## Ultrasonic Imaging of the Onset and Growth of Fractures within Partially Saturated Whitby Mudstone using Coda-Wave Decorrelation Inversion

Reuben Zotz-wilson<sup>1,1</sup>, Lisanne ANR Douma<sup>2,2</sup>, Joel Sarout<sup>3,3</sup>, Jeremie Dautriat<sup>4,4</sup>, David N. Dewhurst<sup>4,4</sup>, and Auke Barnhoorn<sup>1,1</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Delft University of Technology <sup>2</sup>TU Delft <sup>3</sup>CSIRO Energy <sup>4</sup>Commonwealth Scientific and Industrial Research Organisation (CSIRO)

January 14, 2020

#### Abstract

Using active ultrasonic source survey data, Coda-wave Decorrelation (CWD) time-lapse imaging during the triaxial compression of Whitby Mudstone cores provides a 3-D description of the evolution and redistribution of inelastic strain concentrations. Acoustic Emissions (AEs) monitoring is also performed between any two consecutive surveys. From these data, we investigate the impact of initial water saturation \$S\_w\$ on the onset, growth, and reactivation of inelastic deformation, compared to the post-deformation fracture network extracted from X-ray tomography scans. Our results indicate for the applied strain-rate and degree of initial water saturation, and within the frequency range of our ultrasonic transducers (0.1 to 1 MHz), that inelastic strain localisation and propagation in the Whitby Mudstone does not radiate AEs of sufficient magnitude to be detected above the average noise level. This is true for both the initial onset of inelasticity (strain localisation), and during macroscopic failure. In contrast, the CWD results indicate the onset of what is interpreted as localised regions of inelastic strain at less than fifty percent of the peak differential stress the Whitby Mudstone can sustain. The seemingly aseismic nature of these clay-rich rocks suggests the gradual development of inelastic strain, from the microscopic diffuse damage, up until the macroscopic shear failure.

# Ultrasonic Imaging of the Onset and Growth of Fractures within Partially Saturated Whitby Mudstone using Coda-Wave Decorrelation Inversion

### Reuben Zotz-Wilson<sup>1</sup>, Lisanne A.N.R. Douma<sup>1</sup>, Joel Sarout<sup>2</sup>, Jeremie Dautriat<sup>2</sup>, David Dewhurst<sup>2</sup>, Auke Barnhoorn<sup>1</sup>

4

5

6

7

8

<sup>1</sup>Delft University of Technology, Faculty of Civil Engineering and Geoscience. Stevinweg 1, 2628 CN Delft, The

Netherlands

<sup>2</sup>CSIRO - Energy, Perth Australia.

9	Key Points:
10	• Inversion of Coda-Wave Decorrelation data allows the imaging of sub-wavelength
11	strain localization.
12	• CWD inversion is capable of imaging aseismic triaxial deformation and failure of
13	the Whitby mudstone.
14	• Onset of aseismic sub-wavelength precursory strain imaged at less than $50\%$ of
15	peak differential stress.

Corresponding author: Reuben Zotz-Wilson, rdzotz@gmail.com

#### 16 Abstract

Using active ultrasonic source survey data, Coda-wave Decorrelation (CWD) time-lapse 17 imaging during the triaxial compression of Whitby Mudstone cores provides a 3-D de-18 scription of the evolution and redistribution of inelastic strain concentrations. Acoustic 19 Emissions (AEs) monitoring is also performed between any two consecutive surveys. 20 From these data, we investigate the impact of initial water saturation  $S_w$  on the onset, 21 growth, and reactivation of inelastic deformation, compared to the post-deformation frac-22 ture network extracted from X-ray tomography scans. Our results indicate for the applied 23 strain-rate and degree of initial water saturation, and within the frequency range of our ul-24 trasonic transducers (0.1 to 1 MHz), that inelastic strain localisation and propagation in 25 the Whitby Mudstone does not radiate AEs of sufficient magnitude to be detected above 26 the average noise level. This is true for both the initial onset of inelasticity (strain local-27 isation), and during macroscopic failure. In contrast, the CWD results indicate the onset 28 of what is interpreted as localised regions of inelastic strain at less than fifty percent of 29 the peak differential stress the Whitby Mudstone can sustain. The seemingly aseismic na-30 ture of these clay-rich rocks suggests the gradual development of inelastic strain, from the 31 microscopic diffuse damage, up until the macroscopic shear failure. 32

#### **1 Introduction**

Mudstones play an important role in many civil infrastructure, energy and resource 34 projects globally. They act as impermeable seals in conventional hydrocarbon or carbon 35 capture reservoirs [Busch et al., 2008; Armitage et al., 2016], or as both a source [Jianghui 36 et al., 2012] and reservoir rock [Aplin and Macquaker, 2011] in unconventional hydrocar-37 bon projects. Several permanent nuclear storage projects plan to [Brookins, 1976; Vomvoris 38 et al., 2013] or already employ [Aikas and Sundell, 2014] mudstones as the host rock for 39 both high and low grade radioactive waste. Due to their global abundance [Garrels and 40 Mackenzie, 1969], civil infrastructure project such as tunnels, dams, and bridges often di-41 rectly interact with mudstones [Yoshida et al., 1997; Wang et al., 2013; Izumi et al., 1998], 42 presenting a variety of engineering challenges. Furthermore, shales and mudstones are 43 considered as a key input when developing susceptibility maps for environmental damage 44 due to landslides [Ayalew and Yamagishi, 2005]. It is therefore essential to gain an un-45 derstanding of the mechanical properties of mudstones under a variety of environmental 46 conditions. To this end, laboratory triaxial testing of core samples subjected to realistic 47

-2-

subsurface temperature, pressure, stress, and saturation conditions are essential. While the 48 bulk core properties are generally attainable by measurements at the boundary, the deter-49 mination of the time and location at which inelastic changes develop, requires techniques 50 which are sensitive to localised changes within the core. Acoustic Emissions (AEs) mon-51 itoring has been a commonly applied technique within rock-mechanics laboratories for 52 more than two decades [Lockner, 1993; Lei et al., 2004; Heap et al., 2009; Sarout et al., 53 2017], enabling the rate, location, and effective stress at which fracturing develops to be 54 extracted from passive acoustic monitoring. Some inherent limitation of AE monitoring 55 are that it requires: (i) the magnitude of acoustic energy emitted during fracturing to be 56 sufficiently large, and (ii) within the dynamic range that it is detectable by the available 57 sensor network. Further, AE monitoring is unable to detect inelastic changes which are 58 truly aseismic in nature [Main, 1990]. 59

In this study, we apply both active source acoustic and passive AE monitoring, on 60 three laboratory scale core samples of different initial water saturation. The aim is to 61 monitor both the location and time of fracturing from active source monitoring, in com-62 parison with the onset of AE, thereby providing an indication of the degree to which 63 pre-seismic changes occur. This is based on the premise that active source methods do 64 not rely on the spontaneous emission of acoustic energy in order to detect the presence 65 of inelastic deformation, and therefore remain, in principle, sensitive to aseismic fractur-66 ing. While there have been a number of velocity tomography monitoring applications in 67 laboratory rock deformation experiments [Jansen et al., 1993; Brantut, 2018; Aben et al., 68 2019], enabling the three-dimensional imaging of rock fracturing, in this work we apply 69 Coda-Wave Decorrelation (CWD) inversion for the first time within experimental rock me-70 chanics. The CWD method makes use of the coda of recorded waveforms and therefore 71 can be expected to display improved sensitivity when compared to methods which rely on 72 the coherent arrivals [Snieder, 2002; Grêt, 2005; Zotz-Wilson et al., 2019]. While the first 73 publication and experimental application of CWD demonstrates the ability of the method 74 to locate, in a probabilistic sense, the formation of a single defect within a concrete slab 75 [Larose et al., 2010], in this study we apply a least-squares approach which has the poten-76 tial to locate, in terms of a physical quantity, multiple regions of change simultaneously 77 [*Planès et al.*, 2015]. 78

The results of this study, monitoring the active and passive acoustic response of
 mudstone samples of differing initial water saturation, provides valuable information on

-3-

- the development of both microscopic inelastic strain (diffuse damage) and the emergence
- <sup>82</sup> of larger coalesced macroscopic shear fractures.

#### **2** Materials and Methods

84

#### 2.1 Sample material and preparation

The mudstone samples originate from the outcropping Whitby Mudstone formation 85 (WMF), United Kingdom (UK). The WMF is deposited in the East-English Cleveland 86 Basin in anoxic bottom conditions [Powell, 2010]. This Toarcian Age mudstone formation 87 consists of three members, including the Grey Shale Member, Mulgrave Shale Member, 88 and Alum Shale Member [Powell, 2010]. The Mulgrave Shale Member (Lower Jurassic) 89 is the lateral equivalent of the Dutch Posidonia Shale Formation (PSF), the main shale gas 90 target in the Netherlands. The maximum burial depth of the mudstones in the Cleveland 91 Basin is  $\sim 4$  km, where top of the Lower Jurassic does not exceed  $\sim 2.5$  km [Pye, 1985]. 92 The WMF has been considered an analogue for the Dutch PSF [Zijp et al., 2015], since 93 the PSF is not outcropping in the Netherlands, core material is badly preserved, and avail-94 able log data is limited. 95

The WMF is a relatively clay-rich rock, composed of 50 % to 70 % inter-layered illite/smectite, illite, and kaolinite [*Houben et al.*, 2016a]. The organic matter (TOC ~6 %) is often inter-layered within the matrix [*Zijp et al.*, 2015; *Houben et al.*, 2016a]. The porosity of the mudstones originating from the Mulgrave Shale Member is ~13 %, based on the wet and dry mass of a mudstone core [*Douma et al.*, 2019]. The matrix permeability is in the range of  $10 \times 10^{-23}$  m<sup>2</sup> to  $10 \times 10^{-18}$  m<sup>2</sup>, and pore diameters are between 72 and 300 nm [*Houben et al.*, 2016b].

Mudstone blocks are sampled from a wave-cut platform on the east coast of Eng-103 land, north of Whitby (UK), near Runswick Bay. The mudstones in the outcrop are sub-104 merged daily by seawater, due to the tidal cycle. Immediately after sampling, the mud-105 stone blocks were stored in seawater to prevent initial pore water loss. Seawater was used 106 because the assumption was made that the pore fluid of the mudstones became in chemi-107 cal equilibrium with the seawater over geological time. Cylindrical core plugs were cored 108 normal to the bedding out of the same larger sample block and have a length of  $\sim 80 \text{ mm}$ 109 and a diameter of  $\sim 40 \text{ mm}$ . During coring, seawater was used as cooling fluid to pre-110 vent shrinkage or swelling of the clays. After coring, the core plugs were stored at room 111

temperature in three different desiccators with a constant relative humidity atmosphere 112 of  $\sim 85\%$ , 75%, and 35%. At these relative humidities, the corresponding water satura-113 tions achieved after several weeks (until mass stabilization) are  $\sim 70 \pm 10$  %,  $\sim 58 \pm 10$  %, 114 and  $\sim 28 \pm 10$  %, obtained by subtracting the brine volume divided by the pore volume 115 from the initial water saturation [Douma et al., 2019]. The different relative humidity at-116 mospheres were created by using oversaturated brine solutions, as explained in detail by 117 Laloui et al. [2013]. The three core plugs were used for rock mechanical testing after equi-118 librating for approximately two months in a desiccator. 119

120

#### 2.2 Experimental Procedure

The experimental setup used for the mechanical and ultrasonic testing includes a tri-121 axial stress vessel, multichannel ultrasonic monitoring system, and ultrasonic P-wave trans-122 ducers. A similar setup was used by Sarout et al. [2015, 2017] and Douma et al. [2019]. 123 The partially-saturated core plugs are placed in a Viton sleeve to prevent contact with the 124 surrounding confining oil. Two opposed linear variable differential transformers (LVDTs) 125 monitor the axial displacement. The local circumferential strain is measured with a strain 126 gauge-based cantilever mounted through the Viton sleeve, directly on the lateral surface of 127 the core plug. 128

Two aluminium spacers (38 mm diameter; 1 mm thickness) are placed on top and bottom of the partially-saturated core plugs (see fig. 1), to achieve macroscopically undrained conditions during the deformation of the rock. This means that there is no pore pressure control or monitoring during testing, and that no fluid is allowed to exit the core plug. The experiments are all performed at room temperature ( $22.0 \pm 1.5 \text{ °C}$ ). A detailed description of the experimental procedure is given by *Douma et al.* [2019], though in essence this can be summarised as:

136

138

139

An increase in confining pressure at a rate of 0.5 MPa min<sup>-1</sup> up to 15 MPa, followed by a consolidation stage of about three days under isotropic stress conditions.
Subsequently, a vertical stress was applied orthogonal to the bedding with a constant axial strain rate of 1 × 10<sup>-7</sup> s<sup>-1</sup> until failure of the WMF sample.

A total of fourteen piezo-ceramic-based P-wave transducers (footprint diameter 6 mm,

dominant resonant frequency 0.5 MHz) are directly attached to the Whitby Mudstone

-5-

(WM) sample (see fig. 1), through the Viton sleeve, which record the ultrasonic signals 142 propagated through the sample from a particular transducer. Each transducer acts sequen-143 tially as a source  $S_i$ , while the other thirteen transducers act as receivers  $R_i$ . During each 144 survey, multiple repeat measurements are performed, and the recorded waveforms are 145 stacking at each  $R_i$ , thereby improving the Signal-to-Noise Ratio (SNR). Each survey con-146 sists of 182 (14  $\times$  13) stacked waveforms, recorded during a time window of 410 µs, at a 147 sampling rate of 10 MHz, and an amplitude resolution of 12-bit [Sarout et al., 2015]. Sur-148 veys are conducted at regular time intervals of either 2.5 or 5 min during a deformation 149 experiment. Each active source survey takes  $\sim 30$  s, in the time between all fourteen trans-150 ducers are switched to passive monitoring mode, allowing the detection and recording of 151 spontaneous fracturing events referred to as Acoustic Emissions (AEs). In preparation for 152 subsequent processing, the data recorded during each survey p are arranged into an im-153 pulse response data cube  $\mathbf{D}_p$ , with each waveform stored corresponding to  $S_i$  in rows,  $R_j$ 154 in columns, for P surveys. 155

In order to ascertain the actual extent of the fracture network formed during triaxial failure, all tested WM samples were scanned before and after experimentation using an Xray computed tomography scanner. The created data set has a voxel size of 100 x 100 x  $400 \ \mu m$ .

162

#### 2.3 Coda-Wave Decorrelation Inversion Procedure

This section summaries the theory and inversion workflow applied to the three im-163 pulse response data cubes  $\mathbf{D}_n$  obtained from the three triaxial experiments. The work by 164 Larose et al. [2010] was the first description of what we refer to as Coda-Wave Decorre-165 lation Inversion, in which the formation of a single defect within a concrete block was 166 located by active source time-lapse measurements from several ultrasonic receivers. Since 167 this initial publication, other works have applied CWD inversion to monitor the formation 168 of cracks in concrete structures [Larose et al., 2015; Zhang et al., 2016], or study changes 169 due to volcanic [Obermann et al., 2013] or tectonic [Obermann et al., 2014, 2019] activity. 170 In this work, we apply a linear least squares inversion method, for the time-lapse moni-171 toring of shale deformation and failure under triaxial stress conditions. The python code 172 developed by Zotz-Wilson [2019] is used for this purpose. For a detailed description of the 173 theory employed, the reader is referred to Planès et al. [2015]. 174

-6-



Figure 1. Configuration 14 radially mounted transducers, aligned with the middle of each core sample,
after *Sarout et al.* [2015, 2017]; *Douma et al.* [2019].

The basic premise of CWD is that a change in the scattering properties of a medium, 175 can be inferred by a comparison between wavefields recorded before and after the change. 176 This comparison is performed via a normalised cross-correlation, with the measured decor-177 relation coefficient  $K^m$  calculated for a time window  $[t_k - t_w, t_k + t_w]$  within the coda. 178 Similar to Coda-Wave Interferometry (CWI) which relates the phase shift of this correla-179 tion to a change in elastic wavespeed [Larose and Hall, 2009; Payan et al., 2009; Zhang 180 et al., 2012; Grêt et al., 2006] or temperature [Grêt et al., 2006; Weaver and Lobkis, 2000; 181 Larose et al., 2006] of the medium, CWD relates the corresponding  $K^m$  to a change in 182 the scattering properties of the medium. In terms of data processing, for each survey p, 183 the measured decorrelation coefficient  $K_{ij}^m$  between a reference survey  $D_{ref}$  and survey 184  $D_p$  obtained after perturbation, is calculated for each source i and receiver j and non-185 overlapping window of width  $2t_w$  within the coda. The resulting data decorrelation matrix 186

<sup>187</sup>  $\mathbf{K}_{p}^{m}$  of dimensions  $[S_{i}, R_{j}, t_{k}]$  for each survey p, serves as the observed data input to an <sup>188</sup> inversion scheme.

In order to relate each  $K_{ij}^m$  for various windows within the coda to localised change within the core sample, a theoretical estimation of the decorrelation coefficient  $K_{ij}^m$  [*Rossetto et al.*, 2011], associated with a change in scattering at location **r** is calculated as ,

$$K_{ij}^{T}(\mathbf{r}, t_k) = \frac{V_0 \sigma_T}{2} Q(S_i, R_j, \mathbf{r}, t_k),$$
(1)

where  $\sigma_T$  is the scattering cross-section of a defect at position **r** within a medium with a background velocity  $V_0$ . The sensitivity kernel Q(...) used in this work was derived by *Rossetto et al.* [2011] as,

$$Q(S_i, R_j, \mathbf{r}, t_k) = \frac{1}{4\pi \mathcal{D}} \left( \frac{1}{s_i} + \frac{1}{r_j} \right) \exp\left[ \frac{||S_i - R_j||^2 - (s_i + r_j)^2}{4\mathcal{D}t_k} \right],$$
(2)

where  $s_i = ||S_i - \mathbf{r}||$ ,  $r_j = ||R_j - \mathbf{r}||$  and  $\mathcal{D}$  is the diffusivity of the wavefield within the medium. This kernel quantifies the expected sensitivity of a particular sensor arrangement  $(S_i, R_j)$ , at elapse time  $t_k$  to a perturbation at position  $\mathbf{r}$ . For the three-dimensional visualisation of each sensitivity kernel between different  $S_i - R_j$  pairs, see S1. The core volume is then discretised into tetrahedra, allowing eq. (1) to be calculated at the centre of each. A forward problem is then formulated in vector/matrix form as,

$$\mathbf{K}_{p}^{m} = \mathbf{G}\mathbf{m},\tag{3}$$

where  $\mathbf{K}_{p}^{m}$  is arranged into a vector of measured decorrelation coefficients at survey p, 201 for each  $S_i - R_j$  pair, and correlation window. The matrix **G** stores the sensitivity kernels 202  $Q(S_i, R_i, \mathbf{r}, t_k)$  row-wise, calculated at each tetrahedron. The true model parameters **m** is 203 a vector containing the density of  $\sigma_T$  perturbations within each tetrahedron given as  $\sigma_{T_{\rho}}$ 204 with the dimensions mm<sup>2</sup>/mm<sup>3</sup>. A least-squares formulation is adopted [Tarantola, 2005], 205 in order to invert for the model parameters  $\tilde{\mathbf{m}}$ . As  $\sigma_{T_{\rho}}$  must be positive, an iterative pro-206 cedure is applied for each  $\mathbf{K}_p^m$  by which any negative  $\tilde{\mathbf{m}}$  are discarded until convergence is 207 achieved, generally requiring no more than 10 iterations. 208

In order to make comparisons between each tested sample, we maintain the same relative weights in the inversion missfit function. The standard deviation  $\sigma_m$  from the *a priori* model  $m_{priori}$  is 0.53, which controls the degree of accuracy to which the measured data are fitted. The other free parameter in the inversion is the correlation distance between cells  $L_c$  which is set to 12.26 for all three tests. The wavefield diffusivity  $\mathcal{D}$  in eq. (2) is assumed to remain constant throughout each test, and is therefore estimated from a single trace selected at approximately 50 % of peak stress by the approach described in *Anugonda et al.* [2001]. This simplification is motivated by the observation of previous applications of CWD [*Zhang et al.*, 2018], that the inversion is relatively insensitive to changes in  $\mathcal{D}$ .

Additionally, each successive time-step in the inversion p is independent from one-219 another as the initial  $m_{priori}$  are set to zero. Therefore, any observed correlations between 220 successive distributions of  $\sigma_{T_{\rho}}$  are derived from the input data  $\mathbf{K}_{p}^{m}$ . A total of four, non-221 overlapping 40 µs correlation windows beginning at 50 µs up to 210 µs within the coda are 222 applied. The value of 50 µs is selected as this point corresponds to the onset of mostly 223 diffusive decay in energy. The width of each correlation window must be significantly 224 larger than the dominant period  $T_0$  of the wavefield, while the number of windows must 225 be balanced against computational cost. 226

The core volume is discretised into a tetrahedral mesh of 3.2 mm characteristic length 227 [Geuzaine and Remacle, 2017], resulting in  $\sim 15\,000$  cells, thereby keeping the computa-228 tional time low. The model parameters  $\tilde{\mathbf{m}}$  resulting from each inversion time-step p are 229 mapped onto the tetrahedral mesh, providing an indication of the spatio-temporal changes 230 in the density of scattering cross-section  $\sigma_{T_{\rho}}$  with respect to the reference data cube  $D_{ref}$ . 231 The reference point is selected towards the beginning of axial stress loading, once confin-232 ing pressure has been applied, thereby ensuring each ultrasonic transducer is sufficiently 233 coupled to the lateral surface of the WM sample (see fig. 1). Furthermore, in all cases a 234 comparison is made between the  $\tilde{\mathbf{m}}$  distribution resulting from: (i) a fixed reference com-235 parison (i.e. consecutive correlations between  $D_{p_i}$  and  $D_{ref}$ ); and (ii) the  $\tilde{\mathbf{m}}$  distribution 236 resulting from a rolling reference comparison, (i.e. consecutive correlations between  $D_{p_i}$ 237 and  $D_{p_i-N}$  which lags behind  $p_i$  by N surveys). Where large changes in  $\mathbf{K}_n^m$  are identi-238 fied early on during a given deformation experiment, a second  $D_{ref}$  is defined in order 239 to avoid large decorrelation and therefore a reduction in sensitivity to subsequent changes 240 [Zotz-Wilson et al., 2019]. 241

#### 242 3 Results

The analysis of the mudstone samples will be presented from highest to lowest water saturation, i.e., 70%, 58% and 28%. For each sample, the distribution of  $\sigma_{T_{\rho}}$  throughout

-9-

deformation is compared to the post-failure fracture network as imaged by post-mortem X-ray CT scanning. In order to quantitatively compare the three-dimensional inversion results with the evolution of stress during axial loading, 4 mm spheres are placed within the centre of regions of high  $\sigma_{T_{\rho}}$ ; and the average value of all intersected tetrahedra is calculated for each survey/time step throughout the experiment. This allows direct quantitive comparison of the three-dimensional distribution of  $\sigma_{T_{\rho}}$  with the changes in differential stress.

In all cases, rolling reference monitoring is performed to ensure the rate-of-change 252 in  $\sigma_{T_{
ho}}$  correlates with the fixed reference results, thereby avoiding a spurious correlation 253 after sudden large or prolonged changes in the medium [Zotz-Wilson et al., 2019]. For the 254 samples of lower initial water saturation (58 % and 28 %), two fixed reference points be-255 fore and after large changes in  $\sigma_{T_o}$  are defined. For the 70 %  $S_w$  sample, in which only 256 a single large shear fracture formed (fig. 2.b), only a single reference point is necessary. 257 For each deformation experiment we report the evolution of differential stress with time, 258 including the 3 days of consolidation under isotropic stress preceding the axial loading 259 stage. 260

Depending on the experiment, active source surveys were conducted every 2.3 min or 5 min. No acoustic emissions were detected during the (1.8 min or 4.5 min) period of passive monitoring between each consecutive active survey. Therefore, for the applied strain rate of  $1 \times 10^{-7}$  s<sup>-1</sup>, and saturation levels, the Whitby Mudstone is considered to produce no AE of sufficient magnitude to be detected.

266

#### 3.0.1 Sample with 70 % initial water saturation

For the 70% sample shown in fig. 2.a, an initial increase in  $\sigma_{T_o}$  occurs at the base 267 of the main shear fracture (point A in fig. 2.b), which was identified from the post-mortem 268 X-ray CT images. The changes in  $\sigma_{T_{\rho}}$  in region A relative to the fixed reference show an 269 initial increase at 13.8 MPa or 36 % of the peak stress, see fig. 2.a. This initial increase 270 peaks at 90 h, for a differential stress of ~20 MPa, before reducing again and reaching a 271 local minimum of  $\sim 26$  MPa at 98 h. This is immediately followed by a second sharp in-272 crease, around the onset of non-linear deformation. A third smaller rise occurs at  $\sim 106$  h, 273 followed by a smaller reduction up until ~113 h. A final slight increase in  $\sigma_{T_{\rho}}$  leading up 274 to peak stress at 37.8 MPa occurs, followed by a slight drop coinciding with the point of 275

failure. This is followed by ~20 h of slip along the newly formed shear feature(s), during which  $\sigma_{T_o}$  shows a gradual increase, plateauing out towards the end of the experiment.

The rolling-reference dashed curve in region A (fig. 2.a) provides an indication of the rate-of-change in  $\sigma_{T_{\rho}}$  between surveys performed 4.22 h apart. This curve shows its largest value at 89 h followed by peaks of reducing magnitude coinciding with the increase noted in the fixed-reference results at 102 h and 108 h. This provides confidence in the fixed-reference distribution of  $\sigma_{T_{\rho}}$ . At the peak stress, a final larger increase in the rolling reference  $\sigma_{T_{\rho}}$  curve occurs.

The six snapshots taken at the plain disks  $\bullet$  shown in fig. 2.a, display the  $\sigma_{T_{\rho}}$  dis-300 tribution for both x-z slices (fig. 3), and slices parallel to the A-B fracture plane (fig. 4). 301 For a movie of these figures covering the entire experiment see S3. The differences be-302 tween the first two time-steps  $(\bullet_1 - \bullet_2)$  in both figures show a localised increase in  $\sigma_{T_o}$ 303 towards the base of the post-deformation main shear fracture (A), with some distribution 304 along the fracture plane (A-B). As stress increases, the point of largest  $\sigma_{T_o}$  moves fur-305 ther downward along the fracture plane, with the fracture tip also showing a region of in-306 creased  $\sigma_{T_{o}}$ , slightly skewed to the right side of the fracture plane, see point B in fig. 4. 307 Further, there is a reduction in the distribution around point B and an increase in the ex-308 tent at the fracture base (point A) before  $(\bullet_4 - \bullet_5)$  and after  $(\bullet_5 - \bullet_6)$  failure. The x-z slices 309 (fig. 3) also capture the downward movement and increase in  $\sigma_{T_{\rho}}$  toward the base of the 310 main fracture. 311

312

#### 3.0.2 Sample with 58 % initial water saturation

The 58 % sample shows two post-deformation shear fractures. The main fracture ex-313 tends from the lower right (A) of the x-z slice, up until  $\sim$ 58 mm on the left (B) as shown 314 in fig. 5.b. The smaller fracture extends from the approximate centre of the x-z slice (C), 315 up until ~35 mm (D). The CWD inversion results indicate an initial increase in  $\sigma_{T_{\rho}}$  coin-316 ciding with the upper end of the minor fracture (region D), peaking at  $\sim 100$  h, see fig. 5.a. 317 The distribution of this initial increase is captured at the  $\blacktriangle$  snapshots, shown in fig. 6, or 318 as a movie in S4. Between  $\blacktriangle_1 - \blacktriangle_3$  upward drift in the location of maximum  $\sigma_{T_{\rho}}$  occurs, 319 followed by an increase in both magnitude and spatial distribution from  $\blacktriangle_4$ - $\blacktriangle_5$ . The final 320 snapshot ( $\blacktriangle_6$ ) shows the subsequent reduction in magnitude and spatial distribution. Just 321 prior to the peak  $\sigma_{T_{\rho}}$  noted at 98 h along the minor fracture (region D curve in fig. 5.a), 322



Figure 2. (a) Monitoring of the 70%  $S_w$  sample, showing the development in terms of scattering crosssection  $\sigma_{T_{\rho}}$  (reference at 80 h and the rate-of-change of  $\sigma_{T_{\rho}}$  (rolling reference lag of 4.22 h) for a 4 mm sampling sphere located at the base of the main shear fracture. The annotated  $\star$  indicates the identified point at which  $\sigma_{T_{\rho}}$  first localises, while • indicate the snapshots displayed in figs. 3 and 4. (b) X-Ray post-deformation single shear fracture, with a horizontal pre-deformation dehydration fracture plane at ~55 mm. The dashed region was obscured during X-Ray tomography by a transducer and therefore represents an interpretation. See S2 for an isometric view rotation of the fracture network.

an increase occurs at both the base (region A curve) and tip (region B curve) of the ma-323 jor fracture. The six  $\blacksquare$  snapshots shown in fig. 7 indicate a progressive increase in  $\sigma_{T_{\alpha}}$ 324 towards the major fracture tip (B), continuing all the way to peak stress at 51.3 MPa. The 325 x-z sliced distribution reflecting the • snapshots generated from a reference at 90 h (fig. 8) 326 show a process by which the region of largest  $\sigma_{T_{\rho}}$  alternates between regions correspond-327 ing to the post-deformation minor (D) and major fracture (A)  $(\bullet_1 - \bullet_4)$ , and then focuses at 328 the main fracture just prior  $(\bullet_5)$  to, and after  $(\bullet_6)$  the point of dynamic failure. See S5 for 329 a movie of both the x-z and major fracture slice. 330

#### 350

#### 3.0.3 Sample with 28 % initial water saturation

351

352

The 28 % sample post-deformation fracture network consists of one large shear fracture, traversing from the lower left to upper right of the x-z slice (A-B in fig. 9.b), with



Figure 3. The 70%  $S_w$  sample sliced along the x-z plane for time steps  $\bullet_1$  to  $\bullet_6$  as indicated by the  $\bullet$  symbols in fig. 2.a. Point A indicates the position of the 4 mm sampling sphere at  $\bullet_6$ . The distribution of  $\sigma_{T_{\rho}}$ initially localises at  $\bullet_2$  and then drifts downward, displaying increased focus in region A, prior to ( $\bullet_5$ ), and after ( $\bullet_6$ ), failure. See S3 for a movie of this figure.

preexisting genetic dehydration fracture planes at the bottom (E) and two at the top (F) 353 of the core. Around the base of the large fracture (A), several smaller fractures coalesce 354 into a single fracture (C-D in fig. 9.b). Careful inspection of the post deformation X-355 Ray scans indicates several smaller fractures, most of which are on one side of the main 356 shear fracture, though there also exists a smaller fracture which originates from two con-357 ical low density heterogeneities (E) at the base of the core. Furthermore, the dashed re-358 gion in fig. 9.b from the base of the core up until the lower dehydration fracture at E, was 359 damaged during testing and subsequently this region fell off when the core was extracted 360 from the pressure vessel. For the first  $\sim 10$  min of experimentation the applied strain rate 361 is  $1 \times 10^{-6} \text{ s}^{-1}$  up until 7 MPa of axial stress, after which it is reduced to  $1 \times 10^{-7} \text{ s}^{-1}$  for 362



Figure 4. The 70%  $S_w$  sliced parallel to the fracture plane A-B, for time steps  $\bullet_1$  to  $\bullet_6$  as indicated by the • symbols in fig. 2.a. Point A indicates the position of the 4 mm sampling sphere at  $t_6$ , while point B shows the position of the maximum  $\sigma_{T_\rho}$  around the fracture tip. The distribution of  $\sigma_{T_\rho}$  initially localises at  $\bullet_2$  and then drifts downward, displaying increased focus in region A, prior to ( $\bullet_5$ ), and after ( $\bullet_6$ ), failure. See S3 for a movie of this figure.

the remainder of the test. During this period of increased strain rate, in the centre region 363 of the minor fracture (C-D) an increase in  $\sigma_{T_{\rho}}$  occurs, the spatial distribution of which 364 is captured by the ■ snapshots indicated in fig. 9 and displayed in fig. 10. For a movie 365 of both figures see S6. While the first two time-steps  $\blacksquare_1$  -  $\blacksquare_2$  show almost the same dis-366 tribution, the third  $\blacksquare_3$  indicates an increase in magnitude and upward movement. This 367 is then followed ( $\blacksquare_4$  -  $\blacksquare_6$ ) by an increase in spatial distribution and magnitude of  $\sigma_{T_{\rho}}$ . 368 Shortly afterwards a subsequent reduction in  $\sigma_{T_{\rho}}$  occurs. In order to improve sensitivity to 369 subsequent changes, a reference point is defined at 105 h. The results from this redefined 370 reference show an increase in  $\sigma_{T_{\rho}}$  within a region coinciding with the two low density 371



Figure 5. (a) Monitoring of the 58%  $S_w$  sample, showing the development in terms of scattering crosssection  $\sigma_{T_{\rho}}$  for three 4 mm spheres located within the minor and main shear fractures. The annotated  $\bigstar$ indicates the identified point at which  $\sigma_{T_{\rho}}$  first localises, while •,  $\blacktriangle$ , and  $\blacksquare$  indicate the snapshots displayed in figs. 6 to 8. (b) X-Ray post-deformation major (A-B) and minor (C-D) shear fractures, with a preexisting dehydration fracture plane at ~45 mm. See S2 for an isometric view rotation of the fracture network.

heterogeneities (E), and in a region around the upper dehydration fractures (F). See the • 372 snapshots indicated in fig. 9 and displayed in fig. 11. For a movie of both figures see S7. 373 This centre of maximum  $\sigma_{T_{\rho}}$  around E moves downward as it increases (•1 - •3), up un-374 til 130 h, at which point a gradual reduction begins. During  $\bullet_1$  -  $\bullet_3$  we also note a region 375 of increasing  $\sigma_{T_{\rho}}$  around the upper dehydration fracture F. After peak stress is reached at 376 ~167 h a rapid redistribution of  $\sigma_{T_{\rho}}$  over the main fracture plane occurs (Region A curve 377 in fig. 9.a), which increases post failure, between  $\bullet_5$  and  $\bullet_6$ . This re-activation of the re-378 gion surrounding the main fracture plane is spatially captured by the  $\Box$  snapshots shown 379 in fig. 12 and movie in S7, which shows minimal increase between  $\Box_1$  and  $\Box_2$  prior to 380 peak stress, followed by increased distribution  $\Box_3 - \Box_6$  after failure. 381

#### 3.0.4 Comparative analysis

405

For each of the samples of varying initial  $S_w$ , an initial increase in  $\sigma_{T_\rho}$  is determined, based on the criterion of an increase in both its rate-of-change and spatial focus.



Figure 6. The 58%  $S_w$  sample sliced along the minor fracture plane C-D, for time steps  $\blacktriangle_1$  to  $\blacktriangle_6$  as indicated by the  $\blacktriangle$  symbols in fig. 5.a. Point D indicates the position of the 4 mm sampling sphere at  $t_6$ . The focal point of the distribution of  $\sigma_{T_{\rho}}$  moves upwards between  $\blacktriangle_1$  and  $\bigstar_3$  and then increases in magnitude and spatial extent between  $\blacktriangle_4$  and  $\bigstar_5$ . Subsequent reduction in the magnitude of  $\sigma_{T_{\rho}}$  occurs towards  $\bigstar_6$ . See S4 for a movie of this figure.

408	This point is marked in figures figs. 2, 5 and 9 by a $\bigstar$ . For both the 70 and 58 % $S_w$
409	samples an increase in localised $\sigma_{T_{\rho}}$ is found at ~14 MPa, while for the 28 % $S_w$ this oc-
410	curs at 6.5 MPa, see fig. 13. Additionally, we identify a negative correlation between $S_w$
411	and the peak differential stress achieved during each test [Douma et al., 2019].

The relationship between the differential stress normalised by each sample peak stress with volumetric strain is shown in fig. 14. All core samples show an initially positive compactive response though become dilative prior to failure. Here both the 70 % and  $58 \% S_w$  samples show the identified initial focus in  $\sigma_{T_\rho}$  ( $\bigstar$ ) to occurs within the compactive region, prior to the onset of dilatancy.



Figure 7. The 58%  $S_w$  sample sliced along the fracture plane A-B, for time steps  $\blacksquare_1$  to  $\blacksquare_6$  as indicated by the  $\blacksquare$  symbols in fig. 5.a. Points A and B indicate the position of the 4 mm sampling sphere at  $t_6$ . The distribution of  $\sigma_{T_\rho}$  increases from point A towards point B between  $\blacktriangle_1$  and  $\bigstar_6$ . A notable increase in its magnitude at both A and B occurs at  $\bigstar_6$ . See S4 for a movie of this figure.



Figure 8. The 58%  $S_w$  sample sliced along the x-z plane for time steps  $\bullet_1$  to  $\bullet_6$  as indicated by the  $\bullet$  symbols in fig. 5.a, and a reference at 90 h. Points A and D indicate the position of the 4 mm sampling spheres at  $t_6$ . The distribution of  $\sigma_{T_{\rho}}$  alternates between region D and A twice ( $\bullet_1$  to  $\bullet_4$ ). At  $\bullet_5$  prior to failure, region A shows greater  $\sigma_{T_{\rho}}$  than region D. After failure at  $\bullet_6$  only region A displays a focused region of  $\sigma_{T_{\rho}}$ . See S4 for a movie of this figure.



**Figure 9.** (a) Monitoring of the 28%  $S_w$  sample, showing the development of  $\sigma_{T_\rho}$  at the base and tip of 382 the main fracture, and in a region surrounding the high-density impurities. Note the dashed, Region B curve 383 is only shown for the fixed-reference distribution at the beginning of the stress increase. The annotated  $\star$ 384 indicates the identified point at which  $\sigma_{T_{\rho}}$  first localises, while •, **I**, and  $\Box$  indicate the snapshots displayed 385 in figs. 10 to 12. (b) X-Ray post-deformation major (A-B) and minor (C-D) shear fractures, with preexisting 386 dehydration fracture planes above and below F, and below E. Two low-density impurities present in the sam-387 ple are indicated at point E. The dashed regions below E was damaged during testing, and therefore was not 388 present during X-Ray tomography. See S2 for an isometric view rotation of the fracture network. 389



Figure 10. The 28%  $S_w$  sample sliced along the minor fracture plane C-D, for time steps  $\blacksquare_1$  to  $\blacksquare_6$  as indicated by the  $\blacksquare$  symbols in fig. 9.Point D indicates the position of the 4 mm sampling sphere at  $t_6$ . The focal point of the distribution of  $\sigma_{T_\rho}$  moves upward between  $\blacksquare_1$  and  $\blacksquare_3$ , and then increases in magnitude between  $\blacksquare_4$  and  $\blacksquare_6$ . See S6 for a movie of this figure.



Figure 11. The 28%  $S_w$  sample sliced along the x-z plane for time steps  $\bullet_1$  to  $\bullet_6$  as indicated by the  $\bullet$ symbols in fig. 9. Points A and E indicate the position of the 4 mm sampling spheres at  $t_6$ . Point F indicates the dehydration planes; point E the low density inhomogeneities; and B the main fracture tip. Between  $\bullet_1$ and  $\bullet_3$  the  $\sigma_{T_\rho}$  distribution increases in magnitude and focus around regions E and F. At  $\bullet_4$  a reduction in both regions magnitude and distribution occurs. The post failure snapshots ( $\bullet_5$  to  $\bullet_6$ ) show distribution from region A towards region B and within region F. See S7 for a movie of this figure.



Figure 12. The 28%  $S_w$  sample sliced along the main fracture plane A-B, for time steps  $\Box_1$  to  $\Box_6$  as indicated by the  $\Box$  symbols in fig. 9. Point A indicates the position of the 4 mm sampling sphere at  $t_6$ . Between  $\Box_1$  and  $\Box_3$  there is a slight increase in the  $\sigma_{T_\rho}$  distribution in region A, while between  $\Box_3$  and  $\Box_4$  a rapid increase occurs cross the plain A-B. From  $\Box_4$  and  $\Box_6$  the magnitude  $\sigma_{T_\rho}$  increases in region A. See S7 for a movie of this figure.



Figure 13. Comparison between the interpreted onset of localised inelastic strain on the left axis, and differential peak stress on the right axis, vs initial water saturation of each core sample.



Figure 14. The differential stress, normalised by each samples peak stress, is compared with the volumetric milli-strain. The point of identified initial localisation in  $\sigma_{T_{\rho}}$  is indicated by  $\bigstar$ , which for the 70 % and 58 % samples occurs within a region of approximately linear change, prior to the onset of dilatancy which is identified by the  $\blacksquare$  symbols.

#### 423 **4 Discussion**

## 424

# 4.1 The development of the fracture network as interpreted from the distribution of scattering cross-section

The application of CWD inversion in monitoring the triaxial deformation of three 426 mudstones of varying initial water saturation, indicates progressive and repeated re-distribution 427 of inelastic strain within the rock following strain localisation events. Here we define mi-428 croscopic inelastic strain as associated with closure, opening or shearing along micro-429 scopic fractures, while macroscopic inelastic strain refers to the coalescence of micro-430 scopic cracks into a large shear fracture. A region of increased  $\sigma_{T_o}$  indicates initial lo-431 calised microscopic inelastic strain and eventually the formation of macroscopic fractures. 432 An increase in spatial distribution indicates the growth of a cracked region, while the in-433 crease in magnitude of  $\sigma_{T_{o}}$  indicates either an increase in the crack density and/or an in-434 crease in the impedance contrast between the cracks and the rock matrix, which can be 435 interpreted as a change in the aperture of the cracks/fractures. 436

For the most saturated sample, there are three stages of increase, followed by a de-437 crease in  $\sigma_{T_{\rho}}$  at the base of the main shear fracture (point A in fig. 2.b ). This suggests 438 initial localised strain occurs, which is subsequently closed as the stress is reduced and 439 redistributed throughout the rest of the sample. The reactivation of the same region and 440 the increase in both the distribution (spatial extent) and magnitude of  $\sigma_{T_0}$  suggests an in-441 crease occurs in the width, and aperture of the fracture, respectively. This is evident when 442 viewing the slice along the fracture plane (fig. 4 or the S.3 movie), where only after reac-443 tivation at 98 h (•<sub>3</sub>) does the spatial distribution of  $\sigma_{T_o}$  notably increase at both the base 444 (A) and tip (B) of the fracture. This coincides with the onset of non-linear inelastic de-445 formation or the yield point of the sample. The subsequent reduction in  $\sigma_{T_{\rho}}$  distribution at 446 the tip (B) and increase at the base (A) before  $(\bullet_4 - \bullet_5)$ , and after  $(\bullet_5 - \bullet_6)$  failure, indicates 447 that the fracture plane grows laterally at the base while the tip closes up. Further, the ob-448 served reduction in the maximum rate-of-change in  $\sigma_{T_o}$  over the first three activations at 449 the fracture base (dashed curve in fig. 2.a) suggests a linear reduction in the rate at which 450 the micro/macroscopic fractures open. 451

The distribution of  $\sigma_{T_{\rho}}$  during the 58 %  $S_w$  test also displays a process of continuous re-distribution of stress, though in this case between a region corresponding to the minor (C-D) and major (A-B) fractures in fig. 5.b. Initially, in a region surrounding the

455	minor fracture (C-D) at $\sim$ 82 h, we interpret the formation of microscopic inelastic strain.
456	Growth occurs in both magnitude and distribution at ~89 h (see $\blacktriangle_4$ in fig. 6 or S.4 movie),
457	indicating larger scale coalescence occurs at this point. At $98h$ , the main fracture appears
458	to initiate, from the base (A) which again corresponds to the classically determined yield
459	point of the sample. With continued deformation the $\sigma_{T_{\rho}}$ distribution moves towards the
460	tip (B), and eventually fails the sample. Throughout the test we identify approximately
461	four stages of redistribution in $\sigma_{T_{\rho}}$ (see $\bullet_1 - \bullet_4$ in fig. 8 or S.5 movie) between the minor
462	and major fracture. This is interpreted as several stages of opening and closure of initially
463	microscopic and eventually macroscopic fractures, as stress redistribution occurs.

The sample with the lowest initial water content (28 %S<sub>w</sub>) with its major (A-B in 464 fig. 9.b), and minor (C-D) fractures, show a similar process of re-distribution of  $\sigma_{T_o}$ . 465 However, a notable difference with this sample is the presence of the two low density, 466 approximately conical heterogeneities (region E in fig. 9.b) at the lower end of the core. 467 These are interpreted as the void left by the exoskeleton of gastropods such as the Nep-468 tunea contraria [Linnaeus, 1771]. The distribution of  $\sigma_{T_{\rho}}$  supports an interpretation where 469 initially the minor fracture (C-D) experiences localised strain at the base of the core, dur-470 ing the initial region of increased strain-rate, see snapshots  $\blacksquare$  in (fig. 10) or S6 movie. 471 This is followed by gradual prolonged fracturing of a large region surrounding the low 472 density impurities, see  $\bullet_1 - \bullet_4$  in fig. 11 or the S.7 movie. Subsequently the major shear 473 fracture (A-B) develops ( $\Box_4 - \Box_6$  in fig. 12 and  $\bullet_5 - \bullet_6$  in fig. 11 or the S.7 movie) close 474 to the peak stress, and the failure of the sample. This interpretation is supported by the 475 fact that the region surrounding the interpreted marine exoskeletons (E) was fractured to 476 the point that it fell off the end of the sample once removed from the pressure vessel. Ad-477 ditionally, the concentration in  $\sigma_{T_{\rho}}$  between the two preexisting dehydration fractures (F), 478 particularly between  $\bullet_2 - \bullet_3$  in fig. 11, indicates that either a change in compliance oc-479 curs over these interfaces, or microscopic changes occur within the region between them 480 (a layer of different mineralogy or microstructure). 481

In summary, for all tested samples the identified localisation in  $\sigma_{T_{\rho}}$  was found early on during deformation, between 7 % and 36 % of the peak differential stress and prior the onset of dilatancy (see fig. 14). We therefore interpret this initial localisation in  $\sigma_{T_{\rho}}$ , not as the formation of macroscopic coalesced shear fractures but primarily driven by distributed intergranular opening, closure, and shearing at the microscopic scale. A similar conclusion was reached in a recent study by *McBeck et al.* [2018] on the Green River

shale, during which core samples were time-lapse imaged by X-Ray microtomography 488 while under confining pressure. The identification of localised strain regions became ap-489 parent at 35 % of the peak differential stress, preceding macroscopic shear failure. This 490 value is consistent with the upper limit of the range reported here. The interpretation of 491 microscopic fracture formation within the inelastic region (before dilatancy) for WM sam-492 ples is supported by *Douma et al.* [2019], where non-elastic wave-speed changes were ob-493 served, conducive with microfracturing. Further, McBeck et al. [2018] demonstrate that 494 microscopic opening, closure, and shearing work together to eventually produce macro-495 scopic shear failure. Their observations support our interpretation of a complex timeline 496 of locally increasing (opening or shearing) and decreasing (closure of micro/macroscopic 497 fracturing)  $\sigma_{T_o}$  up until failure. 498

It is also interesting to note that the observed initial distribution of  $\sigma_{T_{\rho}}$  in the x-z snapshots shows similar contours to the expected maximum regions of elastic stress distribution for a cylindrical core (2:1 length to diameter ratio) as described by *Paterson and Wong* [2005]. While this is most evident at the beginning of the S3 and S6 movies, it is also shown by the  $\bullet_1$  snapshot in fig. 3.

504

#### 4.2 The impact of water saturation

The Whitby Mudstone plugs display an increase in strength and a reduction in plas-505 ticity with a reduction in water saturation [Douma et al., 2019]. The primary mechanism 506 driving these changes is expected to be an increase in the capillary suction within the pore 507 space of the mudstone [Fjar et al., 2008; Ramos da Silva et al., 2008; Ferrari et al., 2014]. 508 As the pore-fluid evaporates from the mudstone, a reduction in the pore-pressure occurs, 509 leading to a tensile stress or negative pressure, and finally a change in compliance (or 510 stiffness) between individual grains [Onaisi et al., 1994; Forsans and Schmitt, 1994; Ewy, 511 2014]. This ultimately leads to an increase in the strength and a reduction in the plastic-512 ity of the material. Our experimental results corroborate this relationship which has been 513 recently confirmed for the Whitby Mudstone [Douma et al., 2019] as well as other mud-514 stones [Vales et al., 2004; Ramos da Silva et al., 2008; Ghorbani et al., 2009]. The failure 515 of the partially-saturated Whitby Mudstone occurs in the brittle domain, where shear fail-516 ure of the result in the formation of dilative fracture planes [Douma et al., 2019]. Further-517 more, the comparison between the identified onset of inelastic strain (microscopic dam-518 age), and initial water saturation suggests a non-linear relationship, see fig. 13. However, 519

this may be also due to the added inhomogeneity of the low  $S_w$  sample (the low density heterogeneity), or the higher initial strain-rate, and therefore more measurement points are required to statistically validate this argument.

As no AE were detected during passive monitoring of the samples, this suggests that the brittle failure necessary to generate AE is insufficient [*Main*, 1990] to overcome the environmental noise.

526

#### 4.3 CWD: An effective real-time fracture monitoring tool

This study on samples from the WMF indicates that CWD inversion has the potential to image the initiation, propagation and branching of fractures or other heterogeneities, tested under realistic subsurface conditions (stress, pressure, temperature). While there are several other techniques which provide spatio-temporal information on inelastic strain at in-situ conditions, they often require substantial investment in equipment and post-processing, or are inherently less sensitive to subtle localised microscopic changes.

Time-lapse synchrotron micro-tomography undoubtedly provides the highest spatial 533 resolution, as it is able to resolve the detailed structure of macroscopic fractures [Renard 534 et al., 2017, 2018], and microscopic strain localisation through digital volume correlations 535 [Kandula et al., 2018; Mao et al., 2019; Mao and Chiang, 2016; McBeck et al., 2018]. The 536 main limitation of this method is that it requires access to an X-ray beam in a synchrotron 537 of sufficient energy to image a sample housed within a bespoke pressure vessel. Further, 538 the maximum sample size is strictly constrained by both the spatial and temporal resolu-539 tion requirements. 540

Traditional acoustic imaging methods such as velocity tomography, while more affordable, and able to provide sufficient spatiotemporal resolution to resolve the region around macroscopic fractures [*Jansen et al.*, 1993; *Brantut*, 2018; *Aben et al.*, 2019], have not shown sensitivity to microscopic inelastic strain localisation.

Passive AEs monitoring is a well established technique in experimental rock mechanics, and with a sufficiently accurate velocity model provides a spatio-temporal indication of the occurrence of brittle failure [*Lei et al.*, 2004; *Aben et al.*, 2019; *Brantut*, 2018; *Jansen et al.*, 1993; *Sarout et al.*, 2017]. However, as demonstrated by this study on the WMF, AEs monitoring relies on the existence of seismicity of sufficient magnitude and

-26-

frequency to be detected by the available sensor network. For clay- or calcite-rich rocks, where inelastic deformation can develop in a plastic, relatively silent fashion [*Peng and Yang*, 2018], AEs monitoring is a less suitable method to determine the onset of inelastic strain. Further, both active and passive monitoring methods require time consuming preprocessing steps, such as first arrival picking, and the construction of a velocity model, thereby limiting their utility in real-time monitoring.

In summary, CWD inversion monitoring requires little to no additional investment 556 in equipment where acoustic monitoring is already available. Further, it is more sensi-557 tive to subtle changes in scattering or velocity than methods which rely on the coherent 558 arrivals [Zotz-Wilson et al., 2019], and once appropriate inversion parameters are deter-559 mined for a particular lithology and receiver arrangement, quasi-real-time monitoring is 560 feasible. While CWD inversion cannot provide the same spatial resolution as synchrotron 561 micro-tomography, it appears to demonstrate similar sensitivity to the onset of microscopic 562 inelastic strain. There also exist considerable opportunity to improve upon the applica-563 tion CWD within the laboratory setting. For example, the sensitivity kernels used in this 564 study (eq. (2)) do not account for the core boundaries, any in-situ heterogeneities, or the 565 anisotropic layered nature of the WMF. Several works have proposed to better account for 566 the initial material state by first determining the sensitivity kernels by numerically mod-567 elling of the diffusive propagation of energy within [Kanu and Snieder, 2015; Xue et al., 568 2019]. 569

#### 570 **5 Conclusion**

The CWD inversion monitoring of the Whitby Mudstone during triaxial compaction, 571 indicates that the formation of inelastic strain localisation occurs at less than 36 % of peak 572 stress. The AE monitoring suggest such inelastic localisations develop gradually not im-573 pulsively, from microscopic diffuse damage, up until the macroscopic shear failure, while 574 the comparison of different  $S_w$  suggests a non-linear relationship with the onset of strain 575 localisation. In general, the application of CWD inversion to what is ostensibly an aseis-576 mic mudstone, has enabled a qualitative discussion of the time and location at which ini-577 tial microscopic inelastic strain (opening, closure, and shearing) develops. Furthermore, 578 subsequent stages of reactivation and eventual macroscopic shear failure are discernible. 579

#### 580 Acknowledgments

We would like to thank David Nguyen and Stephen Firns at CSIRO's Geomechanics and 581 Geophysics Laboratory, for their assistance during the experimentation. The assistance 582 provided by Joost Van Meel at TUDelft in post processing the CT-scans is also much ap-583 preciated. Further, the funding provided by the Dutch Upstream Gas top-sector initiative 584 (project TKIG01020) and our industry partners Energie Beheer Nederland B.V., and Nep-585 tune Energy Netherlands B.V., Wintershall Noordzee B.V. is acknowledged. Furthermore, 586 we would like to acknowledge the use of the open-source python module pyVista [Sulli-587 van and Kaszynski, 2019], which is used to visualise all of the 3-D fracture networks, and 588 CWD inversion results. The raw acoustic and mechanical data used in this study is avail-589 able at Zotz-Wilson et al. [2019], under the name "Acoustic, mechanical, and microstruc-590 ture data used in: Ultrasonic Imaging of the Onset and Growth of Fractures within Par-591 tially Saturated Whitby Mudstone using Coda-Wave Decorrelation Inversion". 592

#### 593 References

- Aben, F. M., N. Brantut, T. M. Mitchell, and E. C. David (2019), Rupture Energetics in
   Crustal Rock From Laboratory-Scale Seismic Tomography, *Geophys. Res. Lett.*, doi:
   10.1029/2019GL083040.
- Aikas, T., and R. Sundell (2014), ONKALO From Concept to Reality, 1, pp. 1–9,
- 598 WM2014 Conference, Phoenix,.
- Anugonda, P., J. S. Wiehn, and J. A. Turner (2001), Diffusion of ultrasound in concrete,
   *Ultrasonics*, *39*(6), 429–435, doi:10.1016/S0041-624X(01)00077-4.
- Aplin, A. C., and J. H. Macquaker (2011), Mudstone diversity: Origin and implications

for source, seal, and reservoir properties in petroleum systems, *Am. Assoc. Pet. Geol. Bull.*, doi:10.1306/03281110162.

- Armitage, P. J., R. H. Worden, D. R. Faulkner, A. R. Butcher, and A. A. Espie (2016),
- Permeability of the Mercia Mudstone: suitability as caprock to carbon capture and storage sites, *Geofluids*, *16*(1), 26–42, doi:10.1111/gfl.12134.
- Ayalew, L., and H. Yamagishi (2005), The application of GIS-based logistic regression
- for landslide susceptibility mapping in the Kakuda-Yahiko Mountains, Central Japan,
- <sup>609</sup> *Geomorphology*, 65(1-2), 15–31, doi:10.1016/j.geomorph.2004.06.010.
- Brantut, N. (2018), Time-resolved tomography using acoustic emissions in the labora-
- tory, and application to sandstone compaction, *Geophys. J. Int.*, pp. 2177–2192, doi:

- 612 10.1093/gji/ggy068.
- Brookins, D. G. (1976), Shale as a repository for radioactive waste: The evidence from Oklo, *Environ. Geol.*, 1(5), 255–259, doi:10.1007/BF02676715.
- Busch, A., S. Alles, Y. Gensterblum, D. Prinz, D. Dewhurst, M. Raven, H. Stanjek, and
  B. Krooss (2008), Carbon dioxide storage potential of shales, *Int. J. Greenh. Gas Control*, 2(3), 297–308, doi:10.1016/j.ijggc.2008.03.003.
- <sup>618</sup> Douma, L. A. N. R., J. Dautriat, J. Sarout, D. N. Dewhurst, and A. Barnhoorn (2019),
- <sup>619</sup> Impact of water saturation on the elastic anisotropy of the Whitby Mudstone, United

Kingdom, *GEOPHYSICS*, pp. 1–82, doi:10.1190/geo2019-0004.1.

- Ewy, R. T. (2014), Shale swelling/shrinkage and water content change due to im-
- posed suction and due to direct brine contact, Acta Geotech., 9(5), 869–886, doi:
- 623 10.1007/s11440-013-0297-5.
- Ferrari, A., V. Favero, P. Marschall, and L. Laloui (2014), Experimental analysis of the water retention behaviour of shales, *Int. J. Rock Mech. Min. Sci.*, 72, 61–70, doi:
- 626 10.1016/j.ijrmms.2014.08.011.
- Fjar, E., R. Holt, A. M. Raaen, R. Risnes, and P. Horsrud (2008), *Petroleum related rock mechanics*, 2nd ed., 251 287 pp., Elsevier Sience.
- Forsans, T. M., and L. Schmitt (1994), Capillary forces: The neglected factor in shale instability studies?, *Soc. Pet. Eng. - Rock Mech. Pet. Eng. 1994*, pp. 71–84.
- Garrels, R. M., and F. T. Mackenzie (1969), Sedimentary Rock Types: Relative Propor-
- tions as a Function of Geological Time, *Science* (80-. )., 163(3867), 570–571, doi:
- <sup>633</sup> 10.1126/science.163.3867.570.
- Geuzaine, C., and J.-F. Remacle (2017), A three-dimensional finite element mesh genera-
- tor with built-in pre- and post-processing facilities, *Int. J. Numer. Meth. Engng.*
- Ghorbani, A., M. Zamora, and P. Cosenza (2009), Effects of desiccation on the elas-
- tic wave velocities of clay-rocks, Int. J. Rock Mech. Min. Sci., 46(8), 1267–1272, doi:
- 638 10.1016/j.ijrmms.2009.01.009.
- Grêt, A. (2005), Monitoring rapid temporal change in a volcano with coda wave interferometry, *Geophys. Res. Lett.*, *32*(6), L06,304, doi:10.1029/2004GL021143.
- Grêt, A., R. Snieder, and J. Scales (2006), Time-lapse monitoring of rock proper-
- ties with coda wave interferometry, J. Geophys. Res. Solid Earth, 111(3), 1–11, doi:
- 643 10.1029/2004JB003354.

- Heap, M. J., P. Baud, P. G. Meredith, A. F. Bell, and I. G. Main (2009), Time-dependent
  brittle creep in darley dale sandstone, *J. Geophys. Res. Solid Earth*, *114*(7), 1–22, doi:
  10.1029/2008JB006212.
- Houben, M., A. Barnhoorn, L. Wasch, J. Trabucho-Alexandre, C. Peach, and M. Drury
   (2016a), Microstructures of Early Jurassic (Toarcian) shales of Northern Europe, *Int. J. Coal Geol.*, *165*, 76–89, doi:10.1016/j.coal.2016.08.003.
- Houben, M. E., A. Barnhoorn, J. Lie-A-Fat, T. Ravestein, C. J. Peach, and M. R. Drury
- (2016b), Microstructural characteristics of the Whitby Mudstone Formation (UK), *Mar.*

ese Pet. Geol., 70, 185–200, doi:10.1016/j.marpetgeo.2015.11.011.

- Izumi, K., M. Ogihara, and H. Kameyaf (1998), *Displacements of bridge foundations* on sedimentary soft rock: A case study on small-strain stiffness, pp. 233–246, doi:
- 655 10.1680/pdbog.26421.0016.
- Jansen, D. P., S. R. Carlson, R. P. Young, and D. A. Hutchins (1993), Ultrasonic imaging and acoustic emission monitoring of thermally induced microcracks in Lac du Bonnet granite, *J. Geophys. Res.*, *98*(B12).
- Jianghui, M., Z. Min, Z. Hongjing, L. Luofu, W. Zhiyong, Z. Jieli, and W. Ying (2012),
- Geo Geochemical Evidence for Coal and Carbonaceous Mudstone as the Possible Major Oil
- Source Rock in the Jurassic Turpan Basin, Northwest China, *Acta Geol. Sin. English Ed.*, 86(5), 1171–1181, doi:10.1111/j.1755-6724.2012.00739.x.
- Kandula, N., B. Cordonnier, D. K. Dysthe, J. R. Sanchez, X. Zheng, F. Renard, W. Zhu,
- M. Kobchenko, J. McBeck, P. Meakin, C. Noiriel, and F. Fusseis (2018), Dynamic In
- 665 Situ Three-Dimensional Imaging and Digital Volume Correlation Analysis to Quantify

Strain Localization and Fracture Coalescence in Sandstone, *Pure Appl. Geophys.*, *C*, doi:
 10.1007/s00024-018-2003-x.

Kanu, C., and R. Snieder (2015), Numerical computation of the sensitivity kernel for

monitoring weak changes with multiply scattered acoustic waves, Geophys. J. Int.,

<sup>670</sup> 203(3), 1923–1936, doi:10.1093/gji/ggv391.

- Laloui, L., S. Salager, and M. Rizzi (2013), Retention behaviour of natural clayey mate rials at different temperatures, *Acta Geotech.*, 8(5), 537–546, doi:10.1007/s11440-013 0255-2.
- Larose, E., and S. Hall (2009), Monitoring stress related velocity variation in concrete
- with a 2E10-5 relative resolution using diffuse ultrasound, J. Acoust. Soc. Am., 125(4),
- 676 1853–1856, doi:10.1121/1.3079771.

677	Larose, E., J. De Rosny, L. Margerin, D. Anache, P. Gouedard, M. Campillo, and B. Van
678	Tiggelen (2006), Observation of multiple scattering of kHz vibrations in a concrete
679	structure and application to monitoring weak changes, Phys. Rev. E - Stat. Nonlinear,
680	Soft Matter Phys., doi:10.1103/PhysRevE.73.016609.
681	Larose, E., T. Planès, V. Rossetto, and L. Margerin (2010), Locating a small change in a
682	multiple scattering environment, Appl. Phys. Lett., 96(20), doi:10.1063/1.3431269.
683	Larose, E., A. Obermann, A. Digulescu, T. Planès, JF. Chaix, F. Mazerolle, and
684	G. Moreau (2015), Locating and characterizing a crack in concrete with diffuse
685	ultrasound: A four-point bending test, J. Acoust. Soc. Am., 138(1), 232-241, doi:
686	10.1121/1.4922330.
687	Lei, X., K. Masuda, O. Nishizawa, L. Jouniaux, L. Liu, W. Ma, T. Satoh, and
688	K. Kusunose (2004), Detailed analysis of acoustic emission activity during catas-
689	trophic fracture of faults in rock, J. Struct. Geol., 26(2), 247-258, doi:10.1016/S0191-
690	8141(03)00095-6.
691	Linnaeus, C. (1771), Mantissa Plantarum, Mantissa Plant.
692	Lockner, D. (1993), The role of acoustic emission in the study of rock fracture,
693	Int. J. Rock Mech. Min. Sci. Geomech. Abstr., 30(7), 883-899, doi:10.1016/0148-
694	9062(93)90041-B.
695	Main, I. G. (1990), Quasi-static modelling of stress histories during the earthquake cycle:
696	precursory seismic and aseismic stress release, Geophys. J. Int., 102(1), 195-203, doi:
697	10.1111/j.1365-246X.1990.tb00541.x.
698	Mao, L., and Fp. Chiang (2016), 3D strain mapping in rocks using digital volumetric
699	speckle photography technique, Acta Mech., 227(11), 3069-3085, doi:10.1007/s00707-
700	015-1531-z.
701	Mao, L., H. Liu, Y. Zhu, Z. Zhu, R. Guo, and Fp. Chiang (2019), 3D Strain Mapping of
702	Opaque Materials Using an Improved Digital Volumetric Speckle Photography Tech-
703	nique with X-Ray Microtomography, Appl. Sci., 9(7), 1418, doi:10.3390/app9071418.
704	McBeck, J., M. Kobchenko, S. A. Hall, E. Tudisco, B. Cordonnier, P. Meakin, and F. Re-
705	nard (2018), Investigating the Onset of Strain Localization Within Anisotropic Shale
706	Using Digital Volume Correlation of Time-Resolved X-Ray Microtomography Images,
707	J. Geophys. Res. Solid Earth, 123(9), 7509-7528, doi:10.1029/2018JB015676.
708	Obermann, A., T. Planès, E. Larose, and M. Campillo (2013), Imaging preeruptive and
709	coeruptive structural and mechanical changes of a volcano with ambient seismic noise,

710	J. Geophys. Res. Solid Earth, 118(12), 6285–6294, doi:10.1002/2013JB010399.
711	Obermann, A., B. Froment, M. Campillo, E. Larose, T. Planès, B. Valette, J. H. Chen, and
712	Q. Y. Liu (2014), Seismic noise correlations to image structural and mechanical changes
713	associated with the Mw 7 . 9 2008 Wenchuan earthquake, J. Geophys. Res. Solid Earth,
714	119(4), 3155–3168, doi:10.1002/2013JB010932.Received.
715	Obermann, A., T. Planès, E. Larose, and M. Campillo (2019), 4-D Imaging of Subsur-
716	face Changes with Coda Waves: Numerical Studies of 3-D Combined Sensitivity Ker-
717	nels and Applications to the $M_{\rm W}$ 7.9, 2008 Wenchuan Earthquake, Pure Appl. Geophys.,
718	176(3), 1243–1254, doi:10.1007/s00024-018-2014-7.
719	Onaisi, A., C. Durand, and A. Audibert (1994), Role of hydration state of shales in bore-
720	hole stability studies, Soc. Pet. Eng Rock Mech. Pet. Eng. 1994, pp. 275-285.
721	Paterson, M. S., and T. F. Wong (2005), Experimental Rock Deformation - The Brittle
722	Field, in Exp. Rock Deform Brittle F., p. 32, Springer-Verlag, Berlin/Heidelberg, doi:
723	10.1007/b137431.
724	Payan, C., V. Garnier, J. Moysan, and P. A. Johnson (2009), Determination of third or-
725	der elastic constants in a complex solid applying coda wave interferometry, Appl. Phys.
726	Lett., doi:10.1063/1.3064129.
727	Peng, J., and S. Q. Yang (2018), Comparison of mechanical behavior and acoustic
728	emission characteristics of three thermally-damaged rocks, <i>Energies</i> , 11(9), doi:
729	10.3390/en11092350.
730	Planès, T., E. Larose, V. Rossetto, and L. Margerin (2015), Imaging multiple local changes
731	in heterogeneous media with diffuse waves, J. Acoust. Soc. Am., 137(2), 660-667, doi:
732	10.1121/1.4906824.
733	Powell, J. H. (2010), Jurassic sedimentation in the Cleveland Basin: a review, Proc.
734	Yorksh. Geol. Soc., 58(1), 21-72, doi:10.1144/pygs.58.1.278.
735	Pye, K. (1985), Electron microscope analysis of zoned dolomite rhombs in the Jet Rock
736	Formation (Lower Toarcian) of the Whitby area, U.K., Geol. Mag., 122(3), 279-286,
737	doi:10.1017/S0016756800031496.
738	Ramos da Silva, M., C. Schroeder, and J. C. Verbrugge (2008), Unsaturated rock
739	mechanics applied to a low-porosity shale, Eng. Geol., 97(1-2), 42-52, doi:
740	10.1016/j.enggeo.2007.12.003.
741	Renard, F., B. Cordonnier, M. Kobchenko, N. Kandula, J. Weiss, and W. Zhu (2017), Mi-

r42 croscale characterization of rupture nucleation unravels precursors to faulting in rocks,

743	Earth Planet. Sci. Lett., 476, 69-78, doi:10.1016/j.epsl.2017.08.002.
744	Renard, F., J. Weiss, J. Mathiesen, Y. Ben-Zion, N. Kandula, and B. Cordonnier (2018),
745	Critical Evolution of Damage Toward System-Size Failure in Crystalline Rock, J. Geo-
746	phys. Res. Solid Earth, 123(2), 1969-1986, doi:10.1002/2017JB014964.
747	Rossetto, V., L. Margerin, T. Planès, and E. Larose (2011), Locating a weak change using
748	diffuse waves: Theoretical approach and inversion procedure, J. Appl. Phys., 109(3),
749	034,903, doi:10.1063/1.3544503.
750	Sarout, J., C. Delle Piane, D. Nadri, L. Esteban, and D. N. Dewhurst (2015), A robust
751	experimental determination of Thomsen's $\delta$ parameter, <i>GEOPHYSICS</i> , 80(1), A19–A24,
752	doi:10.1190/geo2014-0391.1.
753	Sarout, J., Y. Le Gonidec, A. Ougier-Simonin, A. Schubnel, Y. Gu??guen, and D. N. De-
754	whurst (2017), Laboratory micro-seismic signature of shear faulting and fault slip in
755	shale, Phys. Earth Planet. Inter., 264, 47-62, doi:10.1016/j.pepi.2016.11.005.
756	Snieder, R. (2002), Coda Wave Interferometry for Estimating Nonlinear Behavior in Seis-
757	mic Velocity, Science (80 )., 295(5563), 2253-2255, doi:10.1126/science.1070015.
758	Sullivan, C., and A. Kaszynski (2019), PyVista: 3D plotting and mesh analysis through a
759	streamlined interface for the Visualization Toolkit (VTK), J. Open Source Softw., 4(37),
760	1450, doi:10.21105/joss.01450.
761	Tarantola, A. (2005), Inverse Problem Theory and Methods for Model Parameter Esti-
762	mation, vol. 120, 1816-24 pp., Society for Industrial and Applied Mathematics, doi:
763	10.1137/1.9780898717921.
764	Vales, F., D. Nguyen Minh, H. Gharbi, and A. Rejeb (2004), Experimental study of
765	the influence of the degree of saturation on physical and mechanical properties
766	in Tournemire shale (France), Appl. Clay Sci., 26(1-4 SPEC. ISS.), 197-207, doi:
767	10.1016/j.clay.2003.12.032.
768	Vomvoris, S., A. Claudel, I. Blechschmidt, and H. Muller (2013), The Swiss Radioactive
769	Waste Management Program - Brief History, Status, and Outlook, J. Nucl. Fuel Cycle
770	Waste Technol., 1(1), 9–27, doi:10.7733/jnfcwt.2013.1.1.9.
771	Wang, T., H. Wu, Y. Li, H. Gui, Y. Zhou, M. Chen, X. Xiao, W. Zhou, and X. Zhao
772	(2013), Stability analysis of the slope around flood discharge tunnel under inner
773	water exosmosis at Yangqu hydropower station, Comput. Geotech., 51, 1-11, doi:
774	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.compgeo.2013.01.006.

775	Weaver, R. L., and O. I. Lobkis (2000), Temperature dependence of diffuse field phase,
776	Ultrasonics, doi:10.1016/S0041-624X(99)00047-5.
777	Xue, Q., E. Larose, and L. Moreau (2019), Locating structural changes in a multiple
778	scattering domain with an irregular shape, J. Acoust. Soc. Am., 146(1), 595-602, doi:
779	10.1121/1.5118246.
780	Yoshida, N., M. Nishi, M. Kitamura, and T. Adachi (1997), Analysis of mudstone de-
781	terioration and its effect on tunnel performance, Int. J. Rock Mech. Min. Sci., 34(3-4),
782	353.e1-353.e19, doi:10.1016/S1365-1609(97)00289-X.
783	Zhang, Y., O. Abraham, F. Grondin, A. Loukili, V. Tournat, A. L. Duff, B. Lascoup, and
784	O. Durand (2012), Study of stress-induced velocity variation in concrete under direct
785	tensile force and monitoring of the damage level by using thermally-compensated Coda
786	Wave Interferometry, Ultrasonics, 52(8), 1038–1045, doi:10.1016/j.ultras.2012.08.011.
787	Zhang, Y., T. Planès, E. Larose, A. Obermann, C. Rospars, and G. Moreau (2016), Diffuse
788	ultrasound monitoring of stress and damage development on a 15-ton concrete beam, J.
789	Acoust. Soc. Am., 139(4), 1691–1701, doi:10.1121/1.4945097.
790	Zhang, Y., E. Larose, L. Moreau, and G. D'Ozouville (2018), Three-dimensional in-situ
791	imaging of cracks in concrete using diffuse ultrasound, Struct. Heal. Monit., 17(2), doi:
792	10.1177/1475921717690938.
793	Zijp, M., J. Ten Veen, R. Verreussel, J. T. Heege, D. Ventra, and J. Martin (2015), Shale
794	gas formation research: From well logs to outcrop - And back again, First Break, 33(2),
795	99–106.
796	Zotz-Wilson, R. (2019), Coda-Analysis: First release of Coda-Analysis, doi:
797	10.5281/zenodo.3255940.
798	Zotz-Wilson, R., T. Boerrigter, and A. Barnhoorn (2019), Coda-wave monitoring of con-
799	tinuously evolving material properties and the precursory detection of yielding, J.
800	Acoust. Soc. Am., 145(2), 1060-1068, doi:10.1121/1.5091012.
801	Zotz-Wilson, R., Douma, L. A. N. R., J. Dautriat, J. Sarout, D. N. Dewhurst, and A. Barn-
802	hoorn (2019), CAcoustic, mechanical, and microstructure data used in: Ultrasonic
803	Imaging of the Onset and Growth of Fractures within Partially Saturated Whitby Mud-
804	stone using Coda-Wave Decorrelation Inversion, 4TU Centre for Research Data, doi:

<sup>805</sup> 10.4121/uuid:dc3627dd-8434-4fa3-a4f0-b886c31c1ce2.

Figure 1.



Figure 2.

(a)



(b)

z [mm]

Figure 3.



Figure 4.



Figure 5.

(a)





z [mm]

Figure 6.



Figure 7.



Figure 8.



Figure 9.

(a)



hours

z [mm]

80

60

40

20

0

E

30

(b)

Figure 10.



Figure 11.



0.08

Figure 12.



Figure 13.



Figure 14.

