' profiles are imposed at the inflow boundary.



Figure S2. Velocity profiles generated within the numerical domain when plate motion and, in some cases, additional asthenospheric shear, are prescribed. Specifically, the profiles displayed in Figure S1 are prescribed as inflow boundary conditions for different models, in addition to cases with increased ('6 (0)') or decreased ('2 (0)') plate velocities. The resulting flow field is sampled below oceanic lithosphere to the left of the continent (left), below the continent (centre) and below oceanic lithosphere to the right of the continent (right). Additionally, different rows display profiles measured at 1 Myr, 15 Myr and 30 Myr, respectively. We find that cases where simplified step-function profiles are imposed at the inflow boundary yield results that are practically indistinguishable from the smoother profiles. This demonstrates that results are largely insensitive to the depth-dependence of the inflow profile prescribed within the asthenosphere – the flow is redistributed in line with the underlying physics.



Figure S3. Effect of plate motion and asthenospheric flow on dynamics adjacent to lithospheric steps. The top row illustrates our  $4 \text{ cm yr}^{-1}$  purely plate-driven scenario, while the subsequent two rows display results following the addition of momentum within the asthenosphere, opposite to and aligned with plate motion, respectively. The bottom row is equivalent to the third row, except that the coefficient of thermal expansion has been set to 0; all models are displayed after 20 Myr. Graphic illustration similar to Figure 4, with glyphs only drawn where velocities exceed  $1 \text{ cm yr}^{-1}$ ; the velocity field is that directly output from the model.



**Figure S4.** Location of cell centres used as a basis for vertical velocity profiles in Figure 5, determined at the time of maximum downwelling velocity as illustrated in Figure S5. Cases with plate motion are corrected for plate advection through time.



Figure S5. Maximum downwelling velocity, as a function of time, at the right step (if not specified). The velocity field is analysed over an area surrounding the step, no deeper than continental depth. Each curve has a local minimum, which we use to determine the time at which we compare the vigour of edge-driven instabilities cases across our chosen parameter space (Figure 5). Such a strategy allows for a meaningful comparison between different cases. (a) Effect of step geometry. The inset compares the reference case to the composite rheology model and, therefore, belongs with the cases shown on panel b as indicated by the black arrow. (b) Role of viscosity. The inset corresponds to a zoom on the  $10^{20}$  Pas cases, with a similar aspect ratio as the original panel. (c) & (d) Influence of plate motion and asthenospheric shear.



Figure S6. Temporal evolution of the maximum upwelling velocity recorded at the right step for cases with additional asthenospheric shear of  $2 \text{ cm yr}^{-1}$  prescribed at the inflow boundary. Case '4 (+2)' incorporates both EDC and SDU mechanisms, while case '4 (+2) SDU Only' solely features SDU (the coefficient of thermal expansion is set to 0).



**Figure S7.** Dynamics (a-e) and melt production (f) compared between the reference case (a & c) and the model incorporating a composite rheology (b & d).



**Figure S8.** Topography at the LAB, as delineated by the 1620 K isotherm, for continental geometries used in 3-D simulations. Cases are illustrated after 30 Myr of model evolution. (a) Case U400. (b) Case U600. (c) Case U400-Grad. (d) Case Complex.



**Figure S9.** Influence of the indent's width on the flow dynamics, as observed after 15 Myr. Background colours represent temperature. Black dots depict the location of continental mantle. Arrow glyphs illustrate the velocity field and their colour indicates the strength of flow. Areas experiencing melting are represented as a superimposed surface, coloured by melting rate.



June 7, 2021, 5:58am



**Figure S11.** Melt production around the continent following a 90° change in prescribed plate motion and inflow direction at 16 Myr for the positive-x model. Large white arrows represent both the direction of plate motion and the direction of asthenospheric flow relative to the continent, and point from the continent's leading edge to its trailing edge. (a) Cumulative melt production after 12 Myr. (b) Cumulative melt production between 12 Myr and 16 Myr. (c) Cumulative melt production between 16 Myr and 20 Myr (i.e. immediately following the change in imposed flow direction). (d) Cumulative melt production between 16 Myr and 28 Myr.



**Figure S12.** Comparison of the flow dynamics and melt production adjacent to the continent over time for Case U400. Graphic illustration is similar to Figures 7 and 8. (a) Velocity field after 15 Myr. (b) Cumulative melt production after 15 Myr. (c) Velocity field after 30 Myr. (d) Cumulative melt production after 30 Myr.