# Local correlation of low-SNR and strongly RFI contaminated DOR signals

Maoli Ma<sup>1</sup>, Peijia Li<sup>1</sup>, Fengxian Tong<sup>1</sup>, Weimin Zheng<sup>1</sup>, Tetsuro Kondo<sup>1</sup>, Lei Liu<sup>1</sup>, Xiaojing Wu<sup>1</sup>, and Xin Zheng<sup>1</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Shanghai Astronomical Observatory

November 22, 2022

## Abstract

This paper presents the local correlation method of low-SNR (Signal to Noise Ratio) and strongly RFI (Radio Frequency Interference) contaminated DOR (differential one-way ranging) signals with China's lunar spacecraft. Unlike the Very Long Baseline Interferometry (VLBI) FX correlator used in China VLBI net, the core of local correlation is to construct the received signal model based on the intrinsic characteristics of DOR signals, then extract the residual frequency and phase relative to the model. The performance of the method is verified by means of orbit determination and post-fit residuals analysis. The RMS (root-mean-square) of Delta-DOR delay after orbit determination are 3.7 ns and 0.83 ns when tones SNR varied of 1 dBHz 20 dBHz and 14 dBHz 26 dBHz in two individual experiments. The computed standard deviation of post-fit delay residuals is compatible at 3 sigma level with the theoretical spacecraft thermal noise. Local correlation provides a solution to the special RFI contaminated DOR signals process. The precision of Delta-DOR delay with strong RFI keeps the same level of that without interference.

## Local correlation of low-SNR and strongly RFI contaminated DOR signals

Maoli Ma<sup>1,3</sup>, Peijia Li<sup>1</sup>, Fengxian Tong<sup>1,3</sup>, Weimin Zheng<sup>1,2,3</sup>, Tetsuro Kondo<sup>1</sup>, Lei Liu<sup>1,3</sup>, Xiaojing Wu<sup>1</sup>, Xin Zheng<sup>1,3</sup>

5	<sup>1</sup> Shanghai Astronomical Observatory, Chinese Academy of Science
6	<sup>2</sup> Shanghai Key Laboratory of Space Navigation and Positioning Techniques, Shanghai Astronomical
7	Observatory, Chinese Academy of Sciences
8	<sup>o</sup> Shanghai Astronomical Observatory, Chinese Academy of Sciences, Key Laboratory of Radio Astronomy,
9	Chinese Academy of Sciences
10	<sup>1</sup> Shanghai 200030,China
11	<sup>2</sup> Shanghai 200030,China
12	<sup>3</sup> West Beijing Road, Nanjing, Jiangsu 210008, China

Key Points:

<sup>14</sup> • Delta-DOR

1

2

3

13

- <sup>15</sup> China VLBI net
- <sup>16</sup> Longjiang 2
- Chang' E 3

Corresponding author: Weimin Zheng, zhwm@shao.ac.cn

Corresponding author: Maoli Ma, mamaoli@shao.ac.cn

## 18 Abstract

This paper presents the local correlation method of low-SNR (Signal to Noise Ratio) and 19 strongly RFI (Radio Frequency Interference) contaminated DOR (differential one-way rang-20 ing) signals with China's lunar spacecraft. Unlike the Very Long Baseline Interferometry 21 (VLBI) FX correlator used in China VLBI net, the core of local correlation is to construct 22 the received signal model based on the intrinsic characteristics of DOR signals, then extract 23 the residual frequency and phase relative to the model. The performance of the method is 24 verified by means of orbit determination and post-fit residuals analysis. The RMS (root-25 mean-square) of Delta-DOR delay after orbit determination are 3.7 ns and 0.83 ns when 26 tones SNR varied of 1 dBHz  $\sim$  20 dBHz and 14 dBHz  $\sim$  26 dBHz in two individual experi-27 ments. The computed standard deviation of post-fit delay residuals is compatible at 3 sigma 28 level with the theoretical spacecraft thermal noise. Local correlation provides a solution to 29 the special RFI contaminated DOR signals process. The precision of Delta-DOR delay with 30 strong RFI keeps the same level of that without interference. 31

## 32 1 Introduction

Very Long Baseline Interferometry (VLBI) is a technique that can determine the angular position of distant radio sources by measuring the geometric time delay between the received radio signals at geographically separated stations. Delta Differential One-way Ranging (Delta-DOR) originally developed by Jet Propulsion Laboratory in the late 1970 (Curkendall & Border, 2013) is a navigation application of VLBI. It can be used in conjunction with Doppler and ranging data to determine the spacecraft angular position in the celestial sphere efficiently.

Delta-DOR is generally conducted by deep space navigation stations, including Goldstone, 40 Madrid, Canberra for National Aeronautics and Space Administration (NASA) (Border, 41 2014), and Cebreros, New Norcia, Malargue for European Space Agency (ESA) (James et 42 al., 2009). The tracking data are transferred to data processing center for correlation. As a 43 kind of artificial signal, DOR signals which consist of a series of intrinsic narrowness tones 44 or harmonics of the existing telemetry subcarriers are different from the wideband noise-like 45 signal radiated from quasars. NASA had developed a special software correlator package 46 for Delta-DOR Navigation processing (Rogstad et al., 2009). ESA had developed its own 47 correlator with jointly cooperation with University of Rome "La Sapienza" (Iess & Ardito, 48 2006). 49

Delta-DOR has been extensively and successfully applied to a lot of deep-space missions. Among these missions there are Mars Observer, Mars Odyssey, Phoenix, MAVEN (Curkendall & Border, 2013) (Kinman et al., 2015), etc. Different agencies have established cooperation and inter-operability for cross support of space missions. Tracking data can be exchanged under the conventions and definitions of Delta-DOR in Consultative Committee for Space Data Systems (CCSDS, 2013).

<sup>56</sup> China's Lunar Exploration Project (CLEP) has utilized VLBI stations to support Delta<sup>57</sup> DOR measurement since Chang' E 3 in 2013 (W. Wu et al., 2013). Chinese VLBI net (CVN)
<sup>58</sup> including BJ (50 m), KM (40 m), UR (26 m), TM (65 m) has carried out the observations
<sup>59</sup> and transferred tracking data to VLBI center for correlation. The CVN correlator is FX
<sup>60</sup> (Fourier transform and cross multiplication) type VLBI correlator (Zheng et al., 2014). The
<sup>61</sup> measurement accuracy and real-time ability are better than the requirements of the mis<sup>62</sup> sions.

During the Chang' E observations, CVN encountered with some low-SNR (Signal-to-noise Ratio) or strongly RFI (Radio Frequency Interference) contaminated DOR signals. An increasement of FFT (Fast Fourier Transform) points is required for FX correlator to distinguish the low-SNR intrinsic narrowness tones. The strong RFI was data-transmission signal emitted from another transponder on the same spacecraft. When the two different transponders on Chang'E 3 emitting DOR signals and data-transmission signal meanwhile, DOR signals will be strongly contaminated by the side lobes of the data-transmission signal. The increasement of FFT points sometimes can't distinguish tones if they are totally

submerged in the strong RFI. 71

In this paper, we propose a different local correlation method to process the low-SNR and 72 strongly RFI contaminated DOR signals. In section 2 we describe DOR signals and its 73 characteristics. Section 3 describes correlation methods. Section 4 describes the DOR ex-74 periments setting. Section 5 describes correlation applications in experiments. Section 6 is 75 results and analysis. Section 7 is conclusions. 76

77

#### 2 DOR signals 78

In CLEP, X-band DOR is used in Chang'E 3, Chang'E 4 and Chang'E 5. S-band DOR 79 is used in lunar microsatellite Longjiang and Chang'E 4 relay satellite Queqiao. The DOR 80 tones are generated from modulation by sine waves on the downlink carrier signal. X-band 81 DOR is expressed as follow (CCSDS, 2013), 82

 $s(t) = \sqrt{2P_T} [J_0(m_1)J_0(m_2)\cos(2\pi f_c t) - 2J_1(m_1)J_0(m_2)\sin(2\pi f_c t)\sin(2\pi f_1 t)]$ (1) $-2J_0(m_1)J_1(m_2)\sin(2\pi f_c t)\sin(2\pi f_2 t) + higher harmonics$ 

 $P_T$  is the total power of downlink signal.  $f_c$  is the frequency of the main carrier.  $f_1$  and  $f_2$ 84 are phase modulation frequency.  $f_{1,2}$  has a relationship with  $f_c$ ,  $f_{1,2}/f_c = n_{1,2}$ , where  $n_{1,2}$ 85 are frequency modulation indices.  $m_1$  and  $m_2$  are amplitude modulation indices.  $J_0$  and  $J_1$ 86 are Bessel functions of the first kind. 87

Fig.1 shows X-band DOR signals. The modulation produces a pair of narrow spanned band-88

width tones  $f_{R1}$ ,  $f_{L1}$  with frequency separation 7.6 MHz and wider spanned bandwidth tones 89

 $f_{R2}, f_{L2}$  with frequency separation 38.4 MHz.  $f_{R1}, f_{L1}$  are provided for integer cycle phase ambiguity resolution.  $f_{R2}$  and  $f_{L2}$  with wider frequency separation are used to determine 90

91 delay observables. 92

Amplitude modulation indices  $m_1$  and  $m_2$  decide the power allocation between the carrier



Figure 1. X-band DOR signals. The tones are generated from modulation on the downlink carrier signal.  $f_c$  is the main carrier,  $f_{R1}$  and  $f_{L1}$  are narrow spanned bandwidth tones,  $f_{R2}$  and  $f_{L2}$ are wider spanned bandwidth tones.

93 and the tones, where 94

$$P_{c} = P_{T} J_{0}^{2}(m_{1}) J_{0}^{2}(m_{2})$$

$$P_{R1/L1} = P_{T} J_{1}^{2}(m_{1}) J_{0}^{2}(m_{2})$$

$$P_{R2/L2} = P_{T} J_{0}^{2}(m_{1}) J_{1}^{2}(m_{2})$$
(2)

95



0.4 rad. Such values yield modulation losses  $P_c/P_T$ =-0.7 dB,  $P_{R1/L1}/P_T = P_{R2/L2}/P_T$ 97

=-14.5 dB. Therefore tones are -13.8 dB weaker than the main carrier. The S-band DOR in
 Longjiang 2 and Queqiao only has one pair of tones with spanned bandwidth of 7.6 MHz.
 The modulation losses of tones are same as that of X-band DOR.

From Equation (1) and (2), one can find that a series of intrinsic narrow single-frequency lines comprise of the DOR signals. The tones are coherently related to the main carrier even under the lower SNR cases. So we can make use of carrier-aid method on tones to extract the residual frequency and phase of tones when they're seriously interfered.

## <sup>105</sup> **3** Local correlation algorithm

Fig.2 shows the DOR tracking geometry of a spacecraft. In the geocentric coordinate system, **E** is the geocentric center, **Sc** is the spacecraft. **A** and **B** are two VLBI antennas.

The position vector of spacecraft and  $\mathbf{A}$ ,  $\mathbf{B}$  are  $\mathbf{r_{Sc}}(t)$ ,  $\mathbf{r_A}(t)$  and  $\mathbf{r_B}(t)$ .

In CVN FX correlator, the signals from each antenna should be time-shifting to the geocen-



Figure 2. DOR tracking geometry of a spacecraft, and the different models used in VLBI FX correlator and local correlation.  $\tau_{Ag}(t)$  and  $\tau_{Bg}(t)$  are used by FX correlator for time-shifting the signal from topocentric to geocentric frame.  $\tau_A(t)$  and  $\tau_B(t)$  are used by local correlation for eliminating Doppler shift.

109

tric frame such that all signals track the same wave front. A near-field delay model is used 110 for spacecraft delay compensation, shown as  $\tau_{Ag}(t)$  and  $\tau_{Bg}(t)$  in Fig.2. Cross-correlation 111 is carried on the frequency domain after FFT on signals. An SNR loss due to the frequency smearing and spectrum leakage is given by  $-10log_{10}\sqrt{\frac{BW}{N}}$ , where N is FFT points and BW 112 113 is bandwidth (Liu et al., 2015). The typical values of BW and N used in CVN FX corre-114 lator are BW = 2 MHz and N = 8192. It leads to a SNR loss of -11.9 dB. To distinguish 115 tones with intrinsic narrowness, FX correlator need a large number of FFT points. Duev 116 et al. (2016) used different spectral resolution to correlate the individual sub-carrier lines of 117 Mars Express on several baselines. The fringe-fitting results suggested an optimal spectral 118 resolution value of  $N = 2^{19} = 524288$  points for the intrinsic narrow lines when BW = 16 119 MHz. 120

Fig.3 is the local DOR correlation flowchart. The core of local correlation is to construct a received signal model to eliminate Doppler effect and extract residual frequency and phase of DOR signals relative to the model signal. Instead of  $\tau_{Ag}(t)$  and  $\tau_{Bg}(t)$  used in FX correlator, local DOR correlation compensates earth rotation and the spacecraft motion with the reconstructed model signals  $s_A(t)$  and  $s_B(t)$ , which derived from the dynamical light time model  $\tau_A(t)$ ,  $\tau_B(t)$  and transmit frequency  $f_t$  of main carrier. 127 128

140

153

$$s_{A,B}(t) = \exp[j2\pi f_t(t - \tau_{A,B})]$$
 (3)

 $\tau_A(t)$  and  $\tau_B(t)$  are derived from a prior spacecraft ephemerides and the relative motion between the spacecraft and the stations. In the typical Delta-DOR sessions for Chang' E spacecraft, the telecommunication link is configured in a three-way mode, with the emitted signal generated by the uplink station. Both uplink and downlink light travel paths are considered in  $\tau_A(t)$  and  $\tau_B(t)$ .

The reconstructed model signals are then mixed with real signals. This step compensates a large amount of frequency variation caused by the Doppler shift. The small residual frequency offsets usually less than 1 Hz are mainly from a priori uncertainties of the spacecraft ephemerides.

The mixed signals are then filtered to remove high frequency components, and conjugate multiplied together to generate  $X_{AB}(t)$ .  $X_{AB}(t)$  can be modeled as

$$X_{AB}(t) = \exp[j2\pi f_{AB}t + j\phi_{AB})] + noise \tag{4}$$

<sup>141</sup> Where  $f_{AB}$  and  $\phi_{AB}$  are the residual frequency and phase between A and B. The residual <sup>142</sup> phase  $\phi_{AB}$  of other tones could be obtained in the similar method.

Theoretically, DOR delay depends only on the geometry of the measurement system. How-143 ever, the delay are still biased by ground station clock offsets, instrumental delays, propa-144 gation media (especially troposphere and ionosphere) effects, etc. In order to minimize the 145 bias, a nearby extragalactic quasar should be selected as a calibrator. The separation angle 146 between quasar and spacecraft is usually less than 10°. In general, Delta-DOR takes an al-147 ternative observation sequence like quasar-spacecraft-quasar or spacecraft-quasar-spacecraft. 148 The residual phase from quasar observation is used to calibrate the common error of  $\phi_{AB}$ . 149 Then we obtain  $\Delta \tau$  through a bandwidth synthesis technique.  $\Delta \tau$  accounts for the deviation 150 of measured observables to the computed model delay. The measured Delta-DOR delay  $\tau_{sc}$ 151 is 152

1

$$\tau_{sc} = \tau_B - \tau_A + \Delta \tau \tag{5}$$



Figure 3. DOR correlation flowchart

154

## 155 4 Observations

CVN has conducted hundreds of Delta-DOR observations of Chang' E spacecraft. The 156 down-converted radio signal is recorded using CDAS (Chinese VLBI Data Acquisition Sys-157 tem) terminals (Y. Wu, 2009). The main carrier and individual tones are usually recorded 158 with 8 or 16 frequency channels, with 2 or 4 MHz bandwidth and two-bit encoding. The 159 data collected at different stations are then transferred to the VLBI center for correlation. 160 Generally, the SNR of DOR signals of Chang' E spacecraft is very strong. The nominal 161 value of  $P_c/N_0$  (main carrier power-to-noise ratio) is about 45 dBHz,  $P_{tone}/N_0$  (tone power-162 to-noise ratio) 35 dBHz. A spectral resolution of several hundred Hz is sufficient for a FX 163

correlator to extract the residual frequency and phase of tones. 164

The observations of low-SNR and strongly RFI contaminated Delta-DOR experiments are 165 presented in Table 1. S8525b and s8524b are observations for relay spacecraft Quegiao and 166 microsatellites Longjiang 2. Longjiang 2 was lunched accompany with Queqiao on 21th, 167 May 2018, but kept some angle separations during the cruise stage. The two spacecraft 168 were observed in the same beam of VLBI antennas until their completely separation on 169 25th, May 2018, on which date Queqiao transferred to an eventual Langrange 2 Halo orbit, 170 and Longjiang 2 was set into an elliptical lunar orbit. VLBI antennas pointed to Que-171 qiao and brought in a pointing deviation to Longiang 2. The pointing-off of antennas to 172 Longiang 2 lead to the lower SNR signals compared with Quegiao. The half power beam 173 width of BJ, KM, UR and TM antennas are  $0.15^{\circ}$ ,  $0.19^{\circ}$ ,  $0.3^{\circ}$  and  $0.12^{\circ}$  respectively. In 174 s8525b, Longjiang 2 was out of the half power beam width. The maximum offset from 175 pointing was up to  $0.6^{\circ}$ .

176

Longjiang 2 emitted signals at S-band (~2.2GHz). The  $P_c/N_0$  of main carrier of Longjiang

 Table 1. Experiments of DOR correlation

code	data	spacecraft	band	stations	length of time
s8525b	2018-05-25	Longjiang-2	S-band	BJ,KM,UR,TM	4 hours
s8524b	2018-05-24	Longjiang-2	S-band	BJ,KM,UR,TM	2.9 hours
s7912a	2017-09-12	Chang'E 3 lander	X-band	SH,KM,UR	1.4 hours

<sup>a</sup>Footnote text here.

177

2 in s8524b and s8525b are presented in Fig.4. The  $P_c/N_0$  performance for VLBI station-178 s are significantly different because of the different pointing deviation to spacecraft. The 179  $P_c/N_0$  of main carrier in s8525b varies from 15 dBHz ~ 40 dBHz. It means 1 dBHz ~ 25 180 dBHz for  $P_{tone}/N_0$  derived from Equation (2).  $P_c/N_0$  in s8524b is stronger than those of 181 s8525b with minimum 10 dBHz for  $P_{tone}/N_0$ . 182

S7912a is a Chang'E 3 lander observation. Chang'E 3 was soft landed on the Moon in



Figure 4.  $P_c/N_0$  of Longjiang-2 DOR main carrier in s8524b and s8525b. Ur didn't attend spacecraft observation until 10:23 because of low elevation in s8525b.

183

184 185

186

187

188

the east of Sinus Iridum area on 14, Dec. 2013 (Zheng et al., 2017). It can transmit both DOR signals and data-transmission signal. In s7912a, when two kinds of signals transmitted at the same time, DOR signals were seriously interfered by the data-transmission signal. Fig.5 are power density spectrums of tones and data-transmission signal.  $P/N_0$  of carrier and tones are 48.2 dBHz, 37.6 dBHz, 34.5 dBHz, 34 dBHz and 35.2 dBHz, respectively.

## <sup>189</sup> Compared with $f_{L2}$ , $f_{R2}$ is seriously interfered by the side lobe of data-transmission signal.

<sup>190</sup> Other tones are also contaminated by data-transmission signal to different degree.



Figure 5. Power density spectrum of DOR tones and data-transmission signal from Chang'E 3 lander. Integration time is 5 s, spectral resolution is 2 KHz, sample rate is 4 MHz, bandwidth is 2 MHz, quantification is 2 bit. Comparing with  $f_{L2}$ ,  $f_{R2}$  is serious interfered by data-transmission signal.

191

193

## <sup>192</sup> 5 Local correlation on experiments

## 5.1 Local correlation

We have completed the spacecraft data processing on the above low-SNR and strongly 194 RFI contaminated DOR signals. Fig.6 shows the power density spectrum for the main 195 carrier and the tone of BJ station in s8525b.  $P_c/N_0$  is 16.5 dBHz,  $P_{tone}/N_0$  2.5 dBHz 196 derived from the amplitude modulation indices (Equation 2). Tones were totally submerged 197 in noise. Transmit frequency from uplink station and the light time model were used to 198 construct a received signal model for phase stopping. After the phase stopping, the frequency 199 of the signal becomes to be nearly zero. We filtered out the undesired high frequency 200 components outside a selectable bandwidth through integration. The filter bandwidth was 201 20 Hz.  $P_{tone}/N_0$  and  $P_c/N_0$  increase to 13 dBHz and 30 dBHz respectively after phase 202 stopping and integration (Fig.6). The method was limited to detect tones for BJ station 203 after UTC 13:00 when  $P_c/N_0$  was below 15 dBHz. 204



Figure 6. Power density spectrum of the main carrier and the tone in BJ. Left: Spectrums of raw data, integration time is 1 s. The red lines are noise density.  $P_c/N_0$  is 16.5 dBHz. The tone is totally submerged in the noise. Right: Spectrums after phase stop and integration, integration time is 20 s.  $P_{tone}/N_0$  and  $P_c/N_0$  increase to 13 dBHz and 30 dBHz respectively.

Correlation for s7912a with strong RFI is a little different from the low-SNR signal process. The strong main carriers with  $P_c/N_0$  48 dBHz in s7912a allowed us to use the carrier-aid method. A digital Phase Lock Loop (PLL) was used on the main carrier to filter out undesired interfering data-transmission signal outside a selectable bandwidth. Then phase from PLL was used to track tones with serious interference.

In order to evaluate data-transmission signal's affection on tones, we used a three-order polynomial to fit frequency and phase at each independent scan, then calculated standard variance (STD) of the residual frequency and phase corresponding to the phase model from PLL. The results are presented in Table 2. Although  $f_{R2}$  is seriously contaminated by datatransmission signal in s7912a,  $\sigma_f$  and  $\sigma_{\varphi}$  for those tones are statistically compatible with main carrier or other slight contaminated tones. The interfering data-transmission signal is effectively filtered out after correlation.

**Table 2.** Standard variance of residuals frequency and phase in s7912a.  $\sigma_f$ : mHz,  $\sigma_{\varphi}$ : degree

baseline	$f_{L2}$	$f_{L1}$	$f_{R1}$	$f_{R2}$
	$\sigma_f, \ \sigma_{arphi}$	$\sigma_f, \ \sigma_{arphi}$	$\sigma_f, \sigma_{\varphi}$	$\sigma_f, \sigma_{\varphi}$
SH-KM	1.4, 1.7	1.4, 1.7	1.5, 2.3	1.5, 2.3
SH-UR	0.7,  0.6	0.6,  0.6	0.6,  0.6	0.7, 0.6
KM-UR	1.3,  1.7	1.3,  1.7	1.3,  1.7	1.3, 1.7

218

219

## 5.2 Bandwidth synthesis

To get the Delta-DOR delay, bandwidth synthesis was performed on tones. The tones were recorded at different frequency channels, the strong fringe find quasars were used to calibrate the initial instrument phase error. Then the reference quasars were used to calibrate the common error from the atmosphere, ionosphere, instrument, station position error.

After calibration, we used the inner DOR tones to solve the  $2\pi$  phase ambiguity. If the frequency interval between inner tones is  $\Delta f$ , the corresponding delay ambiguity is  $\tau_a =$  $1/\Delta f$ , distance between spacecraft and earth is l, the longest length of baseline projection onto plane-of-sky is d, the delay deviation caused by prior orbit deviation is  $\tau^p = \Delta d \cdot d/(v_c \cdot l) * 10^9$  ns,  $v_c$  is the velocity of light. For CVN VLBI stations, d is about 3000 km.

S8524b carried out the orbit insertion maneuver before 14:30. The prior ephemerides used 230 for correlation was the initial orbit before maneuvering. The prior orbit deviation was 10 231 km. It led to a nearly 270 ns delay offset, larger than the delay ambiguity of S-band DOR, 232 which is 125 ns. We used an even harmonic of the telemetry subcarriers with spanned 233 bandwidth 1 MHz as well to solve phase ambiguity. The delay ambiguity determined by 234 subcarriers was 1000 ns, larger than the delay deviation caused by the inaccurate prior orbit. 235 Fig.7 are the residual Delta-DOR delay in s8524b and s8525b. Delta-DOR delay in s7912a 236 was obtained by the same method. 237

238

## <sup>239</sup> 6 Results and analysis

The validation of the local correlation method of the low-SNR and strongly RFI contaminated DOR has been carried out by the post-fit or orbit determination on measurements. We took a third order polynomial fit on the residual delay, the computed STD of residuals at different baselines are represented in Table 3. The expected spacecraft thermal noise  $\varepsilon_{\tau_{SC}}$  was estimated from  $P_{tone}/N_0$  and spanned bandwidth  $f_{BW}$  (Kinman et al., 2015).



Figure 7. Residual delay from s8524b and s8525b

$$\varepsilon_{\tau_{SC}} = \left[ \left( \frac{\sqrt{2}}{2\pi f_{BW}} \frac{1}{SNR_1} \right)^2 + \left( \frac{\sqrt{2}}{2\pi f_{BW}} \frac{1}{SNR_2} \right)^2 \right]^{1/2} \mathbf{s}$$
(6)

The  $SNR_i$  for tones at station *i* is given by

$$SNR_i = \sqrt{2(P_{tone}/N_0)_i T_{SC}} \tag{7}$$

T<sub>SC</sub> is the integration time.  $f_{BW}$  is about 7.6 MHz for S-band DOR, 38.4 MHz for X-band DOR.  $P_{tone}/N_0$  of different stations was estimated from Fig. 4 and Equation (2). Table 2 shows that the result of computed STD is compatible at 3 sigma level with the expected spacecraft thermal noise.

The unified X-band range and Delta-DOR were combined and applied in orbit determi-253 nation. The range in s8525b and s8524b were from Qingdao (18 m) and Jiamusi (66 m) 254 respectively. The observables after 13:00 in s8525b or before 14:30 in s8524b were excluded 255 because the spacecraft performing orbit insertion maneuver. No quasar was observed during 256 these periods. The RMS (root mean square) of Delta-DOR delay are 3.7 ns and 0.83 ns for 257 s8525b and s8524b respectively. The corresponding RMS of range are 4.5 m and 0.5 m in 258 the two individual observations. The difference between antenna apertures of Jiamusi and 259 Qingdao is the main cause of RMS difference of range (Cao et al., 2016). 260

In s7912a, the STD of residuals is at the level of 0.47 ns. The delay closure has a standard deviation of 88 ps. Cao et al. (2016) analysed the precise positioning of the Chang'E 3 lander soft landing, argued that the random noise of Delta-DOR delay was 0.33 ns. Chang et al. (2016) used the different lunar gravity field model to evaluate RMS of Delta-DOR delay, the RMS was 0.36 ns when spacecraft was on 100 km  $\times$  100 km lunar orbit, 0.6 ns on 100 km  $\times$  15 km lunar orbit. The accuracy of our measurement of Delta-DOR within the strong RFI is comparable to those obtained by previous works without RFI.

Chang'E 3 is not the only spacecraft that DOR signals interfered by data-transmission sig-268 nal. Chang'E 5 includes the lander-ascentor assembly and the orbiter. Each spacecraft can 269 transmit two series of DOR signals and one series of data-transmission signal. The former 270 is used for spacecraft position determination and latter transferring onboard science data. 271 The beasons of Chang'E 5 had been tested at different CVN stations. When DOR signals 272 and data-transmission signal emitted meanwhile, DOR signals were interfered by the side 273 lobes of data-transmission signal to different degrees (Zhang et al., 2016). Local correlation 274 provides a solution to the extremely RFI contaminated DOR signals processing. 275

Besides SNR and spanned bandwidth of tones, the precision of Delta-DOR measurement
also depends on the precision of the quasar delay measurement, and on knowledge of the
quasar position, clock stability, instrumental phase response, and uncertainties in Earth
platform models and transmission media delays.

280

245

248

#### <sup>281</sup> 7 Conclusions and outlook

In this paper, we firstly present the performance of local correlation on low-SNR and strongly RFI contaminated DOR with China's lunar spacecraft. The results are verified by

Code	Baseline	Bandwidth (MHz)	$P_{tone}/N_0$ (dBHz)	Integration (s)	Expected (ns)	Computed (ns)
s8525b	BJ-KM	7.6	1.0, 12	20	4.34	7.84
s8525b	BJ-UR	7.6	1.0, 20	20	4.20	8.73
s8525b	BJ-TM	7.6	1.0, 14	20	4.28	8.29
s8525b	KM-UR	7.6	12, 20	20	1.27	3.31
s8525b	KM-TM	7.6	12, 14	20	1.50	3.40
s8525b	UR-TM	7.6	20, 14	20	1.05	3.08
s8524b	BJ-KM	7.6	14, 20	20	1.05	1.08
s8524b	BJ-UR	7.6	14, 25	20	0.97	1.01
s8524b	BJ-TM	7.6	14, 24	20	0.98	1.02
s8524b	KM-UR	7.6	20, 25	20	0.53	0.48
s8524b	KM-TM	7.6	20, 24	20	0.55	0.50
s8524b	UR-TM	7.6	26, 25	20	0.35	0.29
s7912a	SH,KM,UR	38.4	34	5	0.05	0.47

 Table 3.
 Accuracy of Delta-DOR

<sup>*a*</sup>Footnote text here.

Table 4. RMS of Delta-DOR delay and range

Code	Delta-DOR (ns)	Range (m)	
s8525b	3.7	4.2	
s8524b	0.83	0.5	

 $^{a}$ Footnote text here.

means of error analysis on the residuals after orbit determination and post-fit. The main points of this paper are summarized as follows:

a. The local correlation method can enchance low-SNR processing ability for CVN to as low as 15 dBHz for carrier and 1 dBHz for tones. The performance of the method strongly depends on  $P_{tone}/N_0$ . The computed delay STD of post-fit residuals is compatible at 3 sigma level with the theoretical spacecraft thermal noise. The RMS of Delta-DOR delay after orbit determination are 3.7 ns when  $P_{tone}/N_0$  varied in the range of 1 dBHz ~ 20 dBHz, 0.83 ns when  $P_{tone}/N_0$  varied in the range of 14 dBHz ~ 26 dBHz.

b. Local correlation provides a solution to the special strongly RFI contaminated DOR
signals processing. The RFI is data-transmission signal transmitted from another transponder on spacecraft. Local correlation can extract residual frequency and phase of tones even
though they are totally submerged by RFI. The precision of Delta-DOR with strong RFI
keeps the same level of that without interference.

297

## 298 Acknowledgments

The research presented in this paper has been supported by the National Natural Science Foundation of China (U1831137, 11703070, 11973011, 11803070, 11903067, 11803069), CAS

301 Key Technology Talent Program, Shanghai Leading Talents program.

The data in this paper is accessible at https://pan.cstcloud.cn/s/tWbmv9X2QZQ.

303

## 304 References

Border, J. S. (2014). 210 Delta Differential One-way Ranging. Jet Propuls. Lab. Calif. Inst.
 Technol. Invent. Math., 210, 5–810.

Cao, J., Zhang, Y., Hu, S., Huang, Y., & Chen, M. (2016). An analysis of precise positioning
 and accuracy of the CE-3 lunar lander soft landing. *Geomatics Inf. Sci. Wuhan Univ.*,
 41(2), 274–278.

310

311

- CCSDS. (2013). DELTA-DOR TECHNICAL CHARACTERISTICS AND PERFOR-MANCE. In *Rep. concern. sp. data syst. stand.* (pp. 1–67). Washington, DC, USA.
- Chang, S., Huang, Y., Li, P., & Hu, X. (2016). Analysis on orbit determination of CE-3
  with different lunar gravity field model. *Geomatics Inf. Sci. Wuhan Univ.*, 41(11), 1427–1439.
- Curkendall, D. W., & Border, J. S. (2013). Delta-DOR: The One-Nanoradian Navigation Measurement System of the Deep Space Network — History, Architecture, and Componentry. Int. J. Mol. Sci., 14(11), 23160–23187.
- Duev, D. A., Pogrebenko, S. V., Cimò, G., Molera Calvés, G., Bocanegra Bahamón, T. M.,
   Gurvits, L. I., ... Witasse, O. (2016). Planetary Radio Interferometry and Doppler
   Experiment (PRIDE) technique: A test case of the Mars Express Phobos fly-by. As tron. Astrophys., 593, 1–10. doi: 10.1051/0004-6361/201628869
- Iess, L., & Ardito, R. A. P. A. (2006). THE EUROPEAN ΔDOR CORRELATOR. In (pp. 1–12). Valencia, Spain: 57th International Astronautical Congress.
- James, N., Abello, R., Lanucara, M., Mercolino, M., & Maddè, R. (2009). Implementation of an ESA delta-DOR capability. *Acta Astronaut.*, 64 (11-12), 1041–1049. doi: 10.1016/ j.actaastro.2009.01.005
- Kinman, P. W., Bedrossian, A., Border, J. S., & Shin, D. (2015). Delta Differential One-way
   Ranging. DSN Telecommun. Link Des. Handb., 1–25.
- Rogstad, S. P., Jongeling, A. P., Finley, S. G., & White, L. A. (2009). DSN Beowulf Cluster-Based VLBI Correlator. NASA Tech Briefs, 33(5), 58–59.
- Wu, W., Wang, G., Jie, D., Zhang, X., & Jiang, D. (2013). High-accuracy VLBI technique
   using DOR signals. *Sci. Sin. Informationis*, 43(2), 185–196. doi: 10.1360/112012-377
- Wu, Y. (2009). The design and implementation of key IP Cores in Chinese VLBI Data Acquisition System(CDAS). Unpublished doctoral dissertation.
- Zhang, Z., Wang, J., Wang, G., & Ma, M. (2016). Reports of the Docking experiments of Chang'E 5 beacons at VLBI stations (Tech. Rep.). Shanghai Astronomical Observatory, Chinese Academy of Science.
- Zheng, W., Tong, F., Zhang, J., Liu, L., & Shu, F. (2017). Interferometry imaging technique for accurate deep-space probe positioning. Adv. Sp. Res., 60(12), 2847-2854. Retrieved from https://doi.org/10.1016/j.asr.2017.09.004 doi: 10.1016/j.asr.2017.09.004
- Zheng, W., Zhang, J., Yu, Y., & Wang, W. (2014). Software correlator in the Chang'E 3
   mission. IVS proceeding.



Fig.1 X-band DOR signals. The tones are generated from modulation on the downlink carrier signal.  $f_c$  is the main carrier,  $f_{L1}$  and  $f_{R1}$  are narrow spanned bandwidth tones,  $f_{L2}$  and  $f_{R2}$  are wider spanned bandwidth tones.



Fig. 2 DOR tracking geometry of a spacecraft, and the different models used in VLBI FX correlator and local correlation.  $\tau_{Ag}(t)$  and  $\tau_{Bg}(t)$  are used by FX correlator for time-shifting the signal from topocentric to geocentric frame.  $\tau_A(t)$  and  $\tau_B(t)$  are used by local correlation for eliminating Doppler shift.



Fig. 3 DOR correlation flowchart



Fig.4  $P_c/N_0$  of Longjiang-2 DOR main carrier in s8524b and s8525b. Ur didn't attend spacecraft observation until 10:23 because of low elevation in s8525b.



Fig.5 Power density spectrum of DOR tones and data-transmission signal from Chang'E 3 lander. Integration time is 5 s, spectral resolution is 2 KHz, sample rate is 4 MHz, bandwidth is 2 MHz, quantification is 2 bit. Comparing with  $f_{L2}$ ,  $f_{R2}$  is serious interfered by data-transmission signal.



Fig. 6L Power density spectrum of the main carrier and the tone in BJ. Left: Spectrums of raw data, integration time is 1 s. The red lines are noise density. P<sub>c</sub>/N<sub>0</sub> is 16.5 dBHz. The tone is totally submerged in the noise.



Fig. 6R Right: Spectrums after phase stop and integration, integration time is 20 s.  $P_{tone}/N_0$  and





Fig. 7 Residual delay from s8524b and s8525b