Sensitivity of metabolic constraints for marine organisms to emission scenarios

Takamitsu Ito¹, Amy Weng¹, and Holt G Thomas¹

¹Georgia Institute of Technology

November 23, 2022

Abstract

Marine ecosystem is influenced by multiple factors under the global warming. Increasing temperature raises the matabolic demand for oxygen, however, its supply declines as the concentration of dissolved oxygen decreases. Metabolic index is defined as the oxygen supply to demand ratio for a marine organism, quantitatively combining the effects of ocean warming and deoxygenation. A subset of the earth system models participating in the Coupled Model Intercomparison Project phase 6 (CMIP6) are used to calculate the century-scale changes in the metabolic index under three different scenarios. Under the most aggressive warming scenario, metabolic index can decline over $50\$ % at northern extratropics including the US west coast. Overall magnitude of the change is dependent on the emission scenarios, whereas spatial patterns are model-dependent, in particular at low latitudes due to the large uncertainty in projected oxygen changes.

Sensitivity of metabolic constraints for marine organisms to emission scenarios

Takamitsu Ito¹, Amy Weng¹, and Holt Thomas¹

⁴ ¹School of Earth and Atmospheric Sciences, Georgia Institute of Technology, Atlanta, Georgia, U.S.A.

5 Key Points:

1

2

3

6	•	Centennial decline of metabolic indices are examined under three emission scenar-
7		ios using CMIP6 earth system models
8	•	Effects of warming and deoxygenation together decrease the metabolic index in
9		the northern extratropical oceans
10	•	Emission scenarios significantly alter the magnitude of the changes while its spa-
11		tial patterns are model-dependent

Corresponding author: Takamitsu Ito, taka.ito@eas.gatech.edu

12 Abstract

Marine ecosystem is influenced by multiple factors under the global warming. Increas-13 ing temperature raises the matabolic demand for oxygen, however, its supply declines 14 as the concentration of dissolved oxygen decreases. Metabolic index is defined as the oxy-15 gen supply to demand ratio for a marine organism, quantitatively combining the effects 16 of ocean warming and deoxygenation. A subset of the earth system models participat-17 ing in the Coupled Model Intercomparison Project phase 6 (CMIP6) are used to calcu-18 late the century-scale changes in the metabolic index under three different scenarios. Un-19 der the most aggressive warming scenario, metabolic index can decline over 50% at north-20 ern extratropics including the US west coast. Overall magnitude of the change is depen-21 dent on the emission scenarios, whereas spatial patterns are model-dependent, in par-22 ticular at low latitudes due to the large uncertainty in projected oxygen changes. 23

²⁴ Plain Language Summary

Global warming changes many aspects of physical and chemical environments in 25 the oceans. Direct observations have shown temperature increase and oxygen decrease 26 for the past several decades, and climate models predict that these trends continue for 27 this century. It is difficult to understand the impacts of multiple environmental factors 28 on marine ecosystems. Recent theoretical advances combines temperature and oxygen 29 to calculate the metabolic constraints of marine animals. Warming increases oxygen de-30 mand due to increasing metabolic rates, however, the supply of oxygen is decreasing. Metabolic 31 index can be defined as the oxygen supply to demand ratio. This study delineates the 32 two factors in the context of climate model projections of metabolic index for the 21st 33 century under different socio-economic scenarios. Comparing four different models gives 34 us a sense of uncertainty due to model structure. We find that warming and oxygen loss 35 play approximately equal role in tightening the metabolic constraints, especially in the 36 mid and high latitude northern hemisphere oceans including the US west coast. These 37 regions exhibit more than 50% decline in the metabolic index under the "business-as-38 usual" emission scenario, but choosing less aggressive emission scenarios can significantly 39 reduce the decline of metabolic index in these regions. 40

41 **1** Introduction

The oceans are the dominant sink of excess heat under the global warming (Zanna 42 et al., 2019) accounting for more than 90% of the Earth's energy imbalance (Cheng et 43 al., 2017). The greatest temperature increase occurs at the surface while deep temper-44 atures remain nearly unchanged due to the slow ventilation of deep waters relative to 45 the timescale of the anthropogenic forcing. This contrast in the rate of warming increases 46 the vertical density difference. Stronger vertical stratification tends to decrease the up-47 per ocean mixing and reduce the vertical transfer of chemical properties. The temper-48 ature increase reduces the solubility of oxygen in the seawater, and the increased den-49 sity stratification further weakens the vertical mixing of oxygen into the interior ocean. 50 These two reinforcing mechanisms decrease the dissolved oxygen concentrations under 51 transient warming scenarios (Matear et al., 2000; Keeling & Garcia, 2002; Keeling et al., 52 2010). Direct observations of dissolved oxygen show a significant decline during the last 53 several decades (Helm et al., 2011; Schmidtko et al., 2017) in association with the ob-54 served increase in ocean heat content (Ito et al., 2017). 55

Increasing temperature and declining oxygen levels are two of the major ecosystem stressors under the warming climate (Gruber, 2011; Bopp et al., 2013). Rates of physiological processes typically depend on temperature. As temperature increases, animals' metabolic oxygen demands are expected to increase. In order for a marine habitat to be viable, the rate of oxygen supply must exceed the resting metabolic demand. Metabolic index (Φ) is defined as the oxygen supply to demand ratio for a marine organism, which quantitatively combines the effect of warming and oxygen loss (Deutsch et al., 2015).

$$\Phi = A_0 B^n \frac{pO_2}{exp(-E/k_B T)} \tag{1}$$

 A_0 is a constant coefficient specific to individual species, and B is the body mass. pO_2 63 is the partial pressure of oxygen of the ambient water, and E(eV) is the temperature 64 sensitivity parameter. $k_B \ (eVK^{-1})$ is the Boltzmann constant, and $T \ (K)$ is the abso-65 lute temperature. If Φ is less than 1, the oxygen supply cannot meet the resting metabolic 66 demand. Observed distribution of marine organisms require minimum metabolic index 67 (Φ_{crit}) of 2 to 5 in order to support critical activities such as growth and reproduction, 68 and the maps of $\Phi > \Phi_{crit}$ capture the patterns of observed marine habitats (Deutsch 69 et al., 2015). Taking the logarithmic derivative of (1) the relative importance of warm-70

⁷¹ ing and oxygen loss can be evaluated.

$$\frac{\delta\Phi}{\Phi} = \frac{\delta p O_2}{p O_2} - \frac{E}{k_B T^2} \delta T \tag{2}$$

For a given body mass (constant B), fractional changes in Φ is linearly dependent on pO_2 72 and temperature. In this framework, relative importance between the two environmen-73 tal variables $(pO_2 \text{ and } T)$ is controlled by the empirically determined temperature sen-74 sitivity parameter (E). The magnitude of E varies from 0.3 to 1.0eV in published data 75 (Deutsch et al., 2015) with the median of 0.6eV. Larger values for this parameter indi-76 cate greater influence of temperature relative to pO_2 . Surface waters are temperature 77 dominated due to the air-sea gas transfer setting $pO_2 \sim pO_{2,air}$. Oxygen concentra-78 tion below the surface mixed layer is controlled by the balance between the ventilation 79 and the respiratory O_2 losses. Under increasing density stratification and weakened ven-80 tilation, subsurface pO_2 is predicted to decrease by shifting the balance towards teh res-81 piratory O_2 losses. The reinforcing changes in pO_2 and T are predicted in the subsur-82 face where significant decreases in pO_2 can occur. 83

The objective of this paper is to examine the centennial trends of the metabolic 84 index as simulated by a subset of earth system models (ESMs) participating in the Cou-85 pled Model Intercomparison Project Phase 6 (Eyring et al., 2016) under different emis-86 sion scenarios. Three future scenarios are considered; ssp126, ssp245 and ssp585 cover-87 ing a wide range of fossil fuel emissions (Gidden et al., 2019). Four models are selected 88 based on the availability of necessary output variables to calculate the metabolic index 89 for pre-industrial control, historical and future scenario simulations; CanESM5 (Swart 90 et al., 2019a, 2019b, 2019c, 2019d, 2019e, 2019f), CNRM-ESM2-1 (Sfrian et al., 2019; 91 Seferian, 2018), GFDL-CM4 (Held et al., 2019; Guo et al., 2018) and IPSL-CM6A-LR 92 (Boucher et al., 2018). The structure of this manuscript is as follows. Section 2 describes 93 the model data analysis methods. Section 3 discusses the centennial changes of metabolic 94 index, its breakdown into temperature and oxygen components, and its scenario depen-95 dence. Section 4 summarizes the results and discusses its implications. 96

97

2 Model Data Analysis Methods

The specific set of ESM simulations used in this study includes the pre-industrial control (piControl), historical simulation (historical) and future projections (ssp126, ssp245, and ssp585). Historical simulation covers from 1850 to 2015 and the ssp scenarios cover

-4-

from 2016 to 2100. The monthly means of ocean potential temperature (θ) , salinity (S), and dissolved oxygen (O_2) are first re-gridded into global 2° longitude-latitude grid using bilinear interpolation. Subsequently the annual mean of each variables are calculated, and the model drift is removed from every grid point using the linear trend of piControl from 1850 to 2100. Drift correction is applied for each variable before the metabolic indices are computed.

Figure 1 evaluates the climatological O_2 at 200m depth over the period from 1980 107 to 2000, and model outputs are compared to the World Ocean Atlas 2018 (Garcia et al., 108 2018). The models capture the spatial variability reasonably well with the correlation 109 coefficient of 0.93 to 0.94. These models can reproduce large scale gradients in O_2 where 110 high latitude waters are relatively well ventilated, and the tropical thermocline is rela-111 tively depleted in O_2 . The global median O_2 is 219μ M for the observation (WOA2018), 112 and the modeled values are 242μ M for CanESM5, 217μ M for CNRM-ESM2-1, 234μ M 113 for GFDL-CM4, and 218μ M for IPSL-CM6A-LR. Supplementary Figure S1 shows the 114 difference between the model and the observation. Interestingly, all models overestimate 115 O_2 concentrations in the central and western tropical Pacific, and also overestimate it 116 in the subpolar North Pacific. Besides these regions, the pattern of the mean-state bi-117 ases differ from model to model without a common pattern. CanESM5 tends to over-118 estimate the O_2 in all basins especially at high latitudes and in the western part of trop-119 ical basins. CNRM-ESM2-1 generally underestimates the O_2 in the tropical Atlantic and 120 in the Southern Ocean, but it tends to overestimate in the North Pacific. This model 121 also underestimates O_2 in the core of the tropical oxygen minimum zones (OMZs). GFDL-CM4 tends to overestimate O_2 in the Pacific basin with the exception of tropical pacific 123 OMZ, where this model well captures the zonally elongated structure of the low- O_2 wa-124 ter there. This model also exhibits the least bias in the subpolar North Atlantic. IPSL-125 CM6A-LR generally overestimate O_2 in the tropical Pacific but underestimates in the 126 Southern Ocean. 127

Potential temperature (θ) is another important variable for the calculation of the metabolic index. The models capture the spatial variability of potential temperature at 200m significantly better than oxygen with the correlation coefficient of 0.96 to 0.99 (see also, Supplementary Figure S2). The global median θ at 200m depth is 11.2°C for the observation (WOA2018), and the models are 11.6°C for CanESM5, 11.1°C for CNRM-

ESM2-1, 9.7°C for GFDL-CM4, and 11.1°C for IPSL-CM6A-LR. While some models show

-5-



Figure 1. Model-Observation comparison of climatological, annual mean dissolved oxygen at 200m depth. (a-d) The plotted values are based on drift-corrected oxygen concentration based on the historical simulation. Climatology is based on the 20-year averages between 1980 to 2000 for the model data. (e) Climatological annual oxygen concentration based on the World Ocean Atlas 2018.

median θ closer to the observation than others, spatial pattern of model biases show sim-134 ilar order of magnitudes among all the models (Supplementary Figure S3). In some mod-135 els, these biases compensate one another to exhibit the global median temperature that 136 is very close to the observation. All models underestimated potential temperature in the 137 subtropical South Pacific from 10°S to 30°S. GFDL-CM4 generally underestimated the 138 subsurface potential temperature in all basins with the exception of the tropical Indian 139 Ocean. In the subpolar North Atlantic, however, GFDL-CM4 better represents the ther-140 mal structure. Other models tend to exhibit a cold bias in the south of Greenland, re-141 flecting overly zonal structure of the North Atlantic Current, as seen in earlier (CMIP5) 142 versions of ESMs (Tagklis et al., 2017). With these biases in mind, we proceed to cal-143 culate the metabolic index in the next section. 144

¹⁴⁵ 3 Centennial Changes of Metabolic index

 pO_2 is calculated as the ratio between the oxygen concentration (O_2) and the Henry's 146 law coefficient for oxygen saturation following Garcia and Gordon (1992). In order to 147 calculate the centennial trend, we take the 20-year average over 2080 to 2100 in the sce-148 nario runs and subtract the 20-year average over 1980 to 2000 from the historical sim-149 ulation. The mean state of the metabolic index, according to (1), generally takes its min-150 imum value in the tropics and increases towards high latitudes. This is caused by the 151 poleward increase in oxygen concentration (and pO_2) and decrease in temperature, both 152 contributing to the poleward increase in the metabolic index (Φ). Typically the criti-153 cal condition ($\Phi = \Phi_{crit}$) occurs somewhere in the mid-latitudes, setting the equator-154 ward edge of the organism's habitat. Increasing temperature and/or decreasing oxygen 155 generally indicate the poleward migration of this critical latitude. 156

Figure 2 shows the centennial change of Φ at 200m in percent from each of the four 157 ESMs. GFDL-CM4 did not include the ssp126 scenario at the time of the writing of this 158 manuscript. Figure 2 is based on the median temperature sensitivity (E = 0.6eV). The 159 depth of 200m is chosen to capture the upper-ocean environment, but below the base 160 of surface mixed layer for most of the ocean regions. Temperature sensitivity parame-161 ter (E) varies over 0.3 to 1.0eV resulting in $\sim \pm 50\%$ change in the temperature con-162 tribution of the change. Temperature effect generally decreases the metabolic index as 163 the seawater warms up. 164

-7-



Figure 2. Centennial change of metabolic index at 200m depth with the median temperature sensitivity (E = 0.6eV). The centennial change is evaluated by the difference between the two periods; 1980-2000 and 2080-2100. Consistent color shading is used for all panels. From left to right, each column shows the results from ssp126, ssp245 and ssp585 scenario runs. From top to bottom, each raw shows the results from difference ESMs; CanESM5, CNRM-ESM2-1, GFDL-CM4, and IPSL-CM6A-LR.

In general, the metabolic indices are decreasing in all emission scenario (Figure 2). 165 In many regions the magnitude of the decline exceeds 50% under the ssp585 scenario. 166 The strongest decrease occurs in some regions of the northern extratropics especially in 167 the California coast, the northern North Atlantic, the western subpolar North Pacific. 168 Comparing difference emission scenarios, the scenario dependence occurs mainly in the 169 magnitude of the change, and the spatial patterns are generally set by the specific model 170 structure. As the degree of global warming intensifies from ssp126 to ssp585, the decrease 171 of metabolic indices gets greater in magnitude across all the models. 172

Models disagree in the sign of change in some parts of the tropics. CanESM5 and 173 GFDL-CM4 show an increase in metabolic indices in the eastern tropics including Pa-174 cific, Atlantic and Indian basins. In contrast, CNRM-ESM2-1 and IPSL-CM6A-LR show 175 decreases in the eastern tropics. In these regions, the increase in metabolic indices are 176 caused by the increase in pO_2 (Figure 3). The oxygen contributions are calculated ac-177 cording to the first term in the RHS of (2). Temperature of seawater increases in these 178 regions (see Figure S4) but the oxygen increase dominates over the thermal effect at low 179 latitudes. 180

Increased stratification and shallower mixed layer depths will weaken the ocean ven-181 tilation and reduce subsurface O_2 in the subduction regions at mid and high latitudes 182 (Keeling et al., 2010; Matear et al., 2000). However, there are several other factors that 183 affect the centennial O_2 trends (Oschlies et al., 2018). Shifts in atmospheric winds can 184 alter the ocean circulation and the ventilation of thermocline. Increased stratification 185 can also reduce the vertical nutrient supply, potentially weakening the biological produc-186 tivity and export of organic matter. Reduced respiration tends to leaves behind subsur-187 face O_2 , leading to an increase in pO_2 . Furthermore, increased stratification may weaken 188 the overturning circulation, weakening the upwelling deep water into the tropical ther-189 mocline (Gnanadesikan et al., 2007), leading to an reduction in the age of water and pO_2 190 increase in the tropical thermocline. The combinations of these factors together control 191 the sensitivity of pO_2 in the tropical thermocline. The superposition of multiple mech-192 anisms makes the attribution challenging (Takano et al., 2018). Individually, each model 193 shows consistent change for all three basins for all scenarios. Thus, the tropical oxygen 194 changes are largely model-dependent, and the disagreement between the models high-195 lights significant uncertainty in the low latitudes. 196

-9-



Figure 3. Oxygen contribution to the centennial change of metabolic index at 200m depth as the difference between the two periods; 1980-2000 and 2080-2100. From left to right, each column shows the results from ssp126, ssp245 and ssp585 scenario runs. From top to bottom, each raw shows the results from difference ESMs; CanESM5, CNRM-ESM2-1, GFDL-CM4, and IPSL-CM6A-LR.

¹⁹⁷ 4 Discussions and Conclusions

Metabolic demand for O_2 increases as the ocean absorbs excess heat and the tem-198 perature rises. Climate models predict the decline of dissolved oxygen and its partial pres-199 sure in the subsurface waters (Bopp et al., 2013; Keeling et al., 2010) while significant 200 uncertainty still remains about the models' ability to reproduce observed mean states, 201 variability and trends from the past several decades (Cabre et al., 2015; Eddebbar et al., 202 2017; Stramma et al., 2012). There is a general tendency for ESMs to underestimate the 203 oxygen trends relative to the historic data (Oschlies et al., 2017). With those limitations 204 in mind, a subset of the CMIP6 models are used to assess the projected centennial change 205 in metabolic index for the 21st century. Figure 4 summarizes our results. In the zonal 206 mean sense, the thermal and oxygen contributions together drives the decrease of metabolic 207 index poleward of 35°N and 35°S. The strong oxygen decline in northern extratropical 208 latitudes combines with the effect of temperature increase to drive the major decrease 209 there. Eastern boundary upwelling region of the US west coast is another high impact 210 areas where the temperature increase and oxygen decline reinforce one another. For the 211 case of E=0.6eV, relative contributions from pO_2 and T are approximately the same in 212 these regions. All models are in agreement that the net change in Φ can reach and ex-213 ceed 50% decline under the ssp585 scenario, which can be avoided in the case of the ssp126 214 or ssp245 scenarios. The northern extratropics including the California coast can be the 215 hot spots of the regional ecological impacts because of the critical condition, $\Phi \sim \Phi_{crit}$, 216 typically occurring close to these regions. In another words, the strongest decline in metabolic 217 index are predicted to occur where the ecosystem is already close to the critical thresh-218 old. 219

The changes in Φ are uncertain at low latitudes. Models generally have difficulty 220 reproducing the mean state and/or variability of observed O₂ in the tropical thermocline 221 (Cabre et al., 2015; Stramma et al., 2012; Oschlies et al., 2017). The amplitude of oxy-222 gen contribution can be large at tropics because of the oxygen minimum zone with very 223 small pO_2 , which amplifies the fractional change. For the models examined in this study, 224 CanESM5 (blue in Figure 4) and GFDL-CM4 (yellow) predict oxygen increase at low 225 latitudes, which is in part compensated by the temperature effect. CNRM-ESM2-1 (red) 226 and IPSL-CM6A-LR (purple) predict oxygen decrease across all latitudes, which rein-227 forces the temperature effect. The ventilation of tropical thermocline is influenced by 228 the complex circulation patterns including zonal jets, wind forcing, mesoscale eddies and 229

-11-

small-scale diapycnal mixing (Brandt et al., 2015; Duteil et al., 2014; Ridder & England, 230 2014; Gnanadesikan et al., 2007; Thomsen et al., 2016; Lachkar et al., 2018; Shaffer et 231 al., 2000). Climate models cannot fully resolve some of these small scale features and 232 must rely on parameterizations. Furthermore, observations from the tropical Pacific show 233 significant multi-decadal trends that are not well captured by climate models (Stramma 234 et al., 2008; Schmidtko et al., 2017; Ito et al., 2017) which is, at least, partially related 235 to the modes of natural climate variability (Duteil et al., 2018; Ito et al., 2019; Deutsch 236 et al., 2011). 237

Despite the discrepancies in the tropics, the overall scenario dependence is simple 238 and obvious. Comparing the ssp126 to ssp585 scenario, it more than doubles the mag-239 nitude of change especially in northern extratropical latitudes (left column in Figure 4) 240 and along the US west coast (Figure 2). While these regions are particularly influenced, 241 moderate decline of metabolic index occurs over much of the Southern Ocean and the 242 subtropical oceans both in the northern and southern hemispheres. For regional appli-243 cation, this calculation can be repeated with different sets of temperature dependence 244 parameters (E) for key species in order to access impacts for a specific ecosystem. Ul-245 timately, the international reduction in the greenhouse gas emissions is fundamental to 246 avoid the continuing, large-scale decline of metabolic constraints in the oceans with bio-247 geochemical, ecological and socio-economic consequences. 248

249 Acknowledgments

Datasets for this research are available in the Earth System Grid Federation (ESGF, https://esgf-250 node.llnl.gov/projects/cmip6/) with these in-text data citation references: CanESM5 (Swart 251 et al., 2019bcdef) licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution ShareAlike 4.0 Inter-252 national License, CNRM-ESM2-1 (Seferian et al., 2019) licensed under a Creative Com-253 mons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 4.0 International License, GFDL-CM4 (Guo 254 et al., 2018) licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-ShareAlike 4.0 International 255 License, and IPSL-CM6A-LR (Boucher et al., 2018) licensed under a Creative Commons 256 Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 4.0 International License. Supplementary Ta-257 ble summerizes the list of ESMs and their reference information. We acknowledge the 258 World Climate Research Programme, which, through its Working Group on Coupled Mod-259 elling, coordinated and promoted CMIP6. We thank the climate modeling groups for pro-260 ducing and making available their model output, the ESGF for archiving the data and 261

-12-



Figure 4. Centennial change of the zonally averaged metabolic index at 200m depth as the difference between the two periods; 1980-2000 and 2080-2100. From left to right, each column shows the contributions from oxygen, temperature, and their combination. From top to bottom, each raw shows the three emission scenarios; ssp126, ssp245 and ssp585. The colors of the line indicate different models; CanESM5 (blue), CNRM-ESM2-1 (red), GFDL-CM4 (yellow), and IPSL-CM6A-LR (purple).

262	providing access, and the multiple funding agencies who support CMIP6 and ESGF. We
263	are thankful for the funding support from the National Science Foundation, Grant Num-
264	ber OPP-1744755 and OCE-1737188, and acknowledge support from the Cullen-Peck Fel-
265	lowship at Georgia Institute of Technology.

266 References

- Bopp, L., Resplandy, L., Orr, J. C., Doney, S. C., Dunne, J. P., Gehlen, M., ...
 Vichi, M. (2013). Multiple stressors of ocean ecosystems in the 21st century:
 projections with CMIP5 models. *BIOGEOSCIENCES*, 10(10), 6225-6245. doi:
 {10.5194/bg-10-6225-2013}
- Boucher, O., Denvil, S., Caubel, A., & Foujols, M. A. (2018). Ipsl ipsl-cm6a-lr model
 output prepared for cmip6 cmip, downloaded 20190802. Earth System Grid
 Federation. Retrieved from http://cera-www.dkrz.de/WDCC/meta/CMIP6/
 CMIP6.CMIP.IPSL.IPSL-CM6A-LR doi: 10.22033/ESGF/CMIP6.1534
- Brandt, P., Bange, H. W., Banyte, D., Dengler, M., Didwischus, S. H., Fischer, T.,
 ... Visbeck, M. (2015). On the role of circulation and mixing in the ventilation of oxygen minimum zones with a focus on the eastern tropical North Atlantic. *BIOGEOSCIENCES*, 12(2), 489-512. doi: {10.5194/bg-12-489-2015}
- Cabre, A., Marinov, I., Bernardello, R., & Bianchi, D. (2015). Oxygen minimum
 zones in the tropical Pacific across CMIP5 models: mean state differences
 and climate change trends. *BIOGEOSCIENCES*, 12(18), 5429-5454. doi:
 {10.5194/bg-12-5429-2015}
- Cheng, L., Trenberth, K. E., Fasullo, J., Boyer, T., Abraham, J., & Zhu, J. (2017).
 Improved estimates of ocean heat content from 1960 to 2015. Science Advances, 3(3). doi: 10.1126/sciadv.1601545
- Deutsch, C., Brix, H., Ito, T., Frenzel, H., & Thompson, L. (2011). Climate-Forced
 Variability of Ocean Hypoxia. SCIENCE, 333(6040), 336-339. doi: {10.1126/
 science.1202422}
- Deutsch, C., Ferrel, A., Seibel, B., Pörtner, H.-O., & Huey, R. B. (2015). Climate
 change tightens a metabolic constraint on marine habitats. *Science*, 348(6239),
 1132–1135. doi: 10.1126/science.aaa1605
- Duteil, O., Boening, C. W., & Oschlies, A. (2014). Variability in subtropical-tropical cells drives oxygen levels in the tropical Pacific Ocean. *GEOPHYSICAL RE*-

294	SEARCH LETTERS, $41(24)$, 8926-8934. doi: $\{10.1002/2014$ GL061774 $\}$
295	Duteil, O., Oschlies, A., & Boening, C. W. (2018). Pacific Decadal Oscillation
296	and recent oxygen decline in the eastern tropical Pacific Ocean. BIOGEO-
297	$SCIENCES, 15(23), 7111-7126.$ doi: {10.5194/bg-15-7111-2018}
298	Eddebbar, Y. A., Long, M. C., Resplandy, L., Roedenbeck, C., Rodgers, K. B.,
299	Manizza, M., & Keeling, R. F. (2017). Impacts of ENSO on air-sea oxygen
300	exchange: Observations and mechanisms. GLOBAL BIOGEOCHEMICAL
301	$CYCLES, 31(5), 901-921.$ doi: {10.1002/2017GB005630}
302	Eyring, V., Bony, S., Meehl, G. A., Senior, C. A., Stevens, B., Stouffer, R. J., &
303	Taylor, K. E. (2016). Overview of the coupled model intercomparison project
304	phase 6 (cmip6) experimental design and organization. Geoscientific Model
305	Development, 9(5), 1937-1958.doi: 10.5194/gmd-9-1937-2016
306	Garcia, H. E., & Gordon, L. I. (1992). Oxygen solubility in seawater: Better fitting
307	equations. Limnology and Oceanography, 37(6), 1307-1312. doi: 10.4319/lo
308	.1992.37.6.1307
309	Garcia, H. E., Weathers, K., Paver, C. R., Smolyar, I., Boyer, T. P., Locarnini,
310	R. A., Reagan, J. R. (2018). World ocean atlas 2018, dissolved oxygen,
311	apparent oxygen utilization, and oxygen saturation. NOAA Atlas NESDIS,
312	$\beta(83), 38.$
313	Gidden, M. J., Riahi, K., Smith, S. J., Fujimori, S., Luderer, G., Kriegler, E.,
314	Takahashi, K. (2019). Global emissions pathways under different socioeco-
315	nomic scenarios for use in cmip6: a dataset of harmonized emissions trajecto-
316	ries through the end of the century. Geoscientific Model Development, $12(4)$,
317	1443–1475. doi: 10.5194/gmd-12-1443-2019
318	Gnanadesikan, A., Russell, J. L., & Zeng, F. (2007). How does ocean ventilation
319	change under global warming? Ocean Science, $3(1)$, 43–53. doi: 10.5194/os-3
320	-43-2007
321	Gruber, N. (2011). Warming up, turning sour, losing breath: ocean biogeochem-
322	istry under global change. PHILOSOPHICAL TRANSACTIONS OF THE
323	ROYAL SOCIETY A-MATHEMATICAL PHYSICAL AND ENGINEERING
324	$SCIENCES, 369(1943), 1980-1996.$ doi: $\{10.1098/rsta.2011.0003\}$
325	Guo, H., John, J. G., Blanton, C., McHugh, C., Nikonov, S., Radhakrishnan,
326	A., Zhao, M. (2018). Noaa-gfdl gfdl-cm4 model output, downloaded

327	20190828. Earth System Grid Federation. Retrieved from http://
328	cera-www.dkrz.de/WDCC/meta/CMIP6/CMIP6.CMIP.NOAA-GFDL.GFDL-CM4
329	doi: 10.22033/ESGF/CMIP6.1402
330	Held, I. M., Guo, H., Adcroft, A., Dunne, J. P., Horowitz, L. W., Krasting, J.,
331	Zadeh, N. (2019). Structure and performance of GFDL's CM4.0
332	climate model. Journal of Advances in Modeling Earth Systems. doi:
333	10.1029/2019MS001829
334	Helm, K. P., Bindoff, N. L., & Church, J. A. (2011). Observed decreases in oxygen
335	content of the global ocean. GEOPHYSICAL RESEARCH LETTERS, 38.
336	doi: $\{10.1029/2011GL049513\}$
337	Ito, T., Long, M. C., Deutsch, C., Minobe, S., & Sun, D. (2019). Mechanisms of
338	Low-Frequency Oxygen Variability in the North Pacific. GLOBAL BIOGEO-
339	CHEMICAL CYCLES, $33(2)$, 110-124. doi: {10.1029/2018GB005987}
340	Ito, T., Minobe, S., Long, M. C., & Deutsch, C. (2017). Upper ocean O-2 trends:
341	1958-2015. GEOPHYSICAL RESEARCH LETTERS, $44(9)$, 4214-4223. doi:
342	$\{10.1002/2017GL073613\}$
343	Keeling, R. F., & Garcia, H. E. (2002). The change in oceanic o2 inventory associ-
344	ated with recent global warming. $PNAS$: Proceedings of the National Academy
345	of Sciences of the United States of America., 99(12), 7848–7853.
346	Keeling, R. F., Krtzinger, A., & Gruber, N. (2010). Ocean deoxygenation in a
347	warming world. Annual Review of Marine Science, 2(1), 199-229. (PMID:
348	21141663) doi: $10.1146/annurev.marine.010908.163855$
349	Lachkar, Z., Levy, M., & Smith, S. (2018). Intensification and deepening of
350	the Arabian Sea oxygen minimum zone in response to increase in Indian
351	monsoon wind intensity. $BIOGEOSCIENCES, 15(1), 159-186.$ doi:
352	$\{10.5194/bg-15-159-2018\}$
353	Matear, R. J., Hirst, A. C., & McNeil, B. I. (2000). Changes in dissolved oxygen in
354	the southern ocean with climate change. $Geochemistry, geophysics, geosystems,$
355	1(11).
356	Oschlies, A., Brandt, P., Stramma, L., & Schmidtko, S. (2018). Drivers and mech-
357	anisms of ocean deoxygenation. Nature Geoscience, 11(7), 467–473. doi: 10
358	.1038/s41561-018-0152-2
359	Oschlies, A., Duteil, O., Getzlaff, J., Koeve, W., Landolfi, A., & Schmidtko, S.

-16-

360	(2017). Patterns of deoxygenation: sensitivity to natural and anthropogenic
361	drivers. PHILOSOPHICAL TRANSACTIONS OF THE ROYAL SOCI-
362	ETY A-MATHEMATICAL PHYSICAL AND ENGINEERING SCIENCES,
363	$375(2102).$ doi: {10.1098/rsta.2016.0325}
364	Ridder, N. N., & England, M. H. (2014). Sensitivity of ocean oxygenation to varia-
365	tions in tropical zonal wind stress magnitude. $GLOBAL BIOGEOCHEMICAL$
366	$CYCLES, 28(9), 909-926.$ doi: {10.1002/2013GB004708}
367	Schmidtko, S., Stramma, L., & Visbeck, M. (2017). Decline in global oceanic oxy-
368	gen content during the past five decades. NATURE, 542(7641), 335+. doi: {10
369	.1038/nature21399}
370	Seferian, R. (2018). Cnrm-cerfacs cnrm-esm2-1 model output prepared for cmip6
371	cmip, downloaded 20191006. Earth System Grid Federation. Retrieved from
372	https://doi.org/10.22033/ESGF/CMIP6.1391
373	.1391
374	Shaffer, G., Leth, O., Ulloa, O., Bendtsen, J., Daneri, G., Dellarossa, V., Sehlst-
375	edt, P. (2000) . Warming and circulation change in the eastern South Pacific
376	Ocean. GEOPHYSICAL RESEARCH LETTERS, 27(9), 1247-1250.
377	Stramma, L., Johnson, G. C., Sprintall, J., & Mohrholz, V. (2008). Expanding
378	oxygen-minimum zones in the tropical oceans. SCIENCE, $320(5876)$, 655-658.
379	doi: $\{10.1126/science.1153847\}$
380	Stramma, L., Oschlies, A., & Schmidtko, S. (2012). Mismatch between observed and
381	modeled trends in dissolved upper-ocean oxygen over the last 50 yr. $BIOGEO{-}$
382	$SCIENCES, 9(10), 4045-4057.$ doi: {10.5194/bg-9-4045-2012}
383	Swart, N. C., Cole, J. N., Kharin, V. V., Lazare, M., Scinocca, J. F., Gillett,
384	N. P., Sigmond, M. (2019b). Cccma canesm5 model output prepared
385	for cmip6 cmip historical, version 20190306. Earth System Grid Feder-
386	ation. Retrieved from http://cera-www.dkrz.de/WDCC/meta/CMIP6/
387	CMIP6.CMIP.CCCma.CanESM5.historical doi: 10.22033/ESGF/CMIP6.3610
388	Swart, N. C., Cole, J. N., Kharin, V. V., Lazare, M., Scinocca, J. F., Gillett,
389	N. P., Sigmond, M. (2019c). Cccma canesm5 model output prepared
390	for cmip6 cmip picontrol, version 20190429. Earth System Grid Feder-
391	ation. Retrieved from http://cera-www.dkrz.de/WDCC/meta/CMIP6/
392	CMIP6.CMIP.CCCma.CanESM5.piControl doi: 10.22033/ESGF/CMIP6.3673

393	Swart, N. C., Cole, J. N., Kharin, V. V., Lazare, M., Scinocca, J. F., Gillett, N. P.,
394	Sigmond, M. (2019d). Cccma canesm5 model output prepared for
395	cmip6 scenariomip ssp126, version 20190429. Earth System Grid Federa-
396	tion. Retrieved from http://cera-www.dkrz.de/WDCC/meta/CMIP6/CMIP6
397	.ScenarioMIP.CCCma.CanESM5.ssp126 doi: $10.22033/ESGF/CMIP6.3683$
398	Swart, N. C., Cole, J. N., Kharin, V. V., Lazare, M., Scinocca, J. F., Gillett,
399	N. P., Sigmond, M. (2019e). Cccma canesm5 model output prepared for
400	cmip6 scenariomip ssp245, version 20190429. Earth System Grid Federa-
401	tion. Retrieved from http://cera-www.dkrz.de/WDCC/meta/CMIP6/CMIP6
402	.ScenarioMIP.CCCma.CanESM5.ssp245 doi: $10.22033/ESGF/CMIP6.3685$
403	Swart, N. C., Cole, J. N., Kharin, V. V., Lazare, M., Scinocca, J. F., Gillett, N. P.,
404	\dots Sigmond, M. (2019f). Cccma canesm5 model output prepared for cmip6 sce-
405	$nariomip \ ssp585, \ version \ 20190429.$ Earth System Grid Federation. Retrieved
406	from http://cera-www.dkrz.de/WDCC/meta/CMIP6/CMIP6.ScenarioMIP
407	.CCCma.CanESM5.ssp585 doi: $10.22033/ESGF/CMIP6.3696$
408	Swart, N. C., Cole, J. N. S., Kharin, V. V., Lazare, M., Scinocca, J. F., Gillett,
409	N. P., Winter, B. (2019a). The canadian earth system model version 5 $$
410	(CanESM5.0.3). Geoscientific Model Development, 12(11), 4823-4873. doi:
411	10.5194/gmd-12-4823-2019
412	Sfrian, R., Nabat, P., Michou, M., Saint-Martin, D., Voldoire, A., Colin, J.,
413	Madec, G. (2019) . Evaluation of cnrm earth system model, CNRM-ESM2-1:
414	Role of earth system processes in present-day and future climate. Journal of
415	Advances in Modeling Earth Systems. doi: $10.1029/2019MS001791$
416	Tagklis, F., Bracco, A., & Ito, T. (2017). Physically driven patchy o2 changes in the
417	north at lantic ocean simulated by the cmip5 earth system models. $\ Global \ Bio$
418	geochemical Cycles, $31(8)$, 1218-1235. doi: 10.1002/2016GB005617
419	Takano, Y., Ito, T., & Deutsch, C. (2018). Projected Centennial Oxygen Trends and
420	Their Attribution to Distinct Ocean Climate Forcings. GLOBAL BIOGEO-
421	CHEMICAL CYCLES, $32(9)$, 1329-1349. doi: {10.1029/2018GB005939}
422	Thomsen, S., Kanzow, T., Colas, F., Echevin, V., Krahmann, G., & Engel, A.
423	(2016). Do submesoscale frontal processes ventilate the oxygen minimum
424	zone off Peru? GEOPHYSICAL RESEARCH LETTERS, 43(15), 8133-8142.
425	doi: $\{10.1002/2016GL070548\}$

426	Zanna, L., Khatiwala, S., Gregory, J. M., Ison, J., & Heimbach, P.	(2019).
427	Global reconstruction of historical ocean heat storage and transport.	Pro-
428	ceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, $116(4)$, $1126-1131$.	doi:
429	10.1073/pnas.1808838115	