# The disappearing lake: An historical analysis of drought and the Salton Sea in the context of the Planetary Health/GeoHealth framework

Pam DeGuzman<sup>1,1</sup> and Aubrey L Doede<sup>2,2</sup>

<sup>1</sup>University of Virginia School of Nursing <sup>2</sup>University of Virginia

May 14, 2020

#### Abstract

The Imperial Valley region of Southeastern California has become one of the most productive agricultural regions in the state. It also has the highest rates of childhood asthma in California. Lack of precipitation in the Imperial Valley has caused the water level of the Salton Sea to recede to a record low since its formation in the early 1900s. Previous studies of wind and dust deposition conducted in other regions have shown how reduced precipitation, ground heating, and the diminishing water level in an arid climate pose a risk of exposing previously-sequestered toxic chemicals to open air, adversely affecting lung health. The purpose of this study is to draw historical parallels between the Aral Sea and Salton Sea in the context of geomorphology, ecology, human health, economics, and human migration, to inform an assessment of environmentally related health impacts of those living in the Imperial Valley region. Future droughts and heatwaves are expected to rise in frequency and severity, and may disproportionately affecting those impacted by financial and health disparities. Future research must include the implications of population health in the context of Planetary Health and GeoHealth as a result of the most recent drought and the receding water levels of the Salton Sea.









1	The Disappearing Lake: An Historical Analysis of Drought and the Salton Sea in
2	the Context of the Planetary Health/GeoHealth Framework
3	
4	Aubrey L. Doede <sup>1</sup> , Pamela B. DeGuzman <sup>1</sup>
5	
6	
7	
8	
9	<sup>1</sup> University of Virginia
10	School of Nursing
11	225 Jeanette Lancaster Way
12	Charlottesville, VA 229803
13	
14	
15	
16	Author Contact and ORCID Identifiers:
17	AL Doede:
18	ALD7DT@virginia.edu
19	https://orcid.org/0000-0002-9977-2806
20	PB DeGuzman:
21	PRB7Y@virginia.edu
22	https://orcid.org/0000-0003-3229-8422

# 23 Key Points

24	•	Comparisons between the Imperial Valley and the Aral Sea environmental
25		disaster may be drawn to identify the potential human health hazards.
26	٠	In the Imperial Valley, financial and health disparities may make exposure to
27		airborne toxic particles near the diminishing Salton Sea an unavoidable
28		consequence of the inability to move away from the area.
29	•	A Planetary Health/GeoHealth perspective is needed to evaluate the region in a
30		context of human health and sustainable resource allocation.

## 32 Abstract

33 The Imperial Valley region of Southeastern California has become one of the most 34 productive agricultural regions in the state. It also has the highest rates of childhood asthma in California. Lack of precipitation in the Imperial Valley has caused the water 35 level of the Salton Sea to recede to a record low since its formation in the early 1900s. 36 37 Previous studies of wind and dust deposition conducted in other regions have shown how reduced precipitation, ground heating, and the diminishing water level in an arid 38 39 climate pose a risk of exposing previously-sequestered toxic chemicals to open air, adversely affecting lung health. The purpose of this study is to draw historical parallels 40 between the Aral Sea and Salton Sea in the context of geomorphology, ecology, human 41 health, economics, and human migration, to inform an assessment of environmentally 42 related health impacts of those living in the Imperial Valley region. Future droughts and 43 heatwaves are expected to rise in frequency and severity, and may disproportionately 44 45 affecting those impacted by financial and health disparities. Future research must include the implications of population health in the context of Planetary Health and 46 GeoHealth as a result of the most recent drought and the receding water levels of the 47 Salton Sea. 48

49

# 51 **1.1. Introduction**

In 2011 and 2012, while the California drought was approaching peak severity. 52 Imperial County's rate of asthma-related emergency department admissions for children 53 was among the highest in California and double that of the entire state (Arballo et al., 54 2014), putting nearly 52,000 children in the area at risk of health consequences from dry 55 56 and dusty air (United States Census, 2015). Human activity and the construction of elaborate infrastructure for irrigation has led to the Imperial Valley region (contained 57 within Southeastern California's Imperial County) to become one of the most productive 58 59 agricultural regions in California despite its naturally arid climate. The water level of the Salton Sea, located centrally within Imperial County (Figure 1), has been diminishing, in 60 part as a result of evaporation, and decreased precipitation and river flow. California's 61 most severe drought took place between the years 2012 and 2017 (Barreau et al., 62 2017; Griffin & Anchukaitis, 2014), including four of those years under a government-63 64 declared state of emergency.

Contamination of the Salton Sea with fertilizer and pesticide compounds from 65 agriculture have the potential to contribute to worsened asthma symptoms (Bloudoff-66 67 Indelicato, 2012) and may already be placing children at risk for diminished lung health. In an arid climate, a reduction in precipitation and associated ground heating (resulting 68 from the diminishing water level and exposed lake bed) can increase airborne 69 70 particulate matter, which is known to adversely affect lung health (Christian-Smith, Levy, & Gleick, 2015; D'Amato & Cecchi, 2008). Airborne pollutants impact long-term lung 71 health of children and adolescents who live in areas with high pollution rates and are 72 73 more susceptible due to increased time spent outdoors (Gauderman et al., 2004, 2002).

Today, Imperial County has the highest rates of asthma in children compared with the
entire state of California. Future droughts and heatwaves are expected to rise in
frequency and severity. Climate events often disproportionately affect those already
impacted by financial and health disparities, and may be more severe for individuals
living in lower-income communities with fewer resources to avoid or respond to
environmental changes [Cook, Smerdon, Seager, & Cook, 2014; Costello et al., 2009;
Griffin & Anchukaitis, 2014; O'Connor et al., 2014]).

Health-related consequences of the California drought in this region has gained 81 attention in recent years (Johnston, Razafy, Lugo, Olmedo, & Farzan, 2019); however, 82 the specific environmental changes and their effect on human health remains largely 83 understudied. Comparing the region to health impacts of droughts in similar, highly-84 studied regions allows an assessment of the potential health impacts of drought in 85 Imperial County today. A number of notable consequences from droughts and resource 86 mismanagement worldwide have contributed to detrimental health effects in humans 87 (Gomez, Parker, Dosman, & McDuffie, 1992; Hefflin et al., 1991; Kelley, Mohtadi, Cane, 88 Seager, & Kushnir, 2015; Smith, Aragão, Sabel, & Nakaya, 2014). Notably, regional 89 90 characteristics, desiccation, and drought-related health impacts of the Aral Sea Basin in Central Asia have been well documented and offer multiple opportunities for 91 comparisons to the Salton Sea and the health risks that are placed upon residents of 92 93 the Imperial Valley. In this paper, the phenomenon of the Aral Sea, including its geomorphological properties, economic history, political context, and pathways of 94 95 human exposure to toxic contaminants as a result of drought and water over-allocation 96 are explored in the context of its similarities to the Salton Sea's current state of

desiccation and decline. The purpose of this study is to draw historical parallels
between the Aral Sea and Salton Sea in the context of geomorphology, ecology, human
health, economics, and human migration, to inform an assessment of potential
environmentally-related health impacts of those living in the Imperial Valley region.

101

## **102 1.2. The Planetary Health/GeoHealth Framework**

The Planetary Health/GeoHealth framework provides an ideal context for the 103 current research. The emerging field is based on the assumption that human, animal, 104 105 and ecosystem health should be addressed jointly in order to address the root causes of environmental decline and human disease (Frumkin, 2017). This emerging framework 106 suggests that human health is affected by a set of environmental conditions and that the 107 disruption of natural and ecological systems by human activity are the drivers of 108 environmental changes, including pollution, biodiversity loss, land degradation, resource 109 scarcity, and climate change. These drivers interact in complex ways, both with each 110 other and with proximate causes of human health effects, including exposure to natural 111 hazards (Myers, 2017). The health and integrity of the Salton Sea's local ecosystem 112 113 should be considered within the context of the health of the population living near the Salton Sea, and likewise, the population's health should be considered within the 114 context of possible environmental conditions and exposures. 115

116

## 117 **2.1. Historical Context: The Aral Sea**

118 The disappearance of the Aral Sea during the 1960s and 1970s has been 119 referred to as a "quiet Chernobyl" (Glantz & Figueroa, 1997) and has been referred to

as one of the worst environmental events of the past century (United Nations 120 Environmental Programme, 1992). Accelerated by unsustainable irrigation and water 121 management practices during the mid-1900s, the Aral Sea underwent a desiccation 122 process that resulted in a statistically significant increase in respiratory disease in 123 countries surrounding the Aral Sea and beyond (O'Hara, Wiggs, Mamedov, Davidson, & 124 125 Hubbard, 2000; Wiggs et al., 2003). In addition, residents in the region experienced higher rates of cancer, hepatic and renal diseases, and pregnancy complications than 126 ever before in this region, resulting from toxic chemicals in drinking water from farm 127 128 runoff (Whish-Wilson, 2002).

129

2.2. Geology, water allocation, and agricultural economy of the Aral Sea Basin 130 The Aral Sea is an endorheic lake in Central Asia, crossing the current country 131 borders of Kazakhstan and Uzbekistan, that is primarily supplied by two major rivers, 132 the Syr Darya and Amu Darya, for the supply of water in the setting of an arid 133 continental climate (White, 2013). The early 1900s marked a spike in productivity for the 134 region, supporting large fishing and cotton industries that were a major supply of food 135 136 and exports for Russia (White, 2013). This quickly necessitated the diversion of water from the Syr Darya and Amu Darya rivers toward irrigation for agriculture. Following the 137 Second World War, The Aral Sea Basin underwent further development, referred to as 138 139 "the Stalin plan for remodeling nature" (Grigoryev, 1952, p. 170), as the Soviet Union was driven by the desire for self-reliance in the production of all crops necessary to 140 support its population (Whish-Wilson, 2002). The plan centered on an increase of the 141 142 production of water-intensive crops in the area, particularly cotton, and, to a lesser

143 extent, wheat and maize.

The agricultural developments and production of the Twentieth Century were 144 bolstered by way of manmade canals to divert water from the Aral Sea's major feeding 145 rivers to irrigation ditches (Aus Der Beek, Voß, & Flörke, 2011; Indoitu et al., 2015; Lee 146 & Jung, 2018; Shukla Mcdermid & Winter, 2017; White, 2013). Priority for water 147 148 resource allocation was given almost entirely to the production of crops, including the emptying of nearby reservoirs to cover any deficit (O'Hara, 2000), and effectively ending 149 the nomadic tradition of indigenous populations in favor of settling and cultivating 150 151 farmland in the setting of increased immigration of farmers to the area (White, 2013).

152

# 153 **2.3. Aral Sea desertification**

The Cold War Era intensified the Soviet Union's need to increase irrigation and cultivation of the land independently, and by the 1980s, the Soviet Union was the second-largest exporter of cotton in the world (White, 2013). An increased demand for irrigation to support the cotton economy continued to divert river water from the Aral Sea, and by the 1980s, no river water reached the Aral Sea during average or dry years (Whish-Wilson, 2002). Between 1960 and 1989, the Aral Sea's water volume diminished by over half (White, 2013).

161 Soviet-era irrigation practices, combined with high evaporation during the summer 162 months, has left behind a nearly dry and empty lake basin (Figure 2) (Indoitu et al., 163 2015). Today, the Aral Sea totals less than half of its surface area and a quarter of its 164 volume since the 1960s (Lee & Jung, 2018), and the salinity of the remaining water has

reached levels similar to ocean water (Crighton, Elliott, Upshur, Van Der Meer, & Small,

2003). The resulting Aralkum Desert has seen significant increases in extreme air
temperatures and overall summer air temperatures (Indoitu et al., 2015; Shukla
Mcdermid & Winter, 2017). Aus Der Beek and colleagues (2011) have concluded that
while global climate change alone has been a factor in the desertification of the Aral
Sea Basin, direct interference in the form of abstractions from the water supply have
contributed to approximately 86% of the Aral Sea's dramatic reduction in its water level.

# 173 **2.4. Human health and economic impacts of the Aral Sea desiccation**

As soon as the early 1900s, the ecological ramifications of increased irrigation and agricultural activity on human health began to emerge. In addition to salinization of soils from the river water, massive diversions of water to farmland areas saturated the water table and created increased areas of swampland, contributing to malarial outbreaks in the region (White, 2013).

In addition to the desertification of the Aral Sea Basin, the overambitious agricultural 179 development on the part of the Soviet Union included the use of toxic pesticides, 180 fertilizers, herbicides, salts, and other chemicals, such as the organophosphate 181 phosalone and organochlorines PCB, Toxaphene, Lindane (HCH), and DDT (Crighton 182 et al., 2003) in amounts far higher than were used elsewhere in the Soviet Union 183 (White, 2013). Most notably, the chemical TCDD (an active ingredient in Agent Orange 184 185 and a known human carcinogen) was deployed in cotton fields (White, 2013). These chemicals made their way to the Aral Sea and were confined underwater, later to be 186 187 exposed as the water level diminished (Indoitu et al., 2015).

188 The dry lake basin in present day can distribute these chemicals across distances

reaching up to 500 kilometers (Indoitu et al., 2015) in what has come to be known as 189 "white dust storms:" clouds of toxic dust produced when combined with dry weather and 190 strong winds" (Figure 3). White dust storms have been increasing in frequency and 191 severity in the Aral Sea Basin (Indoitu et al., 2015; Shukla Mcdermid & Winter, 2017) at 192 the same time that they have become less frequent in the general area (Indoitu et al., 193 194 2015). As a result, the rate of dust deposition, containing high concentrations of toxic chemicals, are among the highest in the world (O'Hara et al., 2000) and have infiltrated 195 not only the air but also the water and food supply pathways (Crighton et al., 2003; 196 197 Kaneko et al., 2003).

Recent evidence (outlined in Table 1) demonstrates the multiple human health 198 and environmental effects that have arisen as a result of the Aral Sea's desiccation 199 process. Furthermore, the recession of the Aral Sea's water level between 1960 and 200 1970 (Crighton et al., 2003) and the resulting increase in water salinity caused the 201 collapse of the region's fishing industry in what remained of the Aral Sea. This forced 202 mass out-migration from the area and lasting high rates of unemployment and economic 203 hardship (Crighton et al., 2003). In the setting of economic collapse and health 204 205 concerns, those who were able to do so migrated away from the area, leaving behind a marginalized population that did not possess the resources to relocate (White, 2013). 206 207

Authors	Study Area(s)	Health Assessment	Environmental Assessment	Findings (Health)	Findings (Environmental)	Study Limitations
Bennion et al. (2007)	Karakalpakstan, Uzbekistan	Questionnaire-based assessment of household exposures and self-reported respiratory health (asthma, allergic rhinitis, pneumonia) Pulmonary function (FEV1) collected via portable spirometer	Dust deposition rates (PM <sub>10</sub> and PM <sub>2.5</sub> ) within 5 km of study populations	Some evidence for an inverse relationship between FEV <sub>1</sub> and dust exposure, but no significant relationship was found	Highest rates of dust deposition occurred during the summer months and in the region closest to the original shoreline. No significant variation between PM <sub>10</sub> vs. PM <sub>2.5</sub> fractions.	Unable to test difference between asthma and allergic rhinitis. Cross-sectional study does not allow for testing for children with wheezing
Crighton et al. (2003)	Karakalpakstan, Uzbekistan	Questionnaire-based assessment of perceived environment, social support networks, psychosocial health, and self-rated somatic health (general)	None	High rates of poor self-rated health Respondents were more likely to have poor self-rated health if they were concerned about environmental problems and had an intermediate or higher education level.	None	Lower-than-expected ratings of poor health and environmental may be due to mass out- migration from the region, leaving behind individuals who were less concerned about these issues.
Indoitu et al. (2015)	Aral Sea region	None	Remote sensing observations (satellite imagery, ozone mapping spectrometry) to track frequency, size, and sources of dust storms and aerosol concentrations over the region	None	The Aral Sea dry lake bed has been a strong source of dust emissions since 2000 and has included the northern and southern desert areas as dust sources. Dust storm frequency, composition, and structure have changed as a result of the Aral Sea desiccation process. Dust emissions originating from the	Absence of meteorological monitoring stations on the dried Aral Sea surface

**Table 1.** Review of the environmental and human health impacts in the region of the Aral Sea Basin.

					Aralkum desert are capable of traveling hundreds of kilometers.	
Kaneko et al. (2003)	Kazalinsk District, Kazakhstan and control area	Questionnaire-based assessment of overall health, gastrointestinal symptoms Renal tubular cell injury as measured by urine sampling	None	Significantly higher prevalence of gastrointestinal symptoms, abnormal renal labs in children living in the Aral Sea region vs. control.	None	Unknown specific cause for renal tubular dysfunction found in the study area.
Kunii et al. (2010)	Kazalinsk District, Kazakhstan and control area	Questionnaire-based assessment of household exposures and respiratory symptoms (pneumonia, chest infection, wheeze)	None	Significantly higher prevalence of wheeze and restrictive pulmonary dysfunction among subjects in the Aral Sea region compared to those living farther away. No significant difference for asthma or obstructive pulmonary dysfunction.	None	Confounding factors related to measurement bias during questionnaire e administration and weather-related variability in pulmonary function performance
O'Hara et al. (2000)	Eastern Turkmenistan	None	Airborne dust deposition rates (PM <sub>10</sub> ) and physical/chemical composition	None	Dust deposition rates were higher desert in monitoring sites than those closer to the Aral Sea. PM <sub>10</sub> values were greater at sites near to irrigated areas compared to the desert. High levels of phosphalone (organophosphate) contamination were found across sites and were highest in irrigated areas despite the	None noted

					cessation of pesticide spraying.	
Wiggs et al. (2003)	Karakalpakstan, Uzbekistan	Questionnaire-based assessment of household exposures and respiratory symptoms (chronic cough, wheeze, asthma) Pulmonary function (FEV <sub>1</sub> ) collected via electronic volume-flow spirometer	Dust deposition rates (PM <sub>10</sub> ) within 5 km of study populations	Children living closer to the former shoreline had a lower prevalence of respiratory health problems compared to main agricultural and urban areas.	Summer months experienced conditions (temperature, precipitation, wind patterns) that were conducive to increased sediment erosion and dust transport, especially in the northern portion of the study area. During the dusty season, deposition rates of PM10 far exceeded US EPA standards.	Likelihood that dust is not the only environmental factor that may cause changes in human health. Dust deposition data indicates multiple potential sources of dust Monthly aggregate data may mask short-term effects on health caused by single dust events(Wiggs et al., 2003)

Of the area making up the former Soviet Union, the Aral Sea region has been 212 recorded as having the highest rates of tuberculosis, far exceeding the classifications of 213 an epidemic outbreak (Wiggs et al., 2003). Based on evidence of dust deposition 214 patterns as demonstrated by Bennion et al. (2007) and Wiggs et al. (2003) and surveys 215 of respiratory symptoms and illness, it is possible that dust in the Aral Sea region was 216 217 the cause of these symptoms. Infant mortality rates in the region are among the world's highest, exceeding 100 deaths per 1,000 live births (Wiggs et al., 2003). In children, 218 autopsy results have shown a strong relationship between proximity to the Aral Sea 219 220 region and lung tissue changes, including fibrosing alveolitis and damage of interstitial lung tissue (Kunii et al., 2010). 221

222

## **3.1. California's Imperial Valley and the Salton Sea Basin**

In the region of the Aral Sea Basin, the economic, environmental, and humanhealth impacts on the local population is a warning for a present phenomenon. Though not connected by people or place, the Aral Sea and Salton Sea regions are comparable through similar geologies, economic goals, strains on the natural systems, and impacts of the local and regional environments on human health.

229

# **3.2. The Salton Sea: Geology, water allocation, and agricultural economy**

The Salton Sea in California's Imperial County, like the Aral Sea, is an endorheic geologic depression located at the northern end of the Imperial Valley and lies over 200 feet below sea level (Cohn, 2000). The Salton Sea was preceded by the much-larger ancient water body, Lake Cahuilla, which underwent repeated expansion and

contraction due to repeated flooding from the Colorado River during prehistoric times 235 and ultimately dried up completely by the 16<sup>th</sup> Century (Cohn, 2000; Laylander, 1995). 236 The resulting Salton Sea Basin (also known as the Salton Depression) remained dry 237 until 1905, when a faulty canal gate, meant to corral the Colorado River for irrigation, 238 flooded the area and resulted in what is currently the Salton Sea (Cohn, 2000; Xu, Bui, 239 240 Lamerdin, & Schlenk, 2016). At 35 miles long, up to 15 miles wide and holding approximately 7.5 million acre-feet of water, it is currently the third-largest saltwater lake 241 in North America (Cohn, 2000). 242

As with the Aral Sea's two main feeding rivers, the Imperial Valley's Colorado River 243 serves as the main water source for large human developments in an arid climate and is 244 bolstered by a complex system of canals. Seven states in the Southwestern United 245 States – five of which are some of the fastest growing states in the country – depend on 246 the Colorado River, whose major landmarks include Lake Mead and the Hoover Dam 247 (which supplies the Las Vegas area) in addition to the Salton Sea. Though the Salton 248 Sea's heyday was marked by beachfront properties and images of the Hollywood elite 249 visiting the "miracle in the desert" on holiday, this massive body of water has no natural 250 251 feeding rivers to maintain its water level due to the accidental nature of its modern existence (Goodyear, 2015; Xu et al., 2016). 252

In the midst of its time as the center of a booming tourist destination, the original purpose of the Colorado River canal system also gave way to a flourishing agricultural industry, thanks to the seemingly endless supply of water from the river. Use of water from the Colorado River, as with the Amu Darya and Syr Darya of the Aral Sea Basin, was propagated by the United States government, incentivized by the prospect of irrigation and agricultural production in an area offering a year-round growing season(Arballo et al., 2014).

Though the mechanisms of water inefficiency in agriculture between the Aral and Salton Seas differ politically – one a result of the Soviet Party's economic and political need for increased production, and one that has been maintained by a political chokehold held by local farming lobbies on the government's sustainability efforts – the result in both areas has been an unsustainable use of water resources toward the production of water-inefficient crops in the context of the local climates due to the lack of incentives for conservation.

The Colorado River was first turned into a source for California agriculture during a 267 particularly wet year, setting off a history of excessive and unsustainable water use (The 268 Economist, 2014). The sense of water from the Colorado River as a birthright to farmers 269 was carried forth by the Law of the River agreement in 1922, which established 270 California's share of the River's water (shared by Colorado, Nevada, and Utah) and set 271 the price of its agriculture-designated water at \$0.20 per gallon (Goodyear, 2015). In 272 Imperial Valley in 1924, the Salton Sea was designated as an agricultural sump as a 273 274 result of irrigation runoff from nearby farmland. Despite the naturally dry climate and relative lack of a natural local water supply, the low price of water – left unchanged to 275 this day – did little to discourage the production of water-intensive crops and use of 276 277 flood irrigation by farmers in the area (Goodyear, 2015).

The once-thriving beachfront communities along the Salton Sea, dependent on the ebbs and flows from farmland irrigation, eventually became ghost towns, their piers for jet skis and fishing now ending hundreds of feet from the receding shoreline. Despite

the fate of these vacation towns, water from the Colorado River continued to feed the 281 vast swaths of farmland in the Imperial Valley, at one point pulling approximately 5.2 282 million acre-feet of water from the Colorado River (Cohn, 2000). Today, the Imperial 283 Valley is still one of California's most productive agricultural areas and holds the largest 284 water right from the Colorado River (Arballo et al., 2014). As a result of the arid climate 285 and irrigation from the 475,000 acres of farmland in Imperial Valley (Cohn, 2000; 286 Orlando, Smalling, & Kuivila, 2006), 75% of water inflow to the Salton Sea now 287 originates almost exclusively from agricultural drainage from Imperial Valley via two 288 289 southern streams in Imperial County and a third originating from Riverside County, to the north of the Salton Sea. (Orlando et al., 2006; Xu et al., 2016) 290

291

## **3.3. Desiccation, ecological impacts, and current state of the Salton Sea**

As in the Aral Sea region, the lack of precipitation in the Imperial Valley region has caused the water level of the Salton Sea to recede (Figure 4). Years of recent water scarcity have forced farms to conserve of water, and in 2013, half a million acres of farmland were left fallow due to drought conditions (Economist, 2015). This led to the reduction of irrigation runoff into the Salton Sea and is compounded by the natural evaporation from the water surface.

Though not a direct comparison to the Amu Darya and Syr Darya rivers, whose natural water supply was diverted away from the Aral Sea for irrigation nearby, the impact on the seas' salinity and ecology are comparable. The Salton Sea's water level is currently at a record low in the modern era. Since its creation, the sea has since become home to abundant populations of water fowl, including some species of

endangered birds, that are dependent on this body of water along the Pacific flyway 304 (Cohn, 2000). However, salinity of the lake, most recently measured at 45 grams per 305 liter, is already 25% more saline than the Pacific Ocean (King, Etvemezian, Sweeney, 306 Buck, & Nikolich, 2011). This, combined with frequent algal blooms and depletion of the 307 water's dissolved oxygen content, has made survival a challenge for most animals that 308 309 call the lake home (Cohn, 2000; Kaiser, 1999). The loss of this habitat is significant, as the loss of California's natural wetlands due to human development has made the 310 Salton Sea a critical ecological resource (Cohn, 2000). 311

312

#### **313 3.4. Drivers of human health impacts of the Salton Sea's desiccation process**

The existence of the Salton Sea in its current state is more than an eyesore or an 314 ecological conundrum; the Salton Sea may also be the source of current, and likely 315 future, health risks to the nearby human population. Similar geographic and 316 environmental features (Gomez et al., 1992; O'Hara et al., 2000; Wiggs et al., 2003) 317 between the two water bodies and regions suggest a link between these features and 318 adverse health consequences in California that may resemble that which occurred half 319 320 a world away. Evidence of human health impacts resulting from drought conditions in the Imperial Valley of Southern California is limited to anecdotal evidence in the form of 321 newspaper articles and editorials highlighting the respiratory health of residents in the 322 323 area and the impact of health disparities on families' inability to effectively cope with environmental risk factors (Bloudoff-Indelicato, 2012; Goodyear, 2015; Ketcham, 2012). 324 Local socioeconomic statistics suggest that residents in the Imperial Valley are 325 326 susceptible to poverty-related health risks associated with living in the region. During a

drought or other environmental event, individuals living in areas such as this inland 327 county may be disproportionately impacted due to financial burdens and health 328 disparities. The 2013 median family income of Imperial County was over 25% below the 329 median national family income, and 23.3% of families were below the federal poverty 330 level, compared to 15.9% in the United States (Arballo et al., 2014). Individuals and 331 332 families with fewer economic resources may be unable to adhere to asthma guidelines or move away from the area in order to reduce exposure to poor air quality (Bureau, 333 2015). 334

Diminishing water levels in the Salton Sea poses a risk of exposing previously-335 sequestered toxic chemicals to the open air. Both the Aral and Salton Seas are terminal 336 lakes in dry, arid climates. The use of agricultural chemicals on nearby farmland in both 337 regions has accumulated in each region's body of water, and these previously-338 submerged chemicals have been increasingly exposed to the open air due to water 339 evaporation. Studies have found these chemicals in the air in the area surrounding the 340 Aral Sea. Rivers feeding the Salton Sea drain pesticides, including DDT, chlorpyrifos, 341 dieldrin, PCBs, selenium, and toxaphene, among other toxins (de Vlaming et al., 2004; 342 343 Orlando et al., 2006; Xu et al., 2016). Although the Salton Sea's desiccation process is still in its beginning stages, previous studies of wind in the Imperial Valley and dust 344 deposition from the Salton Sea's borders (King et al., 2011) have shown that the 345 346 diminishing water level poses a similar risk of exposing previously-sequestered toxic chemicals to the open air as evaporation continues. 347

**Table 2.** Review of environmental testing in the Salton Sea and Imperial Valley region.

Authors	Environmental Assessment	Measurements	Findings
de Vlaming et al. (2004)	Presence of insecticides in water of Salton Sea's contributing rivers (Alamo River and New River)	Toxicity testing of water using mortality rates of three aquatic species	Toxicity of water samples was due to organophosphate insecticides, chlorpyrifos, and diazinon
King et al. (2011)	Relationships between season, soil properties, and windblown dust emissions	PM <sub>10</sub> dust emissions; soil sampling for moisture content, and chemistry.	Some degree of seasonality in Salton Sea's dust emission potential among soft crusts, producing significant dust emissions from winter to early spring, as well as minimally fluctuating emissions from dry wash surfaces No correlation between PM <sub>10</sub> emissions and soil composition/texture, though dry wash sites consistently produced higher PM <sub>10</sub> emissions compared to other landform types.
Orlando et al. (2006)	Presence of pesticides in water and suspended sediment in Salton Sea's contributing rivers	Gas chromatography/mass spectrometry for detection of organochlorine pesticides	Over 75% of samples contained chlorpyrifos, DCPA, EPTC, and trifluralin. Samples from the Alamo River contained maximum dissolved concentrations and contained greater numbers of pesticides compared to the New River samples. Maximum concentrations of carbofuran, chlorpyrifos, diazinon, and malathion were higher than US EPA aquatic life benchmarks.
Xu et al. (2016)	Presence of contaminants in Salton Sea water, its feeding rivers, sediment, and fish tissue	Toxicity testing of water;	<ul> <li>Water and sediment samples showed contamination by DDTs, PAHs, chlorpyrios, pyrethroid insecticides, copper, and chromium.</li> <li>While tributary river water was more contaminated than water in the Salton Sea, the Salton Sea's sediment showed higher levels of contamination than river sediment.</li> <li>Fish tissue samples showed contamination of DDTs, selenium, and chlorpyrifos.</li> </ul>

The similarities between the Aral and Salton seas are further evidence of the human 349 effects of drought in a region that is geographically and climatologically similar to the 350 Salton Sea and which went through very similar farming and irrigation practices like 351 those happening near the Salton Sea. Although the parallels between specific 352 characteristics of both populations are not exact, both regions contain or have contained 353 354 populations who are socioeconomically vulnerable to climate conditions, in part due to their inability to relocate. Residents of the Imperial Valley may only have started to see 355 health effects of drought only in recent years. However, historical evidence presented 356 357 here suggests that attention needs to be paid to the future public health impacts of environmental pollutants on the Imperial Valley population, and water resource 358 allocation policy should be reconsidered as a measure to impact public health. 359

360

# **361 3.5. The "Costs of Inaction" in the Salton Sea Region**

The Aral Sea environmental crisis and its consequences on the local economic 362 climate as well as human health and migration have been studied extensively with the 363 aid of many years' hindsight. In the area surrounding the Salton Sea, the full extent of 364 365 its impact on human health and the environment have yet to be fully observed. In a 2014 report, Cohen (2014) outlined the projected "costs of inaction" from a range of 366 issues that may provide insight into the price of the decline of the Salton Sea region 367 368 (i.e., the estimated costs to the public if no large-scale mitigation efforts are implemented). Notably, the report found that the cost of dust emissions on the local 369 370 population's health could amount to up to \$37 billion USD (2014 through 2047) and 371 between \$10 and 26 billion in non-use value costs in terms of ecological and habitat

worth.

373

# **4.1. Discussion**

In an effort to increase agricultural productivity, the governments in the Aral Sea and 375 Imperial Valley regions introduced policies that included widespread irrigation projects 376 377 and other support systems for agriculture at the expense of sustainable practices. In the Aral Sea basin, productivity was driven by Soviet demands and resulted in a diversion 378 of natural feeding rivers toward agricultural land. Farmers in the Imperial Valley 379 380 responded to market demands for produce and were motivated by the low price of water to produce water-intensive crops and have turned the area into one of the most 381 productive regions in the country for agricultural products. As a result of placing 382 unreasonable demands on the environment during non-drought periods, the misuse of 383 water resources in the Aral Sea basin has led to a collapse of the agricultural system 384 and the economy upon which it depended. Similarly, the high productivity of the Imperial 385 Valley's agricultural economy, relative to the state of California, suggests the 386 consequences of drought may impact the US on a broader scale. California is the most 387 388 populous state in the US with the country's largest economy, accounting for 12% of the population and 13% of the nation's GDP (Young, 2016). In addition, the socioeconomic 389 status of many residents of the area implies that in the event of a public health crisis, 390 391 additional strain will be placed on public healthcare payors, such as Medicaid and Medicare. The combination of these factors provides substantial risk for impacting a 392 393 large section of the country's healthcare and economic sectors.

#### **4.2.** A case for further exploration in the context of Planetary Health

Evidence of the occurrence of anthropogenic change to the environment in other 396 areas of the world, as well as the human health and economic impacts of these 397 changes, provides a scientific premise for the investigation of similar environmental 398 impacts on the health of California residents. Presently, California's Governor has lifted 399 400 the state of emergency due to the recent drought, initiated in 2014 (State of California Department of Water Resources, 2017). This easement should be interpreted 401 cautiously, and not as a prediction of unfaltering future improvement of conditions. The 402 403 years of 2012-2016 marked the state and region's worst drought in over a century (Griffin & Anchukaitis, 2014). Droughts associated with anthropogenic climate change 404 are expected to recur across North America (Cook et al., 2014; Costello et al., 2009; 405 Griffin & Anchukaitis, 2014; O'Connor et al., 2014). 406

407

#### 408 **5.1. Conclusion**

The Salton Sea shares several major characteristics with its historical partner, the Aral Sea, and suggests that the health impacts of agricultural activity in the Salton Sea region must be studied in the context of human interference with an ecosystem and water availability as a result of unsustainable farming practices.

Climate change and the increase in respiratory disease incidence and severity (Sarfaty et al., 2015) calls for the need of further interdisciplinary research within the emerging field of Planetary Health/GeoHealth or the impact of the health of the Imperial Valley's ecology on the respiratory health of its residents. Since the 1970s, droughts worldwide have been longer and more severe. Future droughts and extreme heatwaves are expected to continue to rise in frequency and severity, disproportionately affecting
those already impacted by health disparities (Costello et al., 2009; O'Connor et al.,
2014).

New research into the impacts of poor respiratory health in drought areas will 421 provide a perspective on underrepresented environmental challenges at the local and 422 regional levels. The future of health will require a more robust integration with 423 environmental science research and policy, as drought is one of the most expensive 424 natural events from a number of economic and public health vantage points (Cook et 425 426 al., 2014). This must include, but certainly will not be limited to, the implications of population health associated with the most recent California drought and the receding 427 water levels of the Salton Sea. The Planetary Health/GeoHealth framework addresses 428 this intersection between human and ecosystem health. Planetary Health/GeoHealth 429 functions within other fields, including agriculture, economics, and urban planning, 430 among others, as well as the health and environmental sciences. In the context of 431 Imperial County and the Salton Sea, this may also extend to the more efficient utilization 432 of water resources for irrigation. 433

434

#### 435 **References**

- 436 State of California Department of Water Resources (2017). Governor's Drought
- 437 Declaration. Retrieved June 13, 2017, from
- 438 http://www.water.ca.gov/waterconditions/declaration.cfm
- 439 Arballo, E., Baza, M., Mendoza, V., Conde, M., Cason, D., Zavala, F., & Gran, M. T.
- 440 (2014). Imperial County comprehensive economic development strategy 2014-2015

- 441 *annual update*. El Centro, CA. Retrieved from
- http://www.co.imperial.ca.us/announcements%5CPDFs%5CCEDSpubliccomment.pdf
- 444 Aus Der Beek, T., Voß, F., & Flörke, M. (2011). Modelling the impact of Global Change
- on the hydrological system of the Aral Sea basin. *Physics and Chemistry of the*
- 446 *Earth*, 36, 684–695. doi: 10.1016/j.pce.2011.03.004
- Barreau, T., Conway, D., Hought, K., Jackson, R., Kreutzer, R., Lockman, A., ... A., W.
- J. (2017). Physical, mental, and financial impacts from drought in two California
- 449 counties, 2015. American Journal of Public Health, 107(5), 783–790. doi:
- 450 10.2105/AJPH.2017.303695
- Bennion, P., Hubbard, R., O'hara, S., Wiggs, G., Wegerdt, J., Lewis, S., ... Upshur, R.
- 452 (2007). The impact of airborne dust on respiratory health in children living in the
- 453 Aral Sea region. *International Journal of Epidemiology*, *36*(5), 1103–1110. doi:
- 454 10.1093/ije/dym195
- Bloudoff-Indelicato, M. (2012, October). Climate change is bad news for California
  children with asthma. *Scientific American*.
- 457 Bureau, U. S. C. (2015). Quick facts: Imperial County, California. Retrieved June 11,
- 458 2017, from https://www.census.gov/quickfacts/table/PST045216/06025,00
- 459 Christian-Smith, J., Levy, M. C., & Gleick, P. H. (2015). Maladaptation to drought: A
- 460 case report from California, USA. *Sustain Sci*, *10*, 491–501. doi: 10.1007/s11625-
- 461 014-0269-1
- 462 Cohen, M. J. (2014). Hazard's Toll: The costs of inaction at the Salton Sea. Oakland,
- 463 California. Retrieved from https://pacinst.org/wp-

464 content/uploads/2014/09/PacInst\_HazardsToll-1.pdf

465 Cohn, J. P. (2000). Saving the Salton Sea. *BioScience*, *50*(4), 295–301. Retrieved from

466 https://watermark.silverchair.com/api/watermark?token=AQECAHi208BE49Ooan9k

467 khW\_Ercy7Dm3ZL\_9Cf3qfKAc485ysgAAAfMwggHvBgkqhkiG9w0BBwagggHgMIIB

- 468 3AIBADCCAdUGCSqGSIb3DQEHATAeBglghkgBZQMEAS4wEQQMZEY37CW8fS
- 469 gt5RI3AgEQgIIBplB\_vOpxrMW\_BZ\_aWeXr-WsRrU25KmJj0oqaNdqllGjO-
- 470 Cook, B. I., Smerdon, J. E., Seager, R., & Cook, E. R. (2014). Pan-continental droughts
- in North America over the last millennium. *Journal of Climate*, *27*(1), 383–397. doi:
- 472 10.1175/JCLI-D-13-00100.1
- 473 Costello, A., Abbas, M., Allen, A., Ball, S., Bell, S., Bellamy, R., ... Patterson, C. (2009).
- 474 Managing the health effects of climate change. Lancet and University College
- 475 London Institute for Global Health Commission. *The Lancet*, 373(9676), 1693–
- 476 1733. doi: 10.1016/S0140-6736(09)60935-1
- 477 Crighton, E. J., Elliott, S. J., Upshur, R., Van Der Meer, J., & Small, I. (2003). The Aral
- 478 Sea disaster and self-rated health. Health & Place (Vol. 9). Retrieved from
- 479 https://ac.els-cdn.com/S1353829202000175/1-s2.0-S1353829202000175-
- 480 main.pdf?\_tid=ea2e6ccd-b16d-4c0e-af17-
- 481 5b39e8b2ae4d&acdnat=1544726985\_e5f29a23a24eacace8699a95c6c40116
- D'Amato, G., & Cecchi, L. (2008). Effects of climate change on environmental factors in
- respiratory allergic diseases. *Clinical and Experimental Allergy*, 38, 1264–1274. doi:
- 484 10.1111/j.1365-2222.2008.03033.x
- de Vlaming, V., DiGiorgio, C., Fong, S., Deanovic, L. A., de la Paz Carpio-Obeso, M.,
- 486 MIIIer, J. ., ... Richard, N. J. (2004). Irrigation runoff insecticide pollution of rivers in

487	the Imperial Valley, California (USA). Environmental Pollution, 132, 213–229. doi:
488	10.1016/j.envpol.2004.04.025
489	The Economist (2014). The drying of the West: Drought is forcing Westerners to
490	consider wasting less water. The Economist, (February 22). Retrieved from
491	http://www.economist.com/news/united-states/21596955-drought-forcing-
492	westerners-consider-wasting-less-water- %0Adrying-west%0A
493	The Economist (2015). Cut and dried: Civilians will bear the brunt of new water
494	restrictions, though it is teh farms that use the most. The Economist, (August 8).
495	Retrieved from http://www.economist.com/news/united-states/21647812-governor-
496	cut-and-dried
497	Frumkin, H. (2017). What is planetary health and why now. Boston: Planetary Health
498	Alliance Annual Meeting.
499	Gauderman, J. W., Avol, E., Gilliland, F., Vora, H., Thomas, D., Berhane, K., … Peters,
500	J. (2004). The effect of air pollution on lung development from 10 to 18 years of
501	age. New England Journal of Medicine, 351(11), 1057–1067.
502	Gauderman, J. W., Gilliland, G. F., Vora, H., Avol, E., Stram, D., McConnell, R., …
503	Peters, J. M. (2002). Association between air pollution and lung function growth in
504	Southern California children: Results from a second cohort. American Journal of
505	Respiratory and Critical Care Medicine, 166(1), 76–84. doi: 10.1164/rccm.2111021
506	Glantz, M., & Figueroa, R. (1997). Does the Aral Sea merit heritage status? Global
507	Environ. Change, 7(4), 357–380.
508	Gomez, S. R., Parker, R. A., Dosman, J. A., & McDuffie, H. H. (1992). Respiratory
509	health effects of alkali dust in residents near desiccated Old Wives Lake. Archives

- 510 of Environmental Health, 47(5), 364–369.
- 511 Goodyear, D. (2015, May). California runs dry. *The New Yorker*. Retrieved from
- 512 http://www.newyorker.com/magazine/2015/05/04/the-dying-sea
- 513 Griffin, D., & Anchukaitis, K. J. (2014). How unusual is the 2012 2014 California
- drought? *Geophysical Research Letters*, *41*, 9017–9023. doi:
- 515 10.1002/2014GL062433.1.
- 516 Grigoryev, A. A. (1952). Soviet Plans for Irrigation and Power: A Geographical
- 517 Assessment. Source: The Geographical Journal (Vol. 118). Retrieved from
- 518 https://www.jstor.org/stable/pdf/1791946.pdf?refreqid=excelsior%3A80131dc04cb3
- 519 0f44c7f089f7744a5125
- Hefflin, B. J., Jalaludin, B., McClure, E., Cobb, N., Johnson, C. a, Jecha, L., & Etzel, R.
- a. (1991). Surveillance for dust storms and respiratory diseases in Washington
- 522 State, 1991. Archives of Environmental Health, 49(3), 170–174. doi:
- 523 10.1080/00039896.1994.9940378
- Indoitu, R., Kozhoridze, G., Batyrbaeva, M., Vitkovskaya, I., Orlovsky, N., Blumberg, D.,
- <sup>525</sup> & Orlovsky, L. (2015). Dust emission and environmental changes in the dried
- bottom of the Aral Sea. *Aeolian Research*, *17*, 101–115. doi:
- 527 10.1016/j.aeolia.2015.02.004
- Johnston, J. E., Razafy, M., Lugo, H., Olmedo, L., & Farzan, S. F. (2019). The
- 529 disappearing Salton Sea: A critical reflection on the emerging environmental threat
- of disappearing saline lakes and potential impacts on children's health. doi:
- 531 10.1016/j.scitotenv.2019.01.365
- 532 Kaiser, J. (1999). Battle over a dying sea. *Science*, *284*, 28–30.

533	Kaneko, K., Chiba, M., Hashizume, M., Kunii, O., Sasaki, S., Shimoda, T.,
534	Dauletbaev, D. (2003). Renal tubular dysfunction in children living in the Aral Sea
535	Region. Arch Dis Child, 88, 966–968. doi: 10.1136/adc.88.11.966
536	Kelley, C. P., Mohtadi, S., Cane, M. A., Seager, R., & Kushnir, Y. (2015). Climate
537	change in the Fertile Crescent and implications of the recent Syrian drought.
538	Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, 112(11), 3241–3246. doi:
539	10.1073/pnas.1421533112
540	Ketcham, C. (2012). Razing Arizona: Will drought destroy the Southwest? Harper's
541	Magazine.
542	King, J., Etyemezian, V., Sweeney, M., Buck, B. J., & Nikolich, G. (2011). Dust emission
543	variability at the Salton Sea, California, USA. Aeolian Research, 3, 67–79. doi:
544	10.1016/j.aeolia.2011.03.005
545	Kunii, O., Hashizume, M., Chiba, M., Sasaki, S., & Shimoda, T. (2010). Respiratory
546	symptoms and pulmonary function among school-age children in the Aral Sea
547	region. Archives of Environmental Health, 58(11), 676–682. doi:
548	10.3200/AEOH.58.11.676-682
549	Laylander, D. (1995). The chronology of Lake Cahuilla's final stand. Proceedings of the
550	Society for California Archaeology, 8, 69–78. Retrieved from
551	https://scahome.org/publications/proceedings/Proceedings.08Laylander.pdf
552	Lee, S. O., & Jung, Y. (2018). Efficiency of water use and its implications for a water-
553	food nexus in the Aral Sea Basin. Agricultural Water Management, 207, 80–90. doi:
554	10.1016/j.agwat.2018.05.014
555	Myers, S. S. (2017). Planetary health: protecting human health on a rapidly changing

- 556 planet. Lecture 2860 Www.Thelancet.Com, 390. doi: 10.1016/S0140-
- 557 6736(17)32846-5
- 558 O'Connor, T., Hsia-Kiung, K., Koehler, L., Holmes-Gen, B., Barrett, W., Chan, M., &
- Law, K. (2014). Driving California forward: Public health and societal economic
   benefits of California's AB 32 transportation fuel policies.
- 0'Hara, S. L. (2000). Central Asia's Water Resources: Contemporary and Future
- 562 Management Issues. International Journal of Water Resources Development,
- 563 *16*(3), 423–441. doi: 10.1080/713672501
- O'Hara, S. L., Wiggs, G. F. S., Mamedov, B., Davidson, G., & Hubbard, R. B. (2000).
- 565 Exposure to airborne dust contaminated with pesticide in the Aral Sea region.

*Lancet.* doi: 10.1016/S0140-6736(99)04753-4

- 567 Observatory, N. E. (2007). Dust storm over the South Aral Sea. Retrieved from
- 568 https://earthobservatory.nasa.gov/images/18359/dust-storm-over-the-south-aral-
- 569 sea
- 570 Observatory, N. E. (2012). Shrinking Aral Sea. Retrieved from
- 571 https://svs.gsfc.nasa.gov/vis/a010000/a010800/a010862/index.html
- 572 Observatory, N. E. (2015). Shrinking Shoreline of the Salton Sea. Retrieved from
- 573 https://earthobservatory.nasa.gov/images/86746/shrinking-shoreline-of-the-salton-
- 574 sea
- Orlando, J. L., Smalling, K. L., & Kuivila, K. M. (2006). Pesticides in water and
- suspended sediment of the Alamo and New Rivers, Imperial Valley/Salton Sea
- *Basin*. Retrieved from https://pubs.usgs.gov/ds/365/pdf/ds365.pdf
- 578 Program, U. N. E. (1992). The Aral Sea: Diagnostic study for the development of an

- action plan for the conservation of the Aral Sea. United Nations Environmental *Programme, Nairobi.*
- 581 Sarfaty, M., Bloodhart, B., Ewart, G., Thurston, G. D., Balmes, J. R., Guidotti, T. L., &
- 582 Maibach, E. W. (2015). American Thoracic Society member survey on climate
- change and health. Ann Am Thorac Soc, 12(2), 274–278. doi:
- 584 10.1513/AnnalsATS.201410-460BC
- 585 Shukla Mcdermid, S., & Winter, J. (2017). Anthropogenic forcings on the climate of the 586 Aral Sea: A regional modeling perspective. doi: 10.1016/j.ancene.2017.03.003
- 587 Smith, L. T., Aragão, L. E. O. C., Sabel, C. E., & Nakaya, T. (2014). Drought impacts on
- children's respiratory health in the Brazilian Amazon. *Scientific Reports*, *4*, 3726.
- 589 doi: 10.1038/srep03726
- Whish-Wilson, P. (2002). The Aral Sea environmental health crisis. Journal of Rural and
   Remote Environmental Health 1(2): 29-34
- 592 White, K. D. (2013). Nature-society linkages in the Aral Sea region. *Journal of Eurasian*
- 593 Studies, 4, 18–33. doi: 10.1016/j.euras.2012.10.003
- 594 Wiggs, G. F. S., O'Hara, S. L., Wegerdt, J., van der Meer, J., Small, I., & Hubbard, R.
- 595 (2003). The dynamics and characteristics of aeolian dust in dryland Central Asia:
- 596 Possible impacts on human exposure and respiratory health in the Aral Sea basin.
- 597 *Geographical Journal*, *169*(2), 142–157. doi: 10.1111/1475-4959.04976
- Xu, E. G., Bui, C., Lamerdin, C., & Schlenk, D. (2016). Spatial and temporal
- assessment of environmental contaminants in water, sediments and fish of the
- Salton Sea and its two primary tributaries, California, USA, from 2002 to 2012.
- 601 Science of the Total Environment, 559, 130–140. doi:

- 602 10.1016/j.scitotenv.2016.03.144
- 603 Young, A. (2016, June). California is now world's 6th-largest economy. Sacramento
- 604 Business Journal.

605

# 607 Acknowledgements

# 608 Funding information

- 609 Funding for this work has been supported by the Southern Nursing Research
- 610 Society Dissertation Award.

611

# 612 **Conflicts of Interest**

613 The authors have no conflicts of interest to disclose.

614

# 615 Data Availability

616 This manuscript is a literature review and does not present new data.

617

618







