Baseflow Age Distributions and Depth of Active Groundwater Flow in a Snow-Dominated Mountain Headwater Basin

Rosemary W.H. Carroll¹, Andrew H. Manning², Richard Gray Niswonger³, David W. Marchetti⁴, and Kenneth Hurst Williams⁵

¹Desert Research Institute
²United States Geological Survey
³U. S. Geological Survey
⁴Western State Colorado University
⁵Lawrence Berkeley National Laboratory (DOE)

November 22, 2022

Abstract

Deeper flows through bedrock in mountain watersheds could be important but lack of data to characterize bedrock properties and link flow paths to snow-dynamics limits understanding. To address data scarcity, we combine a previously published integrated hydrologic model of a snow-dominated, headwater basin with a new method for dating baseflow age using dissolved gas tracers SF, N, Ar. The original flow model produces shallow groundwater flow (median depth 6 m), very young stream water and is unable to reproduce observed SF concentrations. To match the observed gas data, bedrock permeability is increased to allow a larger fraction of deeper groundwater flow (median depth 110 m). Results indicate that interannual variability in baseflow age (3-12 y) is dictated by the volume of seasonal interflow. Deeper groundwater flow remains stable ($11.7\pm0.7 \text{ y}$) as a function of the ratio of recharge to bedrock hydraulic conductivity (R/K), where recharge is dictated by long-term climate and land use. With sensitivity experiments, we show that information gleaned from gas tracer data to increase bedrock hydraulic conductivity effectively moves this alpine basin away from shallow, topographically controlled groundwater flow with baseflow age relatively insensitive to water inputs (high R/K), and closer toward recharge-controlled conditions, in which a small shift toward a drier future with less snow accumulation will alter the groundwater flow system and increase baseflow age (low R/K). Work stresses the need to explore alternative methods characterizing bedrock properties in mountain basins to better quantify deeper groundwater flow and predict their hydrologic response to change.

Hosted file

wrr_age_rcarroll_si_rev01.docx available at https://authorea.com/users/363284/articles/ 599016-baseflow-age-distributions-and-depth-of-active-groundwater-flow-in-a-snowdominated-mountain-headwater-basin





Baseflow Age Distributions and Depth of Active Groundwater Flow in a Snow-Dominated Mountain Headwater Basin

3	
4	Rosemary W.H. Carroll ¹ , Andrew H. Manning ² , Richard Niswonger ³ , David Marchetti ⁴ ,
5	and Kenneth H. Willlams ^{5,6}
6	
7	¹ Desert Research Institute, Reno, NV 89512, USA; ² United States Geological Survey, Denver, CO; ³ United States
8	Geological Survey, Menlo Park, CA; ⁴ Western Colorado University, Gunnison, CO; ⁵ Lawrence Berkeley National
9	Laboratory, Berkeley, CA, USA; ⁶ Rocky Mountain Biological Laboratory, Gothic, CO 81224, USA
10	
11 12 13	<i>Correspondence to</i> : Rosemary W.H. Carroll (<u>Rosemary.Carroll@dri.edu</u>), Division of Hydrologic Sciences, Desert Research Institute, 2215 Raggio Parkway, Reno, NV 89512
14	Key Points:
15	• Gas tracer data in baseflow indicates deeper flow through bedrock is an important source
16	to mountain streams.
17	• Historic variability in baseflow age (3-12 y) is from interflow with groundwater
18	contributions stable (11.8±0.7 y).
19	• Precipitation defines groundwater age sensitivity, with flow paths getting deeper and
20	older in a slightly drier future.

22

Abstract. Deeper flows through bedrock in mountain watersheds could be important but lack of 23 data to characterize bedrock properties and link flow paths to snow-dynamics limits 24 understanding. To address data scarcity, we combine a previously published integrated 25 hydrologic model of a snow-dominated, headwater basin with a new method for dating baseflow 26 age using dissolved gas tracers SF₆, N₂, Ar. The original flow model produces shallow 27 groundwater flow (median depth 6 m), very young stream water and is unable to reproduce 28 29 observed SF_6 concentrations. To match the observed gas data, bedrock permeability is increased to allow a larger fraction of deeper groundwater flow (median depth 110 m). Results indicate that 30 interannual variability in baseflow age (3-12 y) is dictated by the volume of seasonal interflow. 31 Deeper groundwater flow remains stable (11.7±0.7 y) as a function of the ratio of recharge to 32 33 bedrock hydraulic conductivity (R/K), where recharge is dictated by long-term climate and land use. With sensitivity experiments, we show that information gleaned from gas tracer data to 34 35 increase bedrock hydraulic conductivity effectively moves this alpine basin away from shallow, topographically controlled groundwater flow with baseflow age relatively insensitive to water 36 37 inputs (high R/K), and closer toward recharge-controlled conditions, in which a small shift toward a drier future with less snow accumulation will alter the groundwater flow system and 38 39 increase baseflow age (low R/K). Work stresses the need to explore alternative methods characterizing bedrock properties in mountain basins to better quantify deeper groundwater flow 40 41 and predict their hydrologic response to change.

42

Plain Language Summary. Snow in mountain systems is an important water source but little is 43 understood how snow processes dictate groundwater flow paths, the age of water and its 44 45 sensitivity to climatic or land use change. We use a recently developed stream water gas-tracer 46 experiment in a steep mountain stream in a Colorado River headwater basin. A hydrologic model cannot match gas tracer data if groundwater flow is shallow, moving through the unconsolidated 47 material near land surface, because groundwater moves too quickly. Instead, groundwater must 48 follow deeper flow paths through the fractured granitic bedrock. A sensitivity analysis shows this 49 50 snow-dominated headwater basin is functioning near a precipitation threshold. With wetter conditions, little change occurs to groundwater flow paths and stream ages are insensitive to 51 changes in climate or forest removal. With small decreases in snowpack accumulation, 52

groundwater flow paths become increasingly deeper and older. Collecting stream water gas data
helped to identify groundwater sensitivity in this basin and to better understand its vulnerability
to change.

56

57 Keywords: stream water age, mountains; gas tracers; baseflow; hydrologic model; particle 58 tracking

59 **1 Introduction**

Baseflow represents stream water derived from both shallow and deep subsurface flow 60 paths that sustain stream discharge late in the season after precipitation or snowmelt events 61 cease. Baseflow is recognized as an important source to stream water in mountainous watersheds 62 (Gabrielli et al., 2012; Rumsey et al., 2015; Hale and McDonnell, 2016; Miller et al., 2016) and 63 reflects the integrated effects of surface processes controlling soil moisture and interflow, 64 groundwater recharge, the subsurface distribution of hydraulic conductivity, and the relative 65 importance of groundwater circulating to different depths. Interflow, or shallow flow through the 66 soil zone is typically ephemeral through either strong permeability contrasts or a seasonally 67 rising water table. Interflow reaching a stream network does so on the order of days to weeks. 68 69 Likewise, the release of bank storage during hydrograph recession moves water from the shallow subsurface into the stream relatively quickly. In contrast, saturated *groundwater* moving through 70 alluvial and bedrock units can have a wide range of flow paths and travel times reflective of 71 lithology, fracture networks and geologic structure (Heidbüchel et al., 2012). The time water 72 73 spends in the subsurface interacting with host material directly influences biogeochemical processes that control mineral weathering (Winnick et al., 2017), carbon dynamics (Brooks et 74 al., 2015; Perdrial et al., 2018), and the biologic integrety of the river network (Meyer et al., 75 2007; Missik et al., 2019). Subsurface residence time also indicates the degree of catchment 76 memory of past inputs to reflect hydrologic sensitivity to land use and climate change (McGuire 77 et al., 2005), and potential persistence of contamination (Mahlknecht et al., 2017). 78

There is a growing recognition that deeper parts of bedrock aquifers in mountain watersheds could be an important component of the watershed hydrologic system, transmitting and storing a larger amount of water and having a larger influence on stream biogeochemical

3

processes than previously appreciated. Extending the depth of hydrologically active groundwater 82 flow below the soil and saprolite zone to include groundwater movement through deeper, 83 unweathered bedrock are being discussed by (Condon et al., 2020), as are exploring the controls 84 on deeper groundwater flow paths (Markovich et al., 2019). However, the manner in which 85 climate, topography, vegetation, and geology in mountain watersheds affect subsurface flow and 86 resultant stream water age distributions remain poorly understood due to a lack of data 87 characterizing watershed-scale heterogeneity of snow distribution and melt dynamics (Deems et 88 al., 2006; Harpold et al., 2012), soil water and losses to evapotranspiration (Wang and 89 Dickinson, 2012; Allen et al., 2013), subsurface hydraulic properties (Meixner et al., 2016), and 90 active circulation depths (Frisbee et al., 2016). 91

Lumped parameter approaches have been applied to numerous catchments lacking 92 93 detailed hydrologic characterization (McGuire and McDonnell, 2006). The age of streamflow (or catchment transit time) is estimated by the convolution of time-varying inputs of an 94 environmental tracer (e.g., ³H, δ^{2} H, δ^{18} O, Cl) applied uniformly across a watershed and lagged 95 through the subsurface by assuming a travel time distribution (e.g. piston-flow, exponential, 96 gamma, Weibull, dispersion) that is adjusted to match observed tracer concentrations in 97 streamflow. Recently, lumped-parameter approaches have been developed that include time 98 variance in travel time distributions to address seasonal changes in flow pathways and 99 mobilization of stored water of varying age (Botter et al., 2011; van der Velde et al., 2012; 100 101 Harman, 2015). These analytical solutions have been applied to a variety of scenarios, including the influence of snow processes on streamflow (Fang et al., 2019) and selective vegetation 102 uptake (Smith et al., 2018). In contrast to these low-order modeling strategies, numerical 103 104 mechanistic models and particle tracking can include complex boundary conditions and directly represent physical and hydrological characteristics dictating catchment flow pathways that 105 determine the travel time distribution (Engdahl et al., 2016; Maxwell et al., 2016; Danesh-Yazdi 106 et al., 2018). These models provide a powerful platform to study basin sensitivity to changing 107 108 climate and other conditions, but their application in steep, mountainous basins is still limited by 109 data scarcity; with bedrock hydrologic data on permeability, porosity and flow rates extremely 110 rare, and complicated by the difficulty in characterizing fractured bedrock (Cesano et al., 2003) that are typically dominant in mountain basins. Lack of subsurface data in mountain systems 111 makes quantifying groundwater flow at depth and its relative importance in mountain hydrology 112

highly uncertain. This knowledge gap remains a major impediment to properly incorporating the
deeper subsurface flow system into our hydrologic models and assessing its relative importance
to limit our ability to predict how surface water quantity and quality might change under
changing climate or land conditions.

To address data scarcity inherent to mountain systems, we apply a method for dating 117 baseflow presented by Sanford et al. (2015) in which stream water N₂, Ar, SF₆ and CFC-113 118 observations are collected over a 12-hour period. The method's effectiveness has been 119 120 demonstrated in low-to-moderate-gradient streams, but has not been applied in high-gradient alpine systems where it could be hampered by higher gas exchange velocities (Solomon et al. 121 1998, Gleeson et al., 2018). We combine these gas tracer data with a previously published 122 hydrologic model of a snow-dominated, alpine headwater basin of the Colorado River (Carroll et 123 al., 2019). While simulated hydrology matches observed stream discharge, no directly observed 124 water table elevations or site-specific hydraulic properties of bedrock are available to constrain 125 126 where and to what depth hydrologically active groundwater flows. Our combined gas tracer and numerical modeling approach builds on previous work (Kolbe et al., 2016; Ameli et al., 2018) 127 128 by increasing scale of analysis and adding snow dynamics in space and time to explore the (i) relative importance of shallow versus deeper groundwater flow contributions to stream water in a 129 130 mountainous watershed as a function of baseflow age, (ii) principal controls on groundwater flow pathways, and (iii) sensitivity of groundwater flow pathways to climate and land use. 131

132 2 Site Description

133 The upper East River is a seasonally snow covered, mountainous watershed in the headwaters of the Upper Colorado River (Figure 1) located near Crested Butte, Colorado. A 134 comprehensive overview of the site is provided by others (Carroll et al., 2018; Hubbard et al., 135 2018). In brief, climate is continental subarctic and stream discharge is dominated by snowmelt 136 with peak flows occurring in early June and receding through the summer and fall. Monsoon 137 rains occur in the summer months and can cause small transient increases in stream flow. The 138 watershed is approximately 85 km², and contains pristine alpine, subalpine, montane and riparian 139 ecosystems. This study is focused on Copper Creek (24 km²), the largest tributary of the upper 140 East River. Land cover is predominantly barren alpine (50%) and conifer forests (36%) with 141

smaller representations of meadows, shrubs, and aspen. Elevations range from 2880 m to 4128 m. The upper portion of the watershed and adjacent peaks are underlain by Tertiary granodiorite. This younger, intrusive rock has upturned Paleozoic and Mesozoic sedimentary strata into steeply dipping hydrostratigraphic units that underlay the lower portion of Copper Creek (Figure 1b). Talus, rock glaciers and alluvial fans dominate surficial deposits within Copper Creek's glacially sculpted valleys (Gaskill et al., 1991). Descriptions of individual geologic units are provided in Table 1.

149 Hydrologic modeling of Copper Creek (Carroll et al., 2019) estimates average annual precipitation in Copper Creek is 1.39 ± 0.27 m/y of which $69\pm9\%$ is snow. Annually, the basin is 150 energy limited (potential ET < precipitation) with average ET losses equal to 36% of annual 151 precipitation. The bulk of ET is lost from the soil zone (67% ET) and lesser amounts are lost 152 153 from sublimation (13% ET), canopy evaporation (9% ET) and groundwater ET (11% ET). On average, stream water is 65% interflow and 35% groundwater, with interflow contributions 154 declining non-linearly with increased aridity due to increased proportional losses to ET. 155 Groundwater volumetric contributions to streamflow remain relatively stable across the historic 156 157 period, with the model estimating more than 60% of groundwater moving through the alluvium overlaying less permeable bedrock. 158

159 **3. Methods**

160 **3.1 Atmospheric Gas Tracers**

161 **3.1.1. Sample Collection and Analysis**

Stream water dissolved gas sample were collected following the general approach of 162 Sanford et al. (2015) in which samples are collected hourly for two relatively inert atmospheric 163 gases (N₂ and Ar) and two gas age-tracers (SF₆ and CFC-113) over a 12 h period. The stream 164 sampling site, CC03 (Figure 1), was chosen because it is located low the watershed, allowing an 165 integrated baseflow age estimate representing most of the watershed, but is above a steep canyon 166 containing large waterfalls. The stream section immediately upstream of the site was free of deep 167 pools and zones of anomalously high turbulence. The location is 2 km above the confluence of 168 Copper Creek to the East River and resides just below the geologic interface between the upper 169 170 basin bedrock containing granodiorite and the lower basin containing sedimentary strata of

higher permeability. The experiment was conducted on August 27, 2017, which is late enough in 171 the year to avoid monsoon rains and possible surface runoff contributions to the stream, vet early 172 enough to still have large diurnal stream temperature fluctuations characteristic of summer 173 months. Stream water temperature was measured every 5 minutes (Solinst Level Logger Edge 174 M3001 LT F6/M2) beginning the day before and extending through the gas sampling period. 175 Local barometric pressure was obtained from a Rocky Mountain Biological Laboratory weather 176 station located 1.9 km from CC03 (Figure 1) and adjusted for the elevational difference of 70 m. 177 Water samples for N₂, Ar, SF₆, and CFCs were collected in duplicate every hour from 8:30 am to 178 8:30 pm (Supporting Information, Tables S1 and S2), to capture minimum and maximum diurnal 179 stream fluctuation. Samples were collected using a peristaltic pump and polyethylene tubing 180 placed several centimetres off the stream bed. Sample containers were filled using techniques 181 182 described at the United States Geological Survey's Reston Groundwater Dating Laboratory (USGS Dating Lab) website (USGS, 2017), stored on ice, and shipped the next day to the USGS 183 184 Dating Lab for analysis. Samples for CFCs and SF₆ were analysed using purge and trap gas chromatography with an electron capture detector (GC-ECD) (Busenberg & Plummer 1992, 185 186 2002), while samples for N₂ and Ar were analysed using gas chromatography with a thermal conductivity detector (GC-TCD, USGS 2017). Measurement errors based on the sample 187 188 duplicates are 1.7% for N₂, 1.4% for Ar, and 1% for SF₆ and CFC-113, these being consistent with lab-reported errors (USGS, 2017). 189

190 Dissolved SF₆ concentrations were measured in three perennial springs located in the vicinity of CC03 to provide independent groundwater age information (Figure 1). Samples were 191 collected in July and October 2017. Argon and N₂ were also measured in two of these springs. 192 Spring CCS is located higher in the Copper Creek watershed 1.7 km from CC03, and springs 193 194 RCS and RGS are located within adjacent tributaries of the East River 5.4 km and 6.7 km from CC03, respectively. All three springs are at elevations between 3200 to 3500 m. Dissolved gases 195 were collected using a peristaltic pump with the intake attached to a PushPoint pore water 196 sampler (PPX36, https://www.mheproducts.com/) inserted into the shallow sediment at the 197 bottom of each spring pool. Sample collection followed the same protocols indicated above 198 199 (USGS 2017) and all samples were analysed by the USGS Dating Lab.

200

201 **3.1.2. Tracer Data Interpretation**

In the technique developed by Sanford et al. (2015), measured stream dissolved gas concentrations are used with stream temperature and local atmospheric pressure measurements to simultaneously solve for the rates of gas and water exchange into and out of the stream, as well as the concentration of the gases in groundwater discharging into the stream. A control volume approach accounts for all inputs and outputs of water and gas along the length of the stream and assumes gases are non-reactive. The change in gas concentration in the stream (C_s [M/L³]) with time [t] is described by the following mass balance equation (equation 11 in Sanford et al. 2015):

210
$$\frac{dC_s}{dt} = \frac{1}{\tau_w} (C_{gw} - C_s) - \frac{1}{\tau_g} (C_s - C_e),$$
(1)
211

where C_{gw} [M/L³] is the gas concentration in groundwater discharging into the stream; C_{e} , 212 $[M/L^3]$ is the atmospheric equilibrium gas concentration; τ_w [t] is the water residence time in the 213 stream, equal to the stream depth divided by the rate of upward groundwater seepage through the 214 streambed; and τ_g [t] is the gas residence time in the stream, equal to the stream water depth 215 divided by the gas-transfer velocity (vg [L/t]). The gas-transfer velocity governs the rate of gas 216 exchange between the stream and the atmosphere. Stream concentrations will be an intermediate 217 value between C_{gw} and C_e ; if $\tau_w \ll \tau_g$ then C_s approaches C_{gw} and if $\tau_w \gg \tau_g$ then C_s approaches 218 C_e and it is difficult to discern C_{gw} . 219

The equilibrium gas concentration fluctuates due to diurnal stream temperature oscillations, and can be computed using Henry's Law with the form:

222

223
$$C_e = P_a e^{a + b\left(\frac{100}{T}\right) + c \ln\left(\frac{T}{100}\right) + d\left(\frac{T}{100}\right)},$$
 (2)

224

where: P_a is the dry atmospheric pressure [atm]; T is the stream temperature [Kelvin]; and *a*, *b*, *c* and *d* are gas-specific coefficients. The method takes advantage of the oscillatory variation of C_e with time to simultaneously solve for C_{gw} , τ_w , and τ_g for each gas using an explicit finite difference representation of equation (1). Because τ_g is one of the computed parameters, a key advantage of this method, over many other techniques using dissolved gas tracers in streams to characterize groundwater inputs, is that it does not require an independent determination of v_g . The purpose of measuring concentrations of N_2 and Ar in addition to the age tracer gases is that

they can estimate the recharge temperature (T_r) and excess air concentration $(A_e, [M/L^3])$ for 232 groundwater. The recharge temperature is the temperature at the water table at the recharge 233 location, and Ae is an excess component of air dissolved in groundwater due to the dissolution of 234 air bubbles trapped when the water table rises during recharge events (Stute and Schlosser, 235 2000). The unfractionated-air model of excess air formation (Aeschbach-Hertig et al., 2000) is 236 assumed in this study. When Tr and Ae are known, estimated values of Cgw for SF6 and CFC-113 237 are used to calculate their atmospheric concentrations at the time of recharge, which in turn 238 provides a mean age for baseflow through use of an assumed form of a travel time distribution 239 (Busenberg and Plummer, 2002). Sanford et al. (2015) assumes a Weibull distribution in which 240 the cumulative distribution function (F) over time is defined as, 241

242

243
$$F(t) = 1 - e^{-(kt)^n}$$
, (3)

244

in which the scale parameter (*k*) and shape parameter (*n*) are adjusted to match the computed atmospheric concentration to the historical record (USGS 2017). The Weibull distribution is equivalent to the exponential mixing model when n = 1.

Values of C_{gw} for each gas are estimated using a modified version of the Excel 248 spreadsheet calculator developed by Sanford et al. (2015), which minimizes the misfit between 249 measured and modeled values of C_s employing the automated General Reduced Gradient solver 250 tool (provided as supporting documentation). Modifications include a reduced time step from 251 0.25 h to 0.1 h and expressing the misfit between measured and modeled values with the sum 252 chi-squared (χ^2), rather the sum squared error, to assess statistical significance of predicted water 253 column concentrations. The sum χ^2 is the square of the difference in measured and modeled 254 values divided by the square of the measurement error. Following Sanford et al. (2015), up to 255 nine parameters can be adjusted to match stream gas concentrations: T_r, A_e, groundwater excess 256 N_2 (potentially present from denitrification), τ_w , a single gas residence time for N_2 and Ar, gas 257 residence times for SF₆ and CFC-113, and C_{gw} values for SF₆ and CFC-113. 258

For springs CCS and RCS, T_r and A_e values were derived from measured N_2 and Ar concentrations and used to compute a piston-flow groundwater age (assumes a uniform age for all sampled water) from the measured SF₆ concentration using standard methods (USGS 2017). The recharge elevation was assumed to be the approximate mean elevation of the portion of the watershed directly upslope of the sampled spring. For spring RGS, Ar and N_2 were not collected and the mean T_r and A_e from the other two springs was used in the calculation of the piston-flow age.

266 **3.2 Integrated Hydrologic Model**

Carroll et al., (2019) simulated energy and water budget components in Copper Creek 267 268 using the USGS Groundwater and Surface water Flow model (GSFLOW, Markstrom et al., 2008). GSFLOW dynamically couples the USGS Precipitation-Runoff Modeling System 269 (PRMS, Markstrom et al., 2015) and the Newton formulation of the USGS 3D Modular 270 Groundwater Flow model (Harbaugh, 2005; Niswonger et al., 2011). The model describes daily 271 272 surface and groundwater interactions related to evapotranspiration (ET) including soil evaporation and plant transpiration, canopy interception, snow sublimation and groundwater ET. 273 The hydrologic model also estimates interflow, groundwater recharge, change in groundwater 274 storage, as well as groundwater-surface water exchanges derived from differential gradients 275 276 between groundwater and stream water elevations (Huntington and Niswonger, 2012), and deeper groundwater flow based on lithology and geologic structure. 277

The finite difference grid resolution is 100-m with elevations resampled from the USGS 278 279 National Elevation Dataset. Landfire (2015) was used to derive parameters of dominant cover type (Figure S5b), summer and winter cover density, canopy interception characteristics for 280 snow and rain, and transmission coefficients for shortwave solar radiation. Climate for water 281 years (October 1-September 30) 1987 to 2018 were simulated using two proximal Snow 282 Telemetry (SNOTEL) stations (Figure 1) and LiDAR derived snow water equivalent from the 283 Airborne Snow Observatory (Painter et al., 2016) (Figure S5a). The largest snow accumulation 284 285 occurs in high elevation cirques, upper subalpine and north-eastern aspects of the basin. LiDAR snow observations implicitly account for snow redistribution by wind and avalanche and provide 286 287 confidence on the location and timing of water inputs to the basin. Maximum soil water storage is conceptualized as a field capacity threshold above which water is partitioned to either lateral 288 289 interflow or allowed to percolate downward via gravity drainage into the unsaturated zone (recharge). The spatial distribution of soil storage is the product of rooting depth obtained from 290 291 Landfire (2015) and available water content as a function of soil type (NRCS, 1991). The Copper 292 Creek geologic model (Figure S5c) contains nine hydrostratigraphic units with 12 layers ranging in thickness from 8 to 120 m for a total thickness of 400 m. Transient water table gradients (e.g. Oct 1, 2016 provided in Figured S5d) dictate alluvial and bedrock water sources to the stream. Water table elevations are shallow and steep in the low permeable granodiorite in the upper portions of the watershed. Fracture networks are not simulated. Instead, we use effective hydraulic conductivity that decreases with depth , with surface hydraulic conductivity optimized to match average observed baseflow at the stream gauge located at the terminus of the basin.

299 **3.2.1 Simulated Baseflow Age Distribution**

300 Baseflow is simulated as the sum of (i) saturated groundwater flow through alluvial and 301 bedrock units, and (ii) seasonal, shallow interflow. These two components are handled separately and combined into a single baseflow age distribution representative of late summer stream water. 302 First, the age of saturated groundwater flow paths are estimated using a particle tracking 303 algorithm in which particles are draped on the water table surface and allowed to move through 304 305 the watershed as a function of groundwater boundary fluxes and associated water table gradients (Mpath7, Pollock, 2016). Individual flow path ages are weighted by recharge: defined as water 306 307 seepage below the soil zone plus ephemeral stream leakage to groundwater and corrected for volume weighted age of water lost back to the atmosphere via groundwater ET. Second, the 308 309 contributing volume of interflow in the river during the late August is assumed less than one year old and added to groundwater age distribution calculated with particle tracking. 310

Both transient and steady state particle tracking simulations use a similar methodology. 311 Transient simulations evaluate the efficacy of the hydrologic model to generate a baseflow age 312 313 distribution able to reproduce the observed gas tracer water column concentrations at the end of August 2017. Initial water table elevations and water fluxes for water year 2017 initiate the 314 transient particle tracking simulation and then historical water fluxes for water years 1987 to 315 2018 are repeated until all particles exit the watershed. A Weibull distribution (k and n, equation 316 3) is adjusted to the flow model baseflow age distribution to solve for stream water SF_6 water 317 column concentrations. The calculation of SF₆ water column concentrations uses tracer-based 318 estimates of Ae and Tr, an assumed recharge elevation of 3400 m (the approximate mean 319 320 elevation of the watershed above CC03), and the historical atmospheric concentration record (USGS 2017). If the age distribution is unable to replicate observed stream concentrations based 321 on the sum χ^2 , then subsurface porosity is adjusted. If adjusting porosity is insufficient to create a 322

statistically significant reproduction of observed gas tracers, then the original calibration of 323 bedrock hydraulic properties in the flow model presented by (Carroll et al., 2019) are revisited 324 based on groundwater age distribution sensitivity to geologic parameterization (refer to 325 Supporting Information S.2). Using the final model, additional transient simulations are initiated 326 to explore interannual variability across a range in historical water years. These years include an 327 extremely wet year (1995), a dry year at the end of a multi-year drought (2002), a dry year with a 328 strong monsoon (2012), a dry year with a weak monsoon (2018) and the median water year 329 (1998). 330

Steady state particle tracking simulations provide information on how deeper 331 groundwater flow paths may change by shifting the historical mean groundwater condition as a 332 function of altering precipitation, temperature or forest presence. The historical median water 333 334 year (1998) is used as a baseline condition from which precipitation is incrementally adjusted by 0.4 to 1.8 the historic daily value with no warming ($+0^{\circ}$ C). This is repeated for $+4^{\circ}$ C and $+10^{\circ}$ C 335 warming applied to both minimum and maximum daily temperatures. The +4°C condition falls 336 in the range of expected end-of-century temperature increase in the East River (Hay et al., 2011) 337 338 while +10°C forces all snow to fall as rain. The effect of spatial distribution of precipitation and temperature across the watershed is also tested by assigning spatially uniform daily values based 339 340 on average historic median water year daily inputs. This removes gradients associated with elevation, storm tracking and snow redistribution. Lastly, the relative importance of forest 341 342 influences on energy and water budget partitioning and baseflow age are explored by removing deciduous and conifer forests from the basin. Forests were replaced by a barren cover type and 343 recharacterization of transmission coefficients for shortwave radiation, interception of 344 precipitation and rooting depths. Soil storage and its conductance were not altered. For each 345 hypothetical scenario, GSFLOW daily stress is simulated over a complete water year and 346 repeated until quasi-steady state conditions occur. Quasi-steady state is complete when combined 347 changes in saturated and unsaturated groundwater storage were less than 1% the annual water 348 budget. Cell specific groundwater fluxes (recharge, ephemeral stream losses and groundwater 349 ET) are aggregated to an annual sum for each model cell and applied to the steady state 350 351 groundwater model for particle tracking.

352 . 4 Results

353 4.1 Atmospheric Gas Tracers

354 Measured N₂, Ar and SF₆ concentrations along with computed T_r, A_e, and piston-flow age values for the three sampled springs are shown in Tables S3 and S4. Computed SF₆ piston-355 flow ages range from 3 y to 14 y. The samples from CCS were collected in June after a large 356 snowpack accumulation and had the youngest ages (3 to 6 y). The younger ages and warm mean 357 T_r of 9.2°C (near the top of the expected range of 0-10°C; see Supporting Information S.1) 358 suggests that CCS either contained a substantial fraction of very young water recharged only 359 weeks prior to sampling during the spring, or the sampled water partially re-equilibrated with the 360 atmosphere. The other springs were sampled in October with piston-flow ages 7 to 14. Mean T_r 361 and Ae values for the spring samples are 5.5°C and 0.0011 cm³STP/g, respectively. 362

Measured concentrations of N_2 and Ar in Copper Creek are very close to computed 363 364 equilibrium concentrations for the stream water (Table S2, Figure S2a,b), indicating a relatively small τ_g (relatively large v_g) for N_2 and Ar. Because v_g is generally positively correlated with 365 stream gradient (Gleeson et al., 2018), a relatively large vg is consistent with Copper Creek's 366 steep gradient of ~0.09 above the sample location. In contrast, measured concentrations of SF₆ 367 and CFC-113 are below equilibrium concentrations for the stream water (Table S2, Figure 368 S2c,d). This suggests that: (a) the age of groundwater discharging into the stream is sufficiently 369 large that the difference between C_{gw} and C_e is non-trivial (on the order of years rather than 370 weeks/months); and (b) though τ_g values are relatively small for Copper Creek, they are still 371 large enough so that the age-tracer Cgw signal is maintained in the stream. Therefore, despite 372 Copper Creek's high gradient, vg for the age-tracer gases were sufficiently slow to permit 373 374 application of the method proposed by Sanford et al. (2015). Although SF₆ and CFC-113 are generally well mixed in the atmosphere, local atmospheric concentrations on the day of sampling 375 could be slightly below the northern hemisphere 6-month average values used to compute C_e 376 (USGS, 2017), such that C_s is actually equal to C_e to invalidate the method. A comparison of the 377 atmospheric concentrations required to produce the observed stream concentrations with multiple 378 North American atmospheric monitoring sites indicates that this scenario was unlikely (Figure 379 380 S1).

The measured gas concentrations in the stream do not provide a unique solution for C_{gw} 381 for either SF₆ or CFC-113, allowing a broad range of possible ages for baseflow (Supporting 382 Information S.1). However, the range of allowable age-tracer C_{gw} values is well-constrained on 383 the high end because atmospheric concentrations of these age tracers have generally increased 384 since their introduction in the mid-20th century. This high-end constraint on C_{gw} can potentially 385 provide a reliable minimum age constraint for baseflow. Note that allowable CFC-113 Cgw 386 values are sufficiently low to indicate recharge predominantly before the mid-1990's when 387 388 atmospheric concentrations started decreasing. The CFC-113 concentrations are discarded from the analysis because, for a given value of τ_w , the estimated CFC-113 C_{gw} consistently produced a 389 substantially older mean age (generally by >10 y) than produced by the simultaneously estimated 390 SF₆ C_{gw} regardless of the assumed form of the travel time distribution. This age discrepancy is 391 likely due to either SF₆ contamination from terrigenic production in the subsurface (e.g. 392 393 Friedrich et al. 2013), CFC-113 degradation occurring under low-oxygen conditions in parts of the aquifer (e.g. Bockgard et al. 2004) or both. A similar discrepancy was observed by Sanford et 394 al. (2015) at some sites in northern Virginia, USA, and they attributed this to terrigenic SF_6 395 contributions based on evidence of terrigenic SF₆ in groundwater samples from local springs and 396 wells in which concentrations reflected impossibly high atmospheric concentrations. For the 397 Copper Creek samples, we believe that CFC-113 degradation is a more likely explanation 398 because the spring samples in the East River display no clear evidence of terrigenic SF_6 399 contributions. Furthermore, the range of allowable CFC-113 piston-flow and exponential mean 400 ages for baseflow (>30 y) are substantially older than most reported groundwater ages for other 401 mountain watersheds underlain by predominantly crystalline rock (generally <20 y; Plummer et 402 403 al. 2001; Manning 2009; Visser et al. 2019; Manning et al. 2019). Regardless, using the SF₆ measurements to determine a maximum C_{gw} and minimum baseflow age is a more appropriate 404 and conservative approach because any terrigenic additions would increase the estimated C_{gw} 405 whereas CFC-113 degradation would decrease the estimated C_{gw}. 406

The maximum SF₆ C_{gw} was estimated through a series of best-fit model solutions in which CFC-113 was excluded from the analysis, a range of SF₆ C_{gw} values were specified, and resulting model fits were evaluated (Table 2, Figure 2a). Model fits, defined by the sum χ^2 metric with a p > 0.1, to observed stream water SF₆ concentrations are similar and acceptable for SF₆ C_{gw} values up to about 2.2 fmol/L. For C_{gw} > 2.3 fmol/L, model fits declining rapidly,

becoming unacceptable. For the purposes of numeric modeling, we move forward with the 412 requirement that any flow-model-generated age distribution must produce an SF₆ C_{gw} 413 concentration <2.3 fmol/L to be consistent with the stream age-tracer measurements. As noted 414 above in Section 3.1.2, values of T_r and A_e , must be assumed to compute C_{gw} for a given age 415 distribution. The fact that C_s and C_e are essentially equal for N_2 and Ar means that the stream N_2 416 and Ar measurements provide no meaningful constraints on these parameters (Figure S3). 417 Therefore, the mean T_r and A_e values derived from the spring samples are assumed in the 418 computation of C_{gw} for the flow-model-generated age distributions (see Supplementary 419 Information S.1 for additional discussion). 420

421

422 4.2 Integrated Hydrologic Model

423 **4.2.1 Baseflow Age Calibration**

424 Simulated streamflow and the fraction of streamflow that is interflow for a range of historically variable water years is provided in Figure 3. Interflow dominates stream water source 425 during snow melt (April-July) and can be bolstered in the summer and fall by monsoon rains. 426 Interflow contributions to Copper Creek in late August 2017 during the gas tracer experiment are 427 22% and align with the same fraction of shallow, soil derived flow in the median water year 428 (1998) and a dry water year with a good monsoon (2012). Figure 4 shows the resulting baseflow 429 age distribution at the sampling location CC03 using the originally published flow model. 430 Median baseflow age is 1.5 y and water table elevations are shallow (median depth of flow 6 m) 431 with 64% of recharged water moving through the top model layer which is predominantly 432 alluvium. Figure 5a illustrates the hyper-localized, topographically controlled and very young 433 434 groundwater flow paths above the sampling location where granodiorite is the dominant bedrock. Using a Weibull distribution fit to the GSFLOW baseflow age output (k=0.28, n=0.44), the SF₆ 435 groundwater concentration is calculated at 2.74 fmol/L and the sum χ^2 is 147 indicating a 436 statistically insignificant replication of SF_6 stream concentrations (Figure 2). 437

Geologic parameter adjustments based on a sensitivity analysis (refer to Supporting Information S.2. Figure S6,7) to promote older baseflow, with the goal of lowering estimated SF_6 groundwater concentrations, included: increasing the granodiorite hydraulic conductivity four-

fold over the original value of 1.16×10^{-7} m/s to 4.66×10^{-7} m/s, and lowering the ratio of 441 horizontal to vertical hydraulic conductivity, or VKA from 10 to 3. Accompanying changes in 442 bedrock properties was a slight increase in soil storage to replicate observed stream discharge 443 (Nash Sutcliffe Efficiency Log discharge = 0.78). Bedrock reparameterization lowers predicted 444 water table elevations (median depth of groundwater flow equal to 115 m), reduces groundwater 445 flow through the alluvium from 64% to 22% (Figure 4b), and produces a baseflow age 446 distribution (Weibull k = 0.79, n = 0.66, Figure 4a) capable of reproducing groundwater SF₆ 447 concentration of 2.2 fmol/L in order to statistically replicate SF₆ stream water concentrations 448 (sum $\chi^2 = 12.9$, Figure 2). The hydrologic model produces a median age at CC03 of 7.5 y, which 449 falls within the range of October ages for perennial springs to provide added confidence in the 450 approach. Figure 5b shows older flow path are now generated in the upper confines of Copper 451 Creek that are less constrained by topography than the original model. 452

453 **4.2.3 Baseflow Age Sensitivity**

Using the calibrated model to assess a variety of historic water years indicates 454 groundwater age contributions are relatively stable 11.8 ± 0.7 y, while late summer baseflow ages 455 range between 3 and 12 years as a function of contributing interflow (Table 3, Figure S8). A 456 sensitivity analysis perturbing long term climate from its median condition by incremental 457 458 changes in the historic median water year daily precipitation show groundwater age distributions (Figure S9) shift progressively toward older water with decreased precipitation. Warming by 459 +4°C decreases groundwater ages slightly for very wet conditions. Warming during a drought 460 (e.g. 0.8P) removes relatively younger water while warming during a more intensive drought 461 462 (e.g. 0.4P) affects all flow paths and the entire distribution shifts older. Warming the basin until snow is converted to rain (+10°C) increases groundwater ages for all conditions, but increases 463 464 are most dramatic under a drier climate. Removing the forest from Copper Creek increases recharge and shifts groundwater toward younger ages with decreased ages most notable during 465 dry conditions. The median ages from all scenarios increase with decreasing precipitation and 466 collapse about a single exponential function defined by average annual net recharge (Figure 6). 467 Assuming spatially uniform climate effectively decreases net recharge for the same amount of 468 annual precipitation. This produces a groundwater age distribution more closely matched to 469 decreasing precipitation by 20% over the historical median condition. 470

471 **5 Discussion**

Stream water source in the late summer is composed of both shallow epemeral flow 472 through soil and saporlite and saturated groudnwater flow through alluvium and bedrock units. 473 Deeper groudnwater flow through unweathered bedrock is often treated as negligable in 474 catchment studies (e.g. Kirchner, 2009). However, there is a growing awareness that deeper 475 bedrock flow may be an important component in mountain hydrology (Gabrielli et al., 2012; 476 Hale and McDonnell, 2016) and a general call to include the bottom of the groundwater system 477 in our conceptual model (Brantley et al., 2007; Brooks et al., 2015). However, a fundemental 478 challeng in hydrology is to define and observe where the bottom of the watershed occurs and to 479 assess if it is important (Condon et al., 2020). The challenge is amplified in steep, snow 480 dominated mountain watersheds. These watersheds provide 60-90% of the freshwater world 481 wide (Viviroli and Weingartner, 2008) and are especially vulnerable to climate change (IPCC, 482 2019) but data describing bedrock properties and deep subsurface flow is scarse in these systems 483 484 and uncertainty in predicting how projected warming or reduced snowpack will affect streamflow response as well as redox-sensitive and time-sensitive reactions in respone to 485 changing water tables and travel times remain large (Manning et al., 2013; Meixner et al., 2016). 486

487 5.1. Age of Baseflow and Depth of Active Groundwater Flow

To address uncertainty in depth of groundwater flow, we present a novel approach that 488 combines a sophisticated numierical hydrologic model and a new method for dating baseflow 489 using dissolved N₂, Ar and SF₆. The gas tracer experimental approach is relatively conveneinent 490 and cost effective as it takes a single day to perform and does not require expensive drilling. 491 Drilling, which is often impossible due to logistical challenges related to steep topography, deep 492 snowpack and (in our case) Wilderness designation. The stream tracer experiment was not 493 originally designed for steep, turbulent rivers with fast gas exchange velocities to the atmosphere 494 and its use in Copper Creek is, in of itself, a methodological question on its effectiveness in 495 alpine environments. Because of fast gas velocities, the approach could not provide a unique 496 497 baseflow age determination in Copper Creek. However, it did provide a relatively robust upper limit on the groundwater SF₆ concentration. This maximum concentration is then used to test the 498

validity of the flow model generated baseflow age distribution, and thereby establish the lowerlimit on the mean age of this distribution.

The originally published GSFLOW model calibrated to stream discharge over a multi-501 decadal period, generates shallow groundwater flow moving predominantly through alluvium 502 situated on much less conductive bedrock. For late summer conditions in 2017, when the tracer 503 experiment was conducted, baseflow median age is estimated very young at 1.5 y. However, this 504 results in statistically insignificant replication of observed SF₆ stream water concentrations. 505 Instead, older groundwater (12.2 y), and a resulting baseflow median age of 7.5 y, must be 506 simulated in the hydrologic model to match observed stream water gas tracer data. With deeper 507 groundwater flow, the recalibrated flow model produces a baseflow median consistent with 508 perennial spring samples collected in October 2017 and in the vicinity of the watershed (10.2 \pm 509 510 3.4 y). Earlier studies on tranist time modeling in mountainous catchments have tended toward younger ages of 1-5 y (see review by McGuire & McDonnell 2006), in which the de-coding of 511 512 catchment travel time distributions have primarily relied upon stable isotopes. Yet these tracers cannot inform transport times longer than 4 years and their exclusive use will bias age 513 distributions and understanding of how catchments store and transmit water (Stewart et al., 514 2012). Techniques for establishing longer travel times include use of atmospheric tracers 515 sensitive to older waters (e.g. ³H, CFC, SF₆) and a growing number of recent studies suggest 516 baseflow mean ages in headwater streams may be older than previously thought (>10 y) 517 (Cartwright et al., 2018; Cartwright et al., 2020). Similarly, ³H/³He groundwater ages from 17 518 stream-side piezometers along a 3.5 km reach of Handcart Gulch in the Colorado Front Range 519 were all between 8.9 y and 19.1 y (Manning et al., 2019). The updated Copper Creek hydrologic 520 model follows this trend in acknowledging older groundwater contributions in mountainous 521 522 waterersheds.

Re-conceptualization of the Copper Creek grounwdater flow system was largely accomplished by increasing the hydraulic conductivity of the dominant bedrock (granodiorite) above the stream sampling location to lower water table elevations and force more groundwater to travel deeper through the subsurface. One can speculate that high relief watersheds like Copper Creek contain older than expected stream flow, perhaps related to greater permeability and porosity to greater depths due to more intense recent uplift and tectonism associated with mountain building (Williams et al., 2015; Jasechko et al., 2016). Final surface pemeability for the granodiorite

 $(4.6 \times 10^{-7} \text{ m/s})$ falls within the typical range of 10^{-8} to 10^{-6} m/s for zones of active flow in 530 fractured crystaline bedrock in mountain settings; (Katsura et al., 2009; Welch and Allen, 2014). 531 The recalibrated model lowers water table depths such that 22% of recharged water moves 532 through the alluvium and produces a median depth of groundwaterflow equal to 110 m, with 533 30% of recharged water reaching depths greater than 200 m. This is somewhat deeper than the 534 maximum depth of active groundwater circultion in crystaline rocks of 100-200 m based on a 535 limited number of prior studies (Welch and Allen, 2014; Markovich et al., 2019). However, 536 Frisbee et al. (2017) estimated active circulation upwards to 1000 m in the crystalline 537 metamorphic rocks of the Sangre de Cristo Mountains, New Mexico. Active circulation depths 538 are a function of tectonic history, lithology, structure, and climate (weathering), and 539 characteristic active flow depths for different bedrock geologic conditions in mountain settings 540 541 remains largely unknown (Markovich et al., 2019).

We acknowledge that constraint on subsurface routing is inherently non-unique in 542 groundwater modeling and the use of a single hydraulic conductance value for a given depth for 543 each hydrostratigraphic unit is simplistic and likely over estimates deep flow paths along the 544 545 highest elevations in Copper Creek in response to low water table elevations. It is also recognized that our model is constrained to younger flows through our use of the minimum age 546 547 as determined by the gas tracers to define median age produced by the hydrologic model and that older travel times associated with deep flow paths, that are most sensitive to deep porosity, as not 548 549 known. Fractured rock porosity is highly uncertain, and complicated by diffusive exchange between mobile water in the fractures and imobile water in the matrix. Effective porosity for age 550 estimates is likely in between matrix and fracture porosity. Unpublished data from a 80 m 551 borehole drillcore in a proximal basin to the East River (Redwell Basin) consisting of contact-552 553 metamorphosed interbedded shale and sandstone indicates a matrix porosity of 1-10%, centering around 3%, while fractored porosity in unweathered crystaline rocks <1% is common (Tullborg 554 and Larson, 2006). For comparison, modeled effective porosity of the granodiorite in Copper 555 Creek is set equal to 2.5% (depth \leq 18 m) and 1.25% (depth > 18 m) and deemed appropriate. 556

557 5.2 Controls on Baseflow Age

558 The physical reality of mountainous watersheds is that heterogenities in the system in 559 combination with spatio-variable inputs create highly diverse flow paths through the watershed.

As a result, the age distribution of stream water is not time invariant but responds dynamically as 560 the nature of overland flow and hydrologic connectivity change, and that flow paths and velocities 561 vary with water storage (Botter, Bertuzzo and Rinaldo, 2011; Van Der Velde et al., 2012; Engdahl, 562 McCallum and Massoudieh, 2016). Transient analysis of individual water years spans the full 563 range of historic climate conditions and results in variability in predicted late summer baseflow 564 median age (3-12 y). This variability is largely due to simulated interflow contributions moving 565 through the soil zone as a result of deep and persistent snowpack and/or a strong monsoon season 566 567 driving younger flows late in the summer. Results agree with other studies showing the mobilization and mixing of younger shallow water stores with older water following wet periods 568 (Hrachowitz et al., 2013; Howcroft et al., 2018). Specifically, Copper Creek baseflow ages align 569 with recent work in Providence Creek, a granodiorite headwater basin in the southern Sierra 570 571 Nevada mountains of California, with stream ages ranging from 3.3 to 10.3 y, with wetter years releasing younger water, as determined using ranked storage functions constrained by radioactive 572 573 isotopes (Visser et al., 2019); and are consistent with spring mean ages in Sagehen, California found to vary 3-7 y between sampling events with age variability controlled by the magnitude of 574 575 the new fraction (<1 y), which generally correlated positively to annual maximum snow water equivalent (Manning et al., 2012). 576

577 In contrast, groundwater flow paths and associated ages showed low variance about the mean (11.8 y) deviating by only 0.7 y despite drastically different snow accumulation and stream 578 579 dynamics for the years assessed. Interannual stability in groundwater flow represents a basin in equilibrium with its historical climate and watershed structure (i.e. topography, land use, 580 geology). Topographic controls have also long been recognized as controlling local, intermediate 581 and regional groundwater flow systems (Toth, 1963; Winter et al., 2001) and been identified as 582 583 the single most important control on catchment-scale transport (McGuire et al., 2005). However, the influence of precipitation magnitude and type (Carroll et al., 2017), vegetation (Rukundo and 584 Doğan, 2019), bedrock lithology (Onda et al., 2006), and subsurface connectivity (Tetzlaff et al., 585 2009) are also recognized in influencing hydrologic partitioning dictating recharge and 586 subsequent groundwater flow to streams. Recharge in mountain watersheds preferentially occurs 587 588 in the upper subalpine (in part) as a function of large and persistent snowpack snow (Musselman et al., 2008; Broxton et al., 2015; Carroll et al., 2018). We show that maintaining historic median 589 daily climate forcing, but uniformly distributing across Copper Creek, reduces recharge and 590

lowers water table elevations to produce older groundwater. Similarly, Badger *et al*, (2019), using a distributed hydrologic model and remotely sensed estimates of snowpack found more uniform snow distributions melted out 5 weeks earlier and produced up to 9.5% less stream flow than conditions that allowed for spatial variability. Therefore, capturing the spatial distribution of snow dynamics to better represent recharge is also important to quantifying groundwater flow pathways and age of water exported to a stream network.

Three-dimensional numerical models have provided guiding principles on recharge-597 598 controlled versus topographically-controlled water tables that in turn drive the length-scale of flow paths and associated ages in mountain systems (Gleeson and Manning, 2008; Markovich et 599 al., 2019). Figure 7 illustrates the conceptual model of flow paths and baseflow age distributions 600 as a function of water table elevational endmembers dictated by the ratio of recharge to hydraulic 601 602 conductivity (R/K). High R/K produces higher water table elevations and increases the influence of topographically controlled, local flow paths on stream-flow generation. If water table 603 elevations are high enough to support perennial streams, then the system is likely permeability-604 limited such that increases in recharge has little effect on changing groundwater flow paths and 605 606 the median age of groundwater is stable. Conversely, watersheds with lower R/K have deeper water table elevations controlled mainly by the recharge rate. Ephemeral streams emerge, flow 607 608 paths are less constrained by local topography and groundwater flow conditions become increasingly sensitive to changes in recharge. 609

610 Our first round of Copper Creek modeling established a very high R/K in the upper confines of the basin to produce a permeability-limited groundwater flow system with shallow 611 water table elevations in which baseflow ages are buffered from possible decreases in recharge. 612 With model re-evaluation, the R/K ratio in Copper Creek is lowered. The water table is still 613 topographically controlled, but the newly calibrated model suggests Copper Creek is actually 614 very close to the recharge-controlled condition, meaning groundwater flow paths will deepen and 615 baseflow age will increase with relatively small reductions in snow accumulation. The larger the 616 deviation from the historical median precipitation toward a drier state, the greater the sensitivity 617 of groundwater age is to either recharge decreases (warming) or increases (forest removal). 618 Ameli et al. (2018), using a combination of tritium tracer and a semi-analytical flow and 619 transport modeling strategy in a New Zealand headwater basin, also found groundwater flow 620 paths lengthen and water ages contributing to streams increase indirectly to recharge rate. 621

However, this rain-dominated catchment underlain by early Pleistocene conglomerate likely reflects a recharged-controlled basin that was not readily apparent in Copper Creek. Our study emphasizes that assuming a snowmelt-dominated mountain watershed is permeability-limited simply because it is underlain by low-permeable crystalline rock is potentially misguided. Instead, our results suggest that proper characterization of the deeper bedrock groundwater flow system is fundamentally important to establishing R/K and determining how a watershed will respond to changing climate and land use.

629 6. Conclusions

There is growing awareness that deeper parts of bedrock aquifers in mountain watersheds 630 could be an important part of a watershed's hydrologic system by storing and transmitting larger 631 amounts of water and having a greater influence on stream source than previously indicated. 632 However, deeper parts of mountain aquifers are very difficult to characterize and information on 633 hydraulic conductivity, porosity and flow rates at depth remain scarce and the true importance of 634 deeper groundwater flow across different geologic settings remains highly undertain. This 635 knowledge gap is a major impediment to our ability to predict how surface water flow and its 636 water quality may respond to changes in precipitation, temperature or land use. Deep 637 groundwater flow in a mountain watershed underlain by fractured crystalline rock is increasingly 638 being observed in headwater streams, but it is rarely linked in any robust fashion to the 639 distribution of hydraulic conductivity. Here we present a proof-of-concept for a new and efficient 640 approach for characterizing deeper groundwater flow a in mountain watershed using stream 641 642 water concentrations of N₂, Ar and SF₆. While shallow and ephemerial interflow produces considerable variability in baseflow age, deeper groundwater flow is found more stable (approx. 643 12 y) with gas tracer data providing solid evidence of non-trivial grounwater flow to streams that 644 occurs at considerable depth in a mountain watershed underlain by fractured crystalline rock. 645 The implications on the conceptual model of groundwater flow in this mountain watershed is 646 substantial – moving it from strongly topographically controlled with groundwater flow paths 647 insensitive to changes in precipitation (and recharge), toward a boarderline recharge controlled 648 649 groundwater system, such that further drying could have a significant effect on groundwater age contributions to stream water. Work clarifies through a case example the importance of 650

characterizing the deep bedrock groundwater system in mountain watersheds as a function of where it resides on the R/K spectrum in order to better predict how groundwater and surface water interactions may respond to future changes in climate or land use.

654

655 Acknowledgements:

656 Work was supported by the USGS 104(g) Grant/Cooperative Agreement No. G16AP00196 and the US Department of Energy Office of Science under contract DE-AC02-05CH11231 as part of 657 Lawrence Berkeley National Laboratory Watershed Function Science Focus Area. Funding from 658 the USGS Mineral Resources Program funded Dr. Manning's time. Additional funding through 659 NSF ROA award #1624073 helped fund Dr. Marchetti. We wish to thank Ward Sanford with the 660 USGS for sharing his baseflow age model template for gas tracer processing and Jerry Casile 661 with the USGS Reston Groundwater Dating Laboratory for his time and expertise on analytical 662 processing of water samples for dissolved gases. We acknowledge the WCU Bartleson-Prather 663 Research Fund for funding WCU undergraduate Manya Ruckhaus who aided in Copper Creek 664 stream and perennial spring sampling. Lastly, we would like to express appreciation to the Rocky 665 Mountain Biological Laboratory for handling Forest Service permitting in the Maroon Bells 666 Wilderness. We appreciate the time and valuable comments from Ward Sanford, Ian Cartwright 667 and two unanimous reviewers. Data and finite difference model approximations of equation 1 are 668 available to the public on the U.S. DOE Environmental Systems Science Data Infrastructure for 669 Virtual Ecosystem (ESS-DIVE). 670

671 **References Cited**

- Aeschbach-Hertig, W., Peeters, F., Beyerle, U., Kipfer, R. (2000) 'Paleotemperature
 reconstruction from noble gases in ground water taking into account equilibration with
 entrapped air', *Nature*, pp. 1040–1043.
- Allen, R. G. *et al.* (2013) 'Sensitivity of Landsat-Scale Energy Balance to Aerodynamic
 Variability in Mountains and Complex Terrain', *Journal of the American Water Resources Association*, 49(3), pp. 592–604. doi: 10.1111/jawr.12055.
- 678 Ameli, A. A. et al. (2018) 'Groundwater Subsidy From Headwaters to Their Parent Water

- Watershed: A Combined Field-Modeling Approach', *Water Resources Research*, 54(7),
 pp. 5110–5125. doi: 10.1029/2017WR022356.
- Anderson, B. T. *et al.* (2014) 'Insights into the physical processes controlling correlatinos
 between snow distribution and terrain properties', *Water Resources Research*, 50, pp.
 4545–4563. doi: 10.1002/2013WR013714.
- Badger, A. M., Livneh, B. and Molotch, N. P. (2019) 'On the Role of Spatial Snow Distribution
 on Alpine Catchment Hydrology', *World Environmental and Water Resources Congress*,
 pp. 215–225.
- Bockgard, N., Rodhe, A. and Olsson, K. A. (2004) 'Accuracy of CFC groundwater dating in a
 crystalline bedrock aquifer: Data from a site in southern Sweden', *Hydrogeology Journal*,
 12, pp. 171–183.
- Botter, G., Bertuzzo, E. and Rinaldo, A. (2011) 'Catchment residence and travel time
 distributions: The master equation', *Geophysical Research Letters*, 38(11), pp. 1–6. doi:
 10.1029/2011GL047666.
- Brantley, S. L., Goldhaber, M. B. and Ragnarsdottir, K. V. (2007) 'Crossing disciplines and
 scales to understand the critical zone', *Elements*, 3(5), pp. 307–314.
- Brooks, P. D. *et al.* (2015) 'Hydrological partitioning in the critical zone: Recent advances and
 opportunities for developing transferable understanding of water cycle dynamics', *Water Resources Research*, 51, pp. 6973–6987. doi: doi:10.1002/2015WR017039.
- Broxton, P. D. *et al.* (2015) 'Quantifying the effects of vegetation structure on snow
 accumulation and ablation in mixed-conifer forests', *Ecohydrology*, 8(6), pp. 1073–1094.
 doi: 10.1002/eco.1565.
- Busenberg, E. and Plummer, L. N. (2002) 'Dating young water with sulfur hexafluride: natural
 and anthropogenic sources of sulfur hexafluride', *Water Resources Research*, 36(10), pp.
 3011–3030. doi: doi:10.1029/2000WR900151.
- Carroll, R. W. H. *et al.* (2017) 'Evaluating mountain meadow groundwater response to Pinyon Juniper and temperature in a great basin watershed', *Ecohydrology*, 10(1), pp. 1–18. doi:
 10.1002/eco.1792.
- Carroll, R. W. H. *et al.* (2018) 'Factors controlling seasonal groundwater and solute flux from
 snow-dominated basins', *Hydrological Processes*, 32(14), pp. 2187–2202. doi:
 10.1002/hyp.13151.

- Carroll, R. W. H. *et al.* (2019) 'The Importance of Interflow to Groundwater Recharge in a
 Snowmelt-Dominated Headwater Basin', *Geophysical Research Letters*, 46(11), pp.
 5899–5908. doi: 10.1029/2019GL082447.
- Cartwright, I. *et al.* (2018) 'Using geochemistry to understand water sources and transit times in
 headwater streams of a temperate rainforest', *Applied Geochemistry*, 99, pp. 1–12. doi:
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.apgeochem.2018.10.018.
- Cartwright, I., Morgenstern, U. and Hofmann, H. (2020) 'Concentration versus streamflow
 trends of major ions and tritium in headwater streams as indicators of changing water
 stores', *Hydrological Processes*, 34(2), pp. 485–505. doi:
 https://doi.org/10.1002/hyp.13600.
- Cesano, D., Bagtzoglou, A. C. and Olofsson, B. (2003) 'Quantifying fractured rock hydraulic
 heterogeneity and groundwater inflow prediction in underground excavations: The
 heterogeneity index', *Tunnelling and Underground Space Technology*, 18(1), pp. 19–34.
 doi: 10.1016/S0886-7798(02)00098-6.
- Condon, L. E. *et al.* (2020) 'Where Is the Bottom of a Watershed?', *Water Resources Research*,
 56(3), pp. 0–3. doi: 10.1029/2019WR026010.
- Danesh-Yazdi, M. *et al.* (2018) 'Bridging the gap betwen numerical solutions of travel time
 distributions and analytical storage selection functions', *Hydrological Processes*, 32(8),
 pp. 1063–1076. doi: doi:org/10.1002/hyp.11481.
- DeBeer, C. M. and Pomeroy, J. W. (2010) 'Simulation of the snowmelt runoff contributing area
 in a small alpine basin', *Hydrology and Earth System Sciences*, 14, pp. 1205–1219. doi:
 doi:10.5194/hess-14-1205-2010.
- Deems, J. S., Fassnacht, S. R. and Elder, K. J. (2006) 'Fractal distribution of snow depth from
 LiDAR data', *Journal of Hydrometeorology*, 7, pp. 285–297.
- Engdahl, N. B., McCallum, J. L. and Massoudieh, A. (2016) 'Transient age distributions in
 subsurface hydrologic systems', *Journal of Hydrology*. Elsevier B.V., 543, pp. 88–100.
 doi: 10.1016/j.jhydrol.2016.04.066.
- Fang, Z. *et al.* (2019) 'Streamflow partitioning and transit time distribution in snow-dominated
 basins as a function of climate', *Journal of Hydrology*. Elsevier, 570(December 2018),
 pp. 726–738. doi: 10.1016/j.jhydrol.2019.01.029.
- Friedrich, R. et al. (2013) 'Factors controlling terrigenic SF6 in young groundwater of the

- 741 Odenwald region (Germany)', *Applied Geochemistry*, 33, pp. 318–329.
- Frisbee, M. D., Tolley, D. G. and Wilson, J. L. (2016) 'Field estimates of groundwater
 circulation depths in two mountainous watersheds in the western U.S. and the effect of
 deep circulation on solute concentrations in streamflow', *Water Resources Research*, 53,
 pp. 2693–2715. doi: 10.1002/2016WR019553.
- Frisbee, M. D., Tolley, D. G. and Wilson, J. L. (2017) 'Field estimates of groundwater
 circulation depths in two mountainous watersheds in the western U.S. and the effect of
 deep circulation on solute concentrations in streamflow', *Water Resources Research*,
 53(4), pp. 2693–2715. doi: 10.1002/2016WR019553.
- Gabrielli, C. P., McDonnell, J. J. and Jarvis, W. T. (2012) 'The role of bedrock groundwater in
 rainfall-runoff response at hillslope and catchment scales', *Journal of Hydrology*.
 Elsevier B.V., 450–451, pp. 117–133. doi: 10.1016/j.jhydrol.2012.05.023.
- Gaskill, D. L. *et al.* (1991) 'Geologic map of the Gothic Quadrangle, Gunnison County,
 Colorado'.
- Gleeson, T. *et al.* (2018) 'The suitability of using dissolved gases to determine groundwater
 discharge to high gradient streams', *Journal of Hydrology*. Elsevier B.V., 557, pp. 561–
 572. doi: 10.1016/j.jhydrol.2017.12.022.
- Gleeson, T. and Manning, A. H. (2008) 'Regional groundwater flow in mountainous terrain:
 Three-dimensional simulations of topographic and hydrogeologic controls', *Water Resources Research*, 44(10), pp. 1–16. doi: 10.1029/2008WR006848.
- Hale, V. C. and McDonnell, J. J. (2016) 'Effect of bedrock permeability on stream base flow
 mean transit time scaling relations: 1. A multiscale catchment intercomparison', *Water Resources Research*, 52(2), pp. 1358–1374. doi: 10.1002/2014WR016124.
- Harbaugh, A. W. (2005) 'MODFLOW-2005, the U.S. Geological Survey Modular Groundwater
 Model The Ground-Water Flow Process', U.S. Geological Survey Technical Methods,
 Book 6, p. Ch. A16.
- Harman, C. J. (2015) 'Time-variable transit time distributions and transport: Theory and
 application to storage-dependent transport of chloride in awatershed', *Water Resources Research*, 51(1), pp. 1–30. doi: 10.1002/2014WR015707.Received.
- Harpold, A. *et al.* (2012) 'Changes in snowpack accumulation and ablation in the intermountain
 west', *Water Resources Research*, 48(11). doi: 10.1029/2012WR011949.

- Hay, L. E., Markstrom, S. L. and Ward-Garrison, C. D. (2011) 'Watershed-scale response to
 climate change through the 21st century for selected basins across the United States', *Earth Interactions*, 15, pp. 1–37.
- Heidbüchel, I. *et al.* (2012) 'The master transit time distribution of variable flow systems', *Water Resources Research*, 48(6), pp. 1–19. doi: 10.1029/2011WR011293.
- Howcroft, W., Cartwright, I. and Morgenstern, U. (2018) 'Mean transit times in headwater
 catchments: Insights from the Otway Ranges, Australia', *Hydrology and Earth System Sciences*, 22(1), pp. 635–653. doi: 10.5194/hess-22-635-2018.
- Hrachowitz, M. *et al.* (2013) 'What can flux tracking teach us about water age distribution
 patterns and their temporal dynamics?', *Hydrology and Earth System Sciences*, 17(2), pp.
 533–564. doi: 10.5194/hess-17-533-2013.
- Hubbard, S. S. *et al.* (2018) 'The East River, Colorado, watershed: A mountainous community
 testbed for improving predictive understanding of multiscale hydrological–
 biogeochemical dynamics', *Vadose Zone Journal*, 17(1). doi: 10.2136/vzj2018.03.0061.
- Huntington, J. L. and Niswonger, R. G. (2012) 'Role of surface-water and groundwater
 interactions on projected summertime streamflow in snow-dominated regions: an
 integrated modeling approach', *Water Resources Research*, 48. doi:
 10.1029/2012WR012319.
- IPCC (2019) 'IPCC Special Report on the Ocean and Cryosphere in a Changing Climate [H.-O.
 Pörtner Roberts, D.C. Masson-Delmotte, V. Zhai, P. Tignor, M. Poloczanska, E.
 Mintenbeck, K. Nicolai, M. Okem, A. Petzold, J. B. Rama, N. Weyer (eds.)]', *In press*,
 (September). doi: https://www.ipcc.ch/report/srocc/.
- Jasechko, S. *et al.* (2016) 'Substantial proportion of global streamflow less than three
 months old', *Nature Geoscience*, 9(2), pp. 126–129. doi: 10.1038/ngeo2636.
- Katsura, S. *et al.* (2009) 'Hydraulic properties of variously weathered granitic bedrock in
 headwater catchments', *Vadose Zone Journal*, 8(3), p. 557. doi:
 doi:10.2136/vzj2008.0142.
- Kirchner, J. W. (2009) 'Catchments as simple dynamical systems: catchment characterization,
 rainfall-runoff modeling, and doing hydrology backward', *Water Resources Research*,
 45. doi: DOI:10.1029/2008WR006912.
- Kolbe, T. et al. (2016) 'Coupling 3D groundwater modeling with CFC-based age dating to

- classify local groundwater circulation in an unconfined crystalline aquifer', *Journal of Hydrology*. Elsevier B.V., 543, pp. 31–46. doi: 10.1016/j.jhydrol.2016.05.020.
- LANDFIRE (2015) *Existing vegetation type and cover layers*, U.S. Department of the Interior,
 Geological Survey. Available at: http://landfire.cr.usgs.gov/viewer/(accessed May 2017).
- Mahlknecht, J. *et al.* (2017) 'Understanding the dynamics and contamination of an urban aquifer
 system using groundwater age (14C, 3H, CFCs) and chemistry', *Hydrological Processes*,
 31(13), pp. 2365–2380. doi: 10.1002/hyp.11182.
- Manning, A. H. (2009) 'Ground-water temperature, noble gas, and carbon isotope data from the
 Española Basin, New Mexico', U.S. Geological Survey Scientific Investigations Report,
 2008–5200, p. 69 p.
- Manning, A. H. *et al.* (2012) 'Evolution of groundwater age in a mountain watershed over a
 period of thirteen years', *Journal of Hydrology*. Elsevier B.V., 460–461, pp. 13–28. doi:
 10.1016/j.jhydrol.2012.06.030.
- Manning, A. H. *et al.* (2013) 'Links between climate change, water-table depth, and water
 chemistry in a mineralized mountain watershed', *Applied Geochemistry*, 37(October
 2016), pp. 64–78. doi: 10.1016/j.apgeochem.2013.07.002.
- Manning, A. H. *et al.* (2019) 'Using stream-side groundwater discharge for geochemical
 exploration in mountainous terrain', *Journal of Geochemical Exploration*, 309. doi:
 doi.org/10.1016/j.gexplo.2019.106415.
- Markovich, K. H. *et al.* (2019) 'Mountain-block Recharge: A Review of Current Understanding'.
 doi: 10.1029/2019WR025676.
- Markstrom, S. L. *et al.* (2008) 'GSFLOW Coupled Ground-Water and Surface-Water Flow
 Model Based on the Integration of the Precipitation-Runoff Modeling System (PRMS)
 and the Modular Ground-Water Flow Model (MODFLOW-2005)':, U.S. Geological *Survey Techniques and Methods*, 6-D1, p. 240.
- Markstrom, S. L. *et al.* (2015) 'PRMS-IV, the precipitation-runoff modeling system, version 4', *U.S. Geological Survey Techniques and Methods, book 6, chap. B7*, p. 158. doi:
 http://dx.doi.org/10.3133/tm6B7.
- Maxwell, R. M. *et al.* (2016) 'The imprint of water and geology on residence times in
 groundwater', *Geophysical Research Letters*, 43, pp. 701–708. doi:
 doi:10.1002/2015GL066916.

- McGuire, K. J. *et al.* (2005) 'The role of topography on catchment-scale water residence time',
 Water Resources Research, 41(5). doi: 10.1029/2004WR003657.
- McGuire, K. J. and McDonnell, J. J. (2006) 'A review and evaluation of catchment transit time
 modeling', *Journal of Hydrology*, 330(3–4), pp. 543–563. doi:
 10.1016/j.jhydrol.2006.04.020.
- Meixner, T. *et al.* (2016) 'Implications of projected climate change for groundwater recharge in
 the western United States', *Journal of Hydrology*. Elsevier B.V., 534(January), pp. 124–
 138. doi: 10.1016/j.jhydrol.2015.12.027.
- Meyer, J. L. *et al.* (2007) 'The contribution of headwater streams to biodiversity in river
 networks', *Journal of the American Water Resources Association*, 43(1), pp. 86–103. doi:
 10.1111/j.1752-1688.2007.00008.x.
- Miller, M. P. *et al.* (2016) 'The importance of base flow in sustaining surface water flow in the
 Upper Colorado River Basin', *Water Resources Research*, 52(5), pp. 3547–3562. doi:
 10.1002/2015WR017963.Received.
- Missik, J. E. C. *et al.* (2019) 'Groundwater-River Water Exchange Enhances Growing Season
 Evapotranspiration and Carbon Uptake in a Semiarid Riparian Ecosystem', *Journal of Geophysical Research: Biogeosciences*, 124(1), pp. 99–114. doi:
 10.1029/2018JG004666.
- Musselman, K. N., Molotch, N. P. and Brooks, P. D. (2008) 'Effects of vegetation on snow
 accumulation and ablation in a mid-latitude sub-alpine forest', *Hydrological Processes*,
 22(15), pp. 2767–2776. doi: 10.1002/hyp.7050.
- Niswonger, R. G., Panday, S. and Ibaraki, M. (2011) 'MODFLOW-NWT, A Newton
 Formulation for MODFLOW-2005', U.S. Geological Survey Groundwater Resources *Program, Techniques and Methods*, 6-A37, p. 44.
- NRCS (1991) Web Soil Survey, United States Department of Agriculture. Available at:
 http://websoilsurvey.nrcs.usda.gov/accessed March 2016.
- Onda, Y. *et al.* (2006) 'Runoff generation mechanisms in high-relief mountainous watersheds
 with different underlying geology', *Journal of Hydrology*, 331, pp. 659–673. doi:
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jhydrol.2006.06.009.
- Painter, T. H. *et al.* (2016) 'The Airborne Snow Observatory: Fusion of scanning lidar, imaging
 spectrometer, and physically-based modeling for mapping snow water equivalent and

- snow albedo', *Remote Sensing of Environment*. Elsevier Inc., 184, pp. 139–152. doi:
 10.1016/j.rse.2016.06.018.
- Perdrial, J. *et al.* (2018) 'A net ecosystem carbon budget for snow dominated forested headwater
 catchments: linking water and carbon fluxes to critical zone carbon storage', *Biogeochemistry*, 138(3), pp. 225–243. doi: 10.1007/s10533-018-0440-3.
- Plummer, L. N. *et al.* (2001) 'Groundwater residence times in Shenandoah National Park, Blue
 Ridge Mountains, Virginia, USA: a multi-tracer approach', *Chemical Geology*, 179, pp.
 93–111.
- Pollock, D. W. (2016) 'User guide for MODPATH Version 7 -- a particle-tracking model for
 MODFLOW', U.S. Geological Survey Open-File Report, 2016–1086, p. 35 p. doi:
 10.3133/ofr20161086.
- Rukundo, E. and Doğan, A. (2019) 'Dominant influencing factors of groundwater recharge
 spatial patterns in Ergene river catchment, Turkey', *Water (Switzerland)*, 11(4). doi:
 10.3390/w11040653.
- Rumsey, C. A. *et al.* (2015) 'Regional Studies Regional scale estimates of baseflow and factors
 influencing baseflow in the Upper Colorado River Basin', *Journal of Hydrology*. Elsevier
 B.V., 4, pp. 91–107.
- Sanford, W. E., Casile, G. and Haase, K. B. (2015) 'Dating base flow in streams using dissolved
 gases and diurnal temperature changes', *Water Resources Research*, pp. 1–14. doi:
 10.1002/2014WR016796.
- Smith, A. A., Tetzlaff, D. and Soulsby, C. (2018) 'Using StorAge Selection functions to quantify
 ecohydrological controls on the time-variant age of evapotranspiration, soil water, and
 recharge', *Hydrology and Earth System Sciences Discussions*, (February), pp. 1–25. doi:
 10.5194/hess-2018-57.
- Solomon, D. K., Cook, P. G. and Sanford, W. E. (1998) *Dissolved gases in subsurface hydrology, Isotope Tracers in Catchment Hydrology*. Edited by C. Kendall and J.
 McDonnell. Amsterdam: Elsevier.
- Stute, M. and Schlosser, P. (2000) 'Atmospheric noble gases', in Cook, P. G. and Herczeg, A. L.
 (eds) *Environmental Tracers in Subsurface Hydrology*. New York: Springer, pp. 349– 377.
- 895 Tetzlaff, D. et al. (2009) 'How does landscape sturcture influence catchment scale transit time

- across different geomorphic provinces?', *Hydrological Processes*, 23, pp. 945–953.
- Toth, J. (1963) 'A theoretical analysis of groundwater flow in small drainage basins', *Journal of Geophysical Research*, 68, pp. 4795–4812. doi: doi:10.1029/JZ068i008p02354.
- Tullborg, E.-L. and Larson, S. A. (2006) 'Porosity in crystalline rocks A matter of scale', *Engineering Geology*, 84(1–2), pp. 75–83. doi: https://doi.org/10.1016/j.enggeo.2005.12.001.
- USGS (2017) U.S. Geological Survey Groundwater Age Dating Laboratory, U.S. Geological
 Survey, Reston, VA. Available at: http://water.usgs.gov/lab/ (Accessed: 23 March 2017).
- Van Der Velde, Y. *et al.* (2012) 'Quantifying catchment-scale mixing and its effect on timevarying travel time distributions', *Water Resources Research*, 48(6), pp. 1–13. doi:
 10.1029/2011WR011310.
- Visser, A. *et al.* (2019) 'Cosmogenic Isotopes Unravel the Hydrochronology and Water Storage
 Dynamics of the Southern Sierra Critical Zone', *Water Resources Research*, pp. 1429–
 1450. doi: 10.1029/2018WR023665.
- Viviroli, D. and Weingartner, R. (2008) 'Water Towers- A Global View of the Hydrological
 Imporants of Mountains.', *Mountains: Sources of Water, Sources of Knowledge*, pp. 15–
 20.
- Wang, K. and Dickinson, R. (2012) 'a Review of Global Terrestrial Evapotranspiration:
 Observation, Modeling, Climatology, and Climate Variability', *Reviews of Geophysics*,
 50(2011), pp. 1–54. doi: 10.1029/2011RG000373.1.INTRODUCTION.
- Welch, L. A. and Allen, D. M. (2014) 'Caractéristiques de la conductivité hydraulique en région
 de montagne et implications pour la conceptualisation des écoulements souterraines dans
 la roche en place', *Hydrogeology Journal*, 22(5), pp. 1003–1026. doi: 10.1007/s10040014-1121-5.
- Winnick, M. J. *et al.* (2017) 'Snowmelt controls on concentration-discharge relationships and the
 balance of oxidative and acid-base weathering fluxes in an alpine catchment, East River,
 Colorado', *Water Resources Research*, 53. doi: 10.1002/2016WR019724.
- Winter, T. C., Rosenberry, D. O. and LaBaugh, J. W. (2001) 'The concept of hydrologic
 landscapes', *Journal of American Water Resources Association*, 37, pp. 335–349. doi:
 doi:10.111/j.1752-1688.2001.tb00973.x.

926

Surface^a K Surface^a Deep Description VKA^b Symbol Epoch Name (modified Gaskill et al., 1991) Porosity (m/s)Porosity 1.2x10⁻⁵ alluvium, fans, debris flow, landslide, 0.2 Qal Holocene Surface Deposits 1 0.1 talus, rock glaciers 1.1×10^{-4} 4.6x10⁻⁷ 3 Tg Oligocene Granodiorite White Rock Pluton - quartz diorite to 0.025 0.0125 quartz manzonite 4.6x10⁻⁷ 3 Sill Oligocene Granodiorite Quartz diorite to quartz manzonite 0.025 0.0125 1.2x10⁻⁶ 3 0.05 Km1 Upper Main Body Mancos mostly silty to sandy marine shale 0.1 Shale Cretaceous 1.2x10⁻⁶ 3 Km2 Upper Lower Member interbedded silty and sandy, calcareous 0.1 0.05 Cretaceous Mancos Shale marine shale, siltstone Dakota Sandstone quartzitic sandstone grading upward to 5.8x10⁻⁶ 3 0.1 Kd 0.05 Upper Cretaceous carbonaceous shale, sandstone, siltstone to fine granded quartite Upper/Middle 1.2x10⁻⁶ 3 0.1 Morrison Fm & Jm: claystone, siltstone, and shale 0.05 JmJe Jurassic Entrada Sandstone (65%) interlensed with cherty sandstone (30%). Je:thick bedded, crosslaminated guartz-arenite, or guartzite 5.8x10⁻⁶ siltstone and sandstone interbedded 3 0.1 PPm Lower Maroon Fm 0.05 Permian/Upperwith conglomerate, mudstone and Middle limestone Pensnsylvanian Middle Gothic Fm 1.2×10^{-6} 3 0.1 Interbedded sandstone, limestone, 0.05 Pg Pennsylvanian siltstone, shale and conglomerate. Metamorphosed along igneous contact

Table 1: Geologic units in Copper Creek and model specified parameters.

^asurface applies to model layer 1 and 2 (\leq 18m). K assumed to decline exponentially with depth

^bratio of vertical to horizontal hydraulic conductivity (anisotropy)

^cdeep applies to model layers 3-12 (18 - 400 m)

Modeled				Estim	ated I	Param	eters			χ^2 Sum	p = 0.1	Acceptable
Gases	EA	C_{xn}	T _r	$\boldsymbol{\tau}_w$	τ_{gnar}	τ_{gsf6}	τ_{g113}	$SF_6 C_{gw}$	CFC-113 C _{gv}	v	χ^2 Sum	Fit?
	(cm ³ STP/g)mg/L	(°C)	(h)	(h)	(h)	(h)	(fmol/L)(pmol/L)	(-)	(-)	
N ₂ , Ar	0.000	<u>0.0</u>	10.0	10.7	0.07					12.6	24.8	Yes
N ₂ , Ar	<u>0.010</u>	<u>0.0</u>	<u>0.0</u>	14.1	0.08					10.6	24.8	Yes
SF ₆ , CFC-113				0.83		0.06	0.08	1.32	0.228	19.1	27.2	Yes
SF ₆ , CFC-113				<u>0.50</u>		0.06	0.07	1.89	0.267	21.9	27.2	Yes
SF ₆ , CFC-113				<u>1.50</u>		0.07	0.14	0.58	0.218	20.7	27.2	Yes
SF ₆ , CFC-113				<u>4.00</u>		0.31	0.14	1.35	0.000	24.9	27.2	Yes
SF_6				0.61		0.25		<u>2.66</u>		100.4	14.7	No
SF_6				0.91		0.37		<u>2.60</u>		71.8	14.7	No
SF_6				1.31		0.46		<u>2.50</u>		42.1	14.7	No
SF_6				1.69		0.48		<u>2.40</u>		26.5	14.7	No
SF_6				2.07		0.49		<u>2.30</u>		17.9	14.7	No
SF_6				2.44		0.48		<u>2.20</u>		12.9	14.7	Yes
SF_6				2.80		0.47		<u>2.10</u>		9.8	14.7	Yes
SF_6				3.15		0.46		<u>2.00</u>		7.8	14.7	Yes
SF_6				4.84		0.43		1.50		4.0	14.7	Yes
SF_6				6.47		0.41		1.00		3.2	14.7	Yes
SF_6				8.08		0.40		<u>0.50</u>		3.0	14.7	Yes
SF_6				9.68		0.39		0.00		2.9	14.7	Yes

929 Table 2. Selected model solutions for stream dissolved gas concentrations.

See text for definitions of model parameters; $cm^3 STP/g = cubic$ centimeters at standard temperature and pressure per gram of water; underlined parameter values were specified not estimated; -- = not estimated or computed; NA = not applicable

930

Water	late Aug.	Median Ag	ge (Years)			
Year	Infterflow (fraction)	Groundwater Only	Baseflow*	Climate Condition		
1995	0.50	11.57	3.30	Wettest year on record, largest snowpack and latest snowmelt		
1998	0.19	11.66	7.80	Median Water Year		
2002	0.03	11.51	11.41	Multiple-year drought 2000-2002		
2012	0.20	11.89	7.62	Single large drought after wet year, good monsoon		
2017	0.22	12.17	7.48	Wet year, gas tracer experiment		
2018	0.01	12.11	11.91	Single large drought after wet year, poor monsoon		

Table 3. Simulated median ages for groundwater and baseflow in Copper Creek for historic climate conditions.

*includes interflow

933 934 935 List of Figures

936

Figure 1. (a) The East River with Copper Creek delineated. Inset shows location of the site in the
context of the western United States and the Upper Colorado River Basin. (b) Geologic cross
section A-A' modified from (Gaskill *et al.*, 1991) with geologic units described in Table 1.

Figure 2. Sampling location CC03 (a) Sum χ^2 between predicted and observed stream water concatenations as a function of contribution groundwater SF₆ concentration. GSFLOW related metrics indicated. (b) SF₆ observed water column concentrations with best fit predicted water column concentrations using baseflow age distributions from original GSFLOW and recalibrated GSFLOW simulation.

946

Figure 3. Copper Creek simulated stream conditions (at the basin outlet) for the recalibrated
GSFLOW model to illustrate interannual variability in stream water source across a range of
historical climate conditions; (a) streamflow, (b) the fraction of streamflow that is interflow.

950

Figure 4. (a) GSFLOW recharge weighted baseflow age cumulative distribution (F(t)) for late August 2017 at the sampling site CC03 and best fit Weibull distributions to calculate stream water SF₆ concentrations shown in Figure 3. Age range of springs based on gas data collected in October 2017 provided. Weibull parameters (refer to equation 3) for the original GSFLOW model k = 0.28, n = 0.44; and for the recalibrated GSFLOW model k = 0.08, n = 0.66. (b) GSFLOW recharge weighted maximum depth of groundwater flow through alluvial and bedrock units (F(depth)) at the watershed outlet. Symbols placed at average depth of model layers 1 to 12.

Figure 5. Groundwater flow path ages through the saturated subsurface for (a) the original GSFLOW model and (b) the recalibrated GSFLOW model. The sampling location for the gas tracer experiment (CC03) and the watershed outlet identified.

962

Figure 6: Sensitivity of groundwater median age to drying, warming and forest removal scenarios with respect to (a) precipitation; and (b) basin-wide net recharge, defined as soil seepage below the rooting zone + stream losses to the groundwater system – groundwater ET. The historic median water year precipitation = 1.28 m/y and corresponding quasi-steady state net recharge (0.22 m/y) separate recharge and topographically controlled groundwater flow paths.

968

Figure 7. Conceptual model of groundwater flow: (a) topographically controlled flow with a high recharge to hydraulic conductivity ratio (R/K). Baseflow median age insensitive to surface dynamics controlling net recharge. (b) Recharge-controlled groundwater flow with a low R/K. Baseflow median age is sensitive to surface processes dictating recharge. ET_{gw} = groundwater ET. Figure 1.







A

Lower Copper Creek | Upper Copper Creek



Figure 2.



Figure 3.



Figure 4.



median _____ Original Gsflow Model Original Gsflow Weibull Age of Oct. Springs 100 10 **Baseflow Age (years)**



Figure 5.



years



Figure 6.



Figure 7.

